

Notes

Chapter 8

“‘Tis All in Peeeces, All Cohaerence Gone”

- 1 Goethe (1962), v. 6240-6256, p. 334: Mephistopheles: “Und hättest du den Ozean durchgeschwommen,/ Das Grenzenlose dort geschaut,/ So sähst du dort doch Well auf Welle kommen,/ Selbst wenn es dir vorm Untergange graut./ Du sähst doch etwas! Sähest wohl in der Grüne/ Gestillter Meere streichende Delphine,/ Sähest Wolken ziehen, Sonne, Mond und Sterne;/ Nichts wirst du sehen in ewig leerer Ferne,/ Den Schritt nicht hören, den du tust,/ Nichts Festes finden, wo du ruhst.”/ Faust: “[...] In deinem Nichts hoff ich das All zu/ finden.” English translation from Goethe (1976).
- 2 Here cited from Harrison and Wood (1998), p. 421.
- 3 Spengler (1972), pp. 238-39. English translations from Spengler (1971), p. 186.
- 4 Hegel (1988), especially pp. 57-156; Hegel (1970), especially vol. II, pp. 351-74 and vol. III, pp. 11-83.
- 5 Hegel (1970), vol. III, pp. 25. English translation from Hegel (1999), vol. 3, p. 232.
- 6 Piaget and Inhelder (1956), pp. 301ff.
- 7 Gablik (1976), pp. 40-47, pp. 66ff. and 80ff.; Blatt (1984), pp. 97, 235-36 and 333-34.
- 8 *Ibid.*, pp. 202, 216 and 231-41.
- 9 Blatt (1984), p. 362.
- 10 Cf., for example, Hayles (1999). For an account of the situation of art at this stage, see Wamberg (1999a).
- 11 *Commentary on Genesis*, introduction (Migne, *Patrologia Latina*, 156, col. 27B), cited in Morris (1972), p. 67. For this section, see also *ibid.*, pp. 64-95.
- 12 On self-exposition as Faustian phenomenon, see also Spengler (1972), pp. 330-40.
- 13 Morris (1972), pp. 64-65.
- 14 Panofsky (1951), pp. 12-16; Nardi (1966), p. 22.
- 15 Panofsky (1951), pp. 16-17. Antal (1924/25), pp. 209-39, also maintains that late medieval Italian culture – painting, poetry, philosophy, religion – springs from a subjectivism oscillating between realism and fervour, i.e. again the extremes of nominalism.

- 16 Panofsky (1951), pp. 18-19.
- 17 Described in the discourse *De possess* (1460), see Cusano (1965ff.).
- 18 “De sapientia”, from *Idiota* (1440-50), I-II, *ibid.*, p. 68.
- 19 *Ibid.*, p. 76.
- 20 Cassirer (1927), p. 23.
- 21 René Descartes, “Discourse on the Method of Rightly Conducting the Reason and Seeking Truth in the Sciences” [1637] (trl. J. Veitch), in *The Rationalists* (1960), pp. 63 (on cogito) and 45, 47, 68 and 92 (on experience).
- 22 Merchant (1980).
- 23 On this God’s lack of fixed place in the Reformation, see Weber (1920), pp. 94-95 and 114. Calvin stated, for example, that miracles occurred in early Christian times in order to spread Christianity, but that God no longer intervened in the material world; see Sheldrake (1990), p. 20.
- 24 For an empirically-based account of this argument, see Moxey (1977).
- 25 Merchant (1980), p. 171.
- 26 Descartes (1960), p. 80; Sheldrake (1990), p. 41.
- 27 On the limitations of the geometric understanding of the world, see Kojève (1980), p. 128.
- 28 Ritter (1989), pp. 155-56.
- 29 *Ibid.*, p. 153: “wie sie sich im Inneren der Menschen abspiegelt [...]” and “das Gefühl und die dichterisch gestimmte Einbildungskraft”.
- 30 Kant (1974), especially §§ 23-24, pp. 164-69.
- 31 Merleau-Ponty (1964), pp. 37, 57 and 72-74; Lacan (1994), pp. 93-97.
- 32 Toulmin and Goodfield (1965), pp. 80, 101-03 and 143-47.
- 33 On this issue, see Cassirer (1927), p. 45.
- 34 See also Cosgrove (1998), p. 17.
- 35 *Trattato della pittura* 1, 42 (f. 12), see Leonardo (1956): “Che ti move, o homo, ad abbandonare le proprie tue habitationi della cita e lasciare li parenti et amici et andare in lochi campestri per monti e ualli, se non la naturale bellezza del mondo la quale se ben consideri sol con senso del vedere fruisci?”
- 36 Ritter (1989), pp. 150-51: “Landschaft ist Natur, die im Anblick für einen fühlenden und empfindenden Betrachter ästhetisch gegenwärtig ist: Nicht die Felder vor der Stadt, der Strom als ‘Grenze’, ‘Handelsweg’ und ‘Problem für Brückenbauer’, nicht die Gebirge und die Steppen der Hirten und Karawanen (oder der Ölsucher) sind als solche schon ‘Landschaft’. Sie werden dies erst, wenn sich der Mensch ihnen ohne praktischen Zweck in ‘freier’ genießender Anschauung zuwendet, um als er selbst in der Natur zu sein.” On the beholder’s significance for the spiritualisation of the landscape, see also Spengler (1972), p. 369.
- 37 Mitchell (1994), p. 15, also stresses freedom from economic-utilitarian purposes as crucial for the landscape’s *modus operandi*.
- 38 See also Cosgrove (1998), pp. 18-20.
- 39 Reported in conversation with Joachim Gasquet (c. 1900), cited in Busch (1997), p. 322.

- 40 Le Roy Ladurie (1975), pp. 446 and 432. The conclusion about the villagers' lack of distance to nature is made in Fechner (1986), pp. 74-75 and 180-81.
- 41 *Études sur Leonardo da Vinci*, I, I, p. 56; *Les origines de la statique*, I, II, p. 156, cited in Jaki (1984), pp. 386 (citation) and 390.
- 42 Blatt (1984), pp. 275-89, notes this connection as well and provides an excellent description of the emergence of the modern world picture, based particularly on Koyré (1957), who can also serve as substantiation for the following.
- 43 Toulmin and Goodfield (1960), pp. 154-60.
- 44 "Deus est sphaera infinita cuius centrum est ubique et circumferentia nusquam." On the use of the phrase in the Late Middle Ages, especially in Neoplatonic circles after its initial appearance in *Liber XXIV philosophorum*, propositio II, see Wind (1958), p. 183. The 14th-century debate about the void and infinity was explored by Koyré in 1949; an account of his study is found in Edgerton (1975), pp. 19-20.
- 45 Koyré (1957), p. 17. Citation from *De docta ignorantia*, 2, 12. Spengler (1972), p. 95, sees Nicholas of Cusa's concept of an infinite God as the germ of infinitesimal arithmetic.
- 46 Cassirer (1927), p. 26.
- 47 On John Philoponus: Duhem (1913-59), vol. 1 (1913), pp. 317 and 374-87; on Buridan: *ibid.*, vol. 8 (1958), pp. 200-214; also, Toulmin and Goodfield (1960), pp. 221-23.
- 48 An object not acted upon by a force will either be at rest or moving at a constant velocity along a linear path.
- 49 Net force = mass x acceleration.
- 50 "Un jour, à la dernière page du livre des *Principes*, Newton écrira: 'Par la force de la gravité, j'ai rendu compte des phénomènes qu'offrent les cieux et de ceux que présente notre mer - *Hactenus phaenomena caelorum et mari nostri per vim gravitatis exposui.*' Ce jour-là, il annoncera le plein épanouissement d'une fleur dont Jean Buridan avait semé la graine. Et le jour où cette graine fut semée est, peut-on dire, celui où naquit la Science moderne." Duhem (1913-59), vol. 8 (1958), p. 340. See also Jaki (1984), p. 429, and *idem* (1990), p. 39.
- 51 Duhem (1913-59), vol. 1 (1913), p. 317.
- 52 Clagett (1968), p. 12 (Latin); Kuhn (1985), pp. 115-18 (with English translation); Toulmin and Goodfield (1960), pp. 164-68.
- 53 On precursors in Oxford, see Schmitt (1988), p. 592. On Oresme's system of co-ordinates, see Clagett (1968), particularly pp. 34-35, 56, 64 and 271 (II, 1).
- 54 Duhem, vol. 7 (1956), pp. 6-7. The Islamic commentators otherwise chiefly believed in an infinity reserved God, see Cohn (1960), p. 69.
- 55 On the infinitely large and the infinitely small in the 14th century, see Duhem, vol. 7 (1956), pp. 3-157.
- 56 Panofsky (1991), p. 65.
- 57 "De sapientia" from *Idiota*, Cusano (1965ff.), p. 82.
- 58 Koyré (1957), pp. 14-15 and 20, citation from *De docta ignorantia*, 2, 12.

- 59 Leonardo (1939), No. 886 (Windsor, Royal Library, ms W., f. 12669a (1489-1506)): "Il sole non si move". *Ibid.*, No. 858 (Paris, Institut de France, ms F., f. 41v (c. 1508)): "Come la terra non è nel mezzo del cerchio del sole, nè nel mezzo del mondo, ma è ben nel mezzo de'sua elementi, compagni e uniti con lei, e chi stesse nella luna, quand'ella insieme col sole è sotto a noi, questa nostra terra coll'elemento dell'acqua parrebbe e farebbe ofito tal qual fa la luna a noi." (Cf. also *ibid.*, Nos. 893 and 898.) In Leonardo (1939), Nos. 945 and 1218, the earth is compared to a machine: "Questo corpo della terra, questa machina" (945).
- 60 For this and the following: Koyré (1957), pp. 28-35.
- 61 *Ibid.*, pp. 35-36, 39, 52, 96 and 275-76.
- 62 Cited in *ibid.*, p. 43.
- 63 Berman (1983), pp. 87-98.
- 64 Donne (1994), p. 177.
- 65 Kant (1974), § 25, pp. 171-72.
- 66 Serres (1989), pp. 37-40, 97 and 105-06.
- 67 Panofsky (1991), p. 65.
- 68 Hubert Damisch's title for his book (1987), *L'Origine de la perspective*, is not exactly a correct description of the subject matter; Kubovy (1986).
- 69 Edgerton (1975), pp. 64-78. With particular reference to Giotto's frescoes in the Arena Chapel in Padua, this connection is also stressed by Blatt (1994), pp. 365-93. It appears to me, however, that Blatt (pp. 383-84) exaggerates the potential of infinity in the frescoes' azure skies, which are called more illusionistic than the ostensibly more traditional gold grounds. As shown in chapter 3, the two grounds are, if anything, equivalent in terms of significance; and the blue, as mentioned in chapter 3 too, is a requirement of fresco painting, which cannot bind gold.
- 70 Edgerton (1975), pp. 64-78.
- 71 See Hammond (1981), pp. 1-9. In *Problems* Aristotle already refers to how solar eclipses cast imprints through holes in leaves, strainers, crossed fingers and baskets but, characteristically, he does not indicate any systematic utilisation of this screening effect in antiquity.
- 72 In pre-1500 late medieval literature we can find more than 200 titles dealing with the mirror. See Grabes (1973), pp. 21 and 25-32. On the significance of mirroring, see also Jay (1993), pp. 31-33 and 37-38.
- 73 Panofsky (1946), "De administratione" XXIX, p. 53, and XXXIV, p. 77.
- 74 *Ibid.*, "De administratione" XXVIII, p. 51, and XXXIII, p. 65: "[...] videor videre me quasi sub aliqua extranea orbis terrarum plaga, quæ nec tota sit in terrarum fæce nec tota in coeli puritate." See also Gage (1993), pp. 69-71.
- 75 Cited in Schöne (1954), p. 78. Of Konrad: "[...] fenestris etiam et pictura auro rutilante parietes afine usque ad finem opere mirabili ornavit." Of Egbert: "[...] qui primus tecta ecclesie plumbo stabilivit et parietes templi vitreis illuminavit."
- 76 Spengler (1972), p. 257. English translation from Spengler (1971), p. 199.
- 77 Alberti (1975), I, p. 48.

- 78 *Della pittura*, I.
- 79 Leonardo (1956), I, 34 (f. 16): "Questo è finestra dell'human corpo per la quale l'anima [in ms: la sua via] specula e fruisce la bellezza del mondo, per questo l'anima si contenta della humano carcere, e senza questo essa humana carcere è suo tormento."
- 80 See Cosgrove (1998), p. 27.
- 81 Manetti (1970), pp. 42-47. See also Edgerton (1975), pp. 61-63 and 124-52, and Kubovy (1986), pp. 32-38, with discussion of earlier literature. Kubovy is of the opinion that Brunelleschi used an intuitively rather than a rigorously construed perspective, but does not ask where, if this is the case, Masaccio learnt his construction.
- 82 Manetti (1970), pp. 43 and 45: "[...] e per quanto s'aveva a dimostrare di cielo, coe che le muraglie del dipinto stanpassono nella aria, messo d'ariento brunito, acciaio che l'aria e cieli naturali vi si specchiassono drento e cosi e nugoli, che di vegono in quello ariente essere menati dal vento, qandetrae [...]."
- 83 Damisch (1972), p. 171: "[...] d'emblème [...] épistémologique, dans la mesure où il révèle les limitations du code perspectif [...]. Il fait apparaître la perspective comme une structure d'exclusion, dont la cohérence se fonde sur une série de refus, et qui doit cependant faire place, comme au fond sur lequel elle s'emprime, à cela même qu'elle exclut de son ordre." English translation from Damisch (2002), p. 124.
- 84 Panofsky (1991), pp. 60-61.
- 85 Alpers (1983).
- 86 Panofsky (1991), pp. 68-69 and n. 71, pp. 151-53.
- 87 Alpers (1983), pp. 51-59.
- 88 Panofsky (1960), p. 126.
- 89 Spengler (1972), p. 357, notes the connection and expands it with three other Faustian discoveries: circulation of the blood (the 'inner' continent), gunpowder (long-distance weapons) and printing (long-distance type).
- 90 Hale (1968), pp. 19-20; Harvey (1991), pp. 51 and 68.
- 91 Hale (1968), p. 9.
- 92 Harvey (1991), p. 54.
- 93 *Ibid.*, pp. 39, 45, 48 and 71.
- 94 2nd edition of *Conditiones terrae sanctae* (1306-09). See Harvey (1980).
- 95 Harvey (1991), pp. 16 and 51. The regional maps appeared in series of 26 or 64.
- 96 On the innovative aspect of Ptolemy's geographical co-ordinates, their conversion into a visual grid and this grid's reception in Florence around 1400, see Edgerton (1975), pp. 91-123; also, Harvey (1991), p. 45.
- 97 *Ibid.*, p. 60. We know of this map from two later copies, one a manuscript, the other printed.
- 98 Hale (1968), p. 19.
- 99 Cited in Edgerton (1975), pp. 121-22.
- 100 Ovid, *Metamorphoses*, I, 132; Tibullus, *Elegies*, I, 3, 39-30 (cited in Lovejoy and Boas (1935), p. 59).

- 101 Edgerton (1975), pp. 113-20. Blatt (1984), pp. 216-17, n. 19, similarly notes the connection between the developments of cartography and those of perspective. See also, Jay (1993), p. 63.
- 102 Despite an aversion to evolutionary thinking, Mitchell observes the contemporaneity of imperialism and the category 'landscape' in such different cultures as China, Japan, Rome, 17th-century Netherlands and France, and 18th-19th-century Britain (Mitchell (1994), pp. 9-10 and 17). See also Cosgrove (1998), p. 20.
- 103 Leonardo (1956), I, 34.
- 104 Galassi (1981).
- 105 *Ibid.*, figs. 8-9.
- 106 Würtemberger (1958), p. 66.
- 107 See Rose (1992), no. 22.
- 108 Le Goff (1977), p. 75.
- 109 Schöne (1954), pp. 169 and 215.
- 110 Petrarca (1970), 4, I, pp. 483-501. Dotti cites, p. 649, G. Billanovitch for the claim that the letter must, for many reasons, be fictive and not written until 1352 or 1353, when Petrarch edited the 4th book of *Le familiari*. Recently, some scholars have even questioned whether the ascent took place at all and, supposing it did, if it happened in 1336 (see Busch (1997), pp. 62-63). In my opinion, the ascent would seem probable, albeit Petrarch has undoubtedly manipulated the details. See also Schama (1995), pp. 419-21.
- 111 *Ab urbe condita*, 40, 21, 2. Compare also with Apollonius Rhodius, *Argonautica* (I, 1112), in which Jason and his entourage ascend Mount Dindymon on the southern coast of the Sea of Marmara: "And to them the Macrian heights and all the coast of Thrace opposite appeared to view close at hand. And there appeared the misty mouth of Bosporus and the Mysian hills; and on the other side the stream of the river Aesepus and the city and Nepeian plain of Adrasteia."
- 112 4, I, 13, Petrarca (1970), p. 489: "Equidem vita, quam beatam dicimus, celso loco sita est; arcta, ut aiunt, ad illam ducit via." English translations from Petrarca (1975-85), vol. I, pp. 172 and 175.
- 113 *Confessions*, 10, 8, 15.
- 114 4, I, 34, Petrarca (1970), p. 499: "O quanto studio laborandum esset, non ut altiozem terram, sed ut elatos terrenis impulsibus appetitus sub pedibus haberemus!" Translation from Petrarca (1975-85), vol. I, p. 179.
- 115 Fabricius Hansen (1996), pp. 87-89 and 102; Fabricius Hansen (1999), pp. 170-72.
- 116 See, for example, Pietro Lorenzetti, *Birth of the Virgin* (1342), Siena, Museo dell'Opera del Duomo, reproduced in Smart (1978), ill. 117; Barna da Siena, *Betrayal of Judas* (c. 1381 or earlier), San Gimignano, Collegiata, reproduced in *ibid.*, ill. 136.
- 117 I am grateful to Maria Fabricius Hansen for these important observations.

