

Notes

Introduction

- 1 Riegl (1929), p. 8: "Die Spezialforschung hat durch Jahrzehnte Material in Fülle aufgehäuft und nun erwacht wiederum der unwiderstehliche Drang, aus der Enge der Einzelercheinungen herauszustreben nach der befreienden Höhe umfassender Überblicke."
- 2 *Confessiones*, 12, xiii (16).
- 3 *Laws*, 713c-e.
- 4 That the mosaic is spurious is corroborated by other apparent forgeries in the Vatican Museum: a mosaic with garlands on a golden background and with the same type of border, ostensibly found in Hadrian's Villa 1738; a mosaic with a basket of flowers, ostensibly from the second century and found 1789-92 in Sala a Croce Greca in Villa dei Quintili on Via Appia Antica. The genesis of the latter in modernity is evident from the far too numerous and various flowers (infinite diversity) and from the complex angles from which the flowers are viewed (a well-developed perspective). The relentless serialism of the border ornamentation is also strikingly non-antique.

Interlude

- 1 Tylor (1870), p. 2.
- 2 For an excellent survey of the history of the sociological theory of evolution, see Sanderson (1990). For the earlier period see also Bowler (1984), pp. 85-102.
- 3 Sanderson (1990), pp. 4-5, 75-130 and 144-53; White (1959); Parsons (1977); Lenski (1970); Habermas (1976); *idem* (1987).
- 4 See also Cosgrove (1998), pp. 40, 46 and 58.
- 5 On this context see Habermas' assistant Rainer Döbert (1981), pp. 77-79.
- 6 Habermas (1976), p. 155.
- 7 Sanderson (1990), pp. 10-35 and 50-74; Parsons (1977), pp. 39-97; Tylor (1870), pp. 152-93 and 370-80. See also Lenski's model, which includes specialised offshoots in fishing, herding and maritime societies, in Lenski (1970), p. 124.

- 8 See Habermas (1976), especially pp. 9-48 and 129-259, and Habermas (1987), especially vol. I, pp. 76-83 and 104-113. For an excellent introduction to this aspect of Habermas' thinking, see Outhwaite (1994), pp. 58-67.
- 9 Habermas (1976), p. 164: "Wahrscheinlich ist die Technikgeschichte mit den grossen evolutionären Schüben der Gesellschaft über die *Evolution der Weltbilder* verknüpft; und diese Verbindung dürfte wiederum über formale Strukturen des Denkens zu erklären sein, für deren Entwicklungslogische Anordnung die kognitivistische Psychologie ein hinreichend untersuchtes ontogenetisches Modell anbietet." English translation from Habermas (1991), p. 149.
- 10 For a critique of Habermas' compound thinking re the cultural onto- and phylogenesis and his concept of directional phylogenesis, see Schmid (1982), pp. 162-80.
- 11 Parsons (1977), pp. 72-114; Sanderson (1990), p. 110.
- 12 Spengler (1972), p. 211: "Es wird hier also nicht davon die Rede sein, was eine Welt 'ist', sondern was sie dem lebendigen Wesen bedeutet, das von ihr umgeben ist. Mit dem Erwachen zerdehnt sich für uns etwas zwischen einem Hier und einem Dort. Das Hier leben, das Dort erleben wir, jenes als eigen, dieses als fremd. Es ist die Entzweiung zwischen Seele und Welt als den Polen der Wirklichkeit [...]. Die Wirklichkeit – die Welt *in bezug* auf eine Seele – ist [...] das Eigne, das sich am Fremden spiegelt, sie *bedeutet ihm selbst*." English translation from Spengler (1971), p. 164.
- 13 See, for example, Habermas (1987), vol. I, pp. 106-09 and 250.
- 14 A condensate of the consciousness-evolutionary and cosmological approaches is to be found in Wamberg (2000).
- 15 Hegel (1970), vol. I, pp. 390-91, 458f.; vol. II, pp. 131, 141, 388-92.
- 16 Hegel (1970), vol. II, pp. 137-46, 364-73; vol. III, pp. 14-40, 112-29.
- 17 Riegl (1901), especially pp. 19-22.
- 18 In Blatt (1994), pp. 195-226, his thesis is presented in summary.
- 19 Piaget and Inhelder (1956).
- 20 Marcussen (2002); summary version hereof in Marcussen (2000), pp. 139-72.
- 21 Eliade (1960) and (1962); Neumann (1949) and (1963); Baring and Cashford (1991).
- 22 Duhem (1913-59); Cassirer (1927); Koyré (1957); Kuhn (1985); Spengler (1972).
- 23 Panofsky (1927), pp. 258-330.
- 24 Spengler (1972), especially pp. 71-124, 181 and 424-28.
- 25 Württenberger (1958), p. 6: "[...] Kunstwerke sind kleine, vom Menschen geschaffene 'Weltbild-Maschinerien', deren Funktionieren auf jeweils ganz bestimmte Hypothesen von Weltbildstandpunkten beruht."
- 26 "Solche irdische Gefilde mit Eigenwert, mit irdischen Zeit- und Ortsbegriff, nennen wir Landschaft." *Ibid.*, pp. 17-21, 28-30 and 65-67.
- 27 Ritter (1989).
- 28 The distinction between virginal *terra* and ploughed-up *territorium* is found in Durand (1986), p. 179.
- 29 The results of this angle of approach are assembled in Wamberg (1999).

- 30 Harris (1977) (more detail about this in chapter 4).
- 31 Lovejoy and Boas (1935); Heitland (1921); Vernant (1973); Spaeth (1996).
- 32 Hegel (1988), IV, A, pp. 127-36; and Kojève (1980).
- 33 Weber (1987), vol. 1, pp. 225-366; vol. 2, pp. 444-88. Even though his approach is more empirical and microhistorical, Martin Warnke toys with something similar in his term “the political landscape” in early modern Western painting, a terrain marked by traces of the powerful (see Warnke (1994), especially pp. 9-20 (“The Occupation of the Plain”)).
- 34 Spengler (1972), especially pp. 300-08.
- 35 For a reconciliation between these two points of view, see Döbert (1977), especially pp. 537-38; also, Döbert (1981), pp. 71-74.
- 36 Panofsky (1955), p. 32. The text is a slightly revised version of Panofsky’s introduction to Panofsky (1939), pp. 3-31. The deliberations as to the placing of the interpretation of landscape in relation to Panofsky’s schema were first presented at the seminar “Har ikonografien en fremtid?” (“Is there a future for iconography?”), held by Dansk Kunsthistoriker Forening in Copenhagen, 22 April 1995. See Wamberg (1995).
- 37 Spengler (1972), p. 313: “Umrisse begrenzen Stoffliches, Farbentöne interpretieren Raum. Aber das eine ist von unmittelbar sinnlicher Natur. Es *erzählt*. Der Raum ist seine Wesen nach transzendent. Er spricht zur Einbildungskraft. Für eine Kunst, die unter seiner Symbolik steht, ist die erzählende Seite eine Herabsetzung und Verdunkelung der tieferen Tendenz, und ein Theoretiker, der hier ein geheimes Missverständnis fühlt, aber nicht begreift, klammert sich an den oberflächlichen Gegensatz von Inhalt und Form.” English translation from Spengler (1971), p. 242.
- 38 Kuhn (1962), pp. 10ff.
- 39 Lévi-Strauss (1969), p. 7.
- 40 Panofsky (1951), p. 21.
- 41 Panofsky (1955), p. 30.
- 42 *Ibid.*, pp. 31, 38 and 32 respectively.
- 43 For example, Lévi-Strauss (1968), pp. 31-54; Eagleton (1983), pp. 103-17.
- 44 The *episteme* concept is presented in Foucault (1966), *passim*, for example pp. 13, 45, 68 and 76-77.
- 45 As early as Piaget’s 1970 book on structuralism, Foucault’s *episteme* discussion was criticised for bypassing the developmental dimension (Blatt (1984), pp. 45-46).
- 46 Bourdieu (1970), pp. 7-41 and 75-158; Bourdieu (1977), pp. 72-95 and 143-58; Bourdieu (1990), especially pp. 52-79; Bourdieu (1993), especially pp. 29-73.
- 47 In the chapter “Art, Evolution, and the Consciousness of History” in Danto (1986), pp. 200ff., Arthur C. Danto links Panofsky’s iconology with both Cassirer’s symbolic forms and Kuhn’s paradigms. Here, with a related argument, it is asserted that the symbolic forms mark out the surface of the culture rather than its deep structures.
- 48 Bourdieu (1990), p. 53.
- 49 *Ibid.*, p. 56 (citation); Bourdieu (1977), pp. 81 and 87.
- 50 Bourdieu (1990), p. 55.

- 51 Bourdieu (1993), pp. 176-79; *id.* (1990), p. 67.
- 52 Bourdieu (1993), p. 37.
- 53 Bourdieu (1970), pp. 35-36.
- 54 *Ibid.*, p. 32; *id.* (1977), pp. 83 and 86.
- 55 Bourdieu (1990), pp. 2-3.
- 56 Spengler (1972), p. 70: "Methode der vergleichenden Morphologie der Weltgeschichte". English translation from Spengler (1971), p. 50.
- 57 Spengler (1972), p. 226: "Es ist im Formgefühl jedes Menschen, jedes Gemeinschaft, Zeitstufe und Epoche wirksam und diktiert ihnen den Stil sämtlicher Lebensäußerungen." Translation from Spengler (1971), p. 175.
- 58 Spengler (1972), p. 66: "eines und desselben seelischen Prinzips" and "mächtigen *Gruppen morphologischen Verwandtschaften*". Translations in Spengler (1971), p. 47.
- 59 *Ibid.*, pp. 3-70.
- 60 Cited in Sanderson (1990), p. 138.
- 61 Bertalanffy (1968).
- 62 See, for example, Jantsch and Waddington (1976).
- 63 Prigogine and Stengers (1984), especially pp. 12-14 and 142-43, and Prigogine "Order through Fluctuation: Self-Organization and Social System", in Jantsch and Waddington (1976), pp. 93-126.
- 64 Spengler (1972), especially pp. 140ff., 198 (citation): "Aber der Tag ist nicht Ursache der Nacht, die Jugend nicht die des Alters, die Blüte nicht die des Frucht." Translation from Spengler (1971), p. 152.
- 65 Johnston (1973), pp. 25-26. Bertalanffy even published an analysis of *Der Untergang des Abendlandes* in 1924.
- 66 On *equifinality* and Driesch, see Bertalanffy (1955), pp. 117-20.
- 67 On *attractors*, see Prigogine and Stengers (1984), p. 152; Ralph Abraham, "Vibrations and the Realization of Form" in Jantsch and Waddington (1976), pp. 134-49; Peat (1992), pp. 182-90 and Emmeche (1991), pp. 94-96.
- 68 See Waddington's "Concluding Remarks" in Jantsch and Waddington (1976), pp. 243-49; and Waddington (1975), especially pp. 220-23; in addition, Reid (1985), pp. 260-63.
- 69 See Piaget: "Piaget's Theory" and *id.*, "Need and Significance of Cross-Cultural Studies in Genetic Psychology" in Inhelder and Chipman (1976), pp. 22 and 260.
- 70 "Process and Structure in Sociocultural Systems" in Jantsch (1976) (pp. 169-84), p. 182.
- 71 On *punctuated equilibrium* see, for example, Somit and Peterson (1989) and Sanderson (1990), pp. 207-08. On Thom, see Abraham in Jantsch and Waddington (1976).
- 72 See Blackmore (1999). The *meme* term was introduced in 1976 in Dawkins' book *The Selfish Gene*.
- 73 Lenski (1970), pp. 48-70, already writes about this.
- 74 Blackmore (1999), pp. 47-52.
- 75 *Ibid.*, p. 19: shortened form (Speel 1995) of Dawkins' phrase "coadapted meme complexes".
- 76 On Heron's *aeolipile*, see Braudel (1992), vol. III, p. 543.

- 77 Blackmore (1999), pp. 132-37.
- 78 Stated in 1988, cited in Sanderson (1990), p. 200. Sanderson is himself sceptical of the idea of evolutionary target-orientation and recommends keeping biology and sociology distinctly separated altogether (especially p. 205).
- 79 See the detailed account in Kauffman (1995). Even though I cannot go into it in more detail here, conversely the biologist Julian Huxley (1887-1975) has cited a growing independence from the surroundings as one of the two parameters that can define progress not just in cultural but also biological evolution; the other is increased control over the surroundings (in *Evolution: The Modern Synthesis* (1963), pp. 564-65, here cited from Lenski (1970), p. 58; see also Barlow (1994), pp. 4-20). In Hoffmeyer (1993) the Danish biochemist reaches a similar conclusion from a semiotic approach; the parameter that in this way expands during the evolutionary sequence is designated "semiotic freedom" by Hoffmeyer.
- 80 For a provisional interpretation of this evolutionary phase, see Wamberg (1999). Marcussen (2002), pp. 267-72, confirms via spatial-geometric arguments that the abstractions of modernism lead 'backwards' in the sense that they involve resumption of elementary geometric concepts that preceded perspective, and which were first made the object of systematic mathematical study in the 18th-19th centuries.
- 81 Popper (1995), pp. 78-92.
- 82 Carroll (1939), ch. XI, pp. 556-57.
- 83 Panofsky (1927).
- 84 Gombrich (1960), pp. 16-18.
- 85 *Ibid.*, pp. 16-17; Hans Sedlmayr: "Die Quintessenz der Lehren Riegls" [1927], in Riegl (1929), pp. xii-xxxiv.
- 86 The term "the grand narrative" was introduced in Jean-François Lyotard's *La condition postmoderne* (1979), see Lyotard (1984), especially pp. 31-41.
- 87 For a presentation of this line of thought in art history, see Bal and Bryson (1991).
- 88 Preziosi (1989), p. xi.
- 89 Snow (1960).
- 90 Gadamer (1990), pp. 307-12.
- 91 In this perception of patterns as dynamic phenomena transferred continuously from world to consciousness, I am in great agreement with Mikkel Bøgh in his instructive article "Formalitet og figurativitet. Fænomenlogiske perspektiver i nyere kunstteori", in Dam Christensen, Michelsen and Wamberg (1999), pp. 215-50. Whereas Bøgh, however, shares the phenomenological lack of focus on history's fundamental mark on our world perception, this is where my interest is primarily focussed.
- 92 See Peirce, II (1965); a fine comment to this is found in May and Stjernfelt (1996).
- 93 Merleau-Ponty (1964), pp. 37, 57 and 72-74; Lacan (1994), pp. 93-97; Damisch (1972); Didi-Huberman (1995); see also Jay (1993), pp. 315-28 and 357-70.
- 94 Gibson (1950), pp. 26-43.

- 95 Bryson (1983), especially pp. 14-15 and 53; Bal and Bryson (1991), especially pp. 188-95.
- 96 *Ibid.*, p. 189. For a critique of post-structuralism's scepticism of icons, see also May and Stjernfelt (1996), p. 200.
- 97 Mount Olympus is often called snow-clad; in the *Aeneid* 4, 245f. Atlas' cape is described as falling snow; ploughed fields, see e.g. the *Aeneid* 10, 140f. (wheat fields).
- 98 Lessing (1984).
- 99 Holly (1984), p. 163.
- 100 Schiller, vol. 8 (1959), p. 562: "daß man so wenige Spuren von dem sentimentalischen Interesse, mit welchem wir Neuere an Naturszenen und an Naturcharakteren hangen können, bei demselben [dem Griechischen Volk] antrifft." English translation from Schiller (1985), p. 189.
- 101 Schiller, vol. 8 (1959), p. 564: "[u]nser Gefühl für Natur gleicht der Empfindung des Kranken für die Gesundheit." English translation from Schiller (1985), p. 190.
- 102 Fechner (1986); Cosgrove (1998).
- 103 Clark (1949); Pochat (1973).
- 104 Schama (1995).
- 105 Friedländer (1947), pp. 18-19.
- 106 Wood (1993), pp. 54-65.

Chapter 1

For Good Is a Form of the Limited

- 1 See also the bison with plants and cones, engraving on mammoth ivory knife (c. 10,000 BC), La Vache cave, Ariège, reproduced in Baring and Cashford (1991), fig. 24.
- 2 Confirmed in Clottes and Lewis-Williams (1998), p. 48: "The natural landscape is lacking. Other cultures represented clouds, rain, the sun and the stars, trees and other plants, rivers, and mountains. Not they."
- 3 *Ibid.*, pp. 86-91; Nougier (1993), pp. 50-56.
- 4 Merleau-Ponty (1964a), pp. 22-23: "Les animaux peints sur la paroi de Lascaux n'y sont pas comme y est la fente ou la boursoufflure du calcaire. Ils ne sont pas davantage *ailleurs*. Un peu en avant, un peu en arrière, soutenus par sa masse dont ils se servent adroitement, ils rayonnent autour d'elle sans jamais rompre leur insaisissable amarre." English translation from Merleau-Ponty (1964b), p. 164.
- 5 Clottes and Lewis-Williams (1998), p. 49. See also p. 92.
- 6 In engravings of bodies in the immediate vicinity of one another – for example, the fish among the reindeer legs in the engraving on a reindeer antler (from Lortet in the Pyrenees; reproduced in Hawkes (1976), p. 34) – there are also very occasional incidences of spatial covering effects in Palaeolithic images.

- 7 Blatt (1984), p. 101. Blatt does not, however, comment on the fragmentation of the animals and connection to the actual surroundings. Also Marcussen (2002), p. 56, remarks on the unstructured picture-plane and the transparent layers.
- 8 Schapiro (1969), pp. 223-24. As a sort of by-product of his pinning down of what could be seen as the exact antithesis of the Palaeolithic image, modernism's autonomous and framed painting, Clement Greenberg is also led to note both the frameless Palaeolithic image concept and its corresponding focus on the body, albeit these phenomena plainly are here ascribed more arbitrary natural circumstances than an inevitable way of perception: "The Palaeolithic painter or engraver could disregard the norm of the frame and treat the surface in both a literally and a virtually sculptural way because he made images rather than pictures, and worked on a support whose limits could be disregarded because [...] nature gave them to the artist in an unmanageable way." (Here quoted from a slightly revised 1965 version of Greenberg's essay "Modernist Painting" (1960), published in Harrison and Wood (1992), p. 759.)
- 9 Schapiro (1969), pp. 223-24.
- 10 See the discussion in Laming-Emperaire (1962), p. 86 (with reproductions) and pp. 105-13. Furthermore, reproductions in Leroi-Gourhan (1967), p. 522.
- 11 Of the various hypotheses on the function of cave paintings, see Clottes and Lewis-Williams (1998), pp. 61-79; Leroi-Gourhan (1967), pp. 32-35.
- 12 Clottes and Lewis-Williams (1998), pp. 12-17, 34 and 92-94.
- 13 This observation is mentioned by the former evolutionist Marshall David Sahlins in Sahlins (1985), p. 150.
- 14 On these pictures see Kühn (1952), pp. 59-60 and 78-79; Sandars (1968), pp. 87-95.
- 15 On this cultural evolution, initially triggered by climate, see Lenski (1970), pp. 159ff.
- 16 Blatt (1984), p.102. The observation is also found in Marcussen (2002), p. 57, who, based on the pictograms of the Hallstatt culture (c. 700-400 BC), refers to an "objectivisation of the spatial relationship itself."
- 17 Another climber on a tree trunk: Alpera, Albacete, reproduced in Sandars (1968), fig. 35; goat with hoof-marks also in 2nd cave, Remigia, Castellón, reproduced in Sandars (1968), ill. 85. Blatt (1984) does not remark on this landscape-determined way of representing space. In Pochat (1987), pp. 7-37, the issue of the origin of the aesthetic viewpoint is referred to, but no serviceable conclusion is reached.
- 18 Parsons (1977), p. 39.
- 19 *Ibid.*, pp. 41-44; Lenski (1970), pp. 134 and 179.
- 20 Another example is reproduced in Groenewegen-Frankfort (1951), pl. Vc.
- 21 Mellink and Filip (1974), pp. 153-56.
- 22 Schapiro (1969), p. 224.
- 23 Blatt (1984), pp. 105 and 109. See also Marcussen (2002), p. 59.
- 24 Lenski (1970), pp. 118-42 and 192-250; Parsons (1977), pp. 38-70.
- 25 Parsons (1977), p. 57.

