EPILOGUE

During Sunday services on 1 June 1856 the Richwood Presbyterian Church publicly lamented the parishioners' "many sins with which we as a people and a church have provoked the withdrawal of Divine favor and influence from our midst." The deacons appointed "Friday the 13th day of June as a day of solemn fasting and humiliation before God on account of our sins and departures" and enjoined the congregation "to practice bodily abstinence on that day as shall be suitable to abasing themselves in the dust before the great God whom we have offended." Squire Gaines was not listed among the penitents.[1]

In April 1857 he had a close scrape with death. "Mr. Gaines," reported the *Covington Journal*, "while plowing Monday last, had a very fine team of horses killed by lightning." Two months later, in early June 1857, he publicly reclaimed his "honor" by terrifying John Jolliffe outside Timberlake's store. Two weeks after that, his neighbors elected Gaines president of Boone County's chapter of the proslavery American Party, the Know-Nothings. At northern Kentucky agricultural fairs his sheep, mares, calves, and hogs annually won top awards throughout the remaining antebellum years, and in 1859 his wife, Elizabeth, gave birth to a healthy boy, Archie.[2]

When civil war broke out, however, northern Kentucky politics

seemed to take a U-turn. Like the northern Kentucky squires who stood by him during the Garner trial, Gaines had always played the staunch Southron, but in 1860 he joined John Finnell, Clinton Butts, William Timberlake, and John Menzies in signing resolutions *opposed* to secession. Finnell took an appointment as Kentucky Adjutant General, in charge of enlisting Union volunteers, and in 1861 Menzies won John Gaines's old Tenth District congressional seat for the Democratic Party's antisecession or "Union" wing. They all seem to have put on the blue uniform. Even young Thomas Marshall enrolled in a Boone County unit of the Home Guards, a militia pledged to protect central Kentucky railroad and telegraph lines against rebel depredations.[3]

Archibald Gaines's family rode out the civil war at Richwood Station, and the record tells us nothing more of him until 1871. The afternoon of 11 November, a day of cold, drizzling rain, found Gaines

> in the barn yard, looking at a colt that had been lamed. The colt made a movement as if to kick, and Mr. Gaines moving back suddenly, stepped on a nail sticking up in a plank. The nail penetrated his foot, and lock jaw ensued.

A *Covington Journal* writer completed his obituary:

> The best medical skill and the most devoted attention on the part of his family and immediate friends could not avert the dread result. Mr. Gaines was one of the oldest citizens of Boone county, and universally respected for those traits of character which mark the kind husband and father—the good citizen—the upright man.

His will left Maplewood to Elizabeth and the six children.[4]

During the war, former Kentucky governor Charles S. Morehead was arrested at Louisville and charged with treason for supporting Confederate rebels. Receiving the news, former Ohio governor Salmon Portland Chase—then serving in Washington as Lincoln's Treasury Secretary—rubbed his hands in satisfaction.[5] Another time John Jolliffe visited the white-pillared Treasury Building and found his way to the reception area outside Secretary Chase's spacious office, there for an appointment with an undersecretary. Chase stepped out to greet him,

but Jolliffe, Chase would later recall, turned aside all pleasantries with an obvious and deep-rooted "hate, for he carried matters [that is, old resentments] to that point."[6]

Jolliffe had moved to Washington, D.C., in 1862 because twenty years of antislavery lawyering had left him all but bankrupt, and the war had brought extraordinary opportunities to the nation's capital. As Union forces swept through the South, they were confiscating property, at times the lands and goods of planters still loyal to Washington. These Unionist planters, many of them former slaveholders, brought suits before the U.S. Court of Claims, later before the newly formed Southern Claims Commission. Jolliffe represented them and saw the first large fees of his career—a $31,000 attorney's bill in one case.[7] His caseload picked up during Reconstruction, and, after decades of boardinghouse life, he and Synthelia moved into a home five blocks from the White House.