Chapter 9

Pressure and Counter-Pressure

- 1 Burckhardt (1926).
- 2 Panofsky (1960), pp. 19, 30 (with citation), 36-37 and 165.
- 3 Spengler (1972), pp. 277-78, 290, 300-308 and 330-66. Citation pp. 300-301: "Die Renaissance bemächtigte sich einiger Künste des Bildes und Wortes, und damit war alles getan. Sie hat die Denkweise Westeuropas, das Lebensgefühl in nichts verändert. Sie drang bis zum Kostüm und zur Gebärde vor, nicht bis zu den Wurzeln des Daseins, denn die Weltanschauung des Barock ist selbst in Italien dem inneren Wesen nach eine Vorsetzung der Gotik." English translation from Spengler (1971), p. 233.
- 4 Baron (1955), pp. 251-52.
- 5 See, for example, Villari (1905), pp. vi, 2-11 and 34. Cf. also Cosgrove (1998), p. 82.
- 6 See, in particular, Villari (1888), especially vol. I, pp. 38-49, 297-305, and vol. II, pp. 418ff.; Baron (1955), p. 251.
- 7 Russell (1946), pp. 521 and 525. Even so sober-minded a Renaissance scholar as Paul Oskar Kristeller has to note: "In the history of philosophy, the period of the Renaissance must be considered as an age of transition and of fermentation rather than one of synthesis or lasting achievement." See Kristeller (1984), p. 30.
- 8 Cassirer (1927), pp. 7, 10, 45 and 49-50.
- 9 Here cited from Jaki (1984), p. 423.
- 10 Spengler (1972), pp. 216, 234 and 236.
- 11 Riegl (1931), especially pp. 7-22.
- 12 Alpers (1983), pp. xix-xxv.
- 13 On the academic genre hierarchy, see Pevsner (1940), pp. 94-95.
- 14 Hegel (1970), vol. II, pp. 140 and 139: "Eben deshalb aber läßt die romantische Kunst die Äußerlichkeit sich nun auch ihrerseits wieder frei für sich ergehen und erlaubt in dieser Rücksicht *allem und jedem Stoff*, bis auf Blumen, Bäume und *gewöhnlichste Hausgeräte* herunter, auch in der *natürlichen Zufälligkeit des Daseins ungehindert* in die Darstellung einzustreten." [my italics] And: "den markierten Zügen des Unschönen einen ungeschmälernten Spielraum." English translations from Hegel (1999), vol. II, pp. 295 and 294.
- 15 Hegel (1970), vol. II, pp. 137-38, 145, 364 and 373; vol. III, pp. 25 and 40.
- 16 *Ibid.*, vol. III, p. 125. Translation from Hegel (1999), vol. III, p. 331.
- 17 See Jauss (1968), pp. 143-68, especially p. 168. I am grateful to Joseph Koerner for drawing my attention to this article.
- 18 Spengler (1972), p. 37: "Es ist ein ehrwürdiges Vorurteil, das wir endlich überwinden sollten, daß die Antike uns innerlich nahesteht, weil wir vermeintlich ihre Schüler und Nachkommen, weil wir tatsächlich ihre Anbeter gewesen sind. Die ganze religionsphilosophische, kunsthistorische,

- sozialkritische Arbeit des 19. Jahrhunderts war nötig [...] um uns endlich fühlen zu lassen, wie unermesslich fremd und fern das alles innerlich ist [...].” Translation from Spengler (1971), p. 27.
- 19 The most comprehensive and thoughtful discussion of this issue that I have read is in the section “Antique (Ancient)/Modern” in Le Goff (1992), pp. 21-50.
- 20 See “modus” in Ernout and Meillet (1967), pp. 408-09.
- 21 *Variae* (finished c. 537), 4, 51, 2; Freund (1957), p. 32. See also *ibid.* pp. 23-40 and III. “Modernus” appears for the first time in writings by Gelasius, 494-95 AD. A synod of 494 issued a ban on giving clerical positions to men who had been born as slaves. When this ban was not adhered to, Gelasius wrote twice to the bishops requesting them to accept the modern rules as opposed to the old rules (“modernus” as opposed to “antiquus”), see Freund (1957), pp. 4-5.
- 22 Le Goff (1992), pp. 27-29.
- 23 De Beer (1948), p. 153.
- 24 Manetti (1887), pp. 103-04; Frankl (1960), p. 255; letter to Leo X, cited in Rowland (1994), p. 101: “Pur, questa architectura ebbe qualche ragione. Però che naque dalli arbori non anchor tagliati, delli quali, piegati li rami e rilegati insieme, fanno li lor terzi acuti.” In this letter it is also claimed that Italy with its glorious past “[...] in vero è patria universale di tutti li cristiani [...]” (*ibid.*, p. 100). On bowers, see for example Vitruvius, *De architectura*, 2, 1, 2-3.
- 25 Filarete (1972), 13, p. 380: “Ancora a me solevano piacere questi moderni, ma poi, ch'io commenciai a gustare questi antichi, mi sone venuti in odio quelli moderni.” English translation from Filarete (1965), p. 175.
- 26 Vasari (1966-87), vol. II, p. 97; vol. III, p. 18 and vol. IV, p. 4. See also Panofsky (1960), pp. 34-35.
- 27 Ghiberti (1912), II, 1.
- 28 Sulzer (1792), p. 434: “Die Mahler vor diesem Zeitpunkt zeichneten nach einem Ideal, das nicht eine erhöhte Natur war, wie das Ideal der Griechen, sondern eine in Verhältniss und Bewegung verdorbene Natur.” See also “Gotik” (1910), in Schlosser (1927), p. 289.
- 29 Wood (1993), p. 59.
- 30 *Ibid.*, p. 65.
- 31 Alpers (1983).
- 32 *Poetics*, 23, 1, 1459a.
- 33 Württenberger (1958), p. 29. Jay (1993), pp. 51-53, also draws attention to the perspectival space's anti-narrative tendencies and sees very precisely, p. 61, note 129, a zone of conflict in Alpers' idea of the alliance linear perspective/narration.
- 34 Kant (1974), §14, p. 142: “Selbst was man Zieraten (*parerga*) nennt, d.i. dasjenige, was nicht in die ganze Vorstellung des Gegenstandes als Bastandstück innerlich, sondern nur äußerlich als Zutat gehört und das Wohlgefallen des Geschmacks vergrößert, tut dieses doch auch nur durch seinen Form: wie Einfassungen der Gemälde, oder Gewänder an Statuen, oder Säulengänge um Prachtgebäude. Besteht aber der Zierat nicht selbst in der schönen Form, ist er, wie der goldene Rahmen, bloß um durch seinen Reiz das Gemälde dem Beifall zu empfehlen angebracht: so heißt

- er alsdann Schmuck, und tut der echte Schönheit Abbruch." English translation from Kant (2000), pp. 110-11. See also Derrida's comments to this in Derrida (1987), pp. 53ff.
- 35 Wood (1993), p. 60.
- 36 Colonna (1964), p. d.iii: "cum gli exquisiti parergi, Acque, fonti, monti, colli, boscheti, animali [...]." English translation from Colonna (1999), p. 61. See also Gombrich (1966), p. 149.
- 37 Cited in Gombrich (1966), p. 151, n. 33: "Doxi autem Ferrariensis urbanum probatur ingenium cum in justis operibus, tum maxime in illis, quae parerga vocantur. Amoena namque picturae diverticula voluptario labore consecratus, praeuptas cautes, viventia nemora, opacas perfluentium ripas, florentes rei rusticae apparatus, agricolarum laetos fervidosque labores, praeterea longissimos terrarum marisque prospectus, classes, aucupia, venationes et cuncta id genus spectatu oculis jucunda, luxurianti ac festiva manu exprimere consuevit." Translation from *ibid.*, pp. 113-14.
- 38 Blount (1969). See also Blount's article on "Parergy, Parergon or Parergum": "[...] an addition or access; a thing put unto, though no part of the matter, any thing that is besides the principal question, point, or purpose in hand."
- 39 Burckhardt (1860), vol. III, p. 796: "Als Gabe des Himmels besaß [die Italienern] [...] den Takt, die äußere Wirklichkeit nicht in alles Detail hinein, sondern nur soweit zu verfolgen, daß die höhere poetische Wahrheit nicht darunter lit."
- 40 Cited in Panofsky (1953), p. 2, and n. 4, p. 361 (whole text in Latin). Attribution to Rogier van der Weyden comes from Bartolomeo Fazio's reference to the painting in *De viris illustribus* (1456); see Baxandall (1971), p. 108.
- 41 Cited in *ibid.*, pp. 107 and 166 (Latin).
- 42 For this and the following, see Olwig (1996), pp. 630-33 and notes 2, 5, 9 and 10, pp. 645-46.
- 43 *Ibid.*, p. 633.
- 44 Wood (1993), p. 42; Fechner (1986), p. 21. In two letters of 1508-09 to his customer, Jakob Heller, Dürer refers routinely to the landscapes in two religious pictures (Wood (1993), p. 42).
- 45 In, respectively, *Della pittura* (1436) and *De re aedificatoria* (c. 1450), chapters 10-11; see Alberti (1966).
- 46 Leonardo: notebook G, f. 11v, Paris, Institut de France, cited in Leonardo (1939), no. 460: "Il vero modo da pratico nel figurare le ca[m]pagne o vo' dire paesi colle sua piante [...]." Pinturicchio's contract with Santa Maria de' Fossi in Perugia, cited in Baxandall (1972), p. 17.
- 47 By Marcantonio Michiel. See Frimmel (1888), p. 106: "El paesetto in tela cun la tempesta [...]."
- 48 One of the first examples of the use of the word in an art context appears in a letter sent from Lüttich (Liège) by Domenicus Lampsonius to Vasari in 1564: "[...] a dipigner' cose piu incerte, che ricercano la mano piu esercitata e sicura, quali sono paesaggi, alberi, acque, nuvole, splendori, fuochj ec." See Frey and Frey (1930), pp. 114-15, no. CDLXVII.
- 49 According to Osswald (1977), p. 135, the German term *Landschaft* is also the subject of broader usage than either the Italian *paesaggio* or the French *paysage*, as it overlaps the meaning of, respectively, *campagna* and *campagne*.
- 50 Wood (1993), pp. 38-39.
- 51 See also *ibid.*, p. 37.

- 52 For an informative survey of this genre, see Gibson (1989).
- 53 Cited in Fechner (1986), p. 22.
- 54 Gombrich (1966), p. 109. Michiel also refers to some works from Cardinal Grimani's collection as: "le molte tavolette de paesi per la maggior parte sono de mano de Alberto de Holanda." Frimmel (1888), p. 102, cited in *ibid.*, p. 109. Gombrich's idea that Italian Renaissance theoreticians were conducive to the development of the Northern landscape image is otherwise sparsely documented and seems to have been instigated by the notion of Renaissance modernity.
- 55 See also Giulio's pen drawing of a landscape with a watermill (reproduced in Martineau and Hope (1984), p. 252), in which the open space plays an even bigger role.
- 56 For a more topographical branch of this school, see, for example, Bamberg Master, *View of the Imperial and Episcopal Palace in Bamberg*, before 1487, pen and watercolour on paper, Berlin, Kupferstichkabinett, reproduced in Wood (1993), ill. 148.
- 57 See Fischer (1989).
- 58 See Wood (1993), ills. 1, 99-103 and 171-79.
- 59 *Ibid.*, ills. 1, 101-02 and 171-79. Strangely, Wood does not reflect on the reluctance in terms of materials.
- 60 *Italienische Reise*, May 13 1787: "[...] daß die Einbildungskraft aller Menchen durchaus Gegenstände, wenn sie solche bedeutend vorstellen will, höher als breiter imaginiert und dadurch dem Bilde mehr Charakter, Ernst und Würde verschafft. [...] Einbildung und Gegenwart verhalten sich wie Poesie und Prosa, jene wird die Gegenstände mächtig und Steil denken, diese sich immer in die Fläche verbreiten. Landschaftsmaler des sechzehnten Jahrhunderts gegen die unsrigen gehalten, geben das auffallendste Beispiel. Eine Zeichnung von Jodocus Momper, neben einen kniepschen Contour würden den ganzen Kontrast sichtbar machen." See Goethe (1992), p. 384. English translation from Goethe (1989), p. 249.
- 61 Wood (1993), p. 40.
- 62 *Ibid.*, pp. 36 and 105.
- 63 See documentation in Brown (1986), especially pp. 132ff.
- 64 Wölfflin (1963), pp. 273-74: "Was für romanische Empfindung so charakteristisch ist, die gegliederte Schönheit, das durchsichtige System mit klar gesonderten Teilen, ist der deutschen Kunst als Ideal zwar nicht unbekannt, aber alsbald sucht der Gedanke das Eine und Allesfüllende, wo die Systematik aufgehoben und die Selbständigkeit des Teils im ganzen untergegangen ist. [...] Und eben darin liegen auch die Voraussetzungen der nordischen Landschaftsmalerei. Man sieht nicht Baum und Hügel und Wolke für sich, sondern alles ist aufgenommen in den Atemzug der einen grossen Natur." English translation, slightly revised, from Wölfflin (1950), pp. 235-36.
- 65 Many of the ideas in this and the following section were introduced in Wamberg (1993), pp. 173-211.
- 66 Some of the first post-antique plant representations based on empirical observation are found in 13th-century British and French cathedral sculptures, for example Southwell; see Pevsner (1945).
- 67 Spengler (1972), pp. 92 and 508-09.
- 68 Panofsky (1991), pp. 53-54.

- 69 *Ansichten vom Niederrhein*, cited in Frankl (1960), p. 445: "In ungeheurer Länge stehen die Gruppen schlanker Säulen da, wie die Bäume eines uralten Forstes; nur am höchsten Gipfel sind sie in eine Krone von Ästen gespalten, die sich mit ihrem Nachbar im spitzen Bogen wölbt und den Auge das ihnen folgen will, fast unerreichbar ist. Läßt sich auch schon das *Unermeßliche* des Weltalls nicht in beschränktem Raum versinnlichen, so liegt gleichwohl in diesem kühnen Emporstreben der Pfeiler und Mauern das Unaufhaltsame, welches die Einbildungskraft so leicht in das *Grenzenlose* verlängert." [Forster's italics]
- 70 Burke (1759), *passim*.
- 71 English translation from Schiller (1966), p. 214.
- 72 Frankl (1960), pp. 439-46. Milner states his opinions in *Essays on Gothic Architecture by the Rev. T. Warton, Rev. J. Bentham, Captain Grose and the Rev. J. Milner*, London, 1800. Panofsky (1991), pp. 53-54, also remarks on the fundamentally unlimited aspect of the serial repetition in Gothic bays.
- 73 Goethe, *Über Baukunst*, cited in Schlosser (1927), p. 291.
- 74 Filarete (1972), XIII, p. 382. English translation from Filarete (1965), p. 176.
- 75 Cited in Rowland (1994), Appendix 1, p. 101: "E li tedeschi, la maniera delli quali in molti luochi ancor dura, spesso per ornamento pongono un qualche figurino ranichiato e mal fatto et peggio inteso per mensola, a sostenere un travo, et altri strani animali e figure et fogliami fuor d'ogni ragione." Rowland, who establishes Colocci as the letterwriter, reproduces the letter with philological accuracy.
- 76 Vasari (1966-87), vol. I, p. 367: "E così per tutte le facce et altri lore ornamenti facevano una maledizione di tabernacolini l'una sopra l'altro, con tante piramidi e punte e foglie, che, non ch'elle possano stare, pare impossibile ch'elle si possano reggere, et hanno più il modo da parer fatte di carta che di pietre o di marmi."
- 77 In *Le vite de' pittori*, cited in de Beer (1948), p. 153.
- 78 "Ordine Gottico" in *Vocabulario toscano dell'arte del disegno*, Florence 1681, p. 113: "un'infinità di piccoli tabernacoli" (cited in Schlosser (1927), p. 288) and "sottilissime colonne, e smisuramente lunghe, auuolte, e in più modi snaturate [...]" (cited in Frankl (1960), p. 343). Baldinucci's judgement is echoed in the classically-oriented Jean-François Félibien des Avaux (1658-1733), the man behind the academic genre hierarchy in France. The foreword to Félibien's collection of biographies of major architects (1687) claims that at least the Late Gothic period, influenced as it was by *délicatesse*, was overwhelmed "dans l'amas confus d'une multitude infinie d'ornements et dans une hardiesse de travail démesurée." (See *ibid.*)
- 79 De Hollanda (1899), pp. 28-29: "A pintura de Frandes, respondeu devagar o pintor, satisfará, senhora, geralmente a qualquer devoto, mais que nenhuma de Italia, que lhe nunca fará chorar uma só lagrima, e a de Frandes muitas; isto não polo vigor e bondade d'aquela pintura, mas pola bondade d'aquela tal devoto. A molheres parecerá bem, principalmente ás muito velhas, ou ás muito moças, e assi mesmo a fradres e a freiras, e a alguns fidalgos desmusicos da verdadeira harmonia. Pintam em Frandes propriamente pera enganar a vista exterior, ou cousas que vos alegrem ou de que não possaes dizer mal, assi como santos e profetas. O seu pintar é trapos, maçonarias, verduras de