- 26 *Ibid.*, pp. 63-69; Lenski (1970), pp. 240-41.
- 27 Parsons (1977), p. 68.
- 28 Harvey (1980), pp. 49-50.
- 29 Sanderson (1990), p. 138.
- 30 Richter (1970), p. 22.
- 31 Blatt (1984), p. 145, is correspondingly of the opinion that the pictorial affect, diminishing with distance, first began in the Hellenistic period.
- 32 Vitruvius, *De architectura*, 7, *praef.* II: "Ex eo moniti Democritus et Anaxagoras de eadem re scripserunt, quemadmodum oporteat, ad aciem oculorum radiorumque extentionem certo loco centro constituto, ad lineas ratione naturali respondere, uti de incerta re incertae imagines aedificiorum in scaenarum picturis redderent speciem et, quae in directis planisque frontibus sint figurata, alia abscedentia, alia prominentia esse videantur." Aristotle, *Poetics*, 1449 a17, however, maintains that Sophocles introduced scene-painting.
- 33 Vitruvius, *De architectura*, I, 2, 2.
- 34 Plutarch, *Alcibiades*, 16.
- 35 Vitruvius, *De architectura* 5, 6, 9.
- 36 White (1967), p. 262: "There seem, indeed, to be no valid grounds for denying the probability, based on the surviving visual evidence, that an antique system of perspective, founded on the single vanishing point, existed at a slightly earlier date in at least one of the cultural centres that influenced Pompeii."
- 37 Reproduced with construction lines in Little (1971), pls. III-IV.
- 38 Hoppe (1926), pp. 6-7.
- 39 On distance and angle: Theorem 8, see Euclid (1938), pp. 6-7. See also Panofsky (1953), vol. I, p. 12.
- 40 Lucretius, *De rerum natura*, 4, 426-31: "Porticus aequali quamvis est denique ductu stansque in perpetuum paribus suffulta columnis, longa tamen parte ab summa cum tota videtur, paulatim trahit angusti fastigia coni, tecta solo iungens atque omnia dextera laevis donec in obscurum coni conduxit acumen."
- 41 Vitruvius, *De architectura*, I, 2, 2: "Item scaenographia est frontis et laterum abscedentium adumbratio ad circinique centrum omnium linearum responsus."
- 42 For a nuanced examination of this debate, with a comparative study of analyses of perspective in Roman murals, see Blatt (1984), pp. 141-57. Blatt also emphasises the intuitive basis of antique perspective.
- 43 Panofsky (1991), pp. 38-39.
- 44 Far later, in Panofsky (1960), p. 122 n. 1, Panofsky has, however, become aware that Philostratus in *Imagines* (I, 4, 2) also involves circles in the description of depth effect: "For it is necessary to deceive the eyes which move back in unison with the appropriate circles." Even though this passage supports a Lucretian reading of Vitruvius – in favour of a conical foreshortening effect – Panofsky does not refer to his earlier theory, but merely uses the observation for a general refutation of the possibility for projection-based perspective in antiquity.

- 45 Blatt (1984), pp. 152-53, also exhibits moderate scepticism of Panofsky's concept.
- 46 Hegel (1970), for example, vol. II, pp. 74ff. On the significance of the figure for antique landscape painting: more in my chapter 6.
- 47 Spengler (1972), p. 309: "Man wird [...] [nie] auf antiken Vasenbildern und Fresken, nicht einmal denen des Hellenismus mit ihrer Fordergrundsäumlichkeit, eine Andeutung des Horizontes finden. Diese Linie, in deren unwirklichem Duft Himmel und Erde verschwimmen, der Inbegriff und das stärkste Symbol der Ferne, enthält das malerische Infinitesimalprinzip." English translation from Spengler (1971), p. 239. See also Spengler (1972), pp. 113 and 192.
- 48 Spengler (1972), pp. 369-70: "sie stellen je eine *Gruppe von Körpern* dar, darunter Felsen, Bäume und sogar, als Körper unter Körpern! – 'das Meer'. Es entsteht keine Tiefe, sondern eine Aufreihung." English translation from Spengler (1971), p. 287.
- 49 Habermas (1976), p. 165: "In Griechenland, Rom und anderen mediterranen Gesellschaften vereinigt der private Grundbesitzer die Stellung eines despotischen Herrn über Sklaven und Tagelöhner im Rahmen der häuslichen Wirtschaft mit der Stellung eines freien Bürgers in der politischen Gemeinschaft von Stadt oder Staat (antiker Produktionsweise)." English translation from Habermas (1991), p. 150. See also Parsons (1977), pp. 90-98 and 107-14.
- 50 In the political arena, this balance is noted by Vernant (1982), p. 95.
- 51 Nougier (1993), pp. 368ff.; on this type of culture, see Parsons (1977), p. 44.
- 52 Lenski (1970), p. 213.
- 53 Parsons (1977), pp. 71-85.
- 54 Lee (s.a.), p. 17.
- 55 On China, see Parsons (1977), pp. 73-80.
- 56 Hegel (1988), pp. 57-156.
- 57 Spengler (1972), p. 212: "Eine Reihe von Graden der Bewußtheit führt von den Uranfängen kindlich-dumpfen Schauens, in denen es noch keine klare Welt für eine Seele und keine ihrer selbst gewiße Seele inmitten einer Welt gibt, zu den höchsten Arten durchgeistiger Zustände, deren nur Menschen ganz reifer Zivilisationen fähig sind." English translation from Spengler (1971), p. 164. See also Spengler (1972), pp. 72-74, 80 and 207-16.
- 58 In Bertalanffy (1968), pp. 212-13, there is a summary of the distribution of this I-model. The connection with Freud referred to in Habermas (1976), p. 14. Edinger (1996), pp. xvi-xxii, provides an instructive survey of Jung's phylogenetic model of the increasing autonomy of consciousness.
- 59 An excellent survey of Piaget's ideas is found in Spencer Pulaski (1971). See also Blatt (1984), pp. 56-69.
- 60 Gablik (1976), p. 11.
- 61 Marcussen (2002), p. 291, confirms the kinship Hegel-Piaget.
- 62 The latter is noted in Piaget (1976), p. 268.
- 63 On this and the following section, see: Pulaski (1971), pp. 13ff.; Ginsburg and Opper (1969), especially pp. 26ff.; Döbert, Habermas and Nunner-Winkler (1977), pp. 9-30 ("Zur Einführung"), 150-68

- (Jane Loevinger, "Zur Bedeutung und Messung von Ich-Entwicklung") and 170-78 (David Elkind, "Egozentrismus in der Adoleszenz").
- 64 Piaget and Inhelder (1956); Blatt (1984), pp. 70-92; Marcussen (2002), pp. 38-47.
- 65 Marcussen (2002), p. 268.
- 66 *Ibid.*, p. 32.
- 67 Piaget and Inhelder (1956), pp. 44-52.
- 68 Pulaski (1971), p. 143.
- 69 Piaget and Inhelder (1956), pp. 209-18; Marcussen (2002), pp. 45-46.
- 70 Piaget and Inhelder (1956), pp. 153-54.
- 71 Neumann (1949), pp. 3-12, 19ff., 127; Lacan (1994), especially pp. 34 and 189; *idem.* (1989), pp. 122-27; Kristeva (1984), especially pp. 27-30 and 46-51; *idem.* (1989), pp. 128-33. Also in Straus (1956), p.133, it is claimed that recognition of surrounding world is determined by two mutually independent factors: self and remoteness. It is only in relation to the remote distance regulated vis-à-vis proximity, that the visual recognition of *das Gegenstand* – the object or the opposite – arises.
- 72 Lacan (1994), pp. 67-119.
- 73 As an indication of the multivalency in Lacan, it can be mentioned that Jay (1993), pp. 363-64, understands the symbolic order as based purely on language and therefore, in contrast to my understanding, as having no dealings with the eye and its perspectival regulation of sight, which is said by Jay to belong to the imaginary domain.
- 74 Miller (1998), pp. 138-39. The first experiments with chimpanzees were conducted by Gordon Gallup in 1970.
- 75 Gablik (1976), p. 43.
- 76 In Norberg-Schulz (1965) there is an outstanding attempt to transfer Piaget's observations of the ontogenesis of representational space to the history of architecture. Even though Marcussen's key concern is similarly to implement Piaget within architecture's spatial history, strangely he makes no reference to Norberg-Schulz.
- 77 Neumann (1949), p. 131. See also Neumann (1963), pp. 89-93.
- 78 *Enzyklopädie*, §396, cited, with reference to phylogenesis, in Habermas (1976), p. 98: "eine unmitelbare, daher ungeistige, bloß natürliche Einheit des Individuums mit seiner Gattung und mit der Welt überhaupt".
- 79 Blatt (1984), p. 101.
- 80 *Ibid.*, pp. 99 and 101. This phase is also presupposed by Marcussen, who refers to it as "versatility" (Marcussen (2000), pp. 150-51; Marcussen (2002), p. 80).
- 81 Lacan (1994), pp. 67-78 and 91-104 (citation p. 75).
- 82 Neumann (1949), p. 131: "Der Welt gegenüberzustehen ist das den Menschen Auszeichnende, es ist sein Leiden und seine Besonderkeit, denn was zunächst Verlust scheint wird zum Positiven." English translation from *idem* (1954), p. 116;
- 83 Habermas (1976), pp. 14-18, 26 and 97-98; *idem* (1987), vol. I, pp. 73-81 and 96.
- 84 Pulaski (1971), pp. 38-52.

- 85 Habermas (1976), p. 98: "In der mythischen Welt werden alle Entitäten als gleichartig aufgefaßt: die einzelnen Menschen sind ebenso Substanzen wie Steine, Pflanzen und Tiere."
- 86 *Ibid.*, pp. 14-19 and 98-100; *idem* (1987), vol. I, pp. 274 and 281.
- 87 Blatt (1984), p. 125.
- 88 See Gablik (1976), pp. 43 and 80ff., and Blatt (1984), pp. 124-25 and 235-36; cf. Piaget and Inhelder (1956), e.g. pp. 45 and 52. On p. 52, in a discussion of Luquet's term "visual realism" in children's drawing, it states quite unambiguously: "The second point of interest is that an examination of visual realism seems to show neither projective relationships of perspective preceding Euclidian relationships [...], nor the reverse, but the two systems developing in unison and, indeed, inter-dependently. This conclusion is also one we shall be able to verify by direct experiment." The agreement between projective and Euclidian space is also noted by Pulaski (1971), pp. 142 and 144.
- 89 Marcussen (2002), pp. 20-37 and 78-79.
- 90 *Ibid.*, pp. 69-72.
- 91 *Ibid.*, pp. 271-72.
- 92 Habermas (1991), p. 106; Habermas (1976), p. 20: "einer immer eindeutigeren kategorialen Abgrenzung der Subjektivität der inneren von der Objektivität der äußeren Natur [...]."
- 93 Hegel (1970), *passim*, for example vol. I, pp. 390-91.
- 94 Riegl (1901), especially pp. 19-22. Iversen (1993), pp. 40-43 and 73-76 provides an excellent account of Riegl's debt to Hildebrand and Hegel. On Riegl's aestheticising of the philosophy of history, see also Sauerländer (1977), pp. 125-39. Blatt (1984), pp.13-14, remarks on Riegl's pioneering role in the viewing of art history as "a single, continuous process with transitions at world-historical epochs".
- 95 Crawford et al. (1966), p. 10.
- 96 See Blatt (1984), pp. 23-33.
- 97 *The Rendering of Nature in Early Greek Art* (trl. J. Fothergill, 1907), here paraphrased from Blatt (1984), p. 374.
- 98 A similarly combined onto- and phylogenetic movement from "straight conception" (*Geradvorstellung*) to "oblique conception" (*Schrägvorstellung*) was suggested at the beginning of the 1900s by the German art historian and Egyptologist Heinrich Schäfer (Marcussen (2002), p. 55).
- 99 Georges-Henri Luquet, *Le dessin enfantin*, here cited from Piaget and Inhelder (1956), pp. 50-51. See also Mounod (1976), pp. 178-80.
- 100 Georges-Henri Luquet, *L'Art primitif*, referred to by Marcussen (2002), pp. 53 and 442.
- 101 Piaget and Inhelder (1956), pp. 155ff.
- 102 On this divide, see Neumann (1949), *passim*; especially pp. 121-27.
- 103 Baring and Cashford (1991), pp. 3-105, 144-54 and 158-61. The father god's repression of the mother gods was observed by Erich Neumann (*ibid.*, p. 152). See also Shelldrake (1990), pp. 4-5.
- 104 Neumann (1949), p. 24: "Er tötet sich selbst, heiratet sich selbst und befruchtet sich selbst. Er ist Mann und Frau, zeugend und empfangend, verschlingend und gebärend, aktiv und passiv, oben und unten zugleich." English translation from Neumann (1954), p. 10.

- 105 Baring and Cashford (1991), pp. 18-22.
- 106 On this *terminus*, see Young (1991), p. 71; Neumann (1949), p. 27.
- 107 *The Danaïds* (Nauck, fragment 44, Loeb, fragment 25). For a comment, see Eliade (1960), p. 172.
- 108 Neumann (1963), pp. 314-16; Young (1991), pp. 242-57; James (1959), pp. 251-52.
- 109 Neumann (1963), p. 223. On the sun as masculine and fertilising, see also Baring and Cashford (1991), pp. 141, 258-59, 285 and 290.
- 110 Meissner, vol. II (1925), pp. 107-12.
- 111 Paglia (1991), *passim*. Same concept in Neumann (1949), p. 160.
- 112 Gimbutas (1974). Gimbutas' somewhat romantic picture of a patriarchal conquest of the matriarchal paradise is accepted surprisingly uncritically by Baring and Cashford (1991), pp. 79-82 and 155-58.
- 113 Lenski (1970), pp. 134 and 295-99, citation p. 298; see also Habermas (1976), p. 174.
- 114 The idea is mentioned by Paglia (1991), p. 54. On the caves as Mother Earth's womb, see Baring and Cashford (1993), pp. 15-18.
- 115 Baring and Cashford (1991), p. 257; Neumann (1949), p. 122.
- 116 Meissner, vol. II (1925), pp. 107-12. For a slightly different ordering of the Babylonian cosmos, placing, for example, the subterranean waters at the bottom of the underworld, see Jensen (1890), especially pp. 253-60.
- 117 White (1959), p. 366, confirms the Greeks' debt to Mesopotamia and Egypt.
- 118 On *pneuma*, see Toulmin and Goodfield (1960), p. 67; Wright (1995), p. 63.
- 119 For example, the pseudo-Aristotelian *On the Universe*, 2,392 a-b. On the elements and celestial spheres, see also Duhem (1913-59), vol. I (1913), pp. 28-33 and 45-48.
- 120 Wright (1995), p. 22.
- 121 The world hierarchy is demonstrated in Plato's *Timaeus*, 62-63. Of Aristotle's ideas on the round earth, see Duhem (1913-59), vol. I, pp. 211-19. See also Toulmin and Goodfield (1965), p. 65; and Marcussen (2002), p. 88.
- 122 Toulmin and Goodfield (1960), p. 163.
- 123 On this and the following, see Romm (1992), especially pp. 37-38, 124-33.
- 124 Wright (1995), pp. 16-17 and 58-59; see also the pseudo-Aristotelian *On the Universe*, 1-3, 391a-394a.
- 125 *Olympian Odes*, 3, 43-45; see Romm (1992), p. 18, for more quotations in this topos.
- 126 Spengler (1972), pp. 840-46. On the world-cave in general, see Blumenberg (1989), especially pp. 50 and 58; on Porphyry's exegesis, see Pieper (1987), pp. 138-40.
- 127 See Vosniadou (1994). Vosniadou's results further develop the studies carried out since the 1970s by, *inter alios*, J. Nussbaum and C. Sneider.
- 128 Spengler (1972), pp. 71-123.
- 129 *Number, the Language of Science* (1930), here cited from Maor (1987), p. 3.
- 130 In *Philebus*. See Cohn (1960), pp. 33-34; on Anaximander, see Toulmin and Goodfield (1960), p. 66. See also Romm (1992), pp. 10-12 and 22-24.
- 131 Cohn (1960), p. 38. *Physics*, 3, 6, 207a. See also Curley (1989).
- 132 *On the Heavens*, 1, 9, 278b-279a.

- 133 2, 6, 1106b 29-30. See also Spengler (1972), p. 229.
- 134 On aggregate space see Cassirer (1927), pp. 191-92; Koyé (1957), p. vi. Also Blatt (1984), pp. 191-95, notes the similarities between Aristotle's thinking in respect of body and place, including the closedness of the geocentric cosmos, and the closed tendencies of the pictorial space in antiquity.
- 135 Spengler (1972), pp. 227-29.
- 136 Terrestrial ground: *ibid.*; land: Onians (1979), p. 52.
- 137 *De rerum natura*, 2. On the atomists' void, see also Duhem (1913-59), vol. 1 (1913), pp. 33-35. Blatt (1984), p. 194, similarly remarks on the modern potential in the atomists' idea of infinity, but sees it outdone by Aristotle's concept of space rather than blocked by inner limitations. See also Marcussen (2002), p. 107.
- 138 Toulmin (1960), pp. 116 and 119-26 (citation p. 126); Spengler (1972), pp. 92-93; Duhem (1913-59), vol. I (1913), pp. 418-26. Aristarchus' system had a precursor of sorts in the Pythagoreans' more esoteric concept of an earth that rotates around a stationary central fire; from this fire the very sun took light (see *ibid.*, pp. 3-20).
- 139 *Symposium*, 189e ff. This androgynous whole only led, however, to heterosexuals. Lesbians and gays are here said to be cut from purely feminine and purely masculine wholes respectively.
- 140 Paglia (1991), pp. 40 ff.
- 141 See Bultmann (1948), pp. 17-19.
- 142 Sophocles, *Oedipus Rex*, 1470-71.
- 143 Spengler (1972), p. 283: "Er betastet den Marmor mit dem Auge". Of the Greeks' tactile sight see also Jay (1993), pp. 21-31. English translation from Spengler (1971), p. 220.
- 144 Spengler (1972), pp. 87 and 90: "Die antike Zahl ist nicht ein Denken räumlicher Beziehungen, sondern für das leibliche Auge abgegrenzter greifbare Einheiten. [...] Alles aus antikem Wachsein Geborene ist also allein durch plastische Begrenztheit zum Range eines Wirklichen erhoben worden. Was sich nicht zeichnen läßt, ist nicht 'Zahl'." Translation from Spengler (1971), pp. 64 and 66.
- 145 *De architectura*, 1, 2, 4. Frankl (1960), pp. 94-99.
- 146 *Poetics*, 7, 1450b-1451a.
- 147 *Ibid.*, 23, 1, 1459a.
- 148 *Ibid.*, 9, 3-4, 1451b.
- 149 Hegel (1970), vol. II, pp. 360-61, 364 and 388-92.
- 150 Kierkegaard (1980), p. 87.
- 151 Mulvey (1989), pp. 14-26. Here the gaze is seen as developed in Hollywood films between the 1930s and 1950s, a period that we can happily call neo-classical. The question is evidently complicated by Lacan's own identification of the eye with perspective vision itself, albeit Lacan is very careful not to make it a gender-ideological issue; see Lacan (1994), especially pp. 86-87. On Mulvey's influence, see Bal and Bryson (1991), p. 201.
- 152 *Republic*, 372e ff. See above.
- 153 *Ibid.*, 597c. Yet see *ibid.*, 401, and the *Laws*, 669a and 817a, for various degrees of truth within mimesis.
- 154 *Republic*, 598b.