On 23 March 1868 a blaze spread through Jolliffe's law offices, at 15th and F streets. Fire companies contained the blaze, and Jolliffe darted inside to salvage his papers—a complete loss, as it turned out. Overcome by smoke, he was carried semiconscious from the building and five days later died of pneumonia. In Washington, the eulogist remembered John Jolliffe as a "quiet and unostentatious" Quaker who early in his career fixed on the goal of achieving liberty and equality for slaves: "He devoted, nay he concentrated to that idea his time, his talents, his learning, his labors, and his life. His destiny has been accomplished." The *Cincinnati Gazette* ran the obituary article on its front page, next to a report on "Ku-Klux Outrages" in Alabama.[8]

We know precious little about the surviving Garners. In 1870 Robert Garner told a Cincinnati newspaper interviewer that the war's outbreak found them still at Willow Grove plantation. Their master, Judge Bonham, was an ardent Southron who had presided over Issaquena County's Democratic Party caucus that sponsored resolutions for secession. With Lincoln's election in December 1860, Bonham ushered in the county's near-unanimous vote to secede. By October 1861, he was a Confederate Army colonel commanding "928 rank & file volunteers" of the 22nd Mississippi Infantry Regiment, which he himself had raised. Among the troops was his farm overseer, twenty-eight-year-old R. G. Maxwell.[9]

After minor skirmishing in northwestern Tennessee during the early autumn of 1861, Bonham led his troops into Kentucky, south of Pa-

ducah, where they "built log cabins for Winter quarters." Dysentery and pneumonia swept through the 22nd Regiment's makeshift camp during the late autumn, and Bonham died shortly before Christmas.[10]

Willow Grove therefore must have fallen into the hands of Mary Bonham and perhaps—if they followed a pattern typical of the wartime South—a specially trusted slave. Unstable conditions, at best. Still worse were rumors of slave insurrections that shot up and down the riverside counties (Adams, Washington, and Issaquena) during the war's first year. The situation at Tennessee Landing must have been particularly threatening to whites because that area of Issaquena County was sparsely populated, with poor roads and no railheads. The best access was via the river, but by early 1862 and especially after the Confederate losses at Shiloh, in early April of that year, Union gunboats patrolled the river practically at will. Runaways were everywhere in the forests and swamps lining the river.[11]

Robert soon joined them. In his 1870 interview Robert says that he served on Union gunboats and fought at the siege of Vicksburg in 1863. Thus far no record of those activities has surfaced, and it's quite possible that Robert was one of many informal (and unrecorded) former slaves who gathered around Union camps and volunteered their labor in exchange for food and supplies. In fact, the first Colored Infantry regiments in western Mississippi weren't formed for months after the surrender of Vicksburg (on 4 July 1863), exactly when the archives yield up a tantalizing reference. A month after General Benjamin Butler commissioned the 71st Regiment of the United States Colored Infantry at Natchez, on 3 March 1864, the paymaster noted among his personnel in Company A one "Robert Gardner," a misspelling that had cropped up in some 1856 news stories about the Garners. For six months this volunteer complained that though he had "cooked for the Company since April 11 64" he had "received no pay for any part of the time," perhaps because (as it says in the last of the "Remarks" on his record), the man was never formally enlisted on the regiment's muster rolls.[12]

If this man is our Robert, as seems likely, then we can well imagine his frustration. The Army's failure to pay his wages was just one more link in a chain of white men's lies and sellouts. Finally, when he had made good his run for freedom, and even fought against Judge Bonham's old regiment at Vicksburg, they wouldn't pay his wage. Well, he didn't need "Massa Linkum's Army."

By November 1864 Robert had evidently just walked away. After the war he resettled the teenaged Tom and Sam on a small farm outside Vicksburg. What happened to Simon and Mary Garner is unknown. None of the Garners appear in the 1870 Mississippi census, suggesting they had either died or migrated. But where? By 1870 Robert Garner was living with his new wife at Cincinnati and listed in the city directory as a laborer.[13] Then he vanished in the great African-American diaspora.