- campos, sombras d'árvores, e rios e pontes, e que chamam paisagens, e muitas figuras para cá e muitas para acolá. E tudo isto inda que pareça bem a alguns olhos, na verdade é feito sem razão nem arte, sem symetria nem proporção, sem advertencia d'escoller nem despejo, e finalmente sem nenhuma sustancia nem nervo.”
- 80 Burke (1759), pp. 51-54 and 58-59.
- 81 Kant (1974), §§23-29, pp. 164-207, citation §25, p. 171: “Erhaben is das, mit welchem in Vergleichung alles andere klein ist.” English translation from Kant (2000), p. 134.
- 82 I first presented the following ideas at Joseph Leo Koerner’s session on “The Abject in Art History”, College Art Association Conference in Boston, February 1996.
- 83 Kristeva (1982), pp. 11-12.
- 84 Berenson (1897), p. 47.
- 85 Panofsky (1946), p. 30. See also the Danish 19th-century art historian Julius Lange, in Lange (1900), pp. 1-9, in which he notes the well-balanced human body in the art of antiquity and contrasts this with the body in the art of modernity, which fluctuates unstably between the ‘starved’ and the bombastic: “In the one case man conceives of himself in his nothingness in relation to an infinity which lies outside of him; in the other case he gathers the idea of infinity in himself, grows and swells, as if in a feeling of his infinite right and claim. The first is Christianity, the other, for the time being, a titanic humanism; but both parts are equally alien to antiquity which conceives not at all of the human being in relation to the idea of anything infinite, but in relation to the human society in which he lives.” (*Ibid.*, p. 6.)
- 86 The former pairs reproduced in White (1979), ills. 11-12 and 31-32.
- 87 Antal (1947); Burke (1986), pp. 34-36.
- 88 The prejudices are even repeated in Jack M. Greenstein’s otherwise intriguing and well-documented reinterpretation of Alberti’s *De pictura*: Masaccio as the modern visual man, Gentile as the medieval craftsman (Greenstein (1997), pp. 693-96). Greenstein short-circuits again from Gentile’s selective use of ornamentation to the *whole* image plane, at the same time as he overestimates the innovation in Masaccio’s focus on the external surfaces of bodies in preference to ostensibly, more archaically, bodies in their totality (see later in the present chapter). What he overlooks is, firstly, that these surfaces are indeed used to outline monumental, statuesque bodies and not how the surfaces interplay with space and atmosphere. Secondly, and more gravely, he passes over the more radically modern concept that the image has no need to deal with well-defined surfaces, but could be aimed at more amorphous phenomena such as gravel, mist, night sky, refraction of light in the atmosphere – in short, a number of the phenomena depicted by Gentile.
- 89 As Spengler regards the Renaissance to be a surface phenomenon, he does not have a determined eye for the conflicts in Italian pictorial art of the time, which he claims to be fundamentally controlled by a Gothic, expansive space (especially Spengler (1972), pp. 330-66). Nonetheless, he is clear about the orientation of this art towards the ideal corporeality and, in particular, he corroborates the closing and proportion-creating effect of Raphael’s backgrounds (*ibid.*, p. 356).
- 90 Baxandall (1971), p. 91.

- 91 *Ibid.*, pp. 92-93 and 155-56 (Latin).
- 92 *Ibid.*, pp. 98-109 and 163-67 (Latin).
- 93 Quintilian, *Institutio Oratoria*, 10, 2, 1: "Ex his ceterisque lectione dignis auctoribus et verborum sumenda copia est et varietas figurarum et compendendi ratio, tum ad exemplum virtutum omnium mens dirigenda."
- 94 *Ibid.*, 12, 10, 79-80: "Sed et copia habeat, modum [...]. Sic erunt magna non nimia, sublimia non abrupta, fortia non temeraria, severa non tristia, gravia non tarda, laeta non luxuriosa, iucunda non dissoluta, grandia non tumida." See Baxandall (1971), p. 138.
- 95 In *De rhetorica libri*, 5, cited in Baxandall (1971), pp. 138-39.
- 96 Alberti (1975), II, 55. English translation from Alberti (1972), p. 90.
- 97 Alberti (1975), II, 33, 35 and 40. Translation from Alberti (1972), p. 71. Baxandall (1971), pp. 129-33, with citation from Isidore of Seville, *Etymologiae*, 2, 18, and its 3rd-century forerunner, Aquila, *De figuris sententiarum et elocutionis*, 18.
- 98 Baxandall (1971), p. 132.
- 99 Greenstein (1997), pp. 671 and 689-97, also stresses the innovative potential of the surface term, in that he understands it as a mediating link where the optical becomes the entrance to knowledge of the objects in the surrounding environment. Greenstein sees, however, no tension between the infinite space and the ideal body, or between the painted surface of the image and the surface of the bodies represented.
- 100 Alberti (1975), II, 35. Translations from Alberti (1972), p. 71.
- 101 Alberti (1975), II, 40.
- 102 This and the following passages: *ibid.*, II, 40. English translation from Alberti (1972), p. 79.
- 103 *Ibid.*, II, 42. Translation from Alberti (1972), p. 83.
- 104 For details, see Wamberg (1993), pp. 186-89.
- 105 Van Veen already noted in 1978 that Ghiberti's reference to the Sienese used Albertian terminology (Veen (1980), pp. 343-48).
- 106 Ghiberti (1912), II, 22: "[...] le quali istorie molto copiose di figure erano istorie del testamento uecchio: nelle quali mi ingegnai con ogni misura osseruare in esse cercare imitare la natura quanto a me fosse possibile, et con tutti i liniamenti che in essa potessi produrre et con egregij conponimenti et douitosi con moltissimi figure. Missi in alcuna istoria circa di figure cento; in quale istorie meno et in qual più." English translation, slightly revised, from Ghiberti (1979), pp. 66-67.
- 107 Ghiberti (1912), II, 11-12.
- 108 Petrarch mentions Simone Martini, partly because they met at the Papal court in Avignon; and in two preaching cycles, held in 1425 and 1427, Saint Bernardino Albizzeschi refers to works of patriotic significance by Simone Martini and Ambrogio Lorenzetti (Ercoli (1980), p. 317; Christiansen et al. (1988), pp. 4-7 and 35-36). In 1459 the Sienese Pope Pius II (Enea Silvio Piccolomini) declares that Simone Martini is not inferior to the Florentine painters (Ercoli (1980), p. 332).
- 109 Ghiberti (1912), II, 11. English translation from Ghiberti (1979), p. 37.
- 110 Ghiberti (1912), II, 12. English translation from Ghiberti (1979), p. 40.

- 111 Ghiberti (1912), II, II. English translations from Ghiberti (1979), pp. 36-37.
- 112 Alberti (1975), II, 26. English translation from Alberti (1972), p. 63.
- 113 For example, in Savonarola, *Sermons on Ezekiel* (1497), cited in Gilbert (1980), p. 159. I am grateful to Maria Fabricius Hansen for this reference. The aphorism is, in one tradition, attributed to Cosimo de' Medici; it is also found later in Leonardo's writings.
- 114 Leonardo (1956), vol. 2, 2, 76 (f. 35v): "Non restero di mettere fra questi precetti una nova inventionione di speculatione, la quale, ben che paia pichola e quasi degna di riso, no' di meno è di grande utilità à destare lo ingegno à varie inventioni. E quest'è, se tu riguarderai in alcuni muri imbrattati di varie machie, o' pietre di varij misti, se harai à inventionare qualche sito, potrai li vedere similitudini di diversi paesi, hornati di montagne, fiumi, sassi, alberi, pianure grande, valli e colli in diversi modi; anchora vi potrai vedere diverse battaglie et atti pronti di figure strane, arie di volti, e abiti, et infinite cose, le quali tu potrai ridurre in integra e bona forma; ch'interviene in simili muri e misti, come del sono delle campane, che ne' loro tocchi vi troverai ogni nome e vocabolo, che ti'nmaginerai. Non isprezzare questo mio parere, nel quale ti si ricorda, che nò'ti sia grave il fermarti alcuna volta, à vedere nelle machie de muri, o' nella cenere del foco, o'nuvoli, o'fanghi, o'altri simili lochi, li quali, se ben fieno da te considerati, tu ti troverai dentro inventioni mirabilissimi [...], perche nelle cose confuse l'ingegno si desta à nove inventioni. Ma fa prima di sapere ben fare tutte le membra de quelle cose, che voi figurare, come le membra delli animali, come le membra de paesi cioè sassi, painte e simili." English translation, slightly revised, from *ibid.*, vol. I, p. 50.
- 115 "[...] gli ochii mei acconciamente al piano non pativano riguardare, in tanto che omni cosa infera ad me apparea imperfecta." See Colonna (1964), p. 20. I am grateful to Maria Fabricius Hansen for having brought this passage to my attention.
- 116 Jay (1993).
- 117 Bryson (1983), pp. 89-92.
- 118 Damisch (1972), especially pp. 26-29 and 32-35.
- 119 *Ibid.*, especially pp. 29, 48, 183, 197, 206n. and 239-40.
- 120 *Ibid.*, especially pp. 29, 94, 99 and 201.
- 121 *Ibid.*, pp. 237-38, 240 and 245-46.
- 122 Didi-Huberman (1995).
- 123 *Ibid.*, especially pp. 1-22, 28-44 and 119-23.
- 124 *Ibid.*, especially pp. 7-8, 36 and 187.
- 125 Merleau-Ponty (1964), pp. 37, 57 and 72-74; Lacan (1994), pp. 93-97. Allowing for Didi-Huberman's and particularly Damisch's scepticism of painting's environmental connection, this influence seems somewhat tense, but the influence becomes comprehensible if we accept a common denominator between body/unconsciousness (Merleau-Ponty/Lacan), the mystery of incarnation (Didi-Huberman) and a transcendental, rupturing style (Damisch).
- 126 See Wölfflin (1963).
- 127 Cf. Sauerländer (1977), p. 127.

- 128 On Wölfflin's direct dissociation from Hegel, see Hart (1989), pp. 98-103. Damisch (1972), pp. 23 and 79, also stresses that Riegl's and Wölfflin's theories deal with the same thing, albeit Wölfflin's ideas are purely descriptive, Riegl's more positively theoretical.
- 129 Wölfflin (1963), p. 273: "Es gibt eine germanische Phantasie, die zwar die allgemeine Entwicklung vom Plastischen zum Malerischen durchmacht, aber doch von allem Anfang an stärker auf malerische Reize reagiert als die südliche. Nicht die Linie, sondern das Liniengeflecht. Nicht die festgelegte Einzelform, sondern die Formbewegung. Man glaubt auch an die Dinge, die sich nicht mit Händen fassen lassen." English translation from Wölfflin (1950), p. 235.
- 130 Burke (1759), pp. 213ff.; Kant (1974), §23, p. 165.
- 131 Panofsky (1955).
- 132 Bryson (1983), pp. 56-66.
- 133 On the escalation of meaning potentials in 18th-19th-century pictorial art, see Bialostocki (1966), pp. 156-80.

Chapter 10

Time, Territory and Wilderness in Early Modern Landscape Images, I

- 1 Applebaum (1992), p. 253; Rösener (1992), pp. 22-23 and 44; Martines (1979), p. 2.
- 2 Bloch (1967), pp. 175-81; Ovitt (1987), p. 139; Le Roy Ladurie (1994), pp. 30-31.
- 3 *Crises agraires en Europe (XIIe-XXe siècle)*, 1973, cited in Braudel (1992), vol. III, p. 546; Rösener (1992), p. 34.
- 4 The situation points towards Aristotle's prophesy in *Politics* (1, 2, 4-5, 1253b-1254a): "[...] for if every tool could perform its own work when ordered, or by seeing what to do in advance, like the statues of Daedalus in the story, or the tripods of Hephaestus which the poet says 'enter self-moved the company divine,' [...] mastercraftsmen would have no need of assistants and masters no need of slaves." This intelligent obedience is certainly not fulfilled until the computers of our times, but the late medieval use of new forms of energy and new tools already constitutes a different situation from that of antiquity.
- 5 Ovitt (1987), p. 141; Braudel (1992), vol. II, pp. 232-33.
- 6 Heitland (1921), p. 456.
- 7 Rösener (1992), p. 28.
- 8 Epperlein (1976), p. 191.
- 9 Cited in Rösener (1992), p. 29.
- 10 Max Weber remarks, more generally, that the linear and aerial perspectives belong to the capitalist, rational culture, and that both are a speciality of Western culture (Weber (1920), p. 3).
- 11 Weber (1920), *passim*.
- 12 Le Goff (1977), p. 110; Rösener (1992), p. 12.
- 13 Ovitt (1987), pp. 151 and 158.

- 14 Weber (1920), pp. 63-71 and 98-201.
- 15 Martines (1979), pp. 17-32.
- 16 Interestingly, the term fails to appear in the Catholic countries. Its precursor is to be found among the Israelites who in turn took it from the industrious Egyptians (see Weber's thorough etymological discussion, Weber (1920), pp. 63ff.).
- 17 London, British Library, Royal ms 2B.VII. See Koseleff (1942), pp. 77-88, and Koseleff (1963), pp. 245-53.
- 18 Webster (1938), pp. 38, 57 and 99-102, plus cat. 53, reproduced pl. 34.
- 19 London, British Library, Add. ms 42130, ff. 170-173v. Camille (1987).
- 20 *Ibid.*, pp. 434-36.
- 21 *Ibid.*, pp. 447-48.
- 22 On the following, see Feldges (1980), *passim*; Fechner (1986), pp. 209-28; Starn (1992), pp. 11-80; and Norman (1995), vol. II, pp. 145-67.
- 23 Brunetto Latini: *Il tesoretto* (c. 1263) and *Li livres dou tresor* (1260s). Local Sienese texts included, presumably, *Breves officialum communis sienensis* (1250) and the civic constitution in both its original Latin version of 1262 and the extended volgare version of 1309-10. The late medieval source has been deciphered by, in particular, Quentin Skinner (1986) and is quoted in Starn (1992), pp. 33-46, and Norman (1995), pp. 156ff. As Starn notes, however, many of the text fragments do not need to be used directly, but can exemplify traditions which were, to the same extent or more, handed down orally.
- 24 According to Starn (1992), pp. 43-45, this is the only positively verifiable Aristotelian-Thomistic reference in Lorenzetti's entire programme. Albeit extremely simplified (or misunderstood) it refers to Thomas Aquinas' discussion of the distribution and exchange of material goods in *Summa Theologica*, derived from Robert Grosseteste's translation of Aristotle's *Ethics* (c. 1250).
- 25 Inspired by Pächt, Starn presumes that, in order to make the agricultural scenes harmonise with the personified seasons, only the spring and summer months (March-September) are represented on the east wall, as there is an alleged absence of markedly autumn and winter activities such as wine-making (October), tree pruning and pig fattening (November) and pig slaughtering (December). This would seem to be something of a misrepresentation as at least two of the activities that are actually present – tilling and sowing – are tasks which in Italian calendar images are typically connected with October-November (see Starn (1992), p. 53 and cf. Webster (1938), p. 176).
- 26 Cited in Huizinga (1990), p. 128.
- 27 Langland (1992), Passus VII, p. 75. See also Passus VI, especially pp. 68-72.
- 28 Feldges (1980), p. 63: "daß Ambrogio mit einer tausendjährigen Tradition von Felslandschaften brechen und, im Sinn eines neuzeitlichen Geniebegriffs, eigenständig ganz neue Formen hätte entwickeln können."
- 29 Norman (1995), vol. I, pp. 135-36, reproduced in *ibid.*, p. 137.
- 30 Feldges (1980), pp. 30-31; Norman (1995), vol. I, p. 137.