- 155 *Ibid.*, 602c.
- 156 *Ibid.*, 605b.
- 157 *Laws*, 663b-c.
- 158 *Outlines of Pyrrhonism*, I, 123.
- 159 *Sophist*, 235e-236c.
- 160 *De architectura*, 6, 2, 1-2. For an interesting discussion of the influence of painting on Vitruvius' deliberations on architecture, see Elsner (1995), pp. 81-86.
- 161 *Theaetetus*, 208e and *Parmenides*, 165c-d. See also *Republic*, 7, 523b, in which far distances and *skiagraphy* are seen as related.
- 162 *Institutio oratoria*, 10, 2, 7-8.
- 163 This observation is made in Blumenberg (1989), p. 26.
- 164 Kant (1974), §14, p. 139; Derrida (1987), pp. 52-56 (herein also reference to Kant's *Religion Within the Limits of Reason Alone* (1793 and 1794)). For this and the following, see also the fruitful analysis in Wood (1993), pp. 56-62. Wood brings the terms *ergon-parergon* into the discussion of the nature of landscape. In recent times, the first scholar to have pointed out the relevance of the *parergon* term in relation to landscape is Ernst H. Gombrich, in Gombrich (1966), pp. 113-14.
- 165 *Geography*, 14, 2, 5.
- 166 *Naturalis historia*, 35, 101.
- 167 *Critias*, 107c-d.
- 168 For an empirical description of medieval pictorial space, see Bunim (1940).
- 169 Riegl (1901), especially pp. 8, 45 and 209; Panofsky (1991), pp. 47-52.
- 170 Spengler (1972), p. 270, emphasises the trans-geographic feature of this development.
- 171 Cohn (1960), pp. 55-57: "Langsam vielmehr und halb unbewußt vollzog sich der für die Geschichte des menschlichen Denkens wichtige Akt."
- 172 Kirschbaum, II (1970), col. 256; Beda, *De natura rerum*, *Pat.Lat.*, 9, 199-202; *Enciclopedia Italiana*, vol. 13 (1932), p. 937. For empyreum in the late Middle Ages, see McDannell and Lang (1988), pp. 81-88.
- 173 Cohn (1960), pp. 63-67.
- 174 McDannell and Lang (1988), pp. 80-81; Cohn (1960), p. 66.
- 175 *Enneads*, I, 6, 9; 5, 8, 9 and 6, 7, 32-33. Cohn (1960), pp. 58-59; Moore (1990), pp. 45ff.
- 176 Bunim (1940), p. 81.
- 177 On *Mandylion*, temple curtain and icon as barrier between heaven and earth, see Kessler (1993), p. 66.

Chapter 2

The First Remoteness of the Depth of Field

- 1 *De rerum natura*, 5, 1370-78.
- 2 See also the more ornamental descendants of these thickets, such as the mosaics in the Roman Santa Costanza (4th century AD).

- 3 Colour reproduction in Feder (1978), p. 81.
- 4 Jahn (1975), p. 6. "Die Felslandschaft wurde zur Landschaft an sich [...]." "Sie lies erkennen, daß sich eine Szene im Freien abspielte [...]."
- 5 Clark (1949), pp. 17-21.
- 6 Friedländer (1947), p. 22.
- 7 Feldges (1980), pp. 61 and 63: "eine tausendjährige Tradition von Felslandschaften" and "[eine] klare Trennung von Felsboden und Einzelpflanzen"; Fechner (1986), pp. 196-97, 201 and 221-23.
- 8 In Christiansen, Kanter and Strehlke (1988), cat. 32a, great emphasis is placed on Dante's role as a source of inspiration for the world picture, which is feasible, but not necessary to an understanding of the image. More exactly, it is nourished by the general antique-medieval cosmology. The Paradise mountain is obviously not located in Africa, as Strehlke claims, but towards the east in accordance with conventional medieval cartography, in which east is placed at the top.
- 9 *Phaedo*, 109c-110a. See also Cicero, *De natura deorum*, 2, 6, 17, in which it is claimed that just as some people are below average intelligence because they live in an environment with dense atmosphere, humankind as a whole has had the misfortune of ending up in the densest and lowest part of the universe.
- 10 Braudel (1972), vol. I, p. 26.
- 11 *Ibid.*, p. 25.
- 12 *Ibid.*, pp. 30ff.
- 13 *Ibid.*, p. 41.
- 14 *Ibid.*, p. 52.
- 15 Braidwood (1967), p. 142.
- 16 *Ibid.*, p. 138.
- 17 *Timaeus*, 47e-53c; Kristeva (1984), pp. 25-30.
- 18 Neumann (1963), pp. 43-46.
- 19 Baring and Cashford (1991), pp. 7-13; Paglia (1990), pp. 54-57.
- 20 Baring and Cashford (1991), pp. 82-83; Neumann (1963), pp. 98-100.
- 21 Baring and Cashford (1991), *passim*; James (1959), *passim*; Rohde (1958), pp. 41-43, 69-73.
- 22 On *pagani*, see Le Goff (1977), pp. 137-38.
- 23 Baring and Cashford (1993), pp. 486-608; Hirn (1912), pp. 337-38; Berger (1985), pp. 49-74.
- 24 Guldan (1966), pp. 38 and 166-67; Berger (1985), pp. 39-43.
- 25 On this etymology, see Serres (1989), pp. 97-98.
- 26 *De rerum natura*, 1, 250ff.
- 27 Eliade (1960), pp. 156-69.
- 28 *De rerum natura*, 5, 805-15. The theory that humankind and animals originally came from the earth is upheld by, for example, Archelaus (Anaxagoras' pupil and Socrates' teacher), Hippolytus and Diodorus Siculus; see Lovejoy and Boas (1935), pp. 206 and 220. For argumentation against autochthonic origins, based on the concept of cosmos and humankind's permanence, see Philo of Alexandria's *On the Eternity of the World*, 55-69.

- 29 *Genesis Rabbah*, 156; *Midrash*, Ruth, 158, see Rossi-Osmida (1974), p. 26. Sarah, Abraham and Jacob were later buried in this cave (Genesis 23: 16-20; 25: 9; 50: 13).
- 30 Eliade (1960), pp. 168-69.
- 31 See also the relief from Esquiline Hill, reproduced in Haas (1982), Abb. 36, p. 192.
- 32 Eliade (1960), p. 164; Dieterich (1905), pp. 6-21.
- 33 1018-29.
- 34 On chthonic energy, see Kérenyi (1976), p. 207. Additional examples are cited in chapters 6 and 12 of the present book.
- 35 Genesis 28: 11f.
- 36 Neumann (1963), pp. 45-46.
- 37 Pieper (1987), pp. 139-46.
- 38 *Epic of Creation*, V, in Dalley (1989), p. 257.
- 39 *De rerum natura*, 6, 536-39.
- 40 *Naturales quaestiones*, 3, 15, 1-6. See also, Forbes (1966), p. 75.
- 41 Codex Hammer, formerly Leicester Library, Holkham Hall, f. 34 (c. 1506-09) in Leonardo (1939), vol. II, 1000, p. 178. The comparison soil/flesh, soft stone/cartilage, hard stone/bones, blood/subterranean water (plus hair/plants) is also found in the mid-13th century Restoro d'Arezzo (1976), I, 20, 26-27, pp. 34-35.
- 42 Hillman (1979), p. 183. On mud in Hades, see Plato, *Republic*, 2, 363d; *Phaedo*, 69c.
- 43 In the eastern part of Greece, the majority of the caves are to the south: near Parnassus, where Delphi is located, and around Athens (Middleton and Waltham (1986), pp. 93-94)).
- 44 *De rerum natura*, 6, 680 ff.
- 45 *Aeneid*, 6, 236f.
- 46 Apuleius, *Golden Ass*, 6, 18: "spiraculum Ditis".
- 47 Neumann (1963), p. 46.
- 48 Goethe (1976), Part 2 Act 4, p. 257, v. 10070; Goethe (1962), p. 454: "Steigst ab in solcher Greuel Mitten,/ Im gräßlich gähnenden Gestein?/ Ich kenn es wohl, doch nicht an dieser Stelle;/ Denn eigentlich war das der Grund der Hölle."
- 49 Cited in Nicolson (1959), p. 49.
- 50 Mühlhäusser (1914), pp. 27 and 49.
- 51 Kircher (1664).
- 52 "Transalpina solitudo mea iocundissima." Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, ms lat. 6802, f. 143v. See also Clark (1949), pp. 17-19.
- 53 Schäfer (1960), no. 306, p. 100.
- 54 *Vergilius Vaticanus*, ms Vat. lat. 3225, pictures 1, 8-9 33-34 and 43, reproduced as contour drawings in Stevenson (1983). Other late medieval representations of hell with cave environments, for example: Giotto, *Last Judgement* (c. 1305), fresco, Padua, Arena Chapel; Anon., *Hell* (1330s), fresco, Pisa, Camposanto; Andrea da Firenze, *Descent of Christ into Limbo* (c. 1365-67), fresco, Florence, Santa Maria Novella; Andrea Orcagna, fragment of *Hell*, fresco, Florence, Museo di Santa Croce; Taddeo

- di Bartolo, *Hell*, fresco, San Gimignano, Collegiata; Nardo di Cione, *Hell* (c. 1351-pre-1357), fresco, Florence, Santa Maria Novella; Giovanni di Paolo, *Hell* (part of *Last Judgement*, c. 1431), panel, Siena, Pinacoteca Nazionale; Fra Angelico, *Hell* (c. 1431), Florence, Museo di San Marco.
- 55 On the *Thebaïd* motif's connection with the new monastic orders in the Late Middle Ages, see Dodge (1979), pp. 106ff. and Buchtal (1966), p. 114. Other examples of the *Thebaïd* motif: Gherardo Starnina's panel in Florence, Galleria degli Uffizi (c. 1410), reproduced in Pochat (1973), Tf. 61, and the anonymous panel in Galleria dell'Accademia, Florence (c. 1440?). See also hermit life in the background of Pietro Lorenzetti's *Saint Albertus Giving the Keys of the Carmelite Order to Saint Borcardus* (1329), Siena, Pinacoteca Nazionale, reproduced in Feldges (1980), Abb. 29-30.
- 56 Le Goff (1992), pp. 47-59. See also Bernheimer (1952), *passim*.
- 57 See also the miniature in the German 10th-century psalter, Stuttgart, Landesbibliothek, f. 107v (to Psalm 91: 13: "You will tread on the lion and the adder; the young lion and the serpent you will trample underfoot.").
- 58 For another Carolingian example, see Pearsall and Salter (1973), ill. 19; furthermore, many depictions by Bosch and his successors such as Herri met de Bles and Brueghel.
- 59 Hughes (1968), pp. 175-78; Isaiah 27: 1; Psalms 104: 26.
- 60 See Veldman (1977), pp. 133-41. The engraving is one of the eight-part *Cycle of the Vicissitudes of Human Affairs*.
- 61 See Zahlten (1979), pp. 75, 137 and 198. *Terra* represented by a mountain is also seen in a 12th-century Creation relief on the archivolt of the northern portal of Chartres Cathedral (see *ibid.*, p. 128, Abb. 234).
- 62 Fronzaroli (1968), pp. 270-72; reference to the *Epic of Gilgamesh*, 5, 3, 105-06. Even in Genesis 25: 27 the hunter Esau is referred to as *sade*. In Arabic a mountaintop is designated *zahr*, raised areas of land *zahira*. 'The land beyond the city' and 'mountain' is also designated by the same word in Accadian.
- 63 *Kleine Pauly*, vol. 5 (1975), p. 1054.
- 64 Tromp (1969), p. 132.
- 65 Black and Green (1992), pp. 114 and 180; *Epic of Gilgamesh* (1972), p. 27; Jensen (1890), pp. 194-95.
- 66 Dalley (1989), p. 318.
- 67 Tromp (1969), p. 132.
- 68 *Epic of Gilgamesh* (1972), pp. 37 and 97-99.
- 69 Sandars (1971), p. 115; on the tops of the Babylonian mountain-house, *Ikur*, more generally, see Jensen (1890), pp. 185-212.
- 70 On Sheol, see McDannell and Lang (1988), pp. 2-7.
- 71 Cf. also Isaiah 45: 19 referring to a "land of darkness"; Psalms 107: 40, in which the Lord causes them to "wander in trackless wastes"; Jeremiah 2: 31: "Have I been a wilderness to Israel, or a land of thick darkness?" See also Tromp (1969), pp. 129-44.
- 72 On Tartarus: *Iliad*, 8, 13f.; *Aeneid*, 6, 543ff.; Hesiod, *Theogony*, v. 720ff. Plato's *Phaedrus*, 249a also refers to an underground place of punishment.

- 73 *Metamorphoses*, I, 192-95.
- 74 Callistratos, *Descriptions*, 422K, p. 379 ("On a Satyr").
- 75 Soutar (1939), pp. 58-61; *Hymn to Apollo*, 258; *Hymn to Aphrodite*, 258; Hesiod, *Theogony*, 2.
- 76 Kérenyi (1976), pp. 33-34, 43-45, 210, 214, 221-224 and 285. See also Pausanias' *Description of Greece*, IO, 32, 1-7.
- 77 Michaelis (1958), p. 87 (18, 2); Kérenyi (1976), pp. 43 and 224.
- 78 On the savage in general, see Bernheimer (1952); on its visual tradition, see Husband (1980).
- 79 Bernheimer (1952), pp. 20 and 23.
- 80 *Ibid.*, pp. 42-43. Orcus appears in one of the oldest documents that can be linked with the wild man: a Spanish 9th- or 10th-century confessional document, apparently copied from an even older French source.
- 81 Goethe (1976), II, Act 4, p. 265, v. 10425; Goethe (1962), p. 464: "Du weißt: das Bergvolk denkt und simuliert,/ Ist in Natur- und Felsenschrift studiert./ Die Geister, längst dem flachen Land entzogen,/ Sind mehr als sonst dem Felsgebirg gewogen./ Sie wirken still durch labyrinthische Klüfte/ Im edlen Gas metallisch reicher Düfte [...]." For a New Age treatment of this belief, see Golowin (1984).
- 82 *Works and Days*, 122-25.
- 83 Hillman (1979), pp. 35-38; Meissner (1925), vol. II, pp. 111-12.
- 84 Berger (1985), pp. 16-17.
- 85 In an eminent study of the Roman corn goddess, Spaeth (1996), p. 130, adduces that Ge/Tellus can be said, to a greater extent, to *incarnate* the earth, whereas Demeter/Ceres is more *associated* with it.
- 86 Vermaseren (1977), pp. 13-14, emphasises the versatile nourishing power of the mountain.
- 87 Haas (1982), pp. 54, 56 and 69.
- 88 See *Ibid.*, p. 162.
- 89 Kristeva (1984), p. 26.
- 90 *Timaeus*, 52d-e.
- 91 See also the Ottonian Gospel from Cologne, now in Bamberg, Staatliche Bibliothek, Bibl. 94 (A.II.18), f. 155 (reproduced in Nordenfalk (1957), p. 124).
- 92 Trento, Biblioteca Diocesana, cod. 2546, f. 13, reproduced in Garrison (1953-56), vol. I, 1953, fig. 33. See also the foam-like rocks in *Christ in Limbo* (c. 1150-1200), which is part of the Tuscan school *Crucifix*, Florence, Galleria degli Uffizi, Inv. no. 432.
- 93 Serres (1989), pp. 96-97.
- 94 With reference to the following passage, see Aksel Haaning's instructive description in Haaning (1993); also, Curtius (1954), pp. 118-19.
- 95 Interestingly, seen through a Husserlian lens, *hyle* is another central concept in Kristeva's semiology, where it stands for the "matter" of meaning (see Kristeva (1984), pp. 31-37).
- 96 Zahltén (1979), pp. 145 and 155. A less characteristic, amorphous mass is seen in a parallel composition in a *Bible moralisée* of c. 1250 (Vienna, Nationalbibliothek, Cod. 2554, f. IV, reproduced in *ibid.*,

- Ill. 270) and in a contemporaneous French manuscript with the Old Testament; in the latter it is held in the Lord's right hand, while the left hand holds out the celestial disc (New York, Pierpont Morgan Library, cod. 638, f. 1, reproduced in *ibid.*, Ill. 232). The folding *materia informis* is also seen in a more rural Creation scene in the English *Bible of Robert de Bello* (c. 1225-50), London, British Library, Burney ms 3, f. 5v. The late medieval depictions of *materia informis* are discussed in *ibid.*, pp. 144-48.
- 97 *Ibid.*, pp. 146-48 and 189. In an English bible from St Alban's Abbey (c. 1180) the chaos mass is similarly described as "hile" (Cambridge, Corpus Christi College, ms 48, f. 7v, reproduced in *ibid.*, Ill. 273).
- 98 *Ibid.*, pp. 66 and 145.
- 99 See Jung (1967), vol. 13, text for ill. B6.
- 100 A late example is the Lombardian health compendia, *Tacuinum Sanitatis*, of around 1400 (see chapter 10).
- 101 On *chaos*: Wright (1995), pp. 77-78; Young (1991), p. 182.
- 102 Dante (1994), 4, 31, p. 134.
- 103 Ruskin (1873), vol. 3, p. 305.
- 104 Nicolson (1959), pp. 197-200.
- 105 Pliny, *Naturalis historia*, 2, 88-89, 202-03; Strabo, *Geography*, 1, 3, 18. See also Forbes (1966), pp. 45 and 50.
- 106 *Etymologiarum sive originum libri XX*, 14, 1, 3; see also same author *De natura rerum*, 46, 1-2; and Perrig (1987), p. 58. Furthermore, Kircher (1664), vol. 1, pp. 191-225.
- 107 *Meteorologica*, 2, 366a-368a.
- 108 *Ibid.*
- 109 *Phaedo*, 69c; Hillman (1979), p. 184. In *De natura rerum*, 47, 1 ("On Etna") Isidore of Seville says that volcanic eruptions occur when the winds battle with fire in the earth's bowels.
- 110 Eliade (1962), pp. 20-21.
- 111 Earthquake, e.g. Pliny, *Naturalis historia*, 2, 82, 193-94; end of the world, e.g. Lucretius, *De rerum natura*, 6, 588-90.
- 112 Genesis 4: 10-11; Livy, *Ab urbe condita*, 7, 6, 1-6.
- 113 In the apocryphal Proto-Gospel, cited in Underwood (1969), vol. 1, p. 104; Menzel (1854), vol. 1, p. 279; Sachs et al. (s.a.), pp. 51-52.
- 114 Perrig (1987).
- 115 14, 8, 21. Isidore uses *tumulus* as synonym for *mons brevis* (little mountain).
- 116 *De causis proprietatum elementorum*, Lib. 2, Tract. 2, Cap. 5 (ed. 1980), vol. 5, II, p. 101: "The mountains come into being mostly and commonly through earthquakes, not least there where the surface is firm and compact and cannot be cleft. For then the strongly compressed and moved [subterranean] wind raises this place into the height and creates mountains. And because earthquakes are frequent under the sea and take place under those waters which contain many earth pits, so that the damp shut in the bowels of the earth cannot escape, therefore the highest mountains