Thomas Satterwhite Noble, "The Modern Medea," photographed by Mathew Brady and lithographed for reproduction in Harper's Weekly Magazine, *18 May 1867. During spring 1867, copies of the photolithograph also appeared in the* St. Louis Guardian, *the* New York Daily Standard, *and the* American Art Journal

Margaret became "The Modern Medea." In Thomas Satterwhite Noble's painting of spring 1867, the slave catchers confront her over the outstretched bodies of two boys, a departure from historical fact that the myth demanded. A youth pointing at the children, palm down, may have been intended to represent young Thomas Marshall. The bearded figure of Archibald Gaines fixes an angry stare on Margaret, while the other two men (one holding the fugitive slave warrant) avert their eyes in horror and disbelief. Without a hint of "phrenzy," Margaret glares back at Gaines in clear-eyed defiance. Noble, who had been a Lexington, Kentucky, teenager when the Garner case was front-page news,

completed "The Modern Medea" on commission for a New York collector. Evidently he intended it as one in a series of canvases on slavery themes, among them a long-lost painting, "Fugitives in Flight," that resurfaced in 1993. "Fugitives" depicts a slave family crossing the placid Ohio River on a moonlit summer's night, in a configuration that refers ironically to Emanuel Leutze's famous painting, "Washington Crossing the Delaware."[14]

These paintings indicate that in 1867 Noble, like antebellum abolitionists, still saw fugitive slaves as heroes and heroines in "the romance of our history," and Mathew Brady's widely circulated photolithograph of "The Modern Medea" certainly recalled the famous case to popular memory. But the recollection was fleeting. Frances E. W. Harper's 1874 poem, "The Slave Mother: A Tale of the Ohio," retold the story of Margaret's child-murder as an offering of profoundest mother love, the commonplace approach to the Garner case and slave infanticides in general. In Harper's 1892 novel, *Iola Leroy; or, Shadows Uplifted*, set during Reconstruction, a character speaks of the Garner case in vague terms ("that slave mother who . . . killed one of [her] children").[15] After that, the almost century-long silence was profound.

Margaret Garner's story had vanished too.

Epilogue

1. Entry for 1 June 1856, Book 2, Richwood Presbyterian Church Session Books, 1838–79.
2. The story of Gaines's lightning-struck team of horses appeared in the *Covington Journal*, 11 April 1857. News of his appointment to a two-year term as president of Boone County's chapter of the American Party appears in the *Covington Journal* of 20 June 1857, two weeks after his trial for assaulting John Jolliffe. Reports of award

winners in competitions at the Northern Kentucky Agricultural Fair were published annually in the *Covington Journal*, typically in late September. In 1860, for example, Gaines won top prizes in the categories of "Harness Mare 4 yrs and Older," "Harness Mare 2yr–3yr," and "Bullock 4 yr & Over"; see the *Covington Journal* 22 September 1860. Data on 1860 residents at Maplewood is available in *Eighth Census of the United States, 1860: Kentucky. Boone County.*