- 31 Perrig (1987), p. 42, is of course on completely the wrong track when he attributes the bareness of the rocks to a Sieneſe burning of the Montemassi fields. It is not poſſible to burn off ſomething that has not previously exiſted.
- 32 Norman (1995), vol. I, p. 139. The nail hole and marks of ſlipping made by the frequently rotated map are ſtill viſible on the wall.
- 33 Le Goff (1977), pp. 67-78. English translations in Le Goff (1980), p. 50.
- 34 Spengler (1972), p. 175: “Ohne peinlichſte Zeitmeſſung – eine *Chronologie des Geſchehenden*, die durchaus unſerm ungeheuren Bedürfnis nach Archäologie, das heißt Erhaltung, Ausgrabung, Sammlung alles Geſchehenen entſpricht – iſt der abendländiſche Menſch nicht denkbar.” English translation in Spengler (1971), p. 134.
- 35 In relation to this and the following, ſee Le Goff (1977), pp. 67-78; Weber (1920), p. 168, corroborates the concluſion that the capitaliſt temporal rhythm originated in the monaſteries and convents.
- 36 Spengler (1972), pp. 19 and 175, ſtresses the ſymbolic ſignificance of the clock for Weſtern culture as diſtinct to that of antiquity.
- 37 “[...] du meſtier de draperie et autres meſtiers où il convient pluſieurs ouvriers ad journee alans et renans à l’oeuvre à certains heures [...]”, cited in Le Goff (1977), p. 70. English translation in Le Goff (1980), p. 46.
- 38 Le Goff (1977), p. 78. English translation in Le Goff (1980), p. 50.
- 39 Le Goff (1977), p. 78. English translation in Le Goff (1980), p. 52.
- 40 Ghiberti (1912), II, II, p. 41: “[...] ſi muoue una turbatione di tempo ſcuro con molta grandine ſaette tuoni tremuori, pare a uederla dipinta pericoli el cielo e’lla terra [...]” English translation in Ghiberti (1974), p. 37.
- 41 The latter reproduced in colour in Frugoni (1988), ill. 68.
- 42 For the following, ſee Smart (1977).
- 43 Taddeo’s letter is preſerved, along with Fra Simone’s reply, in the latter’s *Epistolarum Fratris Symonis de Cascia*. Cited and diſcuſſed in Smart (1977), pp. 404-05. One of Taddeo’s lamentations: “For from days not long paſt I have ſuffered, and ſtill ſuffer, from an unendurable infirmity of the eyes, which has been occaſioned by my own folly. For while, this year, the ſun was in eclipse I looked at the ſun itſelf for a long period of time, and hence the infirmity to which I have juſt referred. For I conſtantly have clouds before my eyes which impede the vigor of my ſight.”
- 44 *Cronaca* XI, XCIX, cited in *ibid.*, p. 412.
- 45 See Meiß (1951), pp. 23 and 70-71.
- 46 Fechner (1986), pp. 242-46.
- 47 Panofsky (1953) vol. I, pp. 33-34; Le Roy Ladurie (1994), p. 48. *Petites Heures du Duc de Berry*, Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, ms lat. 18014.
- 48 Harvey (1991), p. 7.
- 49 Harvey (1980), p. 72. A more accurate map of Rome after the firſt in the genre, probably from the 12th century, has been dated to 1280 and is included in three out of four verſions of Paolino Veneto’s *Magna Chronologia* from the 1320s and 1330s.

- 50 Fabricius Hansen (1999), pp. 68-74.
- 51 Feldges (1980), pp. 11-12.
- 52 Vatican Library, ms Pal. lat. 1993; Feldges (1980), p. 12.
- 53 Cahn (1991).
- 54 *Ibid.*, p. 22.
- 55 Grant (1974), pp. 657-59. The treatise's illustrations of birdlife and hunting scenes were added during the reign of Frederick's son Manfred (reigned 1254-66).
- 56 On the following, see Pächt (1950), pp. 13-47.
- 57 On the following, see Cogliati Arano (1976).
- 58 See also, Le Roy Ladurie (1994), p. 56.
- 59 Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, ms lat. 6977A, f. 103; Rome, Biblioteca Casanatense, *Theatrum Sanitatis*, ms 4182, f. 45, Cogliati Arano (1976), pls. XLV and 153. Pächt (1950) states, p. 37, that the *seasons* have only been depicted once before in this non-allegorical way: in the two Winchester manuscripts from the beginning of the 12th century, with echoes from the Carolingian tradition, British Museum, mss Cotton Julius A.VI and Tiberius B.V.
- 60 See also Cogliati Arano (1976), pls. 202, 236 and 238.
- 61 Fehner (1986), pp. 179-80.
- 62 Spengler (1972), pp. 508-09, corroborates the significance of this approach to the forest for the Faustian world view, and sees it expressed particularly in Gothic architecture.
- 63 Fehner (1986), p. 240; Pächt (1950), p. 38; Steingraber (1985), p. 66.
- 64 On the following, see: Longnon, Cazelles and Meiss (1969); Alexander (1990), pp. 436-52.
- 65 Alexander (1990), p. 440, with citation from Froissart's *Chronicles* (ed. C. Brereton, 1968).
- 66 *Ibid.*, pp. 451-52, where it is stressed, however, that the accuracy of the detail only applies to the architectural features of the building and not its surroundings.
- 67 *Ibid.*, p. 440, sees the castles as expressive of the peasants' subjugation to "a gaze that is contemptuous and not without fear".
- 68 Avril (1978), pp. 76-79, with colour reproductions.
- 69 *Ibid.*, pp. 96-99, with colour reproductions.
- 70 Even though the landscape was in all probability completed by Belbello da Pavia in the 1430s, at the same time as the initial-scene of the *Creation of Eve*, the style suggests that the outlines were drawn by Giovannino dei Grassi's workshop.
- 71 The miniature's innovations are excellently described by Gisèle Lambert in Le Roy Ladurie (1994), cat. 9, pp. 40-41.
- 72 *Works by Christine de Pisan*, Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, ms fr. 606, reproduced in Thomas (1979), pl. 18. In the Limbourg brothers *Les Belles Heures de Duc de Berry* (c. 1408-09) half the miniature is concluded by a Gothic ornamental sky and half by a blue sky (reproduced in Meiss and Beatson (1974)). In their *Les Très Riches Heures* (c. 1410-16) only the small images at the beginning have ornamental sky, while the rest have an atmospheric sky.
- 73 Ruskin (1873), vol. III, p. 261.

- 74 Breustedt (1966), pp. 5-6 and 53.
- 75 Painted on the sportello part of a tabernacle containing the head of the local Saint Fina; dated 1402.
- 76 Cited in Baxandall (1971), pp. 105 and 164-65 (Latin): "Pinxit item en eadem urbe turbinem arbores caeteraque id genus radicitus evertentem, cuius est ea facies, ut vel prospicientibus horrorem ac metum incutiat."
- 77 Zeri (1987), p. 122.
- 78 F. 161v.

Chapter II

Time, Territory and Wilderness in Early Modern Landscape Images, II

- 1 *Het Schilder-Boeck's* first and theoretical part, *Den Grondt der Edel Vry Schilder-const*, ch. 8, 29 and 30-31, cited in Brown (1986), p. 40.
- 2 *Den Grondt der Edel Vry Schilder-const*, ch. 8, 41, 44 and 46.
- 3 Weber (1920), *passim*, particularly pp. 1-37, 84-95 and 164ff.
- 4 *Ibid.*, pp. 189-90 and 196-99.
- 5 Of this myth, see Baron (1955).
- 6 Le Goff (1977), p. 113. Spengler (1972), pp. 349-50, also corroborates the connection between the Italian Renaissance and a court culture weak in development of state.
- 7 Le Roy Ladurie (1994), pp. 14-18; *ibid.*, p. 18: "Cette immense respiration multiséculaire d'une structure sociale [...]." Braudel (1992), vol. II, pp. 265-72. See also Cosgrove (1998), pp. 52, 70, 76, 80-82 and 87; Coles (1952); and Cipolla (1952).
- 8 An example: when, in 1913-14, Henry Clay Frick, the American coke and steel industrialist, had a mansion built in New York to house his art collection, the panels were bordered with gilt corn sheaves, a discrete reminder of the labour that had made his collection possible.
- 9 *Metamorphoses*, 116-20.
- 10 Carus (1955), p. 38: "Darstellung einer gewissen Stimmung des Gemütslebens (Sinn) durch die Nachbildung einer entsprechenden Stimmung des Naturlebens (Wahrheit)".
- 11 Panofsky (1955a), p. 85, and Koerner (1993), p. 201; Koerner, pp. 264-73 and 292-316 in *ibid.*, discusses other aspects of the myth of the Fall which, although here applied in relation to Hans Baldung Grien, are of potentially macrohistorical interest.
- 12 The link between melancholy and imaginative ability is presented in the *Nicomachean Ethics*, 1150b 25 and in *Problems*, 30, 1.
- 13 See Klíbanky, Panofsky and Saxl (1964), especially pp. 15-41 and 338-41.
- 14 Alberti (1960-73), vol. II (1966), Libro II, p. 87: "Vedi la terra ora vestita di fiori, ora grave di pomi e frutti, ora nuda senza sue fronde e chiome, ora squallida e orrida pe' ghiacci e per la neve canute le fronti e summità de' monti e delle piaggie. E quanto pronto vediamo ora niuna, come dicea

- Mannilio poeta, segue mai simile a una altra ora, non agli animi degli uomini solo, quali mo lieti, poi tristi, indi irati, poi pieni di sospetti e simili perturbazioni, ma ancora alla tutta universa natura, caldo el di, freddo la notte, lucido la mattina, fusco la sera, testé vento, subito quieto, poi sereno, poi piogge, fulgori, tuoni, e così sempre di varietà in nuove varietà.”
- 15 Spengler (1972), p. 84, emphasises the continuity in Faustian, contrapunctual music.
- 16 Serres (1989), pp. 333-40.
- 17 Hegel (1970) vol. II, pp. 140-41: “Das Innere in diesem Verhältnis, so auf die Spitze hinausgetrieben, ist die äußerlichkeitslose Äußerung, unsichtbar gleichsam nur sich selber vernehmend, ein Tönen als solches, ohne Gegenständlichkeit und Gestalt, ein Schweben über den Wätern, ein Klingen über einer Welt, welche in ihren und an ihren heterogenen Erscheinungen nur einen Gegensein dieses Insichseins der Seele aufnehmen und widerspiegeln kann.”
- 18 Spengler (1972), p. 230: “[...] körperlose Reiche von Tönen, Tonräume, Tonmeere; das Orchester brandet, schlägt Wellen, verebbt; es malt Fernen, Lichter, Schatten, Stürme, ziehende Wolken, Blitze, Farben von vollkommener Jenseitigkeit; man denke an die Landschaften der Instrumentation Glucks und Beethovens.” See also *ibid.*, pp. 66, 119 and 298-99. English translation, here slightly revised, from Spengler (1971), p. 177.
- 19 *De rerum natura*, 6, 1119ff.
- 20 Boccaccio (1511), 8, 1, f. 61: “Tandem dum sic in pendulo essem; et ecce ex orientali oceano quasi se ab inferis in altum efferens; tardum atque nubilum sidus visum est; Stygia velatum caligine. Quod dum nebulis imixtum intuerer; memor præceptoque venerabilis Andalo: odiosum atque nocivum Saturni astrum fore cognovi.” The Genoese traveller, geographer and astronomer Andalò di Negro was Boccaccio’s friend and consultant in astrological matters. See also Klibansky, Panofsky and Saxl (1964), pp. 174-76.
- 21 Carus (1955), p. 92: “Alles, was in des Menschen Brust widerklingt, ein Verhellen und Verfinstern, ein Entwickeln und Auflösen, ein Bilden und Zerstören, alles schwebt in den zarten Gebilden der Wolkenregionen vor unsern Sinnen; und auf die rechte Weise aufgefaßt, durch den Kunstgenius vergeistigt, erregt es wunderbar selbst das Gemüt, an welchem diese Erscheinungen in der Wirklichkeit unbemerkt vorübergleiten.” See also Wedewer (1980), p. 39. Also Spengler (1972), pp. 309-10, notes the significance of clouds for the Faustian painting.
- 22 Cited in Parris and Fleming-Williams (1991), pp. 228-29.
- 23 *Laws*, 663b.
- 24 Damisch (1972), especially pp. 14-15, 22-23 and 190-92.
- 25 For Spengler (1972), pp. 322-23, visible brushwork in particular is a sign of becoming, and thereby of Western, historical sensibility.
- 26 Panofsky (1953), vol. I, pp. 232-43.
- 27 Colour reproduction in Hartt (1987), colorpl. 27.
- 28 Eisler (1989), *passim*, colour reproduction in *ibid.*, Fig. 31.
- 29 Cited in Baxandall (1963), pp. 320-21.
- 30 Cited in Baxandall (1971), pp. 97 and 161 (Latin).

- 31 Cited in *ibid.*, pp. 93 and 156 (Latin).
- 32 Florence, Museo di San Marco; reproduced in Pope-Hennessy (1974), pl. 25.
- 33 For other examples, see Christiansen et al. (1989).
- 34 A Netherlandish parallel to the gaze at the sun could be Rogier van der Weyden's *Saint Columba Altarpiece* (c. 1458-59; Munich, Alte Pinakothek) in which the guiding star shines forth from behind the roof of a stable – the ruins of a church; reproduced in Panofsky (1953), vol. II, pl. 213.
- 35 See Breustedt (1966), p. 15. Bouts further develops the sunrise motif in *Saint Christopher*, reproduced in *ibid.*, fig. 434.
- 36 London, National Gallery, reproduced in Panofsky (1953), vol. II, pl. 290. Breustedt (1966) provides a complete catalogue of Netherlandish nocturnal images up until c. 1520/30.
- 37 Examples of other early Italian nocturnal images: several *Nativity* scenes by Lorenzo Monaco, Giovanni di Paolo and Benozzo Gozzoli (the last two in the Vatican Pinacoteca), but none have a convincing darkness (see Breustedt (1966), pp. 59-65).
- 38 Predella, Vatican, Pinacoteca. Gentile da Fabriano paints the same motif in the 1420s (also in the Vatican Pinacoteca).
- 39 Colour reproduction in Hartt (1987), colorpl. 62.
- 40 A few examples among many: Masaccio, *Rendering of the Tribute Money* (c. 1425; Florence, Brancacci Chapel, Santa Maria del Carmine); Filippo Lippi, *Adoration in the Forest* (c. 1459; Berlin, Staatliche Museen, Gemäldegalerie); Mantegna, *Crucifixion* (1457-59; Paris, Musée du Louvre); Perugino, *Crucifixion with the Virgin, Saint John, Saint Jerome, and Saint Mary Magdalene* (1482-85; Washington, National Gallery).
- 41 Spengler (1972), pp. 323-27, sees the studio-brown tone typical of so many European paintings from the 16th to the 19th century as being particularly atmospheric and suggestive of infinity, and thereby as an expression congenial to Protestantism. In my opinion, it is more a case of a 'contamination' from the *chiaroscuro*-look of Renaissance nocturnal clouds, a brown colouring that is just as alien to the still Renaissance-free 15th century as it is to 19th-century reactions against the academy: the Pre-Raphaelites and the Impressionists.
- 42 Damisch (1972), pp. 27-29. In *ibid.*, p. 194, he acknowledges that Leonardo's *sfumato* does not allow space for /cloud/ as an autonomous indication of style.
- 43 Cited in Hussey (1967), p. 43.
- 44 Respectively: Paris, Institut de France, B.N. 2038 (Ash. I) (1492), f. 22v, cited in Leonardo (1939), vol. I, 294, p. 235 ("prospettiva del variare e perdere over diminuire la propria essentia de' colori"); B.N. 2038, f. 25v, cited in *ibid.*, 295, p. 235.
- 45 Of Leonardo's *sfumato*, Spengler (1972), p. 356, states that it is: "das erste Zeichen einer Verleugnung der Körpergrenzen um des Raumes zu willen. Von hier geht der Impressionismus aus."
- 46 See Leonardo (1989), pp. 161-68. Damisch (1972), pp. 215-19, also notes Leonardo's interest in the phenomena of non-linear colour, light and atmosphere.
- 47 Damisch (1972), p. 192, also notes Leonardo's interest for forceful weather phenomena, which are other challengers to the linear order.