- are often placed by the ocean and the waters.” (“Causa autem universalis et essentialis est, quod montes nascuntur ex terraemotu, ubi superficies terrae solida est et compacta et scindi non potest; tunc enim ventus fortiter multiplicatus et agitatus elevat locum illum in sublime et facit montes. Et quia terraemotus frequenter habet materiam suam iuxta mare et iuxta aquas claudentes poros terrae, ne evaporet vapor terreus in visceribus terrae conclusus, ideo iuxta mare et iuxta aquas frequentissime nascuntur altissimi montes.”) See also Perrig (1987), pp. 44-45.
- 117 Grant (1974), p. 619.
- 118 In Restoro d’Arezzo (1976), 2, 5, 8, p. 128: “E già semo usuti in tale monte: quando li andavamo sù per esso e percotavamo suso per studio, rebombava e resonava com’elli fosse cupo e sollo dentro.” Perrig (1987), p. 45, refers to this passage, but does not mention its earthquake context.
- 119 The hollowness of mountains is, of course, not restricted to hills, as Perrig (1987), p. 45, supposes.
- 120 *On the Eternity of the World*, 132-37.
- 121 Forbes, vol. 7 (1966), pp. 12-15. For example, Seneca, *Naturales quaestiones*, 3, 9 and 6, 7-8. Plato, *Phaedo*, 111c-113c (here Tartarus). Aristotle, however, is of the modern view that springs and rivers stem from rain and melted snow.
- 122 *Etymologiarum sive originum*, 13, 20, 1.
- 123 Kircher (1664), vol. 1, pp. 70-71, reproduced p. 71. Other subterranean water caves: *ibid.*, p. 70 (Himalaya), p. 73 (South Africa) and p. 74 (the Andes). See also the diagrams of subterranean water caves, vol. 1, pp. 233-34.
- 124 See also the *Creation of Land and Plants* (c. 1143-c. 1171), mosaic, Palermo, Cappella Palatina, reproduced in Demus (1950), ill. 26B.
- 125 Euripides, *Ion*, 1081-86: “[...] and also the fifty daughters of Nereus, in the sea, and in the eddies of everflowing rivers, dance in honor of the maid of the golden garland [...] [at Dionysus’ feast].”
- 126 Jonah 2: 5-6; in Aeschylus, *Prometheus Bound*, 365-67, the monster Typhon ends up in the sea, “pressed down beneath the roots of Aetna”.
- 127 In the *Iliad*, 18, 400f., Hephaestus lives for nine years “within their hollow cave; and round about me flowed, murmuring with foam, the stream of Oceanus, a flood unspeakable.” In Aeschylus, *Prometheus Bound*, 301-04, Oceanus is said to live in “rock-roofed caves”. In *De natura rerum*, 48, Isidore of Seville writes that Oceanus is circulating the peripheral regions of the earth.
- 128 Pausanias, 8, 17-18; Herodotus, 6, 74. See Forbes, vol. 7. (1966), pp. 16-18. Pausanias (8, 22, 3) also attributes this behaviour to the rivers Erasinus, Ladon and Anias. Eridanus (Po) is said to rise in the underworld, where Aeneas saw it flow through the Elysian fields (*Aeneid*, 6, 659). The Helicon river flowed five kilometres under the earth, from Mount Olympus to the sea, in order to avoid pollution from the spot where Orpheus was torn to pieces by the Maenads (Pausanias, 9, 30, 8).
- 129 Ringbom (1958), p. 108.
- 130 Hughes (1968), p. 87: reference to Pomponius Mela, *De situ orbis*, 1, 9; Bede, *Hexaemeron*, 1. Ephrem the Syrian identified Pison with the Danube (in *Commentary on Genesis*, 1, 23b, cited in Daniélou (1953), p. 451). Gregory of Nyssa thought that the Paradise rivers were fed by the oceanic river surrounding the cosmos (Migne, *Patrologia Graeca*, 46, 593D; see also Daniélou (1953), p. 435).

- 131 See Blume (1966), pp. 18-30.
- 132 Compare also Job 38: 16-17, "Have you entered into the springs of the sea, or walked in the recesses of the deep? Have the gates of death been revealed to you, or have you seen the gates of deep darkness? Have you comprehended the expanse of the earth?"; Psalms 69: 2, "I sink in deep mire, where there is no foothold; I have come into deep waters; and the flood sweeps over me." Exodus 20: 4, "You shall not make for yourself a carved image, or any likeness of anything that is in heaven above, or that is in the earth beneath, or that is in the water under the earth."
- 133 See Zahlten (1979), pp. 131-32.
- 134 See also the mosaic in San Marco, Venice (13th century).
- 135 Hughes (1968), pp. 88-93.
- 136 See also the *Baptism of Christ*, Lectionary from Limoges (early 12th century), Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, ms lat. 9438, reproduced in Hauttmann (1929), p. 650.
- 137 *Greek Anthology*, 16, Epigram 230.
- 138 *De architectura*, 2, praef. 2. See also Schama (1995), pp. 401-05.
- 139 Isaiah 48: 21. See also Psalms 105: 41: "He opened the rock, and water gushed out; it flowed through the desert like a river."
- 140 Pfister (1909), pp. 358-59; Pausanias, 3, 24, 2 (Atalanta); 4, 36, 7 (Dionysus); Theocritus, *Idylls*, 7,6 (Chalcon).
- 141 703f. Compare also Philostratus, *Imagines*, 1, 14 ("Semele"): "We must not be surprised if in honour of Dionysus the Fire is crowned by the Earth, for the Earth will take part with the Fire in the Bacchic revel and will make it possible for the revellers to take wine from springs and to draw milk from clods of earth or from a rock as from living breasts."
- 142 *Metamorphoses*, 1, III-12; Hughes (1968), p. 87.
- 143 Sachs (*s.a.*), p. 133.
- 144 Walker Bynum (1991), p. 97. Walker Bynum does not, however, address the chthonic aspect in her analysis.
- 145 *Ibid.*, pp. 87, 100 and 114.
- 146 Gougaud (1925), p. 104.
- 147 In Matthew 7: 24-27 the wise man builds his house on rocky ground and not on sand, so that it is not washed away when the floods come. Saint Basil the Great catalogues a number of places where the rock symbolises Christ (Migne, *Patrologia Graeca*, 30, 257B-C); Origen sees protective rocks as Christ's solid doctrine; see Kirschbaum, vol. 2 (1970), cols. 24-25. Old Testament references: Genesis 49: 24; 2 Samuel 23: 3; Psalms 18: 31. In accounting metaphorically for certain particularly perfect saints' indifference to the opposite sex, Byzantine hagiography sometimes turned to rocks and stones (besides *logos*), see Kazhdan (1990), pp. 139-43.
- 148 James (1959), p. 252.
- 149 On the mountaintop cult, which was practised by herdsmen in particular, see Rutkowski (1986), pp. 73-95.

- 150 Kérenyi (1976), p. 16-19. The cave of Eileithyia, goddess of birth, near Amnisos, the harbour town for Knossos, is referred to in the *Odyssey*. Zeus was said to have been born in the Mount Ida cave. On cultic activities in the caves, see Tyree (1977) and Rutkowski (1986).
- 151 Evans, vol. II, 2 (1928), p. 453.
- 152 Lang (1969), vol. II, p. 122, observed: "The purpose and role of the jagged type of rocks is not completely clear", but added (p. 123), as a possibility, a derivation from stalactites. Even in 1988 Lyvia Morgan (Morgan (1988), p. 32) remarks that: "In virtually every painting where a natural environment is shown the ground is steep and rocky", but provides no explanation of this phenomenon.
- 153 Pottery: see, for example, Evans, vol. I (1921), pp. 178-79, 238 and 608.
- 154 See also Lang (1969), vol. II, pls. 132, 137 and Q.
- 155 Fauré (1964), *passim*; Rutkowski (1986), pp. 50-52.
- 156 See Marinatos (1984), pp. 24-26; see also the striped stones in the undulating rocks in the *Flying Fish Fresco* from Phylakopi (reproduced in Evans, vol. I (1921), p. 541).
- 157 See also the *Shield fresco* in the Palace of Knossos (reproduced in Evans, vol. III (1930). The wounded lion on the seal reproduced in Evans, vol. IV, 2 (1935), p. 546, is lying on rocks that look as if they are liquid.
- 158 The connection to coral is supported by Minoan pottery with imitations of marine animal shells and barnacle growth on rocks (see Evans, vol. IV (1935), pp. 102-03).
- 159 Reproductions from Evans, vol. III (1930), p. 362.
- 160 See also the seal with stalactites: *Hunter Impaling Lion*, on gold pearl seal from a tomb, Thisbê (reproduced in Evans, vol. IV, 2 (1935), p. 573).
- 161 These statements are found on more than 3,000 tablets, see Castleden (1990), pp. 99-103.
- 162 Cited in Sébillor (1894), p. 395. English translation from Eliade (1962), p. 44.
- 163 *Enneads*, 4, 4, 27.
- 164 *Naturalis historia*, 36, 24, 125. Pliny also mentions the particular speciality that some lead mines become even more productive after they have lain fallow. This effect is compared with some women seemingly becoming more fertile following a miscarriage (*idem.*, 34, 49, 164-65).
- 165 Strabo, *Geography*, 5, 2, 6 and 7, 5, 8.
- 166 43, 833b, 1-3; see also 42, 833a, 28-30 and 44, 833b, 1-4. Furthermore (48, 833b, 23-25), about the peculiar production of the Chalybian and Amisenian iron: "[...] it grows together, as at least they assert, from the sand that is carried down by the rivers." In Virgil, *Aeneid*, 10, 174, Elba is called "insula inexhaustis Chalybum generosa metallis". Regeneration of metals is also apparent in that their very presence is often described in terms of birth – for example in *Iliad*, 2, 857, where distant Alybe is called "the birthplace of silver". See also Halleux (1970), pp. 16-19.
- 167 Eliade (1962), pp. 37-38. Theophrastus also divides certain stones by gender: cornaline (feminine: diaphan), lynx, azurite; the masculine stones are again more robustly coloured (Halleux (1970), p. 22). See also Pliny, *Naturalis historia*, 37, 28, 100-101, who, as far as the *sandastros* stone is concerned, differentiates between the fiery brilliant male and the more mellow female. Antiquity often sees the reciprocal attraction of magnesium stones as sexual (Halleux (1970), pp. 21-23). And in Nonnus

- (*Dionysiaca*, 2, 493f.) the two stones which make fire when they strike one another are called male and female.
- 168 Forbes, vol. 7 (1966), p. 91.
- 169 Theophrastus (1965), p. 59. Aëtitae are also mentioned by Pliny (*Naturalis historia*, 36, 39, 149-50), and by Dioscorides and Philostratus – all of whom consider them to be a remedy against miscarriage (see Theophrastus (1965), p. 24). In Pliny (36, 29, 134), moreover, we read: “Theophrastus, again, and Mucianus express the opinion that there are certain stones that give birth to other stones.” In *Paradoxographorum graecorum reliquiae*, 12, 1 (cited in Halleux (1970), p. 24), one Andronicus is quoted as maintaining that in a certain area of Spain there are small polygonal, white glossy stones that breed – the writer has allegedly personally checked the claim.
- 170 Evans, vol. II, 2 (1928), p. 453, calls the latter “Grotesque rocks”.
- 171 For round-curved crests: see, for example, King (1915), *passim* (double-outlined); see also *Man Placing Gift in Mountain Shrine* on Minoan rhyton (double outline), reproduced in Rutkowski (1986), p. 83. An engraving of the Euphrates-Tigris region on a silver plate from Maykop (Kuban River valley) (c. 2000 BC or later) shows the Caucasus Mountains as a collection of triangles mixed with occasional curved forms (reproduced in Haas (1982), p. 207).
- 172 Evans, vol. I (1921), p. 313.
- 173 The god ascending the mountain is probably the sun god Utu with sunbeams and saw. See Kramer (1963), p. 61.
- 174 Rutkowski (1986), p. 51. The shrine is E. VI. 10.
- 175 Ringbom (1958), pp. 102-06.
- 176 Naumann (1977).
- 177 Isaiah 14: 13 speaks scornfully of the king of Babylon who intends to sit “on the mount of assembly in the far reaches of the north”.
- 178 Ringbom (1958), pp. 106-07.
- 179 *Ibid.*, p. 344.
- 180 *Ibid.*, p. 331.
- 181 See Moretti (1967), p. 24. On the one short side the rocks also come in from the left.
- 182 The concept of the organic properties of the terraced rock was first presented in Wamberg (1990), p. 138. This article was the very first to link rocks in paintings with pre-modern ideas of mineral growth.
- 183 For the idea of panspermic seed as initiator of mineral and metal genesis, see also Kircher (1664), vol. 2, pp. 328-30.
- 184 See Harvey (1980), p. 39.
- 185 *Bacchanalian Scene* from Pompeii, Casa del Citarista, Naples, Museo Nazionale, reproduced in Herrmann (1904-31), Tf. 108.
- 186 See Kallab (1900), p. 9.
- 187 Re the following, see Plumpe (1943), pp. 1-14.

- 188 *Aeneid*, I, 166-68: "Fronte sub adversa scopulis pendentibus antrum, intus aquae dulces, vivoque sedilia saxo, nympharum domus."
- 189 13, 810-11: "[...] sunt mihi, pars montis, vivo pendentia saxo antra [...]."
- 190 *Aeneid*, 3, 688-89: "[...] vivo praetervehor ostia saxo Pantagiae Megarosque sinus Thapsumque iacentem."
- 191 *Fasti*, 5, 661-62: "[...] et subiit vivo rorantia saxo antra [...]."
- 192 *Metamorphoses*, 3, 159-60: "[...] nam pumice vivo et levibus tofis nativum duxerat arcum [...]."
- 193 *Ibid.*, 14, 711-13: "[...] et saxo, quod adhuc vivum radice tenetur [...]."
- 194 *Annals*, 4, 55: "Paulum addubitatum, quod Halicarnasii mille et ducentos per annos nullo motu terrae nutavisse sedes suas vivoque in saxo fundamenta templi adseveraverant."
- 195 Forbes (1966), pp. 67 and 84.
- 196 *Timaeus* 60c; *Kitab al-Shifa*, cited in Grant (1974), p. 619; *De causis proprietatum elementorum, Alberti Magni Opera Omnia* 5, II (1980), p. 101. See also Forbes (1966), p. 67.
- 197 Restoro d'Arezzo (1976) 2, 5, 8, pp. 128-29: "E già semo usiti en monti li quali erano tutti bianchi, quasi come neve, li quali erano nati e fatti da aqua, la quale faceva petra; e segno de questo si era che l'acqua uscia a sommo quelli monnti, e venendo giù e spargendose d'atorno a quelli monti, quella aqua se strignea facendose petra, e crescea sempre lo monte. E e'lla summità d'uno de quelli monti era uno bagno d'acqua calda e'llo quale noi ne bagnammo, e li nostri capelli li quali stavano e'll'acqua li se 'mponea petra da torno, come la cera a lo stopino per fare candela."
- 198 *Meteorologica*, I, 14, 351a-b. Compare also with Lucretius' writing about the creation of the world (*De rerum natura*, 5, 492-94): "The plains settled down, the lofty mountains increased their height; for the rocks could not sink, nor could all parts subside equally to the same degree." See also Philo's *On the Eternity of the World*, 132-33, in which the growth and decay of mountains is compared to that of trees.
- 199 Forbes (1966), p. 3.
- 200 *Meteorologica*, 2, 7-8, 365b.
- 201 Re the following, see Piaget (1929), pp. 339-49; citation from p. 340. The builder-idea was corroborated by my own daughter, Miranda, aged five, in December 2006.
- 202 Solitary cylindrical forms are also seen in *Abraham's Sacrifice*, Ravenna, San Vitale, mosaic on the north side of the presbytery, reproduced in Volbach (1958), Tf. 159; these bear an echo of the three- and five-part cylinder groups in Damascus, Umayyad Mosque, entrance portico mosaics: *Architectonic Landscape*, executed by Christian artists 705-11, reproduced in Lazarev (1967), tav. 73. See also the mound-like bundles of cylindrical forms sited on the green ground in *Saint Apollinaris as Shepherd for his Flock* (c. 549), apse mosaic, Ravenna, Sant'Apollinare in Classe; the same effect can be seen in *Saint Cosmas and Saint Damian Being Presented to the Lord by the Apostles* (526-30), apse mosaic, Rome, Santi Cosma e Damiano, reproduced in Wilpert (1917), vol. III, Tf. 102.
- 203 *Moses and the Burning Bush*, atrium mosaic, Moses Dome, reproduced in Demus (1984), vol. 2, 2, b/w pl. 329.