3. On the "opposition" resolutions, see the *Covington Journal* of 5 February 1859 and 8 September 1860. Menzies's run for Kentucky's Tenth District congressional seat was widely reported in the *Journal* during the summer of 1861. The enrollment of "Thos. Marshall of Boone" in the northern Kentucky Home Guards is reported in the *Journal* of 21 September 1861.
4. Weather data are from the *Cincinnati Enquirer*, 11 November 1871. See also "Archibald K. Gaines" (obituary), *Covington Journal*, 18 November 1871; and Gaines's will, filed 22 March 1872, available in Boone County (KY) Willbook I, 395.
5. Chase to Edward L. Pierce, 14 January 1863, in *The Salmon Portland Chase Papers* (microfilm edition), ed. John Niven (Frederick, MD: University Publications, 1987), Reel 30, 01011.
6. Chase to Edward L. Pierce, undated (probably late March or April 1864), in *Salmon Portland Chase Papers*, Reel 30, 00739.
7. See Elizabeth A. Jolliffe, "John Jolliffe," in *Historical, Genealogical, and Biographical Account of the Jolliffe Family of Virginia, 1652 to 1893* (Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott, 1893), 223–31. The Jolliffes' addresses (including that for John's law office) are available in *Boyd's Washington and Georgetown Directory* (Washington, DC: Hutchinson and Brothers), for the years 1863 through 1868.
8. "The Late John Jolliffe," *Cincinnati Gazette*, 10 April 1868.
9. See the "Democratic Meeting in Issaquena," *Semi-Weekly Mississippian*, 23 May 1860, and stories of Issaquena politics in the *Semi-Weekly Mississippian* of 17 October and 24 October 1860. A story on Confederate military movements in the *Semi-Weekly Mississippian* of 20 November 1861 provides some detail on movements of the 22nd Infantry, with a comment by one of his officers that "Colonel Bonham is not only a military man by education, but naturally so"—that in response to some early doubts that had arisen about his abilities. On the 22nd Infantry, see also Steward Sifakis, *Compendium of the Confederate Armies: Mississippi* (New York: Facts on File, 1995), 109–11; and Charles E. Hooker, "Mississippi," in *Confederate Military History*, Vol. 7: *Alabama and Mississippi* (Atlanta: Confederate Publishing Company, 1899).
10. These details are available from Isaac E. Hirsh, "The Life Story of Isaac E. Hirsh: Co. G, 22nd Regiment, Mississippi Infantry, C.S.A.," unpublished ms. (1911), Tennessee State Library, 35–36.
11. On the 1861–62 slave insurrections that originated at Second Creek, west of Natchez, see Winthrop Jordan, *Tumult and Silence at Second Creek: An Inquiry into a Civil War Slave Conspiracy* (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1993); on actions of Bonham's 22nd Mississippi Regiment, see Hooker, "Mississippi," in *Confederate Military History*, Vol. 7, especially Chapter 4.
12. Robert's interview with the *Cincinnati Chronicle* reporter, published as "A Reminiscence of Slavery," is available in *The Press* (Philadelphia), 18 March 1870, 2. The records for Robert Gardner, Company A, 71st Colored Infantry Regiment, are available at the National Archives; his payroll record is page 274, card numbers

7069303, 7069338, and 7069373. There was no other Robert (or Simon, or Simeon, or Sam) Garner (or Gardner, or Guarner) who served among the U.S. Colored Troops.

13. From Robert Garner's *Cincinnati Chronicle* interview: "[Robert] was in the siege of Vicksburg, and was in active service until the close of the war, when he received an honorable discharge. He subsequently married, and is now living in this city [Cincinnati]. His two boys Thomas and Samuel are living on a farm opposite Vicksburg, in Mississippi." The 1870 census of Mississippi was conducted six months after these words were published; Thomas and Samuel Garner, by then ages twenty and eighteen, do not appear in it.
14. Scholars may yet find other instances, but for now the known lithographic reproductions of Noble's "The Modern Medea" include: the *St. Louis Guardian*, 27 April 1867; the *New York Daily Standard*, 9 May 1867; *American Art Journal*, May 1867; *The Round Table*, 18 May 1867; and *Harper's Weekly Magazine*, 18 May 1867. Two years later the *Boston Herald* of 3 January 1869 also ran the picture and an accompanying story. See James D. Birchfield, Albert Boime, and William J. Hennessey, *Thomas Satterwhite Noble: 1835–1907* (Lexington: University of Kentucky Art Museum, 1987), 68. "Fugitives in Flight" was discovered in a Lexington, KY, attic, then restored and auctioned at Sotheby's in 1993. The painting is currently on permanent display at the Greenville County Museum of Art in Greenville, South Carolina. I am grateful to curator Martha Severens for sharing information about the painting.
15. "The Slave Mother: A Tale of the Ohio," in *Complete Poems of Frances E. W. Harper*, ed. Maryemma Graham (New York: Oxford University Press, 1988), 28–30. The dating of the poem is Suzanne Dietzel's, in a bibliographic survey appended to the volume (221). See also Harper's 1892 novel, *Iola Leroy; or, Shadows Uplifted* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1988), 98.

MODERN MEDEA

A Family Story of Slavery and Child-Murder from the Old South

STEVEN WEISENBURGER

HILL AND WANG

A division of Farrar, Straus and Giroux

1999