- 48 Chapter 66: "Come si deve figurar' una fortuna." The observation of the ambiguity of the term is made by Bätschmann (1990), p. 102. A storm is still called *fortunale* in Italian today.
- 49 Panofsky (1951b), pp. 36ff.; Damisch (1972), pp. 180-83.
- 50 *Adagia*, 2. Ch., 4. Cent., no. 38, cited in Panofsky (1951b), pp. 41 and 39, respectively. As early as Pliny, Apelles was associated with unpaintable topics such as "thunder, lightning and thunderbolts" (*Naturalis historia*, 35, 96, cited in *ibid.*, p. 36).
- 51 *De architectura*, 2, 1. Forest fire is also described by Pliny and Lucretius.
- 52 *Selve*, 1, 6, Lorenzo de' Medici (1939), vol.1, p. 244: "Ma, se dá libertá dalla spelonca/ Eolo a'venti tempestosi e fèri,/ non solamente i verdi rami tronca,/ man vanno a terra i vecchi pini interi;/ i miser legni con la prora adonca/ minaccia il mare irato, e par disperì;/ l'aria di folte nebbie prende un velo;/ cosí si duol la terra, il mare e'l cielo." See also Turner (1966), pp. 48-49.
- 53 Damisch (1972), p. 197, quite appropriately places the "threatening" clouds in this painting (and its 16th-century successors) in inverted commas.
- 54 Settis (1983), particularly pp. 132ff.
- 55 Amadeo similarly shows these figures against a background of trees and buildings.
- 56 Other examples of close juxtaposition of heavens and earth at the beginning of the 16th century include: *Ascensions*: Rosso Fiorentino, *Ascension of the Virgin* (1517), Florence, Santissima Annunziata; Andrea del Sarto, same theme (1526-29), Florence, Palazzo Pitti; Titian, same theme (1516-18), Venice, Santa Maria Gloriosa dei Frari. *Gods manifest in matter*: Titian, *Danaë and the Shower of Gold* (1554), Madrid, Prado. *Witnesses from the heavens*: Beccafumi, *Stigmatisation of Saint Catherine* (c. 1518), Siena, Pinacoteca Nazionale; Perino del Vaga, *Nativity* (1534), Washington, National Gallery; Correggio, *Adoration of the Shepherds* (1522), Dresden, Gemäldegalerie. *Visions*: Parmigianino, *Vision of Saint Jerome* (1526-27), London, National Gallery. *Instances of fall*: Perino del Vaga, *Fall of the Giants* (c. 1529), Genoa, Palazzo del Principe; Beccafumi, *Saint Michael and the Fallen Angels* (c. 1524), Siena, Pinacoteca Nazionale. Also Damisch (1972), p. 113, notes the important function of clouds in 16th-17th-century scenes of revelation, but given that he considers the /cloud/function as allied with a transcendence in relation to that which is visible and physical, he is not inclined to perceive these revelatory clouds as a safeguard against modernity, but on the contrary as the most sophisticated visual sign of the period.
- 57 Of the rarity and late arrival of tempests in Poussin, see Bätschmann (1990), pp. 97-102. Besides *Winter*, Poussin only executed two paintings with storm scenes, both in 1651: *Landscape with Pyramus and Thisbe* (Frankfurt) and *Landscape with Storm* (Rouen). Bätschmann also observes a growing interest in meteorological phenomena during the 17th century, both in the sciences and the arts.
- 58 *Het Schilder-Boeck*, I, 8, 3-5, 7-8, 10, 12-15, cited in Brown (1986), pp. 37-38. Van Mander's ideas are later repeated in Joachim von Sandrart's *Teutsche Academie* (1675-79). Here the tired art academy pupil is advised to draw landscapes, aerial perspective and the rising and setting of the sun. Sandrart asks them to note that the landscape's colours are particularly beautiful after rain, during a thunderstorm and in the autumn (see Bramsen (1990), p. 208).
- 59 Ovid, *Metamorphoses* I, 123-24 and 135-36.

- 60 Ernout and Meillet (1967), p. 408. The cognate term *modius* was a spatial measurement for cereal crops, pulses, etc.
- 61 8, 8, cited in Brown (1986), p. 37.
- 62 Rösener (1992), pp. 102 and 109. See also Le Roy Ladurie (1994), pp. 30-31.
- 63 See de Bruyne (1946), pp. 41-42; Pochat (1973), pp. 116-18; Busch (1997), pp. 41-42. In John of Garland's *Parisiana Poetria* we read, for example: "Thus there are three styles in accordance with the three ranks of humankind; the humble style suits the shepherds; the mediocre suits the peasants; the grave suits those who are above shepherds and peasants." ("Item sunt tres styli secundum tres status hominum; pastorali vitae convenit stylus humilis, agricolis mediocris, gravis gravibus personis quae praesunt pastoribus et agricolis.") (Cited in de Bruyne (1946), p. 42.)
- 64 It is perhaps also telling that *centuria*, the agrimensores' unit of land measurement, has etymological cognation with the English *century*.
- 65 See Klibansky, Panofsky and Saxl (1964), pp. 204-09; Filedt Kok (1985), pp. 221-22; von Meyenburg (1991), p. 85.
- 66 Klibansky, Panofsky and Saxl (1964), pp. 333-34.
- 67 Discussed in *Der Bauer und seine Befreiung* (1975), p. 51.
- 68 The latter reproduced in Hartt (1987), ill. 265.
- 69 London, National Gallery; Florence, Uffizi; Paris, Louvre.
- 70 The same rationale presumably lies behind the yellow, green and brown fields in Roger van der Weyden's version of the theme (c. 1432-35), Washington, National Gallery of Art. It is, in addition, hardly immaterial that the saint was martyred at the beginning of the 4th century, the climax of late antique interest in agriculture.
- 71 Falkenburg (1988), pp. 16 and 42; Meiss (1969), p. 195; Berger (1985), p. 90; Baring and Cashford (1991), pp. 577-78.
- 72 Otherwise, for example, the following numbers in Gibson (1989): 1, 3 (Patinir, *Flight...*, Antwerp, Koninklijk Museum voor Schone Kunsten); 1, 28 (Workshop of Joachim Patinir, *Rest...*, Antwerp, Museum Ridder Smidt van Gelder); 1, 34 (Master of the Female Half-lengths, *Rest...*, Vienna, Kunsthistorisches Museum); 2, 6 (Lucas Gassel, *Flight...* (1542), Maastricht, Bonnefantenmuseum); 2, 67 (Mathys Cock (?), *Rest...*, Antwerp, Museum Mayer van den Bergh). See also Jean Colombe's *Flight...* in *Les Très Riches Heures* (before 1485), f. 57.
- 73 Cited in Baxandall (1971), pp. 93 and 155.
- 74 For the following, see Campbell (1997), pp. 31-36 and 40-42.
- 75 In Joannes Tzetzes' *scholion* on Hesiod's *Works and Days*, c. 1135; see Nigel Wilson in Molfino and Natale (1991), vol. I, p. 83.
- 76 Letter quoted in Baxandall (1971), pp. 89-90 (English), pp. 158-59 (Latin). Two other muses also change identity on this occasion: Melpomene from tragedy to vocal melody, Erato from lyric poetry to matrimony and the duties of love (Campbell (1997), p. 31).
- 77 On the Good Government, see Jaynie Anderson in Molfino and Natale (1991), p. 174; on a more general fertility, see Campbell (1997), p. 42.

- 78 Jaynie Anderson in Molfino and Natale (1991), vol. II, pp. 165-87.
- 79 See the relevant close-ups in Varese (1989), pp. 376-81. On the astrological iconography of the cycle, see Warburg (1932), vol. II, pp. 459-81.
- 80 See also the brutally hacked branches in Alesso Badovinetti's *Nativity* (1460-62), Florence, Santissima Annunziata, reproduced in Hartt (1987), ill. 318.
- 81 Saint Jerome's forest-worker iconography can also be seen in Jacopo del Sellaio's version of the motif (c. 1480; Washington, National Gallery) – here the hermit forest worker's axe is still stuck into one of the trees that has yet to be felled by its blade.
- 82 Le Goff (1977), p. 139.
- 83 Berlin, Kupferstichkabinett, pen, watercolour and gouache on paper, reproduced in Wood (1993), fig. 1.
- 84 A prominent example of one such can be seen in the background of the *Sleeping Venus* by Giorgione and Titian (c. 1505-10), Dresden, Gemäldegalerie.
- 85 Epperlein (1976), pp. 200 and 205 and Abb. 6.
- 86 The observation with regard to the Master of the Housebook and Schongauer is made by Ernst Ullmann in *Der Bauer und seine Befreiung* (1975), p. 27. For illustrations, see *ibid.*, pp. 39-50.
- 87 On Crescenzi, see Saltini (1979), pp. 51-57; Le Roy Ladurie (1994), p. 44. The popularity of the treatise is demonstrated by, for example, the fact that there are 26 extant illuminated copies (see Le Roy Ladurie (1994), p. 44).
- 88 III, conclusion, cited in Epperlein (1976), p. 203: "Die Reichen werden herabstürzen, die Armen aber aufsteigen und zu Reichtümern gelangen."
- 89 See *Der Bauer und seine Befreiung* (1975), pp. 52-53 and Epperlein (1976), pp. 205-06. The edition has 261 woodcuts in all.
- 90 Smith (1992), p. 8.
- 91 See also Applebaum (1992), p. 322.
- 92 On Aertsen, Beuckelaer and Protestantism, see Moxey (1977). On Brueghel's peasants and the reformed Erasmian Catholicism, see Sullivan (1994).
- 93 Ficino apropos Plotin's *Enneads*, I, 6, 7, cited in Wind (1958), p. 107: "Animus affectibus ad materiam quasi nubibus procul expulsis ad intellectualis pulchritudinis lumen extemplo convertitur." Boccaccio, *Genealogia deorum gentilium* (12, 62), also refers to Mercury as expelling the clouds of the mind (see Wind (1958)).
- 94 See also Watson (1979), pls. 30-36 and 38-39.
- 95 On the following, see *ibid.*, pp. 52-60. See also the garden of vanity in Andrea da Firenze's *Way to Salvation* (1366-68) in the Florentine Santa Maria Novella (Cappella degli Spagnuoli).
- 96 Clark (1949), p. 3.
- 97 "O anima, perchè, perchè non pensi/ Che Morte ti torra quel vestimento/ In che tu senti corporal dilecto/ Per la virtù de suoi cinque sensi." Cited in Watson (1979), p. 143.
- 98 *Il Tesoretto*, 21, see Latini (1788), p. 261: "Come 'n calen di maggio,/ Passati e valli e monti,/ E boschi e selve e ponti,/ I' giunsi 'n un bel prato/ Fiorito d'ogni lato,/ Lo più ricco del mondo./ Ma or mi

- parea tondo./ Or avia quadratura./ Or avia l'aria scura./ Or è chiara e lucente./ Or veggio molta gente./ Or non veggio persone. [...] Così da ogni canto/ Vedeo sollazzo e pianto." English translation, slightly modified, from Watson (1979), p. 30.
- 99 *Epithalamium de nuptiis Honorii Augusti*, 3, 49-85.
- 100 Lorris: 635-42; Petrarch: 4, 101-5 and 121-23; Boccaccio, *Decameron*: 3; *Teseida*: 7, 51-35; see Watson (1979), pp. 28-33.
- 101 Tour de la Garde-Robe. See Börsch-Supan (1967), pp. 220-22.
- 102 See also the animal paddock in Sano di Pietro's *Nativity*, Barbara Piasecka Johnson Collection, reproduced in Christiansen et al. (1989), p. 181.
- 103 On the following, see Guldan (1966), pp. 36-39.
- 104 Of Eve's connection to the Great Goddess in general, see Baring and Cashford (1993), pp. 486-546.
- 105 *Oratio*, 6 (5) from *SS. Deiparae Visitationem*, 16, *Patrologia Graeca*, 127, 675-78, cited in Guldan (1966), p. 37.
- 106 Of this iconographical tradition, see the excellent survey in Falkenburg (1988), pp. 24-26.
- 107 The terms are coined in, respectively, Jacob of Serugh (*Carmen de Beata Virgine Maria*) and Andrew of Crete (*Oratio*, 5, *Annuntiationem Beatae Mariae*, *Patrologia Graeca*, 97, 895-96), cited in Guldan (1966), p. 37.
- 108 Boccaccio (1963), 32, 15-16, p. 124: "O ninfe, abbiate ora compassione alle mie noie! Poi che egli ha gran parte della notte tirata con queste ciance, gli orti di Venere invano si fatica di coltivare; e cercante con vecchio bomere fendere la terra di quelli disiderante i graziosi semi, lavora indarno [...]."
- 109 *Comento sopra alcuni de' suoi sonetti*, Lorenzo de' Medici (1939), vol. I, p. 42: "Perché 'paradiso', chiunque rettamente vuole diffinire, non vuol dir altro che un giardino amenissimo, abbondante di tutte le cose piacevoli e dilettevoli, d'arbori, di pomi, di fiori, acque vive e correnti, canti d'uccelli, ed in effetto di tutte le amenità che può pensare il cuore dell'uomo; e per questo si verifica che paradiso era ove era sì bella donna, perché qui era copia d'ogni amenità e dolcezza, che un gentil cuore può desiderare."
- 110 See also Bellini's *Madonna with Blessing Child* (1510), Milan, Brera, and his *Madonna of the Meadow* (c. 1505), London, National Gallery.
- 111 The territorial markers suppressed in this way also include an aspect of 15th-century painting I have not pursued: references to authentic topography. On this subject, Gibbons (1977) notes that Bellini's topographic references disappear in his post-1500 High Renaissance period (p. 183).
- 112 9, 4, Alberti (1966), vol. II, p. 805: "Cumque pictura ut poetica varia sit - alia quae maximorum gesta principium dignissima memoratu, alia quae privatorum civium mores, alia quae aratoriam vitam exprimat -, prima illa, quae maiestatem habet, publicis et praestantissimorum operibus adhibebitur; secunda vero privatorum civium parietibus, ornamento ut sit, appingetur; ultima ortis maxime conveniet, quod omnium sit ea quidem iocundissima. Hilarescimus maiorem in modum animis, cum pictas videmus amoenitates regionum et portus et piscationes et venationes

- et natationes et agrestium ludos et frondosa." English translation, slightly modified, from Alberti (1988), p. 299.
- 113 Hay and Law (1989), pp. 53-55.
- 114 See Maisak (1981), pp. 46-47.
- 115 *Ibid.*, p. 47.
- 116 Heitland (1921), pp. 9-10, 50 and 121-23.
- 117 Maisak (1981), p. 28.
- 118 Ovid, *Fasti*, 2, 271-89; Schama (1995), pp. 526-29.
- 119 See Sannazaro (1961). For the following, also Maisak (1981), pp. 59-66.
- 120 According to Braudel (1992), vol. II, p. 393, the collapse of the Florentine banking empire was already underway after the fall of the Bardi family in 1345.
- 121 Ficino (1576), vol. I, pp. 843-44. Letter translated into French in Chastel (1959), p. 228.
- 122 This observation is made in Haaning (1998), p. 50.
- 123 Pochat (1967), pp. 92-105. Pochat's contribution mainly consists of proof for an interpretation submitted in Brummer (1964), pp. 55-67. Before this, Chastel (1954), *passim*, and Chastel (1959), pp. 226-33, had also presented significant literary material, particularly by Ficino and Lorenzo de' Medici, but without showing how it was used more explicitly in the picture. For a thorough examination of the various readings of this picture, see Hauser (1999). In Brockhaus (1933), pp. 397-416, one of the tarot series is quite unfoundedly linked to the Mantuan princely congress of 1459-60, at which the cards supposedly kept Pius II and Nicholas of Cusa entertained!
- 124 *Altercazione*, II, 1-40, see Lorenzo il Magnifico (1939), pp. 41-42. Vv. 37-39: "Maraviglia di te, pastor, non aggio/ ché spesso insieme ci troviamo al fonte,/ e talor sotto qualche ombroso faggio." ("I am not surprised, shepherd, to see you here, since we have often met one another by the spring, or sometimes under some shady beech tree.") Chastel already refers to Ficino in the figure of a shepherd, but without connecting the role with this painting (Chastel (1954), pp. 28 and 36, n. 47).
- 125 Plato, *Phaedrus*, 259d.
- 126 Hauser (1999), p. 263, maps some, but not all of the lines. My observations on this linear game were first published in Wamberg (1998).
- 127 Ficino (1576), vol. II, p. 1283 ("In Platonis Ionem [...]"): "Iupiter quidem mens Dei est, ab hac Apollo, mens animæ mundi, & anima totius mundi, octo sphaerarum coelestium animæ, quæ novem musæ vocantur, quia dum coelos harmonicæ movent, Musicam pariunt melodiam, quæ in novem distributa sonos, octo scilicet sphaerarum tonos, & unum omnium concentum, novem Sirenes Deo canentes producit." ("Jupiter is God's spirit. From him originates Apollo, the spirit of the world soul and the soul of the whole universe, together with the eight celestial orbs - in total nine souls known as the nine muses, because they, while harmonically moving the heavens, bring forth music and melody which, divided into nine tones (eight sphere tones and the sound of the whole), produce nine sirens who sing in God's honour.") For a French translation, see Chastel (1954), p. 137. Hauser (1999), unconvincingly, reads Calliope as Syrinx and Hermes as Daphnis.