- 204 For other examples, see the reproductions in de Witt (1954-59), vol. 1, tav. II, III and VII; vol.2, tav. VIII; and vol. 4, tav. 9 and II.
- 205 See also the *Capturing of a Bison, a Female Tiger and an Antelope*, Corridor of the Great Hunt, reproduced in Dorigo (1971), colourpl. 7.
- 206 See also the fresco fragment in Santa Saba, Rome (c. 750-800), reproduced in Wilpert (1917), vol. IV, Tf. 189, 7.
- 207 See, for example, *Deposition* (after 1164), fresco, Church of Saint Panteleimon, near Nerezi (the former Yugoslavia), reproduced in Grabar (1953); and *Anastasis*, Mount Athos, Dionysiou, cod. 587, f. 2, reproduced in Weitzmann (1980), fig. 6.
- 208 Other examples in Demus (1950), tav. 59-109. The stalks, by turns, rise abruptly from the soft contours of the hills and flow in continuity with them.
- 209 See *ibid.*, tav. 59-109. Similar forms are seen in *Saint John the Baptist Announcing the Coming of Christ* (c. 1066-1100), Austria, Lambach Abbey, reproduced in Demus (1970), fig. 143, and in *Otto III's Gospel Book*, Munich, Bayerisches Nationalbibliothek, Cod. lat. 4453, reproduced in *ibid.*, fig. 92 – in the latter these forms are the only indication of ground at all.
- 210 Similar gently serrated surfaces are seen in *Saint John the Evangelist with his Pupil Procurus*, Gospel book (early 12th century), Moscow, State Historical Museum, ms gr. 41, f. 206v, reproduced in Lazarev (1967), tav. 263; and in *Moses on Mount Sinai* (12th century) from the Octateuch, Istanbul, Topkapu Saray Library, cod. 8, f. 257v, reproduced in Pearsall & Salter (1973), pl. 15a. These 'petal and leaf rocks' must have their origins in rocks of the type in the *Menologion of Emperor Basil II* (c. 985), Vat. gr. 1613, reproduced in Lazarev (1967), tav. 121-22 – even though the upper plateaus are gently curved, they have yet to become independent living units.
- 211 Reproduced in Demus (1950), tav. 8-36. Demus calls attention to their odd appearance (p. 357) and similarly compares them to fungi.
- 212 Forbes, vol. VII (1966), p. 18.
- 213 Other examples: Chora Church in Constantinople, frescoes and mosaics made 1315-1320/21, reproduced in Underwood (1969). Dečani monastery (Serbia), frescoes painted sometime after 1327, reproduced in Bihalji-Merin (1960), pl. 61; *Menologion* (Thessaloniki 1322-40), Oxford, Bodleian Library, ms gr. th. f. t., f. 2, reproduced in Demus (1977f.), vol. 1, Abb. 1-105; *Raising of Lazarus* (c. 1302), fresco, Mount Athos, Chilandari Monastery, reproduced in Talbot Rice (1962), p. 100. The first example of this type of rock that I have been able to find is the Moses Dome in the atrium of San Marco, Venice, (6th dome) of 1280-81, reproduced in Demus (1984), vol. II, 2, colourpl. 73-74. In a late-15th-century icon in the State Tretyakov Gallery, Moscow (reproduced in Weitzmann et al. (1982), p. 283), the 'plant-like' is still influencing the crystalline: the steps conclude in small balls with circular base.
- 214 Other examples include *Saint Francis Receiving the Stigmata* from the same altarpiece, reproduced in Oertel (1968), pl. 31; the Florentine school's *Saint Michael and Stories from his Life* (13th century), panel from Sant'Angelo a Vico l'Abate, Florence, Galleria dell'Accademia, reproduced in Sinibaldi and Brunetti (1937), tav. 56b; Salerno di Coppio, *Crucifix*, panel, Pistoia Cathedral, reproduced in *ibid.*,

- tav. 59a. A variant of this type of rock is one in which the top of the hills end in S-shaped cracks; see the Pisan school *Santa Catarina of Alexandria and Stories from her Life* (13th century), panel, Pisa, Museo Civico, reproduced in *ibid.*, tav. 22a.
- 215 Cennini (1933), ch. 88, p. 57.
- 216 Line 201, cited in Godman (1985), pp. 136-37: "Et lapides vivi pereunt altaria circum."
- 217 Cited in Nicolson (1959), p. 174. For more post-medieval examples, see also my chapter 12.
- 218 Forbes (1966), pp. 33-34; Grant (1974), p. 619.

Chapter 3

The Second Remoteness of the Depth of Field

- 1 *Griffin Fresco* (c. 1500 BC) in the Throne Room of the Palace of Knossos is set on alternately white rocks and red background; and the *Partridge Fresco* from the "Caravansera" at Knossos (now in the Heraklion Archaeological Museum) has a deep-blue background.
- 2 See also Wilkinson (1992), pp. 129 and 176-77.
- 3 Merkelbach (1984), p. 304.
- 4 *De gloria atheniensium*, 2 (*Moralia* 346a); also Pliny, *Naturalis historia*, 35, 36, 60, and a scholiast. See Pollitt (1990), pp. 147-48. Woermann (1876), p. 216, also names the lexicographers Hesychius and Phobios as sources.
- 5 According to Aristotle, *Rhetoric*, 3, 12, *skiagraphia* is identical with scene-painting.
- 6 Reproduced in Hermann (1904-31), vol. I, Tf. 48. See also *Slaying of the Niobids* from Pompeii's Casa VII, 15, 2 (Naples, Museo Archeologico Nazionale), in which the shadows similarly flicker in all directions.
- 7 Spengler (1972), pp. 113, 192 and 309; Damisch (1972), pp. 176-77.
- 8 Turquoise: for example, *Andromeda Being Rescued by Perseus*, Pompeii, House of the Priest Amandus, reproduced in Picard (1968), p. 64. Colourless: *Pan and the Nymphs* from Pompeii, Naples, Museo Archeologico Nazionale, reproduced in *ibid.*, ill. 38.
- 9 *Odyssey*, 10, 47-50. Reproduced in colour in von Matt (1969), Tf. 15. Strangely, Damisch overlooks these clouds in his mention of the work (Damisch (1972), p. 176). See also the grey-green and mauve clouds surrounding Zeus in the fresco with *Zeus in the Clouds*, reproduced in Peters (1963), ill. 139, referred to on p. 141.
- 10 On Typhon's winds, see Vernant (1982), pp. 109-13. That the distinction between the two types of wind was not always airtight was due to, *inter alia*, an Old Testament concept of four angry winds; see, for example, Jeremiah 49: 36. See also the many questions on winds in the pseudo-Aristotelian *Problems*, 26.
- 11 Colour reproduction in Feder (1978), p. 77.
- 12 This sense of unreality is eminently described by Panofsky (1953), p. 9.
- 13 Lucretius, *De rerum natura*, 5, 579-81.
- 14 *Republic*, 508c. See Bultmann (1948), pp. 13 and 20.

- 15 Hoppe (1926), pp. 7-8.
- 16 Hass (1982), p. 66.
- 17 Homeric *Hymn to Demeter*, 78; Hesiod, *Theogony*, 558, 41, 929j and 71-73.
- 18 *Odyssey*, 6, 42ff.
- 19 *Clouds*, 264-67 and 327-30. Slightly revised from Loeb.
- 20 Exodus 19: 16-18 and 24: 16-17. Deshman (1995), p. 11. Deshman, *passim*, supplies an extremely erudite account of cloud symbolism in Judeo-Christian culture. My thanks to Herbert Kessler for bringing this study to my attention.
- 21 *Aeneid*, 10, 633-34.
- 22 *Metamorphoses*, 9, 271-72.
- 23 Gilbert (1907), p. 34. For example, *Theogony*, 757, 807.
- 24 Pauly-Wissowa (1894-1980), "Nimbus", col. 591ff. Deshman (1995), p. 12.
- 25 *Aeneid*, 2, 615; Servius (1946), p. 471: "NIMBO EFFULGENS nube divina, est enim fulgidum lumen, quo deorum capita cinguntur; sic etiam pingi solet." For a discussion of clouds and haloes, see also Hughes (1968), pp. 124-30.
- 26 Gilbert (1907), pp. 488-93. Aristotle, *Meteorologica*, 1, 9. Pliny, *Naturalis historia*, 2, 47, III.
- 27 Lucretius, *De rerum natura*, 6, 103-04.
- 28 Gilbert (1907), pp. 619-38. Aristotle, *Meteorologica*, 2, 9, 369a-b; Pliny, *Naturalis historia*, 2, 38, 104 and 2, 43, 112-13 (citation).
- 29 Fechner (1986), pp. 165-67 discusses the lack of a solution to the issue. Damisch (1972), p. 209, comes closest to a breakthrough with his suggestion that the celestial bands are consistent with "une conception cosmologique élaborée", inasmuch as they correspond "à des zones, à des lieux qualitativement différenciés". In Haerberlein (1939), p. 95, the medieval celestial strips are seen as an expression of "zahrftarbigen Sonnenaufgangs-, Abend- und Regenbogenstimmungen". Although there is, as we will see, a core of truth in this – unsubstantiated – assertion, the interpretation has too strong a touch of the romantic and atmospheric. On p. 78 the author considers the pink clouds that allegedly cover many of the golden or blue heavens in medieval landscape images, and sees them as representing dawn in a paradisiacal ideal landscape that is supposedly typical of medieval art (see also p. 112). In terms of description and interpretation alike, this reading would seem to be somewhat unreliable.
- 30 109d-110a.
- 31 *De civitate Dei*, 11, 33. In a variant of this, Fulgentius (468-533) linked air with the bodies of demons, the fallen angels, as opposed to fire and ether, which were reserved for God's angels. See *De Trinitate*, 9, in Migne, *Patrologia Latina* 65, 505: "Qui facit angelos suos spiritus, et ministros suos ignem urentem (Psal. CIII, 4). Corpus ergo aethereum, id est igneum, eos dicunt habere: angelos vero malos, id est daemones, corpus aereum." See also Kirschbaum (1970), vol. II, col. 9.
- 32 On colour's evocation of precious materials, see Kessler (2004), p. 30.
- 33 Meissner (1925) vol. II, p. 108.
- 34 Eliade (1962), pp. 19-20.

- 35 *On the Soul*, 2, 418b I, II-13. See also *Sense and Sensibilia*, 439a, I, 26-27: "[...] light is a nature inhering in the transparent when the latter is without determinate boundary." Furthermore, Schöne (1954), p. 69; Meier and Suntrup (1987), p. 391.
- 36 Cited in Schöne (1954), p. 69.
- 37 *Ibid.*, p. 62.
- 38 Schöne (1954), p. 26; Kessler (2004), p. 20; Kirschbaum (1970), vol. II, col. 9. Sources, for example: Bede, *De templo Salomonis*, 12 (Migne, *Patrologia Latina*, 91, 763); Bruno of Segni, *Sententiae* I, 4: "De templo Salomonis" (*Patrologia Latina*, 165, 886).
- 39 Slightly revised translation from Spengler (1971), pp. 247-48; Spengler (1972), p. 320: "[...] jenseits alles Farbig-Natürlichen [...]. Gold is überhaupt keine Farbe."
- 40 Cited in Schöne (1954), p. 60.
- 41 Cited in *ibid.*, p. 78: "[...] sed nihil habet communis ad solis hujus lumen."
- 42 Schöne (1954), p. 26. Purple: for example, evangelist portrait (early 9th century), Brussels, Bibliothèque Royale, ms 18723, f. 17v, colour reproduction in Nordenfalk (1957), p. 59; red: for example, *Otto III's Prayer Book* (Mainz, 11th century), Pommersfelden, Gräflisch Schönbornsche Bibliothek, cod. 2940, colour reproduction in *ibid.*, (1957), p. 127. On red and purple as possible symbols of celestial light, see Lehmann (1971), p. 239 and note 8, p. 257. On red as symbol of phenomena such as Christ's passion, blood and human nature, love, shame, sin and glory, see Meier and Suntrup (1987), pp. 419-69.
- 43 See also Ezekiel 10: 1.
- 44 Kirschbaum (1970), vol. II, col. 9. Bede, *De templo Salomonis*, 14 (Migne, *Patrologia Latina*, 91, 768): "Plenae sunt hyacinthis, quia ad gloriam Patris universa quae fecit retulit, quia per opera quae fecit nostros ad coelestia quaerenda sensus erigit."
- 45 Cited in Godman (1985), pp. 290-91.
- 46 Bruno of Segni, *Expositio in Exodum*, 28, 105 (*Patrologia Latina*, 164, 341): "Hyacinthus enim, ut jam saepe diximus, quoniam aerei coloris est, coelum significat."
- 47 Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, ms lat. 8850, f. IV, colour reproduction in Mütterich and Gaehde (1976), pl. 4. Discussion of the miniature in Koehler, vol. II (1958), pp. 73-74.
- 48 Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, ms lat. I, f. 329v, colour reproduction in Mütterich and Gaehde (1976), pl. 23. Discussion of the miniature in Koehler, vol. I (1963), II, pp. 53-57.
- 49 Klementine Lipfert (1956) reaches the same conclusion with regard to the colour of medieval clothes, see Rösch (1960), p. 424. Furthermore Dronke (1972), p. 52 and *passim*; Meier and Suntrup (1987), pp. 410-11.
- 50 Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, ms lat. 266, f. 171v, colour reproduction in Mütterich and Gaehde (1976), pl. 26. Discussion of the miniature in Koehler (1963), vol. II, pp. 76-81.
- 51 Kessler (2005).
- 52 See, for example, *Vergilius Romanus*, Vatican Library, ms Vat. lat. 3867 (5th century), and the Ottonian manuscripts *Pericope Book of Heinrich II* and *Gospels of Otto III*, Munich, Staatsbibliothek, ms Clm. 4452 and 4453 respectively.

- 53 Colour reproduction in Mütterich and Gaehde (1976), pl. 6.
- 54 no b-IIIa.
- 55 See also, Daniel 10: 6, in which the Lord is revealed in the likeness of precious stone.
- 56 On the medieval reception of these stones, see Dronke (1972), pp. 77-80.
- 57 *Epic of Gilgamesh* (1972), p. 100.
- 58 Strophe 1, Dalley (1989), p. 291.
- 59 See, for example, the relief from a synagogue in Jaffa, reproduced in Grabar (1968), ill. 46.
- 60 Dronke (1972), pp. 80-85.
- 61 On this symbolism, see the detailed survey in Lehmann (1971), pp. 228-70; also, Spengler (1972), p. 270.
- 62 In Battistero di San Giovanni (5th century), Naples, the dome has an inlaid Cross monogram surrounded by white and golden stars on a blue background (reproduced in Berchem and Clouzot (1924), p. 106). On the underside of the contemporaneous triumphal arch in Santa Maria Maggiore, Rome (reproduced in *ibid.*, pp. 57-58), the same Cross monogram is surrounded by flowers growing from two baskets at the feet of the arch.
- 63 See also the shades of blue, brown and red around the Judging Christ in the mosaics in Santa Cecilia, Rome (821).
- 64 See Panofsky (1951b), p. 39; Damisch (1972), p. 76. In a letter to Aurelius Symmachus, moreover, Ausonius refers to some gilt leaves and painted clouds that only please for as long as one looks at them. Against the background of the otherwise cloudless antique painting, Damisch questions Panofsky's suggestion that Ausonius is referring to a contemporaneous painting practice (*ibid.*). Taking into consideration the iconographic potentialities of the clouds and, moreover, taking note of the growing presence of revelatory clouds in the mosaics of late antiquity, Damisch's otherwise reasonable doubt would seem unfounded.
- 65 On the connection between clypeus and nimbus in the Middle Ages, see Dushman (1995), pp. 102-03.
- 66 Kirschbaum (1970), vol. III, col. 147.
- 67 Servius (1946), p. 463: "IN LUCE in nimbo, qui cum numinibus semper est."
- 68 Colour reproduction in Mütterich and Gaehde (1976), pl. 33.
- 69 4: 6. Kirschbaum (1970), col. 257-58 and 261. The frozen wave structure in the sea of glass is made very clear in another Carolingian illuminated manuscript: *Codex Aureus of Saint Emmeram*, f. 6 (see my PLATE 17). The colour here is also green, surrounded by blue and golden.
- 70 Eisler (1910), pp. 410-12; Zahlten (1979), p. 149ff.
- 71 Kirschbaum (1970), "Himmel", col. 263. *De divisione naturae*, 3, in Migne, *Patrologia Latina*, 122, 675-77.
- 72 *De civitate Dei*, II, 5.
- 73 Kirschbaum (1970), "Regenbogen", col. 521. On the symbolism of two- to four-coloured rainbows, see Dronke (1972), pp. 68-71.

- 74 Colour reproduction in Nordenfalk (1957), p. 127. See Rösch (1960), pp. 418-26, especially pp. 422ff. On the rainbow as throne: Gregory the Great, *In Ezechielem*, homily 8 (Migne, *Patrologia Latina* 76, 867-68). Also, Kirschbaum, "Regenbogen", col. 521.
- 75 Ms Vat. lat. 3867, f. 234v, illustration to the *Aeneid*, 10.
- 76 Heinberg (1989), p. 75. The concept is already mentioned by Hegel (1970), vol. II, p. 278.
- 77 "Quamvis atrigeros decoret curvamine tractus/ Iris in aereo roscida curva polo./ Quadricolor croceis signet vestigia plantis/ Titanis rutilos excipient radios/ Altera sed vestris, si fas est dicere, tectis/ Multicolor varians Iris honore micat./ Aureus in primo color enitet ordine flagrans;/ Gramineus sequitur Veris honore virens;/ Pulpureum flagrat specimen mirabile visu./ Saphirus ridens spargit in astra decus;/ Emicat et vitreus supter supraque coruscus./ Glaucicomum pelagi gaudet habere modum./ Nobilis altithroni crucis exprimitur decus alium./ Vitrea qua varium linia carpit iter./ Aureus ac viridis, croceus color aereusque/ Conveniunt domino, qui regit astra, deo:/ Sic ruber ac viridis hominem per vulnera passum./ Aureus, aereus sceptraque canunt./ Phebus amat talem, niveis et crinibus aulam/ Deidicat illustrans, aspicit atque polo./ Tempore brumali pollent hic verna serena,/ Fitque hiemps aestas tempore nubifero." Cited in Godman (1985), pp. 290-91. The poem evidently builds on a Virgil topos. In the *Aeneid* (5, 84-88) the glistening of snake scales is compared with that of the rainbow: "[...] his back chequered with blue spots, and his scales ablaze with the sheen of dappled gold, as in the clouds the rainbow darts a thousand shifting tints athwart the sun." The same thousand shifting tints are mentioned when Iris is sent from the heavens to the earth, *ibid.*, 4, 700-01.
- 78 Compare, for example, the celestial lines in the *Pericope Book of Heinrich II* (early 11th century, Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Clm. 4452, reproduced in Nordenfalk (1957), p. 122 (f. 152v: *Saint Peter Receiving the Keys*)) with the lines in the mandorla and firmaments in the portrait of Saint Luke from the *Gospels of Otto III* (Reichenau, c. 1000, Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, ms Clm. 4453, f. 139v, reproduced in *ibid.*, p. 116).
- 79 Discussion of the miniature in Koehler (1963), vol. II, pp. 20-22.
- 80 An equivalent dialectic between veiling and unveiling would seem to be played out in liturgical use of curtains in the High Middle Ages; see Jørgensen (1998), which refers to, *inter alios*, Isidore of Seville, *Etymologiae*, 10, 32 and 13, 4, 1, who intriguingly identifies *caelum* (heaven) as the source for *clarum*, while itself being derived from *celare* (to conceal) (p. 94). See also Jørgensen (2003), pp. 186-88.
- 81 In Psalms 104: 2 the heavens are also compared with a tent. On the origins of this idea, see Eisler (1910). On the symbolism of cloth and baldachin in medieval architecture and architectural decoration, particularly domes, see Lehmann (1971).
- 82 Reproduced in Zanker (1988), p. 191; see also *ibid.*, p. 224.
- 83 Same motif on the sarcophagi in Grabar (1968), figs. 109-110.
- 84 In the 5th-century *Vergilius Romanus* manuscript there is a scene in which a deity is seen descending from the heavens with a cloth stretched like an arch above his head. The cloth is divided into the colours of the rainbow, and we thus here see the link heavens-cloth-rainbow.