- 128 In, for example, Franchino Gafurio's *Practica musice*, Milan 1496 (republished in 1518 as *De harmonica musicorum instrumentorum opus*). See Seznec (1953), pp. 135-43, with Gafurio's chart of Apollo, the planets, the muses and musical keys, reproduced *ibid.*, p. 135.
- 129 Ficino (1576), vol. II, p. 1283 ("In Platonis Ionem [...]"): "Calliope Musa vox est, ex omnibus saltans sphaerarum vocibus." ("The muse Calliope is a voice brought forth by all the voices of the spheres.") *Ibid.*, p. 1383 ("In Phædrum [...]"): "Allegoria fabulæ de cicadis, musis, dæmonibus": "Musæ vero ad coelestes sphaeras pertinere putantur. Sic modo Calliope quidem fit anima mundi." ("The muses are indeed believed to belong to the celestial spheres. Thus Calliope becomes the world soul.") About the unusual aspect of this, see the brilliant study of Ficino's *Phaedrus* commentary in Allen (1984), pp. 29-30.
- 130 Hauser (1999) reads the recumbent figure as a close relative: Eros.
- 131 Observed by Hauser (1999), pp. 256-58, with reference to a 15th-century manuscript of *Trionfi* in Paris, Bibliothèque de l'Arsenal, ms 5056 (reproduced *ibid.*, Fig. 4).
- 132 *Phaedrus*, 263d: "Upon my word, you rate the nymphs of Achelous and Pan, son of Hermes, much higher as artists in oratory than Lysias, son of Cephalus." Ficino (1576), vol. II, p. 1384 (Cap. 39: "Officium scriptoris, Dionysius, Musæ, Pan, Nymphæ."): "Dionysus, the muses, Pan and the nymphs inspire Socrates. Dionysus supplies the wakening of the mind, the muses poetry, Pan eloquence, the nymphs variation." ("Dionysius, Musæ, Pan, Nymphæ, Socratem afflaverunt: Dionysius præstitit mentis excussum, Musæ Poësim, Pan facundiam, Nymphæ varietatem.") See also Allen (1984), pp. 30-34.
- 133 Ficino (1576), vol. II, p. 1365 ("In Phædrum", Cap. 4: "De furore poetico [...]"): "Furens autem nullus est simplici sermone contentus. Sed in clamorem prorumpit, & cantus & carmina. Quamobrem furor quilibet, sive fatidicus, sive mysterialis, seu amatorius, dum in cantus procedit & carmina, merito in furem poeticum videtur absolvi." On *furor divinus* in Plato and Ficino, see also Allen (1984), pp. 41-67.
- 134 On Ficino and music, see Chastel (1959), pp. 189ff. and Allen (1984), pp. 29-30 and 53-55.
- 135 *Phaedrus*, 230c. This has seemingly not been observed before.
- 136 *Ibid.*, 259d.
- 137 Ficino (1576), vol. II, p. 1383 (Cap. 35): "Sic quidem animæ iam diu Philosophate ad coelestia revocantur." (The citation seems somewhat corrupted in the Basle edition.) On the continuity air-demons-music-cicadas in Ficino, see further Allen (1984), pp. 24-28.
- 138 Also observed in Hauser (1999), pp. 260-62.
- 139 Wind (1958), pp. 108-09; Wind here discusses the Neoplatonic idea of the cosmic breath and Hermes' role in it. On Hermes as driving the winds, Boccaccio writes in *Genealogia deorum gentilium* (2, 7): "Ventos agere Mercurii est." (Boccaccio (1511), f. 17v.) And when Jupiter in the *Aeneid* (4, 223) calls upon Mercury to go to the heavens and drive the clouds, he explicitly refers to the winds as "zephyrs": "Vade ade, nate, voca zephyros et labere pinnis."
- 140 Ficino (1576), vol. II, p. 1367 ("Cap. VI: "Quæ fit anima omnis atque tota, & quomodo principium motus [...]"): "Intellectualem vero proprietatem eiusmodi atque multiformem, naturaliter peperit

in se ipso, & in sequentia protulit, quemadmodum varia nubes accepto Solis radio, colores in se varios procreat. Nubes igitur ut simpliciter luceat, efficienter habet a sole, ut autem tali quodam colore refulgeat, habet saltem formaliter ex se ipsa.” (“[The soul] naturally gives birth to the intellect’s multitude of forms [?], in the same way as the changing cloud, when it catches the radiance of the sun, itself produces various colours. That the cloud shines has its cause in the sun, but that it reflects this light with a certain colour has its cause in itself.”)

141 *Ibid.*, pp. 1939-45: “Ex Michaelē Psello De Dæmonibus”; on cloud forms, see p. 1942 (“Quomodo dæmones occupant hominem, loquantur, moveant, se transformant.”): “[...] corpora vero dæmonum, simplicia sunt ductu, flexuque, facilia, ad omnemque configurationem naturaliter apta, sicut enim nubes suspicimus nunc hominum, nunc ursorum, nunc draconum aliorum ve præferre figuras [...].” (“The bodies of the demons are light and simple in movement and suppleness, naturally able to assume all sorts of forms, in the same way as we are led to think that clouds assume the form of humans, bears, dragons and other things.”) Psellus’ influence on cloud images in 15th-century painting is discussed generally in Janson (1973), pp. 58 and 66, n. 48.

142 Ficino (1576), vol. I, p. 844: “Imitatio ad Rusticandum. Marsilius Ficinus Ioanni Cavalcanti amico unico, S.D.” The letter in its totality goes like this (with thanks to Patrick Kragelund’s Danish translation):

“I would think you lighter than any breeze, should you perhaps think that I, moved by some breeze or other, had travelled from the city out to the Careggian hills. But nothing would be further from my mind than to have any thought of him as mobile, he who has more weight than the rocks themselves. For, as it has indeed been my opinion that it was not without reason why it would be much preferable if you came up to me on the mountain than if I in these times descended the mountain to you, I have accordingly implored Apollo to prescribe to my lyre the songs of Orpheus and Amphion with which they in days of old moved oaks and rocks, so that I thus could attract you, who in my opinion is such a wooden and rocky man, out to me.

But Apollo replied: ‘You are entirely mistaken, my Marsilius, for Giovanni is neither of wood nor stone. Otherwise your citar would long since have enticed him out to you. No, of wood or stone Giovanni is not fashioned. There is here need of more powerful artistry. Now you must endeavour to change the form of this stone rather than its location. Using Zoroaster’s art of transformation you must transform the big rock on Monte Vecchio to a magnet, and in so doing draw the iron-man out here.’

That was Apollo’s reply to me as I walked at daybreak in Monte Vecchio’s forest. So now I am pondering this. See, my friend – I entreat you – what great matters I ponder for your sake. See, how you force me to exert myself to no avail. O how it would be better and easier if you changed voluntarily, rather than the rocks having to be changed by me. When first you cease to be as unyielding as iron, then I shall indeed cease to exert myself in vain.”

143 “[...] quadam commotum aura [...]”; “[...] qui vel saxis est gravior.”

144 “[...] Orphei Amphionisque dictaret carmina, quibus illi quondam quercus et saxa movebant, quo ipse te arboreum, meo iudicio, saxeamque tra herem.”

- 145 “Ingens istud Vecchij montis saxum, (si potes) metamorphosea Zoroastris arte transferas in magnetem [...]”

Chapter 12

The Architecture of the Underworld

- 1 Clark (1949), p. 21.
- 2 Martines (1979), p. 267.
- 3 The ground plan for the following is outlined for the first time in Wamberg (1990).
- 4 For more miniatures by de' Russi and Giraldi, see Michelini Tocci (1965); for another example by Guindaleri, see Salmi (1956), Tf. 469.
- 5 Pennick (1979), pp. 21-22.
- 6 Friis Johansen (1955), pp. 96-99.
- 7 Jerome, *Letters*, XXII, 7.
- 8 Colour reproduction in Giovannucci Vigi (1993), p. 174. See Russo (1987); Meiss (1974), pp. 134-40.
- 9 For the following, see Pieper (1987), pp. 140-45; Rossi-Osmida (1974), pp. 17-18.
- 10 *De architectura*, 2.1.
- 11 See also *Centaur attacked by Tigers*, Berlin, Staatliche Museen, reproduced in Jahn (1975), Abb. 1; and *Scene by the Sea with Galathea*, from House of Livia, reproduced in Pfuhl, vol. III (1923), Abb. 730.
- 12 See also Sellaio's religious scenes in Milan, Contessa Rasini Collection, reproduced in Berenson (1963), vol. II, fig. 826, and in University of Göttingen (reproduced in *Katalog der Gemäldesammlung der Universität Göttingen* (1926), No. 164 – here there are also oblique bridging blocks and a perfectly formed natural arch); Pinturicchio, *Saint Bernardino Liberating a Prisoner*, panel, Perugia, Galleria Nazionale dell'Umbria, reproduced in Zeri (1987), Ill. 528; Luca Signorelli and Bartolomeo della Gatta, *Moses' Testament and Death*, fresco, Vatican, Sistine Chapel, reproduced in *ibid.*, Ill. 606; Domenico Ghirlandaio, *Adoration of the Shepherds* (1485), Florence, Santa Trinità.
- 13 Martineau (1992), cat. 65.
- 14 Lightbown (1986), p. 36.
- 15 *Sophist*, 265e.
- 16 Pochat (1973), pp. 101-02.
- 17 Ficino (1964), XIII, 3, vol. 2, p. 223: “Denique homo omnia divinae naturae opera imitatur et naturae inferioris opera perficit, corrigit et emendat.” English translation in Ficino (2004), Book XIII, ch. 3.1.
- 18 Alberti (1966), pp. 93-94: “Nascose la natura e' metalli, nascose l'oro e l'altre minere sotto grandissimi monti e ne' luoghi desertissimi. Noi frugoli omicciuoli lo producemmo in luce e ponemmo fra' primi usi. Ella disperse le gemme lucidissime e in forma quanto a lei ottima maestra parse attissima. Noi le raccoglemmo persino dalle ultimi ed estremissime regioni, e cincischianle diamoli nuova lima e forma. [...] Stavansi e' marmi giacendo in terra: noi li collocammo sulle fronti de'tempi e sopra a'nostri capi. E tanto ci dispiace ogni naturale libertà di qualunque cosa

- procreata, che ancora ardimmo soggiogarci a servitù noi istessi. E a tutte queste inezie nacquero e crebbero artefici innumerabili, segni e argomenti certissimi di nostra stoltizia. Aggiungi ancora la poca concordia dell'uomo quale egli ha con tutte le cose create e seco stessi, quasi come giurasse in sé osservare ultima crudeltà e immanità. Volle el suo ventre essere pubblica sepultura di tutte le cose, erbe, piante, frutti, uccelli, quadrupedi, vermi, pesci; nulla sopra terra, nulla sotto terra, nulla che esso non divorì.”
- 19 Eliade (1962), pp. 47-49; Sébillot (1894), pp. 392-96.
- 20 Discussed in Camille (1996), pp. 139-40.
- 21 Eliade (1962), p. 51.
- 22 Another depiction of the coupling cave/work is found in Theophilus Schweighart's *Speculum saphicum rhodostauroticum* (1604), reproduced in Roob (1997), p. 333.
- 23 Roob (1997), p. 31.
- 24 *Summa theologica*, I, 115, 1, see Aquinas (1949ff.).
- 25 See Ross (1971), pp. 110, 137-41 and 250-55.
- 26 Thomas Aquinas, *Summa theologica*, I, 115, 1: “[...] sed tamen unum corpus est infra alterum, in quantum est in potentia ad id quod habet aliud in actu.” (“[...] but one body is under another, as much as it has potential for that which another body already possesses in action.”)
- 27 Biedermann (1986), vol. II, pp. 294-96.
- 28 Klossowski de Rola (1988), p. 44.
- 29 Cited in *Eröffnete Geheimnisse des Steins der Weisen oder Schatz-Kammer der Alchymie* (1718), p. 361: “Es ist ein Stein, und doch kein Stein,/ In disem ligt die Kunst allein;/ Die Natur hats also gemacht,/ Doch zur Volkommenheit nicht bracht;/ Seins gleichen wirdt auff Erd nicht funden,/ Es wechst auff Bergen und in Gründen,/ Materiam Primam thuts mans nennen;/ Der ist gar Weiss, der solches mag kennen.” This text builds upon *Aureum vellus* (*Goldene Vlies*), one of the first German-language alchemy books, originally published 1598 in Rorschach near Bodensee. The publisher is unknown and the source originals were mainly Latin manuscripts.
- 30 *Physics*, 2, 199a 10ff.
- 31 Woodbridge (1965), p. 52.
- 32 Pieper (1987), p. 154; Dixon (1981), p. 23 and figs. 160-62 (16th-century illustrations of *domus*).
- 33 In Girolamo dai Libri's *Nativity with Rabbits* (c. 1500), Verona, Museo di Castelvecchio, the fertility symbolism is also explicit: rabbits by a cave entrance, reproduced in Levi d'Ancona (1977a), p. 309. Architectonic features are also coupled with organic features in Ferrarese Jacopo Filippo d'Argenta's chorale manuscripts for Ferrara Cathedral (1481ff.; PLATE 40), Ferrara, Museo della Cattedrale. See Giuvannucci Vigi (1983), pp. 201-22. Many of the miniatures have echoes in the chorales for San Francesco d'Assisi in Brescia, now in Pinacoteca Tosio e Martinengo, see Calabi (1938), pp. 57-67.
- 34 *Metamorphoses*, 3, 159-60.
- 35 *De re aedificatoria*, 2, 9.

- 36 In *De re aedificatoria*, 9, 4 Alberti states, furthermore, that travertine foam was used in the garden grottos of antiquity, what Ovid called “living rock” (“pumice vivo”, see *Metamorphoses*, 3, 159-60; also *Fasti*, 2, 315).
- 37 Leonardo (1939), vol. II, 980, p. 166: “le falde delle pietre vive”.
- 38 Cited in Hope (1980), p. 112.
- 39 See the red and blue pebbles in, for example, Gratian’s *Decretum*, printed in Venice 1473 and illuminated by Giraldi 1474, Museo Civico di Schifanoia, f. 91; or the Giraldi studio’s chorales for Ferrara’s Certosa, no. 2 and L/A (after 1468), also Museo Civico di Schifanoia. See Herrmann (1900), pp. 117ff. A similar rock landscape, sprinkled with glinting stones and studded with ferocious peaks, can be seen in a West French manuscript of c. 1440 (from Angers?) of Batholomeus Anglicus’ *Propriété des Choses*, but here the subject is due to a specific iconography – the author’s list of precious stones and metals – and not, as in the aforementioned case, the paradigm (Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, ms fr. 136, f. 73., reproduced and discussed in Cahn (1991), pp. 22-23).
- 40 For the following, see: Pochat (1990), pp. 203-04; Campbell (1997), p. 126.
- 41 The codex title is *Ordine de le Noze de lo illustrissimo Signor Misir Costantino Sforza de Aragonia: et de la illustrissima Madona Camilia de Aragonia sua consorte nel anno MCCCCLXXV infrascripto*.
- 42 *Alchemie*, Freiburg 1960, pp. 10ff., cited in Pochat (1990), p. 204: “eine unermessliche Sammlung unerschaffener Dinge”.
- 43 Eliade (1971), p. 54; Sébillot (1894), pp. 415-17.
- 44 See Fabricius (1976), p. 38.
- 45 This information is provided in Trismosin’s treatise *Wanderschafft*, p. 4, in *Aureum Vellus*, the collection of tracts published in Rorschach 1598. The collection also included the first publication of *Splendor Solis*. See Fabricius (1976), p. 243. However, Trismosin might be an invention.
- 46 Hartt (1952), pp. 340-41; Kern (1982), pp. 268 and 279-81.
- 47 Reproduced in Kern (1982), fig. 344.
- 48 Ziggurat-like terraced rocks also feature in Lorenzo de’ Medici’s library. See, for example, *All’ombra del Lauro* (1992), pp. 136 (Plut. 16, 4, f. 1), and p. 137 (Plut. 63, 2, f. 3), where there are water canals on the plateaus and, uppermost, a plant with a bird on it. Moreover, *ibid.* pp. 144 (Plut. 13, 6, f. 1), 136 (Plut. 16, 4, f. 1), 129 (Plut. 82, 6, f. 1), where bees swarm around a beehive shaped exactly like the underlying cylindrical rocks.
- 49 See, for example, Augustine, *De civitate Dei*, 7, 24, with citation from Varro.
- 50 See also his Vatican *Deposition*, reproduced in Christiansen, Kanter and Strehlke (1988), p. 189.
- 51 *Bible of Borso d’Este*, illuminated by, *inter alios*, Taddeo Crivelli and Franco de’ Russi: Modena, Biblioteca Estense, ms V. G. 12=Lat. 429, reproduced facsimile in Treccani Degli Alfieri (1961). See also the Ferrarese chorale miniatures from the second half of the 15th century in Collezione Hoepli, reproduced in Toesca (1930), tav. CXVI and CXVIII. Pietro Guindaleri’s Pliny miniatures: especially ff. 45v (min. 25; reproduced in Bovero (1957), fig. 4), and 82 (min. 12).
- 52 On the stone images, see Daston (1998) and Baltrušaitis (1983), pp. 87-149. See also the final section of the current chapter.

- 53 A similar border illustration, in which the river systems are also included, can be seen in a second copy of the same work (after 1321), Oxford, ms Tanner 190, f. 175v, reproduced in Degenhart-Schmitt (1980), vol. II-1, Abb. 23, p. 16.
- 54 A slightly earlier manuscript, a northeast French edition of Moses ben Abraham's *Chroniques de la Bible* from c. 1300 (The Hague, Koninklijke Bibliotheek, ms 131 A 3), there is a related border miniature describing one of Daniel's dream visions: four beasts forced from the sea by the four winds (Daniel 7: 1-27; reproduced in Cahn (1991), p. 17). Rather than depicting the usual medieval personifications of winds (cf. chapter 7), the illuminator has here released the actual winds (*tourbillons de vent*): chaotic wave formations which, like the rocks in the Sanudo manuscript, float in a strangely independent way around the border. Naturalism is obviously born of a semantic licentiousness in the periphery.
- 55 F. Mercier, the only scholar to have addressed the phenomenon (in Mercier (1968), pp. 82-84), writes pertinently of "expérimentations spatiales uniques en Quattrocento".
- 56 See Baltrušaitis (1954), pp. 31-40; Fabricius Hansen (1996b), pp. 99-100.
- 57 Clark (1949), p. 87.
- 58 Perrig (1980), p. 51: "ohne [...] die Vorstellung eines unsichtbaren Gärtners".
- 59 *Ibid.*, pp. 59-60; Leonardo (1939), vol. II, 981 and 983, pp. 166-67.
- 60 Snow-Smith (1987); Stefaniak (1997). These two articles provide the basis for the following.
- 61 Stefaniak (1997), pp. 4-5.
- 62 Snow-Smith (1987), p. 94.
- 63 Sermo II: "De nominatione Mariae", Mariale, f. M 5, cited in Stefaniak (1997), p. 8.
- 64 The narcissus are noted by Stefaniak (1997), p. 24, and linked to the Madonna's mirror-like brooch. The idea that Mary is looking down into the water was suggested by Mary Garrard in 1992.
- 65 Stefaniak (1997), pp. 18-25.
- 66 Alberti (1975), II, 26. Translation from Alberti (1972), p. 63.
- 67 *Trattato della pittura*, Leonardo (1956), I, 34; cf. also the present chapter 8.
- 68 This idea of self-referentiality in Leonardo's painting has, as far as I am aware, never been presented before.
- 69 *Aeneid*, I, 166-68, see chapter 2.
- 70 Stefaniak (1997), p. 22.
- 71 Luke I: 41.
- 72 Song of Songs 2: 13-14. Robertson (1954), pp. 92-95, suggests a connection to this passage, albeit with no mention of the hand.
- 73 *Timaeus*, 50 a-c.
- 74 Stefaniak (1997), p. 34, n. 102.
- 75 Pseudo-Cavalca's description in *La vita di San Giovanni Battista*, cited in Snow-Smith (1987), pp. 52-53. Gabriel's pointing hand has been left out of the later London version of *Virgin of the Rocks*, presumably because it made for too blatant an accentuation of John the Baptist in the role of Saint Francis (Snow-Smith (1987), p. 63) (see also below).

- 76 See, for example, Domenico Veneziano's *Santa Lucia Altarpiece* in Florence, Uffizi.
- 77 Dante (1994), 32, 24-30, p. 354 (although, in this 1994 edition, the translator has changed the order between Augustine and Francis).
- 78 *Vita secunda*, 1, 3, in Habig (1973), p. 364; see also Snow-Smith (1987), p. 59.
- 79 Matthew 27: 51.
- 80 *Gospel of Nicodemus*, 13: 11-14, cited in Snow-Smith (1987), p. 75. Nicodemus' ideas were spread from the 13th century onwards through the popular writings of Vincent of Beauvais and Jacobus de Voragine (*ibid.*, p. 93, n. 117).
- 81 Habig (1973), p. 1438; see also Snow-Smith (1987), p. 69, and Schama (1995), pp. 436-39.
- 82 Cited in Snow-Smith (1987), p. 69. The work is used again by the Franciscan preacher Saint Bernardino of Siena in the first half of the 15th century in his many sermons on the theme Franciscus alter Christus.
- 83 Perrig (1980), p. 67.
- 84 Leonardo's two drawings were executed as directions for Charles d'Amboise c. 1506-08 and are now in the British Library, Codex Arundel, ff. 231v and 224. On Poliziano's play and Leonardo's scenery, see Pedretti (1964), pp. 25-34; Marinoni (1957), pp. 273-87; Pochat (1990), pp. 226-28. On *sacre rappresentazioni* of the Nativity, see Pochat (1990), p. 228.
- 85 The whole passage: "E tirato dalla mia bramosa voglia, vago di vedere la gran copia delle varie e strane forme dalla artificiosa natura, raggiratomì alquanto infra gli ombrosi scogli, pervenni all'entrata d'una gran caverna; dinanzi alla quale, restato alquanto stupefatto e ignorante di tal cosa, pegato le mie reni in arco, e ferma la stanca mano sopra il ginocchio, e colla destra mi feci ten[ebre] alle abbassate e chiuse ciglia; e spesso piegandomi in qua e in là per [ve]dere se dentro vi discernessi alcuna cosa; e questo vietatomì [per] la grande oscuri[tà] che là entro era. E stato alquanto, subito sa[l]se in me due cose, paura e desiderio; paura per la minac[cian]te e scura spilonca, desiderio per vedere se là entro fusse alcu[na] miracolosa cosa." Cited in Leonardo (1974), pp. 184-85.
- 86 Leonardo (1974), p. 133: "De' denari e oro. Uscirà delle cavernose spelonche chi farà con sudore affaticare tutti i popoli del mondo, con grandi affanni, ansietà, sudori, per essere aiutato da lui." *Ibid.*, p. 74: "Salvatico è quel che si salva." See also Emison (1993), p. 117.
- 87 Cited in Pochat (1973), p. 129.
- 88 Ficino (1964), 13, 3, 6, vol. 2, p. 225. English translation in Ficino (2004).
- 89 Pochard (1973), p. 292, n. 189, and p. 319.
- 90 Martines (1979), p. 267.
- 91 *Diario ferrarese dall'anno 1409 sino al 1502 di autori incerti* (ed. G. Pardi), in *Rerum Italicarum Scriptores*, rev. ed. vol. 24, pt. VII, Bologna, 1928, here cited from Gundesheimer (1973), pp. 155-56: "(MCCCCLXXI, de Zenaro, lo illustrissimo duca Borso cominciò dare principio a fare una montagna de terra per forza de carri, navi et brozi et de opere manuali, che era una grande facenda;) del che tutto il populo se ne redoleva molto, perchè non era utile alcuno et li contadini non poteano lavorare le possessione per cagione de dicto lavoriero; et faceva fare questa montagna dove se chiama Monte

- Sancto; et di questo il populo mor'morava molto." See also Gibbons (1966), p. 410. No. 76 of an engraved view of Ferrara from c. 1600 is designated "Montagna grande", reproduced in Walker (1956), fig. 15, p. 30.
- 92 See Sannazaro (1961), X (prose), 5, pp. 79-80: "Et intrati nel santo pineto, trovammo sotto una pendente ripa, fra ruinati sassi una spelunca vecchissima e grande, non so se naturalmente o se da manuale artificio cavata nel duro monte [...]"
- 93 Damisch (1972), p. 184 (English translation in Damisch (2002), p. 132), refers similarly to "the vanishing lines of the ground, treated in curvilinear perspective". Also, of Mantegna's rock, he synthesises interestingly, albeit only in part correctly, that with its phantasmagorical folds it fulfils a similar function to Correggio's cloud, stretched out as it is in the indeterminate area between depictable and non-depictable. Although it would seem plausible that both Mantegna's rocks and Correggio's clouds deal with the relationship between representation and nature, the proper phantasmagorical dimension – i.e. the indeterminacy of artificiality expanding so far as to the surroundings, flickering between interpretant, representamen and object – is still a speciality of Mantegna.
- 94 See Prager and Scaglia (1972), pp. 3-4.
- 95 *De ingeneis* is divided between Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, ms lat. 197 (books I-II) and Florence, Biblioteca Nazionale, ms Palatino 766 (books III-IV). *De machinis*: Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, ms Clm. 28800, reproduced in Scaglia (1971).
- 96 Scaglia (1971), vol. 1, p. 19.
- 97 *Naturalis historia*, 36, 1-2.
- 98 Fabricius Hansen (1996b).
- 99 Winkelmann et al. (1958), pp. 69-72; p. 69: "Neither the Earlier nor the High Middle Ages know of mining representations."
- 100 Vienna, Nationalbibliothek. For a detailed survey, see Winkelmann et al. (1958), pp. 72-79.
- 101 Pen and watercolour, Aulendorf, Fürstlich zu Waldburg-Wolfeggisches Kupferstichkabinet; see Filedt Kok (1985), p. 17.
- 102 Cited in Bromehead (1956), vol. 2, p. 25.
- 103 See also Wood (1993), figs. 35 and 70.
- 104 *Ibid.*, p. 119.
- 105 The woodcut, with no explanatory remarks, is reproduced in Winkelmann et al. (1958). I have not had access to Palz's treatise and therefore cannot support my interpretation of the woodcut with written evidence – if, that is, such testimony exists.
- 106 Forbes (1966), p. 145.
- 107 See Bucci (1965).
- 108 Compare, for example, Herri met de Bles' *Landscape with Mining Scenes* (fig. 12.49) with his *Landscape with Saint John the Baptist Preaching* (Brussels, Musées Royaux des Beaux-Arts de Belgique), reproduced in Gibson (1989), fig. 2.46.

- 109 Ruhmer (1959), p. 8. Cossa's grandfather, great-grandfather, uncle and great-uncle were also employed in this occupation.
- 110 See Roob (1997), p. 516.
- 111 See also the two watercourses flanking the diagram of the alchemical transformation in A.T. de Limojon de Saint-Didier's *Le triomphe hermétique* (1689), in Christopher Love Morley and Theodorus Muylkens' *Collectanea chymica* (Leiden: Cornelius Boutesteyn and Frederik Haaring 1693), reproduced in Klossowski de Rola (1988), p. 304. The text of the German-language edition of *Le triomphe hermétique* (Frankfurt, 1765), which includes a redrawing of the same illustration, refers to "two parabolic streams [...] which together yield the mysterious triangular stone [i.e. the Philosophers' Stone, the instrument for the alchemical transformation]" (see Roob (1997), p. 411). On a different level, Gentili (1982), p. 574, suggests that the sewer entrances in the *Miracles of Saint Vincent Ferrer* refer to Borso's hydraulic works in Ferrara.
- 112 For the following, see Signorini (1985), pp. 153-69.
- 113 *Geography*, 5, 3, 11.
- 114 On Valla (with citation), see Baxandall (1971), pp. 118-19. In Goldthwaite (1980), pp. 212-37, there is an instructive historical summary of quarrying in Western Late Middle Ages; Goldthwaite is, however, silent on its attitudinal implications.
- 115 The dating is apparent from Guindaleri's complaint in 1489 to Francesco Gonzaga that he has not been paid for the completion of "quello Plinio opera di certo superba, che rappresenta la fatica di qualche decennio." See Luzio (1908), pp. 59-60.
- 116 See Bovero (1957), pp. 261-65.
- 117 Signorini (1985), p. 155. Mantegna possibly also illuminates the abovementioned coupling of hermit plus mining and quarrying milieus. Not only had the area around Tivoli been the main supplier of stone for the art works of Rome, but the area by the Anio river was also particularly abundant in monks and anchorites. See the cave by the natural arch above the grooms, where two praying figures feature in front of two cowl-clad monks, one standing and one sitting (Signorini (1985), p. 158, detail reproduced in *ibid.*, fig. 67).
- 118 Sachs (s. a.), pp. 51-52; Ferguson (1954), p. 107.
- 119 Panofsky (1953), vol. I, p. 186, makes no mention of Barbara's connection to mine-work.
- 120 It was recently discovered that the Copenhagen painting was in the collection of the Italian-born Briton Ignazio Hugford, before being sold in 1753 to the Roman Cardinal and Papal Secretary of State, Silvio Valenti Gonzaga. After Valenti Gonzaga's death in 1756, it came in 1763 to its permanent home in the collection of the Danish king (now the Danish state). Despite the Mantuan origins of the Valenti Gonzaga family, Hugford's earlier ownership of the painting thus disproves any certainty about a possible Mantuan provenance (see Perini (1993), p. 551). I am indebted to Chris Fischer and Charles Dempsey for this reference. For the following, see Wamberg (1991).
- 121 Hartt (1952).
- 122 "Qui natus olim ex virgine nunc e sepulcro nasceris." Cited in Hirn (1912), p. 337.
- 123 Migne, *Patrologia Latina*, 112, col. 887.

- 124 See Wamberg (1991) and Andreas Hauser's well-argued reading of the painting in Hauser (2000b), pp. 450-59.
- 125 *Naturalis historia*, 33, 1, 1. In her short, astute article (Emison (1993)), Patricia Emison links the related passages from Alberti's *Theogenius* cited above with both Leonardo's painting and Mantegna's *Madonna of the Stonecutters*. She very precisely submits that Mantegna's rock is profaned by the stonemasons, whereas Leonardo's is virginal. However, as she is not aware of Alberti's use of the Golden Age topos, she presumes that Mantegna's agricultural activities on the left, including pastoralism, are also part of the rape on equal terms with the quarrying. This, as we have seen, is unlikely. On Leonardo, see later in the current chapter.
- 126 Isaiah 14: 18-19. See also 2 Kings 9: 30-37.
- 127 Hartt (1952), p. 338, identifies the harvest as wheat, but ripe wheat is not green.
- 128 For the linking of lust and idolatry, see for instance Colossians 3: 5.
- 129 On the column's connotations to antiquity, see Bandmann (1970), n. 75, p. 148.
- 130 See also the Louvre *Sketchbook*, f. 19v (*Saint Jerome in the Wilderness*). This and the following mentioned folios are reproduced in Eisler (1989).
- 131 An equivalent scene, in which only the actual statue is being worked on, can be seen in the *British Museum Sketchbook*, f. 69v.
- 132 As free-standing basins with conical base: British Museum, f. 70v. With column and idol: British Museum, ff. 66v and 75; Louvre, ff. 7 and 17.
- 133 Degenhart and Schmitt (1968-90), vol. II, 6 (1990), p. 370.
- 134 Fabricius Hansen (1994), pp. 12-13.
- 135 Hauser (2000b), the first to comment on the erection, pursues a similar interpretation (pp. 458-79).
- 136 Camille (1989), p. 33.
- 137 Book of Wisdom 15: 7-17.
- 138 Book of Daniel 2: 31-35. The modern English Bible merely states that "a stone was cut out" and not, as in the Latin *Vulgata*, that it was from the mountain. This is first specified in verse 45: "a stone was cut from a mountain".
- 139 *Monitum in Homiliis de S. Virginis Deiparae Mysteryis*, 16, Migne, *Patrologia Graeca*, 98, col. 307, here cited from Snow-Smith (1987), p. 35: "Ave, Dei mons praepinguis et umbrosus: in quo enutritus [...]. Agnus peccata atque infirmitates nostras portavit; mons e quo devolutus ille, nulla manu praecisus, lapis, contrivit aras idolorum, et factus est 'incaput anguli, mirabilis in oculis nostris'." Snow-Smith links this passage to Leonardo's *Virgin of the Rocks*.
- 140 Migne, *Patrologia Latina*, 112, col. 980: "Lapis [...]. Hunc lapidem et Daniel de monte sine manibus intellexit, ut hic est Christum de populo Judæorum sine opere conjugali progenitum, qui postea in montem magnum factus implevit universam faciem terræ: quod tam gentes, quam Judæos fecundaverat verbo doctrinae suæ." *Ibid.* col. 1001: "Mons, virgo Maria ut in Daniele: 'Abscissus lapis de monte sine manibus', quod Christus de Maria natus est sine virili semine."

- 141 Hauser convincingly observes that these crystals can, furthermore, be seen as the wildly bristling hair of a monstrous, proto-Arcimboldean profile whose eye, nose and jutting under-jaw are evoked by the left side of the mountain (Hauser (2001), p. 149).
- 142 Eliade (1971), p. 43.
- 143 See 1 Peter 2: 4; 1 Corinthians 10: 4. According to, for example, Pseudo-Albertus Magnus's *De occultis naturae* (13th century) alchemy's *lapis* should be understood as the Infant Christ in Bethlehem; this stone possesses a wonderful power [*effectus mirabilis virtutis*]; see Haaning (1993), p. 178.
- 144 "simil cose non sono tutte della natura nè tutte dell'arte, ma vi hanno ambedue parte, aiutandosi l'una l'altra – come per dare un esempio, la natura da il suo diamante ò carbonchio ò cristallo et simile altra materia rozza et informe, et l'arte gli pulisce, riquadra, intagli etc. [...]" Cited in Berti (1967), p. 63.
- 145 First noted by Christiansen in Martineau (1992), p. 394.
- 146 I am indebted to Maria Fabricius Hansen for this idea. See also Fabricius Hansen (1996b), pp. 128-30 and 242-44.
- 147 Hauser (2000b), pp. 484ff., also notes the marble-like aspect of Christ's body and similarly links it to the paragone between painting and sculpture.
- 148 Camille (1989), p. 30; Koerner (1993), pp. 80-126.
- 149 *Della pittura*, II, 1.
- 150 *Trattato di architettura*, f. 181, cited in Gilbert (1980), p. 90.
- 151 I am indebted to Maria Fabricius Hansen for this observation.
- 152 *Elegies*, 3, 2, 8: "[...] saxa Cithaeronis Thebas agitata per artem sponte sua in muri membra coisse ferunt [...]."
- 153 Lucian, *Astrology*, 22; *Odyssey*, 8, 265ff. On Mantegna's use of these texts, see Wind (1948), pp. 9ff. and Wind (1949), p. 229, n. 47. For a synthesising, albeit deficient, outline of previous interpretations, see Lightbown (1986), pp. 189-201.
- 154 Hauser (2000a), pp. 23-25.
- 155 On Apollo's identification with Orpheus, see *ibid.*, pp. 35-39.
- 156 Wind (1948), p. 10.
- 157 "Pegaso novo, al cui un fluente/ Fonte risorge in arrido terreno", cited in Luzio and Renier (1902), p. 247, n. 3. Ariosto later said of the same poet (*Orlando furioso*, 42, 91, cited in *ibid.*, p. 247): "And a Marco Cavallo, who will cause such a fount of poetry to spring from Ancona,/ just like the winged horse did from the mountain/ I do not know if it was from Parnassus or Helicon." ("Et un Marco Cavallo, che tal fonte/ Farà di poesia nascer d'Ancona,/ Qual fè il cavallo alato uscir dal monte/ Non so se di Parnaso o d'Elicona.")
- 158 "[...] è doctissima, che è stata al monte de Parnaso et a la fonte pegasea [...]; and "[...] tucta dedita a le Muse [...]" Cited in *ibid.*, p. 246.
- 159 Hauser (2000a), pp. 29-32.
- 160 This and the following play of lines are observed in Jones (1981), pp. 193-98.