- 85 See also Job 38: 9 (referring to the sea): “[...] when I made clouds its garment and thick darkness its swaddling band.” Furthermore, Job exclaims (22: 13-14): “But you say, ‘What does God know? Can he judge through the deep darkness? Thick clouds veil him, so that he does not see, and he walks on the vault of heaven.’” Psalms 97: 2: “Clouds and thick darkness are all around him.” Isaiah 5: 30: “And if one looks to the land, behold, darkness and distress; and the light is darkened by its clouds.”
- 86 See Meer (1978), p. 123.
- 87 In the portrait of *Saint Matthew* from the same school (Milan, Biblioteca Ambrosiana, ms C. 53, sup., f. 19, reproduced in Robb (1973), p. 137) there are no visual similarities between the heavens and Matthew’s garments but, on the other hand, three of the celestial strips are quite plainly suggestive of drapery folds.
- 88 Transfiguration: Matthew 17: 5; Mark 9: 7; Luke 9: 34. Ascension: Acts 1: 9-11. Second Coming: Matthew 24: 27-31; Luke 21: 27; Book of Revelation 1: 7.
- 89 *Commentaria in Esaiam*, 7, 19, 2-4, cited in Deshman (1995), p. 11. The interpretation of Isaiah’s “swift cloud” as both the Virgin Mary’s and Christ’s “not burdened” flesh also occurs in Ambrosius (*Expositio Psalmi*, 118, 3, 19 and 5, 3), the writings of many Carolingians (e.g. Hrabanus Maurus, *Commentaria in Ecclesiastica*, 5, 13, in Migne, *Patrologia Latina*, 109, 925ff.; *idem.*, *De Universo*, 22, 9, 18, *Patrologia Latina*, 111, 276A-B; Remi of Auxerre, *Commentaria in Esaiam*, 2, 19, *Patrologia Latina*, 116, 807D) and in Bede (*In Lucam*, 1; *Homiliae*, 1, 3 and 2, 15), cited in Deshman (1995), pp. 11 and 34. The body of Christ as a cloud also appears in Augustine (commentary to Psalms, 88 (89), 7-8, *Enarrationes*, 88, 1, 7-9, cited in Deshman (1995), p. 33) and in Ambrosius Autpertus (d. 784) (*In Apocalypsin*, 1, 7a-b, cited in Deshman (1995), p. 66). The idea that Mary was enveloped in a cloud at the moment of Jesus’ conception was advanced by, for example, Ambrosius (*Expositio evangelii secundum Lucam*, 7, 19), cited in Deshman (1995), p. 10.
- 90 See Deshman (1995), pp. 13-17 and 25. This interpretation of the word is seen, for example, in the work of the Carolingian writers Amalarius of Metz (*Liber officialis*, 4, 30, 9-10, cited in Deshman (1995), p. 15) and Remi of Auxerre (*Commentaria in Esaiam*, 2, 45, *Patrologia Latina*, 116, 944B-D, cited in *ibid.*, p. 14) or in the writings of the English bishop Aethelwold (*Benedictional*, cited in *ibid.*, p. 15).
- 91 Kessler (1994), pp. 533-94. Preparatory studies for this pioneering work are found in Kessler (1977), pp. 73-78.
- 92 Augustine, *Confessions* 13, xv (16).
- 93 The rolling together was already prophesied in Isaiah 34: 4.
- 94 26: 1ff.; 27: 16; 28: 5 and 15.
- 95 Even though the terminology used about some of the precious stones is unclear, they would seem to be identical.
- 96 Matthew 27: 50-51; Mark 15: 36-38.
- 97 Other example: the apse mosaics in Old Saint Peter’s (4th century) and Santa Maria Maggiore (13th century); the motif can be traced at least as far back as the Venus baldachin in Nero’s Domus

- Aurea, Rome, where it alludes to Venus' birth from the waves, conveyed by a scallop shell; see Lehmann (1971), p. 242.
- 98 F. 215v, colour reproduction in Mütterich and Gaehde (1976), pl. 22. The miniature is discussed in Koehler (1963), vol. II, pp. 57-60. Also in the *David Frontispiece* in the *Bible of San Paolo fuori le mura*, f. 170, David is on an underlay of undulating clouds, see Kessler (1977), pl. 141.
- 99 Colour reproduction in Mütterich and Gaehde (1976), pl. 43. In the same manuscript's *Hieronymus frontispiece* (f. 3v, reproduced in Kessler (1977), pl. 131) the clouds in the background resemble mountain peaks.
- 100 See also the *Adoration of the Lamb* from the Sacramentary in Udine (975-93), f. 66v, and the manuscript in Göttingen, Staats- und Universitätsbibliothek, cod. theol. 231, f. 19, reproduced in Comoretto (1988), p. 74.
- 101 This observation has apparently not been made before in the literature of art history.
- 102 The miniature is discussed in Koehler (1960), pp. 77-80; however, there is no mention of the ambiguities I shall now be describing.
- 103 Also, in the portrait of Luke (f. 64v) in the Carolingian gospel in the Treasury of Cologne Cathedral, there are four brown tree trunks growing from dark-blue, rock-like cloud formations.
- 104 *De perfectione*, logos 2, in Migne, *Patrologia Graeca*, 44, 1209A. See also Daniélou (1953), p. 446.
- 105 *Hom.Ps.*, 36, cited in Daniélou (1953), p. 446. Plato's *Phaedrus*, 247b-d, also refers to "the back of the world", the home of the gods, but here the place is said to be without colour or form and can only be perceived via the intellect, the master of the soul.
- 106 Lucretius, *De rerum natura*, 6, 250-52. Compare also Pliny, *Naturalis historia*, 2, 42, III and 2, 44, II5 and Aristotle, *Meteorologica*, 2, 9.
- 107 Vienna, Weltliche Schatzkammer, f. 76v, colour reproduction in Mütterich and Gaehde (1976), pl. 8.
- 108 Discussed in Koehler, vol. II (1963), pp. 245-82; more examples, Abb. 10-12; see also Braunfels (1968), p. 206.
- 109 Cited in Godman (1985), pp. 198-205. Vv. 6 and 8: "Quo vocat aura levis, placidis superare profundum [...]. Tendere ad ignotas celerique per aequora terras". V.14: "Spargit ad astra suum Karolus rex nomen opimum". Vv. 86-87: "Scilicet imperii ut quantum rex culmine reges/ Excellit [...]". Vv. 95-96: "[...] ingenti magna consurgit ad alta/ Mole tholis muro praeclcis sidera tangens." V.113: "Scandit ad astra domus muris sacrata polis". V.121: "[...] vastus fragor aethera pulsat". Compare also Paschasius Radbertus' elegy *Phyllis* on the occasion of Charlemagne's death (*ibid.*, pp. 260-61): "Who, I ask, would not lament that a man raised above the stars has been reduced to ashes [...]" (Vv. 23-24: "Quo, rogo, non plangat hominem super astram levatum/ In cineres redigi [...]?" "May sadness, weeping and sorrow beat upon the heavens". (V. 41: "Mesticiae, fletus, lacrimae simul aethera pulsant".) With regard to horizontal expansion, compare Moduin's poem (Godman, no. 24, pp. 194-95, Vv. 48ff.). This lists the things that would have to happen before Moduin's praise of Charlemagne ceased, *inter alia* that "[t]he stars shall fall and be mingled in the bowels of the earth or the rivers rear up to the highest heavens", or that the poet himself will have to "go seeking

kingdoms through the vast ocean – perhaps Thule at the end of the earth will eventually pity me from her banks and take me to where Thetis will look mercifully upon me and reward me, a weary stranger, with a place to live [...]” (“Ante cadunt imis miscientia sidera terris,/ Sese aut ad summos extollunt flumina caelos, [...] Ibimus aut vastum quaerentes regna per aequor –/ Forte toris miserans tandem nos ultima Thule/ Suscipiet, Thetis quo nos miserata videbit,/ Ignotisque loci tribuet stipendia fessis [...]”)

- 110 Cited in Godman (1985), pp. 268-69, vv. 67-68: “Tutor et aeternus caelorum in saecula rector,/ Qui terrestre valet in caelum tollere regnum.”
- 111 For a purely spatial interpretation of this phenomenon, see Ueberwasser (1951), pp. 52-57.

Chapter 4 *Sociology of the Middle Distance*

- 1 Durand (1986), p. 8, declares work and sacrifice to be part of a joint “sacrificial machine”.
- 2 Slightly revised translation from Spengler (1971), p. 138; Spengler (1972), p. 180: “Und deshalb ist der Sozialismus – nicht der theoretische von Marx, sondern der praktische, von Friedrich Wilhelm begründete des Preussentums, der jenem voraufging und ihn wieder überwinden wird – mit seiner tiefen Verwandtschaft zum Ägyptertum das Gegenstück zum wirtschaftlichen Stoizismus der Antike, ägyptisch in seiner umfassenden Sorge für dauerhafte wirtschaftliche Zusammenhänge, in seiner Erziehung des einzelnen zur Pflicht für das Ganze und in der Heiligung des Fleisses, durch den die Zeit und Zukunft bejaht werden.” This prophecy of Marxism’s defeat by ‘practical socialism’ obviously seems particularly striking after the post-1989 fall of the Eastern bloc and the growth of social democracy.
- 3 Hegel (1988), pp. 127-36; Kojève (1980).
- 4 Eliade (1960), p. 155. Smoholla was commenting at the end of the 19th century.
- 5 See Anati (1960); Nougier (1993), pp. 333-42; Harvey (1980), pp. 45-46.
- 6 Glob (1969), p. 143.
- 7 Anati (1960), pp. 125-26.
- 8 Habermas (1976), p. 26.
- 9 Fenced fields and agricultural scenes are also found in rock engravings around Mt Bego in the Maritime Alps (c. third millennium BC), see Nougier (1993), pp. 323-30.
- 10 Harris (1977), pp. 70-74.
- 11 Crawford (1991), p. 42; see also pp. 7-8, 27 and 37.
- 12 Helck et al. (1973ff.), vol. 3 (1980), “Landwirtschaft”, col. 930; vol. 1 (1975), “Ackerbau”, col. 60. The digging of irrigation canals was possibly not introduced until the Ptolemaic period.
- 13 *Ibid.*, vol. 7 (1989), “Wasser”.
- 14 On the worship of the feminine earth in Egypt, see Baring and Cashford (1991), pp. 225ff.
- 15 Helck et al. (1973ff.), vol. 1 (1975), “Arbeit”; “Ackerbau”, col. 61.

- 16 * Grape picking and fowling: e.g. Thebes, tomb of Nakht; fig picking: e.g. Beni Hasan, chapel of Khnumhotep II, 12th Dynasty (reproduced in Stevenson Smith (1958), ill.77A); fishing: e.g. Saqqara, tomb of Ptahhotep; bull hunting: e.g. Ramses III hunting wild bulls, Medinet Habu; rhinoceros hunting: e.g. tomb of Mereruwka, 6th Dynasty (reproduced in Weigall (1924), ill. 61.
- 17 See Conti (1978), p. 64. The ceremony of striking the earth was also used at the foundation of holy buildings – see, for example, Wolf (1971), fig. 89, of bricklayers constructing a building (fresco, Thebes, Rekhmire, c. 1440 BC).
- 18 Helck et al. (1973ff), vol. 1 (1975), “Earu-Gefilde”, col. 1156.
- 19 Sandars (1972), pp. 29-30. *
- 20 Panofsky (1964), pp. 14-15.
- 21 There are also scenes of agricultural work in the tomb of granary scribe Unsu (c. 1450 BC), cf. fresco fragment in Paris, Musée du Louvre.
- 22 On the muted pictorial presence of mine-work in the early historical period, see the excellent survey in Winkelmann et al. (1958), pp. 37-40.
- 23 Eliade (1971), especially p. 56. See also Sébillot (1894), pp. 390-91.
- 24 Stevenson Smith (1951), pp. 180-81, reproduced fig. 169. A relief in the tomb of Mereruwka (6th Dynasty, reproduced in *ibid.*, fig. 231) shows the departed sitting at an easel painting the three seasons, personified by three human figures. Each figure holds a cartouche with four lunar symbols.
- 25 Benko (1993), p. 208.
- 26 Cylinder seal with corn goddess: reproduced in Baring and Cashford (1991), FIGS. 23-24, p. 208 (c. 2300-2000 BC). See also the ploughing scene on a cylinder seal from c. 2500 BC, reproduced in Crawford (1991), p. 45, fig. 3.3. All illustrations of Mesopotamian ploughing in Salonen (1968) come from cylinder seals.
- 27 Pittman (1987), pp. 20-21.
- 28 *Atrahasis*, 1 and 7, Dalley (1989), pp. 9 and 18.
- 29 See, for example, Barnett (1975).
- 30 Lions in gardens: from Room E, British Museum, Nos. 118916 and 118914, reproduced in Barnett (1960), Tf. 54-55.
- 31 Ebeling et al. (1928ff.), vol. 1 (1928), “Ackerwirtschaft in sumerischer Zeit”, p. 19: “Vor allem machte man auch dort noch einen strengen Unterschied zwischen Ackerbau und Gartenbau.”
- 32 Crawford (1991), pp. 10-11.
- 33 Black and Green (1992), p. 72.
- 34 *Epic of Gilgamesh* (1972), 1.
- 35 Tooley and Bricker (1969), pp. 10 and 147; Winkelmann et al. (1958), pp. 40-42.
- 36 Meissner, vol. 2 (1925), pp. 389-93.
- 37 Groenewegen-Frankfort (1951), pp. 170ff, emphasises the secular tone of the Assyrian monumental reliefs.
- 38 Relief from the palace at Khorsabad (originally Dur-Sharrukin; 713-06 BC), Paris, Musée du Louvre. Also in a scene depicting soldiers leaving a burning city with their spoils of war (reproduced in Groenewegen-Frankfort (1951), pl. 78), the slope is divided up by broad roads.

- 39 McClung (1983), p. 3 and note 3, p. 149.
- 40 *Metamorphoses*, I, 95.
- 41 *Ibid.*, I, 132.
- 42 For other manifestations of this topos see, for example, Aratos, *Phaenomena*, 96-136 (cited in Lovejoy and Boas (1935), pp. 34-35) (albeit here in a grain-cultural Golden Age); Ovid, *Amores*, 3, 8, 43-44; and Tibullus, *Elegies*, I, 3, 39-40: “[...] nor, seeking gain in unknown lands, had the vagrant seaman loaded his bark with foreign wares.”
- 43 *Odyssey*, 4, 566-68.
- 44 II2-15.
- 45 *Metamorphoses*, I, II6-20.
- 46 See, e.g. the *Punishment of Eros* from the tablinium in Pompeii VII, 2, 2, now in Naples, Museo Archeologico Nazionale, reproduced in Ling (1991), p. 139.
- 47 II4-17.
- 48 *Metamorphoses*, I, 101-12.
- 49 *De rerum natura*, 5, 925-36.
- 50 *Works and Days*, 146.
- 51 *Metamorphoses*, I, 123-24 and 135-36.
- 52 *Georgics*, I, 125-26. For other examples of the topos with division of fields in the most decadent phase of civilisation, see Pseudo-Seneca, *Octavia*, 388ff. (cited in *ibid.*, p. 52); Tibullus, *Elegies*, I, 3, 44 (cited in *ibid.*, p. 59): “[...] no stone was planted on the land to set fixed boundaries to men’s estates”; Ovid, *Amores* 3, 8, 42 (cited in *ibid.*, p. 63); Seneca, *Phaedra*, 483ff. (cited in *ibid.*, p. 284); Horace, *Odes*, 3, 24, 12 (cited in *ibid.*, p. 331).
- 53 *Metamorphoses*, I, 137-45.
- 54 For more examples of this topos, see chapter 12.
- 55 Montmarquet (1989), p. 2, quotes 60 percent from a study in 1968; Ehrenberg (1989), p. 50, cites 90 percent.
- 56 Ehrenberg (1989), pp. 58 and 80.
- 57 *Ibid.* pp. 79-80; Salonen (1968), p. II.
- 58 White (1959), p. 367.
- 59 See, for example, Harris (1977), pp. 43-53, on the origins of war in agrarian culture.
- 60 Garnsey (1988), p. 198.
- 61 1 Kings 5: 6-10; Isaiah 37: 24 (citation).
- 62 In *Anzu*, 2, for example: “Rush and inundate the mountain pastures” (Dalley (1989), p. 212); *Erra and Ishum*, 2: “I shall destroy mountains and fell their cattle” (*ibid.*, p. 297). Virgil’s (?) early *Culex* (42-156) gives an evocative description of the pastoral mountain landscape.
- 63 Ehrenberg (1989), p. 100; Whittaker (1988), Introduction, p. 3; Cherry, pp. 18 and 22.
- 64 Vasey (1992), p. 64.
- 65 Heitland (1921), p. 174.
- 66 In *De trinitate*, cited in Weidinger (1986), pp. 162-63.

- 67 Jeanmaire (1951), pp. 30-32; Vernant (1973), pp. 248-50.
- 68 *Georgics* I, 21-23: "dique deaeque omnes, studium quibus arva tueri, quique novas alitis non ullo semine fruges, quique satis largum caelo demittitis imbrem!"
- 69 *De re rustica*, I, 2, 20-22 and 2, 2, 9. Grazing of livestock is recommended generally on forested land, and Varro writes about his own herds, which "wintered in Apulia and summered in the mountains around Reate, these two widely separated ranges being connected by public cattle-trails, as a pair of buckets by their yoke." See also Garnsey (1988), p. 201; Heitland (1921), p. 179; Saltini (1979), p. 19.
- 70 Columella (Loeb-ed. 1955), p. 26, note. Hammond and Scullard (1979), p. 108.
- 71 Rösener (1992), p. 137.
- 72 Bernheimer (1952), p. 94.
- 73 Frazer (1922), pp. 140-41 and 387; Lehmann-Hartleben and Olsen (1942), pp. 41 and 47.
- 74 Diodorus Siculus, 3, 63, 3.
- 75 Catullus, 34, 5-20. Referred to in Lehmann (1953), p. 109.
- 76 *Naturalis historia*, 12, 1-2.
- 77 Of corn as replacement of acorn, see Virgil's (?) *Culex* 134-36. Ceres' and Venus' different affiliations are stressed by Festus (s.v. *cocum*, 58 Müller, cited in Spaeth (1996), p. 38): "Naevius says, 'The cook produces Neptune, Venus, [and] Ceres.' By 'Ceres' he means bread, by 'Neptune' fish, by 'Venus' vegetables."
- 78 *Naturalis historia*, 2, 63, 157.
- 79 *Geography*, 3, 3, 7. See also Shaw (1982/83), p. 29.
- 80 Lovejoy and Boas (1935), pp. 6-11; Schama (1995), pp. 517 and 526-27.
- 81 3, 677b-c. The idea of mountain shepherds as survivors of a flood is also expressed in Plato's dialogues *Critias* and *Timaeus*, see Lovejoy and Boas (1935), pp. 160-61.
- 82 See Heitland (1921), p. 98. The model is promoted, for example, by Varro, *De re rustica*, 2, 1, 3ff.
- 83 Berger (1985), pp. 17-18.
- 84 *Servius' Commentary on Aeneid Book Four*, 58, here cited from Spaeth (1996), p. 53. Spaeth refers to further relevant passages.
- 85 Respectively: 4, 19; 7, 10: 4, 2; and 4, 106. The nomads of eastern India were also said to eat raw meat (*ibid.* 3, 99). See also Shaw (1982/83), pp. 11-12. The distinction between shepherds and ploughmen is also maintained by the early historians Hellanicus and Hecataeus (*ibid.*, p. 8).
- 86 6, 84.
- 87 *Prometheus Bound*, 447-58.
- 88 See also Hoppin (1919), vol. I, p. 34; Hoppin (1919), vol. II, p. 41; Folsom (1976), fig. 20; Boardman (1974), fig. 222.
- 89 Among the countless other depictions of this motif, the following should be mentioned: Satyrs picking, carrying and treading grapes: Attic black-figure kylix, reproduced in Isager and Skydsgaard (1992), pl. 3.6; satyrs treading wine on stone press: Attic red-figure amphora, reproduced in *ibid.*, pl. 3.8. See also Reinach (1909-12), vol. III, p. 83 (vintaging satyrs); and *ibid.*, vol. II, p. 276 (wine treading satyrs) and p. 454 (wine growing).

- 90 On the naturalness of fermentation, as opposed to, for example, the impact of fire, see Bryson (1990), pp. 17ff.
- 91 *Dionysiaca*, 12, 293-362. See also Kérenyi (1976), pp. 58-60.
- 92 Panofsky (1964), p. 34.
- 93 Kerény (1976), pp. 257-58.
- 94 Another hunting motif is the hunt of the Calydonian boar; see, for example, the alabaster urn (c. 350-0 BC) in Volterra, Museo Guarnacci.
- 95 The pastoral category also includes scenes such as packing and transport of wool, or nymphs fetching water from well houses (e.g. reproduction in Boardman (1974), fig. 224).
- 96 Cited in Thompson (1963), s. p.
- 97 Amouretti (1986), pp. 293-95. She here details what she calls a complete catalogue of plough representations in Greek art.
- 98 Compare also, in a broader agricultural perspective, the vase with harvest workers returning from the fields (c. 1500 BC) from Crete, Haghia Triada, now in the Archaeological Museum of Heraklion, reproduced in Baring and Cashford (1991), fig. 40, p. 132. We do not know, however, which crop - corn, olives or something else - has been harvested.
- 99 Amouretti (1986), pp. 85, 227 and 293-95. Reproduction of another black-figure painting: *ibid.*, pl. 8. Reproduction of Thasos imprint, red-figure vase and Metapontum coin: *ibid.*, pl. 9.
- 100 Many writers have noted the Greek absence of art historical documents concerning farming: Berger (1985), p. 2; Osborne (1987), pp. 18-20; Saltini (1979), p. 14. For unknown reasons, Isager and Skydsgaard (1992), p. 46, consider the visual documentation to be ample.
- 101 Triptolemus carrying corn is also depicted on a red-figure hydria in Copenhagen, Ny Carlsberg Glyptotek, reproduced in Isager and Skydsgaard (1992), pl. 2.1, p. 23.
- 102 On Triptolemus, see, for example, Pausanias I, 14, 2-4; 7, 8, 2-3; 8, 4, 1.
- 103 See Baring and Cashford (1991), p. 379.
- 104 See also Isager and Skydsgaard (1992), p. 23, pl. 2.2; Amouretti (1986), pl. 9.
- 105 Pipili (2000), p. 153.
- 106 *Ibid.*, p. 153; Ziomecki (1975), pp. 23-43; Boardman (1974), p. 212.
- 107 Boardman (2001), p. 234; Pipili (2000), pp. 153-54 and 159.
- 108 Hammond and Scullard (1979), p. 29.
- 109 Osbourne (1987), p. 16.
- 110 Burford (1993), p. 14. Isager and Skydsgaard (1992), p. 4, and Applebaum (1992), p. 44, similarly note the extreme absence of written sources on agriculture in antiquity.
- 111 This circumstance is noted by Applebaum (1992), p. 579.
- 112 Heitland (1921), pp. 22-24.
- 113 289-90; 303-05.
- 114 *Iliad*, 18, 541ff.
- 115 *Odyssey*, 18, 358-76.
- 116 For example, *ibid.*, II, 489-91.

- 117 *Ibid.*, 9, 105-11.
- 118 *Ibid.*, 9, 191. See Heitland (1921), p. 19.
- 119 *Illiad*, 13, 322.
- 120 Laubscher (1982), p. 6.
- 121 Smith (1991), p. 138.
- 122 *Ibid.*, p. 140, mentions Herodas, *Mime* 4 (3rd century BC), in which two middle-class women and their slave girl visit a temple of Asclepius (possibly on Kos). Among the more prestigious votive offerings mentioned: a statue of Hygieia, the work of Praxiteles' sons; a portrait statue of a prominent local woman; genre statues such as "a girl looking up at an apple", an "old man" and a "boy strangling a goose".
- 123 Frazer (1992), pp. 51-52.
- 124 Fechner (1986), p. 99.
- 125 Rosenmeyer (1969), especially pp. 200-01; Heitland (1921), pp. 115-16.
- 126 Others of the idylls with corn-cultural elements: nos. 7, 9, 13 and 25.
- 127 Winkelmann et al. (1958), p. 52.
- 128 *Naturalis historia*, 36, 1-2.
- 129 For a discussion of this series, see Winkelmann et al. (1958), pp. 42-48.
- 130 Garnsey (1988), p. 198.
- 131 *De rerum natura*, 4, 1107: "[...] atque in eost Venus ut muliebria conserat arva [...]."
- 132 Spaeth (1996), pp. 41-47 and 114-19.
- 133 *De civitate Dei*, 7, 24. On the connection between work and sacrifice, see Durand (1986).
- 134 Berger (1985), pp. 2-3 and 31-40, however, provides a feminist more than a sociological explanation for this: patriarchal culture generally, and especially in the Middle Ages, oppresses the Great Goddess.
- 135 Spaeth (1996), p. 37.
- 136 *Ibid.*, pp. 81-97 and 113-23. Ceres' link to the plebeians was first noted by H. le Bonniec in 1958.
- 137 Lovejoy and Boas (1935), pp. 103ff.
- 138 Here cited from Paglia (1991), p. 260.
- 139 *On the Generation of Animals*, 1, 22, 730b.
- 140 Lovejoy and Boas (1935), p. 169.
- 141 *Physics*, 2, 8, 199a 10ff.
- 142 *On the Parts of Animals*, 1, 1, 639b.
- 143 *Politics*, 1, 1256a-b.
- 144 Vernant (1973), p. 255.
- 145 *Ibid.*, pp. 247, 268-69.
- 146 *Politics*, 1, 1256a, 29-30.
- 147 *Ibid.*, 1, 1256b 8.
- 148 Heitland (1921), pp. 11 and 70.
- 149 Osborne (1987), p. 16.

- 150 Heitland (1921), pp. 33, 36, 52 and 106.
 151 420-22, cited in Heitland (1921), p. 33.
 152 *Ibid.*, pp. 115 and 120.
 153 *Politics*, 3, 1282a, 17-23. The same idea in Plato's *Republic*, 601e. See also Vernant (1983), pp. 273-75.
 154 *Politics*, 1,4, 1253b; *Republic*, 374; Vernant (1973), p. 268.
 155 *Politics*, 7, 1328b40-1329a.
 156 Heitland (1921), pp. 74-77 and 92.
 157 *Republic*, 372eff.
 158 Vernant (1973), pp. 266-67 and 269; Heitland (1921), p. 96. See also Aristotle's *Politics*, 1257, 11-15, 1258b2-8 and 1267a6 f.
 159 *Laws*, 713c-e.
 160 Vernant (1973), p. 269.
 161 Hegel (1988), pp. 127-36; Kojève (1980), p. 15.
 162 Kojève (1980), p. 42.
 163 *Ibid.*, p. 46.
 164 Montmarquet (1989), p. 28.
 165 Vernant (1973), p. 251. See also, Heitland (1921), pp. 8 and 66-67.
 166 *Economist*, 9, 14-18; 11, 10.
 167 Of the following, see Dilke (1971), especially pp. 82ff. and 214-17; Dilke (1985), pp. 87-90; Chouquer and Favory (1991).
 168 Harvey (1991).

Chapter 5 Forms of Paradise

- 1 Gelfer-Jørgensen (1986), p. 68.
 2 Eliade (1960), pp. 59-72.
 3 Cited in Dalley (1989), p. 291.
 4 See Gelfer-Jørgensen (1986), p. 66.
 5 Maisak (1981), pp. 36-38.
 6 Cited in Widengren (1951), pp. 5-6. See also: *ibid.*, p. 19; Rossi-Osmida (1974), pp. 29-30.
 7 Widengren (1951), pp. 9-10. The last of the three inscriptions in Gudea CylA 27, 23-24.
 8 *Ibid.*, p. 11.
 9 Cited in *ibid.*, p. 45.
 10 *Epic of Gilgamesh* (1972), 11, 4 and 6.
 11 Lines 65-67, cited in Widengren (1951), p. 33.
 12 *Ibid.*, pp. 14-18 and 48.
 13 *Ibid.*, pp. 42-45.
 14 *Ibid.*, pp. 20-30.

- 15 For comparison, see the tree and forked streams of water projecting from the vase on a gold vase from Amlash (9th-8th century BC), reproduced in Gelfer-Jørgensen (1986), fig. 30, p. 54.
- 16 Winged goddesses: from Nimrud, Northwest Palace (Ashurnasirpal II's reign, 883-859 BC), Room I, British Museum (reproduced in Barnett (1960), Tf. 3); eagle-gods: same location (reproduced in *ibid.*, Tf. 7).
- 17 Widengren (1951), p. 40.
- 18 The same image of Nebuchadnezzar is found in Daniel 4: 9-12. Compare also: "And the surviving remnant of the house of Judah shall again take root downward and bear fruit upward." (Isaiah 37: 31) "There shall come forth a shoot from the stump of Jesse, and a branch from his roots shall bear fruit." (Isaiah 11: 1) "In those days and at that time I will cause a righteous Branch to spring up for David, and he shall execute justice and righteousness in the land." (Jeremiah 33: 15) "I will bring my servant the Branch. [...] In that day [...] every one of you will invite his neighbor to come under his vine and under his fig tree." (Zechariah 3: 8-9) Also: Isaiah 4: 2; Jeremiah 23: 5; Zechariah 6: 12.
- 19 Reinach (1909-12), vol. II, p. 417, no. 1. Other examples of sacred trees wound around by serpents in Greco-Roman relief art are found in *ibid.*, p. 264, no. 1 (*Jason Aided by Medea Removes the Golden Fleece*, Paris, Musée du Louvre) and p. 415, no. 4 (*Hero and Horse in front of Holy Tree*, Athens, National Archeological Museum).
- 20 See Åkerström-Hougen (1974), pp. 65-66; Grabar (1968), p. 52. See also the mosaic floor from the Church of St Christopher, Qabr Hiram, Lebanon (AD 575), now in the Louvre.
- 21 See Maguire (1987).
- 22 *De laudibus Constantini*, 616, in Migne, *Patrologia Graeca*, 20, 1344. See also Maguire (1987), p. 21, and Jacoby (1985), p. 116.
- 23 Maguire (1987), p. 22.
- 24 See *ibid.*, pp. 36-40.
- 25 *Ibid.*, p. 7. The examples are the Butrinto baptistery in Albania and the south aisle of the Greek basilica C in Nea Anchialos (both 6th century).
- 26 Ringbom (1958), pp. 281-82 and 389.
- 27 *Ibid.*, pp. 335 and 396-97; Gelfer-Jørgensen (1986), pp. 68-70.
- 28 See Matthew 24: 30: "Then will appear in heaven the sign of the Son of Man, and then all the tribes of the earth will mourn, and they will see the Son of Man coming on the clouds of heaven with power and great glory." Matthew 25: 31: "When the Son of Man comes in his glory, and all the angels with him, then he will sit on his glorious throne." Book of Revelation 21: 10: "And he carried me away in the Spirit to a great, high mountain, and showed me the holy city Jerusalem coming down out of heaven from God [...]." 14: 1: "Then I looked, and behold, on the Mount Zion stood the Lamb [...]."
- 29 Ringbom (1958), pp. 36-65 and 436-38.
- 30 Torriti's restoration added Saint Francis of Assisi and Saint Anthony of Padua besides, kneeling, the Franciscan benefactor Pope Nicolaus IV.

- 31 Ringbom (1958), pp. 55-60; Krautheimer (1980), p. 210.
- 32 Metropolitan Museum of Art has a number of examples in its collection. Another example is reproduced in Gelfer-Jørgensen (1986), fig. 41, p. 68 (from Limoges).
- 33 According to *ibid.*, p. 65, the only example of a mountain in early Islamic art is, incidentally, a rock such as this with double-outlined peaks. The mountain appears in a fresco scene with two female dancers pouring water into bowls from long-necked bottles (Samarra, Jawsaq al-Khaqani, palace of Caliph Mu'tasim, domed harem chamber (836-39), reproduced in *ibid.*, fig. 36, p. 64).
- 34 *Odyssey*, 5, 64-72.
- 35 Curtius (1954), pp. 202 and 199 (refers to Book 14 of Isidore's *Etymologiae*). Athenaeus had already referred to the topos as especially common in the *Deipnosophists*, 749. On the topos in antiquity, see Schönbeck (1962).
- 36 "[...] loca solius voluptatis plena [...] unde nullus fructus exsolvitur", cited in Curtius (1954), p. 199.
- 37 Schönbeck (1962), p. 15.
- 38 *Idyll II*, 45-46; *Idyll 3*, 12. See also Virgil, *Eclagues*, 5, 5-6: "See how the wild vine with its stray clusters has overrun the cave."
- 39 I, 166-68.
- 40 Helbig (1969), vol. III, pp. 454-57.
- 41 Seneca, *Oedipus*, 530-47; Statius, *Thebais*, 6, 98-106; Claudian, *Rape of Proserpine*, 2, 107-11.
- 42 *Metamorphoses*, 10, 90-106. See also Curtius (1954), p. 199. Compare also Emathion's garden in Nonnos' *Dionysiaca*, 3,140 and the garden in Achilles Tatius I, 15; the latter makes a point of the density of the walled plantation with quantities of trees, flowers, birds and a spring in the middle. Philostratus (*Imagines*, I, 6) refers to a garden with cupids playing and harvesting fruit from apple trees with gilded arrow quivers in the branches. The trees are spread among ruler-straight beds surrounded by paths. The orchard is watered with dark-blue water from a cave. See Woermann (1876), pp. 229-30.
- 43 *Homeric Hymn to Demeter*, 425f.; *Eclage 2*, 45.f. See also Curtius (1954), pp. 194 and 199. Virgil's (?) earlier *Culex* (lines 398-409) mentions a stretch of meadow land with as many as 18 types of flower.
- 44 Helbig (1969), p. 454 (Bernhard Andreae).
- 45 Frazer (1978), pp. 110ff.
- 46 Maisak (1981), p. 22.
- 47 Philo: in *Questions and Answers on Genesis*, I, 6; Gregory: in *On the Song of Songs*, Homily, 9, Migne, *Patrologia Graeca* 44, 969B; see also Daniélou (1953), p. 434.; Honorius: in *Elucidarium* I, 13 (Migne, *Patrologia Latina*, 172, 1117): "Locus amoenissimus in Oriente, in quo arbores diversi generis contra varios defectus erant consitae [...]"
- 48 Also noted in Rosenmeyer (1969), pp. 189 and 196.
- 49 *Odyssey*, 6, 291-294.
- 50 *Eclage 7*, 65-68.
- 51 Bernheimer (1952), p. 103.
- 52 *Odyssey*, 7, 112-32.

- 52 * *Odyssey*, 7, 112-32.
- 53 *Aeneid*, 7, 29-35.
- 54 Cf. Genesis 2: 6: “[...] and a mist was coming up from the land and was watering the whole face of the ground.”
- 55 Romanos’ *Kontakion* (menology for 25 December), cited in Benz (1953), p. 403.
- 56 *Faust*, 2, 3, v. 9594-95: “Tust du doch, als ob da drinnen ganze Weltenräume wären,/ Wald und Wiese, Bäche, Seen; welche Märchen spinnst du ab!” English translation from Goethe (1976), p. 244. In Irish popular belief, the entrance to Paradise is often imagined to be placed in the side of a burial mound, see Cavendish (1977), p. 87.
- 57 7, 563-70.
- 58 “Of Medieval Landscape”, Ruskin (1873), vol. 3, p. 274.
- 59 Lucretius, *De rerum natura*, 5, 195-203, 824 and 1385ff.
- 60 *Odyssey*, 24, 11f. (see also *ibid.*, 11, 539). On the Elysian Fields, see the *Odyssey*, 4, 561-69. Claudian’s (c. 370-410) Paradise dedicated to Venus in *Epithalamium de nuptiis Honorii Augusti* (verses 50ff.) is placed on a high inaccessible mountain – in this case Pharos on Cyprus. Moreover, it is: frost-, wind- and cloudless; level; permanently equipped with flowers untouched by working hands; and in a state of eternal springtime.
- 61 Toulmin and Goodfield (1965), p. 67.
- 62 *Iliad*, 14, 347-49. For a later exploration of the same motif, see Goethe’s *Faust*, 2, 1: “Schlüpfet zu den Blumenkronen,/ Tiefer tiefer, still zu wohnen,/ In die Felsen, unters Laub! [...] Doch senkt sich Himmelsklarheit in die Tiefen,/ Und Zweig’ und Äste, frisch erquickt, entsprossen/ Dem duftgen Abgrund, wo versenkt sie schliefen;/ Auch Farb an Farbe klärt sich los vom Grunde,/ Wo Blum und Blatt von Zitterperle triefen:/ Ein Paradies wird um mich her die Runde.”
- 63 *Adversus Marcionem*, 3,16, in Migne, *Patrologia Latina*, 2, 343: “Nam quia Jesus Christus secundum populum, quod sumus nos nati in saeculi desertis, introducturus erat in terram promissionis, melle et lacte manantem, id est, vitae aeternae possessionem, qua nihil dulcius [...]”. See also Daniélou (1953), p. 440.
- 64 *Homilies on Numbers*, cited in Daniélou (1953), p. 433.
- 65 2 Corinthians 12: 2-4. *Assumption of Moses*, 38, 5 and 40, 2, see Daniélou (1953), p. 435. According to Theophilus of Antioch and Ephrem the Syrian, Paradise is situated midway between heaven and earth; according to the latter because it unites body and soul (*ibid.*, pp. 442-43 and 449).
- 66 Tertullian, *Apologeticus adversus gentes pro christianis*, 47, in Migne, *Patrologia Latina*, 1, 520 (see also Daniélou (1953), p. 436): “Et si paradisum nominemus, locum divinae amoenitatis recipiendis sanctorum spiritibus destinatum, maceria quadam igneae illius zonae a notitia orbis communis segregatum, Elysii campi fidem occupaverunt.” Origen, *In Exhortationem ad Martyrium*, 36, Migne, *Patrologia Graeca*, 11, 610-11 (on the sword of fire). See also Daniélou (1953), p. 437.
- 67 Cited in Daniélou (1953), p. 448. Compare also Origen, *De principiis*, 2, 11, 6, cited in *ibid.*, p. 443: after death the saints are placed in Paradise, the lowest step on the way to heaven; they later move into the air and finally to heaven itself.