- 161^a A similar conclusion is reached by Hauser (2000a, p. 37), who, moreover, observes a line going from Vulcan's eye through his left curved hand and up to Venus' genitals, also a sign of his cleansing. Hauser also convincingly detects a geometry emphasising the link between Venus' and Mars' love and the sources of poetry: a line linking the floor of the natural arch with the right waterfall, and a line going from this waterfall through Venus' genitals and on to the left waterfall (Hauser (2000a), p. 31).
- 162 On *Harmonia* and the love between Mars and Venus, see Panofsky (1939), pp. 163-64.
- 163 Wind (1948), p. 86.
- 164 The reference to Nicander (handed down in Antonius Liberalis' *Metamorphoses*) is found in E. Tietze-Conrat's attack on Wind's book, Tietze-Conrat (1949), pp. 127-28, albeit the author links the citation with Vulcan's rocks. In his response to this attack, Wind (1949), p. 229, Wind remarks, quite rightly, that Pegasus is situated too far away from the volcanic formations for it to be their growth he has to stop. Neither Tietze-Conrat nor Wind observe, however, the Hippocrene spring's crystals.
- 165 Ovid, *Metamorphoses*, I, 313-19.
- 166 *Ibid.*, I, 383 and 388-415.
- 167 *Naturalis historia*, 37, 3, 5-6: "Post hunc anulum regis alterius in fama est gemma, Pyrrhi illius, qui adversus Romanos bellum gessit. Namque habuisse dicitur achaten in qua novem Musae et Apollo citharem tenens spectarentur, non arte, sed naturae sponte ita discurrentibus maculis ut Muis quoque singulis sua redderentur insignia." Baltrušaitis (1983), pp. III-13, pursues the fate of the Pyrrhus agate in the various versions of Marbodius' *Lapidarium* (Migne, *Patrologia Latina*, 171) between the 11th and 15th centuries. See also Alberti (1975), II, 28, pp. 64-65.
- 168 "Über den Begriff der Geschichte IX" (1940), Benjamin, vol. I, 2 (1974), pp. 697-98: "Es gibt ein Bild von Klee, das Angelus Novus heißt. Ein Ängel ist darauf dargestellt, der aussieht, als wäre er im Begriff, sich von etwas zu entfernen, worauf er starrt. Seine Augen sind aufgerissen, sein Mund steht offen und seine Flügel sind ausgespannt. Der Engel der Geschichte muß so aussehen. Er hat das Antlitz der Vergangenheit zugewendet. Wo eine Kette von Begebenheiten vor *uns* erscheint, da sieht *er* eine einzige Katastrophe, die unablässig Trümmer auf Trümmer häuft und sie ihm vor die Füße schleudert. Er möchte wohl verweilen, die Toten wecken und das Zerschlagene zusammenfügen. Aber ein Sturm weht vom Paradiese her, der sich in seinen Flügeln verfangen hat und so stark ist, dass der Engel sie nicht mehr schließen kann. Dieser Sturm treibt ihn unaufhaltsam in die Zukunft, der er den Rücken kehrt, während er Trümmerhaufen, vor ihm zum Himmel wächst. Das, was wir den Fortschritt nennen, ist *dieser* Sturm."
- 169 *Het Schilder-Boeck*, I, 8, 32, cited in Brown (1986), p. 41.
- 170 "Vetustas omnia deformavit", Piccolomini (1984), 5, 27, pp. 986-87. For drawing my attention to this and several other passages concerning the ruin in early modernity, and also for many inspiring discussions since 1991 about this and related topics, I am indebted to Maria Fabricius Hansen. Fabricius Hansen's extensive account of the significance of the ruin in late medieval Italy

- is published in Fabricius Hansen (1996) and *idem* (1999). My own thoughts on the iconological significance of the ruin were first presented in my unpublished MA dissertation (1990).
- 171 “invidioso della gloria delli mortali” and “edace lima: e venenoso morso”, cited in Rowland (1994), p. 100.
- 172 Cited in Gibson (1989), p. 55.
- 173 Nicolson (1959).
- 174 Grant (1974), pp. 619-20.
- 175 Leonardo (1939), Nos. 983 (first citation from Milan, Biblioteca Ambrosiana, ms C.A. (c. 1483-1518), f. 126v) and 953 (previously Norfolk, Holkham Hall, Leicester Library (c. 1504-06), f. 20): “Come li scogli e promontori de’ mari al continuo ruinano e si consumano”. See also *ibid.*, Nos. 954, 976 and 979-81, and Perrig (1980), p. 59.
- 176 *Het Schilder-Boeck*, I, 8, 34, cited in Brown (1986), p. 41.
- 177 Spengler (1972), pp. 328-29, also notes the significance of the ruin to the Faustian culture and its corresponding absence prior to this culture.
- 178 Troy, for example: *Troy Being Plundered and Destroyed by the Greeks, Roman de Troye* (Naples, 1300-1310), Tours, Bibliothèque Municipale, ms 953, reproduced in Degenhart and Schmitt, vol. II-3 (1980), Tf. II4 (cat. 679).
- 179 The effect is described precisely by Heckscher (1937-38), pp. 210-12. Strangely, Heckscher’s observations have long had no follow-up. See Fabricius Hansen (1999), pp. 42-47.
- 180 Camille (1989), p. 5.
- 181 Heckscher (1937-38), p. 211. The phenomenon is also discussed in Fabricius Hansen (1999), who notes, in addition, a similar unbrokenness in pre-modern depictions of buildings under construction (pp. 42-47).
- 182 As an argument to explain the intact appearance of medieval buildings, Heckscher similarly turns to contemporaneous ideas of beauty being identical with completeness (Heckscher (1937-38), pp. 210-12).
- 183 Isaiah 34: 13-14; 13: 19-22.
- 184 *Adoration of the Magi, Strozzi Altarpiece*, Florence, Galleria degli Uffizi.
- 185 Panofsky (1953), pp. 133-34.
- 186 Panofsky (1960), p. 113.
- 187 Fabricius Hansen (1996), pp. 104-08; *idem* (1999), pp. 216-18 and 231-36.
- 188 Alberti (1988), 3, 14, p. 86: bone, flesh, nerves; *ibid.*, 3, 8, p. 73: muscles; *ibid.*, 9, 5, p. 301: animals; *ibid.*, 9, 5, p. 303: the body; *ibid.*, 9, 8, p. 310: animals. Apropos this and the following comments, see also Fabricius Hansen (1999), pp. 164-77.
- 189 Manetti (1970), p. 51.
- 190 Pius II: “porta [...] nudata marmoribus”, in Piccolomini (1984), 9, 19; letter to Leo X: “Cadavero” and “l’ossa del corpo senza carne”, cited in Rowland (1994), p. 100; Poggio: “[...] ut nunc omni decore nudata, prostrata iaceat instar gigantei cadaveris corrupti [...]”, in *De varietate fortunae*, cited

- in Valentini and Zucchetti (1953), p. 23r. I am indebted to Maria Fabricius Hansen for drawing my attention to these passages.
- 191 Cf. also Joseph Koerner's remark about the human corpse generated by 16th-century South German art: "First, as body image, it overturns the Renaissance fiction of the closed and finished person, replacing it with an admonishing vision of the physical dissolution of all boundaries." (Koerner (1993), p. 266.)
- 192 2 Kings 8: 30-37.
- 193 *Epistola*, Valentini and Zucchetti (1953), p. 93: "Dici solet, et habet certam res ipsa rationem, in ruinosis urbibus, quas aut violentus casus diruit aut vetustas exedit, esse aerem parum salubrem [...]." See also Fabricius Hansen (1999), p. 175.
- 194 Piccolomini (1984), 6, 22, p. 1184: "[...] et murorum quadrati lapides vix credibilis magnitudinis."
- 195 Alberti (1988), 7, 2, p.192. Cf. also Giovanni Dondi, a learned Paduan and Petrarch's friend, who writes in his treatise *Iter romanum* (c. 1375): "In Coliseo [...] fuerunt pilastri 800, omnes de saxis magnis quadratis et magno ingenio laboratis et compositis [...]", cited in Günther (1988), p. 15.
- 196 *Naturalis historia*, 35, 10. The same story is told of Nealces or Apelles and a horse: Dio Chrysostom, *Discourses*, 64. See Janson (1973), p. 56.
- 197 Cf. Damisch (1972), pp. 53 and 55.
- 198 Janson (1973), p. 64.
- 199 Didi-Huberman (1995), cf. chapter 9.
- 200 See the extensive documentation in Baltrušaitis (1983).
- 201 The phenomenon has been thoroughly investigated in an unpublished study by Christopher S. Wood, "Dürer's Hidden Faces" (1987). I am indebted to Christopher Wood for allowing me access to this text.
- 202 The same notion is seen later in A.-J. Dézallier d'Argenville's engraving of a skull-shaped stone (1755), reproduced in Baltrušaitis (1983), p. 134. Hauser, among other instances, also points to a mummy-like figure underneath Christ, hinting at his imminent burial, in the *Agony in the Garden* (fig. 11.42), and to several rock faces in the *Camera degli Sposi* (Hauser (2001), p. 149).
- 203 Campbell (1997), pp. 155-57.
- 204 In Cap. IX, Ficino (1576), vol. II, pp. 1865-66. This and other passages from *Asclepius* are also quoted in Augustine's *De civitate Dei*, 8, 23-24.
- 205 Book Two. Taking Pliny as his source (*Naturalis historia*, 35, 15-16), Alberti has earlier stated that painting was in use among the Egyptians 6,000 years before it reached Greece.
- 206 *Naturalis historia*, 36, 17, 77: "est autem saxo naturali elaborata."
- 207 Cited in Janson (1973), p. 55.
- 208 Cited in *ibid.*, p. 62.
- 209 Alberti (1975), II, 28, pp. 64-65).
- 210 *Naturalis historia*, 36, 5; *Natural History of Stones*, 2, 3, 1. Albertus Magnus himself states that he has seen the picture in the block of marble which everyone agreed had been painted by nature. See Janson (1973), pp. 56-58; also, Baltrušaitis (1983), pp. 114-15.

- 211 Fabricius Hansen (2000).
- 212 Cicero, *De divinatione*, 1, 13, cited in Janson (1973), p. 57.
- 213 *De meteorologica*, 3, 3, 23, cited in Janson (1973), p. 58, n. 16.
- 214 *Apollonios of Tyana*, 2, 22; see Janson (1973), pp. 58-60 and Damisch (1972), pp. 53-54.
- 215 Petrarca (1996), 129, vv. 27-29, p. 625: "Ove porge ombra un pino alto od un colle/ talor m'arresto, et pur nel primo sasso/ disegno co la mente il suo bel viso." Vv. 49-51, *ibid.*, p. 626: "Poi quando il vero sgombra/ quel dolce error, pur li medesimo assido/ me freddo, pietra morta in pietra viva [...]." In the closing hymn to the Virgin Mary, *canzone* 366, v. III, *ibid.*, p. 1400, Laura is referred to explicitly as Medusa: "Medusa et l'error mio m'àn fatto un sasso/ d'umor vano stillante [...]." English translation in Petrarca (1999). I am indebted to the Petrarch scholar Unn Falkeid for reference to these passages and their interpretation.
- 216 Daniel Arasse has spotted, furthermore, a cloudy profile in the *trompe l'oeil* oculus of Camera degli Sposi, and, apart from lesser human faces in the Pallas clouds, Hauser also mentions a panther-like face in the San Zeno *Agony in the Garden* (see Hauser (2001), p. 148).
- 217 Leonardo (1939), vol. 2, 1021, p. 187. The reverse effect, that distant mountains look like clouds, is discussed by van Mander in *Het Schilderboeck* (1604), 1, 8, 8 (cited in Brown (1986), p. 37: "See how that hazy landscape in the distance begins to look like the sky, and almost merges into it. Solid mountains seem to be moving clouds.")
- 218 *De rerum natura*, 4, 133-42: "[Simulacra] quae multis formata modis sublime feruntur nec speciem mutare suam liquentia cessant et cuiusque modi formarum vertere in oras; ut nubes facile interdum concrecere in alto cernimus et mundi speciem violare serenam aera mulcentes motu. Nam saepe Gigantum ora volare videntur et umbram ducere late, interdum magni montes avolsaque saxa montibus anteire et solem succedere praeter, inde alios trahere atque inducere belua nimbos." The connection is noted by Damisch (1972), p. 54.
- 219 See Lightbown (1986), pp. 201-08.
- 220 "ET MIHI VIRTUTUM MATRI SUCCURRITE DIVI" ("And you, O Gods, help me, Mother of Virtues").
- 221 See Battista Spagnoli Mantuano (1499), Lib. 1, ff. 5v and 7: "Totam pudicitiam veram poesis amat." And: "Est Helicon virgo; virgo peneia Daphne; Castalidasque aiunt virgine matre satas. Ite procul veneris vates Heliconis ab amne; Virgeneus vestro laeditur ore liquor." English translation in Lightbown (1986), p. 208.
- 222 For example, *Iliad*, 2, 42-54.
- 223 On this and the following, see Levi d'Ancona (1977b), pp. 98ff. Levi d'Ancona's deliberations are in principle excellent, but when articulated in a polemic with Janson (1973) - cf. the title of her article - they seem to be unnecessarily categorical. That the cloud images have an iconographical stratum does not, of course, preclude other interpretations, including the one proposed by Janson.
- 224 Boccaccio (1511), 8, 1, f. 61.
- 225 Cartari (1571), p. 20. Levi d'Ancona (1977b) claims mistakenly, p. 104, that according to Cartari, the Saturn legend actually ends with an image of a god on horseback in the sky.

- 226 Isaiah 14: 12-14.
- 227 Job 39: 18.
- 228 *Moralium libri*, Migne, *Patrologia Latina*, 76, 596-97.
- 229 Damisch (1972), p. 54, similarly notes the correspondence between cloud-horseman and sculpture fragments; however, he connects them with Foucault's Renaissance *episteme* relating to the homogeneity of things.
- 230 Hauser (2001).
- 231 *Ibid.*, pp. 164-71. Hauser does not, however, involve melancholy in this reading.
- 232 Vasari, vol. III (1878), p. 389. English translation from Vasari (1996), p. 559. The source is presumably a letter from Girolamo Campagnola (c. 1433/35-1522) to Leonico Tomeo (1456-1531). The letter is also reflected in Bernardino Scardeone's *De Antiquitate Urbis Patavii, & claris civibus Patauinis libri tres*, Basle, 1560, p. 373; see Lightbown (1986), pp. 392-93.
- 233 See Christiansen in Martineau (1992), pp. 94-114.
- 234 Amstrong Anderson (1976), pp. 13-14.
- 235 Lohr (1969), p. 429; Kristeller (1960), p. 149.
- 236 Levi d'Ancona (1977b), p. 98.
- 237 de' Thiene (1487), f. 45. The debate was sparked off by Burley (1482) (f. 70). That the relationship between art and nature really was a concern is apparent from the fact that the later version of Burley's Aristotle commentary was supplemented by his *De deo, natura et arte*, see Shapiro (1963), pp. 88-90.

Jacob Wamberg


Landscape as World Picture

Tracing Cultural Evolution in Images

VOLUME II

Early Modernity

Translated by Gaye Kynoch

Aarhus University Press | 

Landscape as World Picture: Tracing Cultural Evolution in Images
Volume II: *Early Modernity*

First published in Danish as *Landskabet som verdensbillede. Naturafbildning og kulturel evolution i Vesten fra hulemalerierne til den tidlige modernitet* by Passepartout, Aarhus, 2005

© Jacob Wamberg and Aarhus University Press 2009

Graphic design and cover: Jørgen Sparre
Cover illustration: Detail from Jan van Eyck, *Madonna of Chancellor Rolin* (c. 1433-34), oil on wood. Paris, Musée du Louvre.
Typesetting: Narayana Press
Type: Legacy Serif and Legacy Sans
Paper: Lessebo Design Smooth and Hello Silk
Printed by Narayana Press, Denmark

Printed in Denmark 2009

ISBN 978 87 7934 287 3

AARHUS UNIVERSITY PRESS
Langelandsgade 177
DK - 8200 Aarhus N
www.unipress.dk

Gazelle Book Services Ltd.
White Cross Mills
Hightown, Lancaster, LA1 4XS
United Kingdom
www.gaxellebookservices.co.uk

The David Brown Book Company
Box 511
Oakville, CT 06779
USA
www.oxbowbooks.com

Published with the financial support of
The Aarhus University Research Foundation
The Danish Research Council for the Humanities (FKK)
The New Carlsberg Foundation
The Novo Nordisk Foundation