- 68 Isidore, *Etymologiae*, 14, 3; Thomas Aquinas *Summa theologiae*, 1, 102, see Daniélou (1953), p. 445.
- 69 Ephrem the Syrian, *Hymns on Paradise*, 1, 4; Walafrid Strabo, *Glossa ordinaria, Liber Genesis*, 2, 8C, cited in Daniélou (1953), p. 445. See also *ibid.* p. 457.
- 70 *Hymns on Paradise*, 1, 6-17; 2, 10 and 3, 1-3. See also Daniélou (1953), p. 453.
- 71 *Phaedrus*, 248c.
- 72 *Naturalis historia*, 2, 64, 160.
- 73 Ginzberg (1909-38), vol. V (1925), p. 142, note 31. Also reference to Dähnhardt, *Natursage I*, index "Gebirge".
- 74 In some myths it is alternatively maintained, however, that the earth was only level, and at the same time covered with water, until the third day of Creation. In these accounts, mountains and hills and corresponding deep ponds had already appeared after God's command that the waters should be gathered in one place (*ibid.*, vol. I (1909), p. 18).
- 75 *Ibid.*, vol. I (1909), pp. 77-80.
- 76 Nicolson (1959), pp. 82-86.
- 77 Ginzberg (1909-38), vol. V (1925), p. 142, note 31; see also *ibid.*, vol. IV (1913), p. 234: at the Second Coming, the Messiah will grind the Holy Land's mountains to powder as if they were straw.
- 78 *Ibid.*, vol. III (1911), pp. 31 (citation) and 91.
- 79 According to some Jewish commentators, the first threesome of idolatry, incest and murder (in Enos' generation) had already led to a lesser Flood, which covered one third of the earth and resulted in the formation of mountains, valleys and rocky ground: a terrain that will not be redeemed until the Messianic Age (*ibid.*, vol. V (1925), p. 152, note 55).
- 80 Book V, ch. ii, pt. 1, p. 22, cited in Nicolson (1959), p. 88.
- 81 *Ibid.*
- 82 *Enerratio in Psalmum LXXXIX*, 3, in Migne, *Patrologia Latina*, 37, 1141-42; *De Genesi ad Literam*, 8, 25, in Migne, *Patrologia Latina*, 34, 330: "[...] tunc in novitate terrarum, etsi non omnia, plura tamen plana fuisse credibile est, quo latius possent erumpentia fluenta dispergi atque distendi."
- 83 Migne, *Patrologia Latina*, 93, 75-76: "*Et originali mundo non pepercit. Idem ipse mundus est, in quo nunc humanum genus habitat, quem inhabitaverunt hi qui ante diluvium fuerunt. Sed tamen recte originalis mundus ille, quasi alius dicitur, quia sicut in consequentibus hujus Epistolae scriptum continetur, ille tunc mundus aqua inundatus periit, et coelis videlicet qui erant prius, id est, cunctis aeris hujus turbulenti spatiis aquarum accrescentium altitudine consumptis, terra quoque in alteram faciem excedentibus aquis immutata. Nam etsi montes aliqui atque convalles ab initio facti creduntur, non tamen tanti quanti nunc in orbe cernuntur universo. Quod negari forte potuisset, si non etiam nunc omnibus annis terrarum faciem cerneremus aquarum subversione mutatam. Quod tanto magis tunc fuisse factum creditur, quanto major ac diuturnior aquarum impetus terram obsidens alluebat.*" See also Nicolson (1959), pp. 90-91.

Chapter 6

Probing the Golden Age Field

- 1 Ling (1991), pp. 1-3 and 12-51.
- 2 Rostovtzeff (1911), pp. 1-186.
- 3 Schefold (1952) is a model example of the impressionistic and, as regards information, particularly sparse approach. In spite of a still somewhat loose methodological structure, Bettina Bergmann has, however, relatively recently undertaken a substantial preliminary study for a synthesis of social and religious history by identifying relevant quotations from the contemporaneous Roman literature (Bergmann (1992), pp. 20-46).
- 4 Without otherwise subscribing to his conclusions with respect to the philosophy of history, this analysis is inspired by Michel Foucault's study of Velázquez' *Las Meninas* in Foucault (1966). In this work he illustrates how the individual observer is displaced (*deplacé*) in the communal space between image and observer. To Foucault this displacement is characteristic of the classical *episteme* which prevailed in the 17th and 18th centuries until it was supplanted by the modern *episteme* around 1800.
- 5 Woermann (1876), pp. 252ff.; Fechner (1986), p. 88; Ling (1991), p. 109 (on *aktai* in scene 5). Similarly, in *Imagines* Philostratus refers to *leimones* (meadow nymphs) and *skopiai* (mountaintop nymphs), see Fechner (1986), p. 88.
- 6 Naples, Museo Archeologico Nazionale, inv. 9553; Peters (1963), p. 146 and Fig. 139.
- 7 See Schefold (1952), Tf. 19 and 49.
- 8 *Silvae*, 2, 2, 72ff.: "Quid mille revolvam culmina visendique vices? Sua cuique voluptas atque omni proprium thalamo mare, transque iacentem. Nerea diversis servit sua terra fenestris [...]", etc.
- 9 *Epistles*, 5, 6: "Nec procul a balineo scalae, quae in cryptoporticum ferunt, prius ad diaetas tres. Harum alia areolae illi, in qua platani quattuor, alia prato, alia vineis imminet diversasque caeli partes ut prospectus habet."
- 10 For a discussion of the views in this letter and *Epistles*, 2, 17, see Elsner (1995), pp. 77 and 80-81. Despite erudite observations, especially in relation to Roman art of memorising, it seems to me that Elsner interprets the references through a too anachronistically modern lens, which makes the connection between exterior and interior in Roman architecture fluid and thereby overlooks the discontinuity of the views.
- 11 "Magnam capies voluptatem, si hunc regionis situm ex monte prospexeris. Neque enim terras tibi, sed formam aliquam ad eximiam pulchritudinem pictam videberis cernere; ea varietate, ea descriptione, quocumque inciderint oculi, reficientur. Villa in colle imo sita prospicit quasi ex summo [...]" Here somewhat revised from the translation in Loeb.
- 12 Silberberg (1980), p. 31, comments on the fluid boundaries.
- 13 *Laws*, 3, 677b. Peters (1963), p. 191, also notes the water in the landscape floors and similarly observes that now and then it gives the impression of flooding.
- 14 Colour reproduction in Bergmann (1992), frontispiece.

- 15 2, 2, 98-106. Or *Epigram*, 16, 226 in *Greek Anthology* (Alcaeus of Messene; Loeb ed.): "O Pan, who walkest on the mountains, breathe music with thy sweet lips [...], and round thee to the beat of the rhythm let the inspired feet of these water-nymphs move in the dance."
- 16 See Evans (1901); also Pfister (1909), pp. 358-65: "Lokalmarken: Quellen und Flüsse, Höhlen und Erdspalten, Steine und Felsen, Bäume und Haine."
- 17 275b-c, 230b-c and 278b-c. The latter passage states: "Do you now go and tell Lysias that we two went down to the stream where is the holy place of the nymphs, and there listened to words which charged us to deliver a message [...]."
- 18 Bergmann (1992), p. 31; Pennick (1979), p. 38.
- 19 Pennick (1979), pp. 44-54.
- 20 Pfister (1909), pp. 321-30.
- 21 Singular form: *sacellum*, see Evans (1901), p. 30.
- 22 For bases of sacred trees divided into crudely-formed blocks, see, for example, the scenes from Pompeii, Casa del Centenario, reproduced in Rostovtzeff (1911), Abb. 15-16.
- 23 *Greek Anthology*, 9, *Epigrams*, 316 (Leonidas of Tarentum); Horace, *Epodes*, 2, 17-22.
- 24 Pennick (1979), pp. 56-61. For example, in 1565, despite the Reformation, Queen Elizabeth I advises (on *Ancient General Customs*): "The people shall once a year with their curate walk about the parish as they were accustomed [...]; the curate in certain convenient places shall admonish the people to give God thanks."
- 25 The uncertainty in this respect is noted by Silberberg (1980), p. 5.
- 26 See also *Paris on Mount Ida* (c. 50-60 AD), Naples, Museo Archeologico Nazionale, reproduced in Schefold (1952), p. 119. The anthropomorphic personification of the mountain god Ida is seen on a rock. Maureen Carroll-Spillecke similarly highlights the accord between the rural deities and the wild terrains surrounding them in Greek and Hellenistic reliefs (Carroll-Spillecke (1985), pp. 63 and 174).
- 27 For other motifs with rocks used as seats or footstools, see Curtius (1960), frontispiece, Abb. 2, 22, 64, 150, 158-59, 165, 169, 208; Maiuri (1953), pl. 10.
- 28 Cf. Philostratus, *Imagines*, 1, 15 ("Ariadne"): "I do not need to say that it is Theseus you see there on the ship and Dionysus yonder on the land, nor will I assume you to be ignorant and call your attention to the woman on the rocks, lying there in gentle slumber."
- 29 *Illiad*, 16, 235: "- and about thee dwell the Selli, thine interpreters, men with unwashed feet that couch on the ground." See Kéryni (1976), p. 207.
- 30 Kéryni (1976), p. 360. One of these *monosandaloí* can be seen in Villa of the Mysteries, Pompeii, reproduced in *ibid.*, ill. 110c.
- 31 *De rerum natura*, 5, 1402.
- 32 *Naturalis historia*, 2, 63, 154.
- 33 *De rerum natura*, 5, 69-75.
- 34 *Ibid.*, 5, 945-52.
- 35 *Ibid.*, 4, 580-94.

- 36 II, 1, 22 and I, 8, 6. The same admonition had already been given in Cato, *De re rustica*, 5, 3-4.
- 37 Bergmann (1992), p. 32.
- 38 *Elegies*, 3, 13, 47-48.
- 39 *De lingua latina*, 5, 49.
- 40 *Institutio oratoria*, 10, 1, 88.
- 41 *Naturalis historia*, 12, 2, 3.
- 42 *De natura deorum*, 2,9: "Sed neglegentia nobilitatis augurii disciplina ommissa veritas auspicio-
rum sprete est, species tantum retenta [...]". Of the decline of the augurs' function, see also *De legibus*,
2, 13, 33; *De re publica*, 5, 1, 2. In the late text *De divinatione*, however, Cicero attacked every kind of
divination, including the faculty of the augurs.
- 43 *Odes*, 3, 6, 1-4: "Delicta maiorum immeritus lues, Romane, donec templa refeceris aedisque labentis
deorum et foeda nigro simulacra fumo."
- 44 Bergmann (1992), p. 33.
- 45 Livy, *Ab urbe condita*, 4, 20, 7. See Zanker (1988), pp. 102-08.
- 46 Bergmann (1992), n. 22, p. 44.
- 47 Ling (1991), p. 146.
- 48 Bergmann (1992), p. 41.
- 49 *Ibid.*, p. 40.
- 50 3, 2, 5.
- 51 *Elegies*, 3, 2, 9f. Of artificial caves, cf. also Seneca, *Epistles*, 55, 6, 6. Varro (*De re rustica*, 1, 2, 2) and
Horace (*Satires*, 2, 6, 1ff.) recommend the presence of a spring on the estate (Lehmann (1953), p. 116).
- 52 Bergmann (1992), p. 40.
- 53 *Naturalis historia*, 17, 1, 6.
- 54 6, 73. See also Bergmann (1992), p. 41. Cf. also Virgil, *Eclogues*, 7, 35-36: "Now we have thee of marble
for the time; but if births make full the flock, then be thou of gold."
- 55 On a harbour pier in a fresco from Casa della Fontana Piccola in Pompeii, VI, 8, 23, there is also
a ruined fortification tower: photograph of drawn copy in Deutsches Archäologisches Institut,
Rome, neg. 75.1671.
- 56 See also the fresco from Pompeii in Naples, Museo Archeologico Nazionale, inv. 9405, photograph
in Deutsches Archäologisches Institut, Rome, neg. 75.1505.
- 57 Bergmann (1992), n. 8, p. 43, claims that the ruined fortification tower should perhaps be seen in
parallel with Strabo, who apparently interprets the ruined fortification towers in the Mediterranean
area as a sign of the Augustan peace. It has not been possible to verify this information.
- 58 Spengler (1972), pp. 173: "pietätsvoll gepflegte Ruine", and 328: "ob ein Grieche die Bildung der Patina
nicht als Zerstörung des Kunstwerkes empfunden hätte. Es ist nicht die Farbe allein, das raumferne
Grün, das er aus seelischen Gründen vermied; die Patina ist Symbol der *Vergänglichkeit* und sie
erhält damit eine merkwürdige Beziehung zu den Symbolen der Uhr und der Bestattungsform."
English translations in Spengler (1971), pp. 132 and 253.

- 59 *De architectura*, 7, 5, 2: "Postea ingressi sunt, ut etiam aedificiorum figuras, columnarum et fastigiorum eminentes protecturas imitarentur, patentibus autem locis, uti exhedris, propter amplitudines parietum scaenarum frontes tragico more aut comico seu satyrico designarent, ambulationibus vero propter spatia longitudinis varietatibus topiorum ornarent a certis locorum proprietatibus imagines exprimentes; pinguntur enim portus, promunturia, litora, flumina, fontes, euripi, fana, luci, montes, pecora, pastores. Nonnulli locis item signorum melographiam habentes deorum simulacra seu fabularum dispositas explicationes, non minus troianas pugnas seu Ulixis errationes per topia, ceteraque, quae sunt eorum similibus rationibus ab rerum natura procreata." Here slightly modified translation from Loeb.
- 60 *Naturalis historia*, 35, 37, 116-17: "Non fraudando et S.Tadio [possibly Studio or Ludio] divi Augusti aetate, qui primus instituit amoenissimam parietum picturam, villas et porticus [possibly portus] ac topiaria opera, lucos, nemora, colles, piscinas, euripos, amnes, litora, qualia quis optaret, varias ibi obambulantium species aut navigantium terraque villas adeuntium asellis aut vehiculis, iam piscantes, aucupantes aut venantes aut etiam vindemiantes. Sunt in eius exemplaribus nobiles palustri [possibly paulstri or plaustri] accessu [possibly ac sensu] villae, succollatis [possibly suae collatis or subcollantium] sponsione [possibly specie] mulieribus labantes trepidis quae [possibly trepidisque] feruntur, plurimae praeterea tales argutiae facetissimi salis. Idem subdialibus maritimas urbes pingere instituit, blandissimo aspectu minimoque inpendio."
- 61 The issue of the sacral-idylls' work activities needs, to an even greater extent than the cult aspect, a systematic analysis in the art historical literature.
- 62 See also Ling (1991), ill. 149 (man with sticks), ill. 155 (man with stick).
- 63 See also, *ibid.*, ill. 155.
- 64 And again *ibid.*, ill. 155.
- 65 *Ibid.*, ill. 157 and photograph in Deutsches Archäologisches Institut, Rome, neg. 53,504, of G. Discanno's drawing after the Pompeian fresco in VIII, 2, 39 (two women gardening in small, low-walled enclosure; in the middle, a Herme). Silberberg (1980), p. 6, provides an excellent survey of the activities of the figures in the sacral-idylls.
- 66 Museo di Castellamare di Stabia, photograph in Deutsches Archäologisches Institut, Rome, neg. 77, 253.
- 67 Clarke (2003), pp. 85-87 and 95-118.
- 68 *Ibid.*, pp. 259-61, reproduced pl. 23.
- 69 Both Leach (1992), p. 198, and Silberberg (1980), p. 43, note in passing this absence of work on the land and agricultural themes in the sacral-idylls – Silberberg giving the reason that it would be offensive. It is difficult to determine if there is a ploughing scene in the damaged fresco from Pompeii, Naples, Museo Archeologico Nazionale, Inv. 9411; photograph in Deutsches Archäologisches Institut, Rome, neg. 60,466. According to Peters (1963), p. 57, in the Second Style columbarium of Villa Pamphili in Rome there is an exceptional scene (Cxxx) with two men working the soil: one with a hoe, the other with an unidentified tool which he is holding with both hands. Peters refers to Bendinelli's monograph (1941), pl. 6.

- 70 The mountain is often claimed to be Vesuvius, but apart from the fact that grapevines are grown on Vesuvius – as on so many other mountains – there is nothing to support this improbably topographical interpretation. There is another example of depiction of grapevines, on a drawn copy, in Leach (1992), p. 76.
- 71 Horace, *Odes*, 2, 15, 10-16.
- 72 Lehmann (1953), pp. 101-07. See Columella, *De agricultura*, 1, 6, 9-10, and Varro, *De re rustica*, 1, 57, 1.
- 73 The rehabilitation of navigation, following its traditional status as Golden Age challenger, is addressed, according to *L'anné philologique* 1988, no. 14531, in J.G. Cernysou's "La navigation en mer dans les utopies antiques" (Russian) in G.S. Knabe (ed.), *Vie quotidienne et histoire dans l'Antiquité*, Moscow, 1988. Unfortunately, I have been unable to gain access to this publication.
- 74 Heitland (1921), pp. 163 and 222.
- 75 Varro, *De re rustica*, 1, 17, 1: "instrumenti genus vocale".
- 76 *De agricultura*, 11, 1, 23. See also *ibid.*, 1, 8, 6-7.
- 77 *Pericles*, 1, 152. See also Applebaum (1992), p. 32.
- 78 *De oratore*, 2, 9, 40 (see also *ibid.* 1, 18, 83 and 1, 62, 263). Also, Heitland (1921), pp. 187-88; Clarke (2003), pp. 95-96. Other relevant passages from Cicero in *De Officiis*, 1, 42, 150-51 (disparagement of, *inter alia*, workshop labour and wage work, payment for which is simply pledge for slavery); *Brutus*, 257 (precedence of pictorial art over unskilled work); *Tusculanae disputationes*, 5, 36, 104 (on the foolishness of conferring collective worth on those considered individually to be barbaric workers [*operarii barbarii*]).
- 79 Heitland (1921), p. 174.
- 80 *Naturalis historia*, 18, 4, 19-21.
- 81 *Ibid.*, 8, 7, 35.
- 82 *De agricultura*, 1, 1, 18-1, 2, 1 and 1, 3, 12. Quotations: 1 *praef.*, 3, 15 and 13 respectively. See also Heitland (1921), p. 110.
- 83 *Ibid.*, p. 200.
- 84 Nicander of Colophon is known to have written a more metaphrastic poem about farming in the 2nd century BC, even though according to Cicero (*De oratore*, 1, 16, 69) he "was a complete stranger to country life". See *Virgil's Works* (1950), p. xvii.
- 85 Cassius Dio, *Roman History*, 52, 28. See also Heitland (1921), p. 225.
- 86 Heitland (1921), pp. 218, 223, 233-34 and 229-30.
- 87 1, 68-72; 5, 33-37.
- 88 *Eclogue 1*, 27-29.
- 89 *Eclogue 2*, 19-22.
- 90 Heitland (1921), p. 219.
- 91 Bernheimer (1952), p. 86.
- 92 Woermann (1876), p. 194: "Mutter der Landschaftsmalerei".

- 93 Diodorus Siculus, *Bibliotheca historica*, 31, 18, 2: "Demetrius, topographer" and Valerius Maximus, *Factorum dictorumque memorabilium libri IX*, 5, 1, 1: Ptolemy's host referred to as "pictor alexandrinus". Also quoted in Pollitt (1990), p. 178.
- 94 Schefold (1960), in addition to scene paintings, refers to Hellenistic illustrated scrolls – especially Isis scrolls – as the chief sources of Roman landscape painting. The hypothesis seems very flimsy, but it does suggest a link to Hellenistic Egypt. Silberberg (1980), pp. 16-26, is, however, sceptical of the idea of an Egyptian origin and declares the question unresolved.
- 95 *Aratus*, 15, 3. See Arnott (1962), p. 94.
- 96 5, 3, 8. See also Arnott (1962), p. 95.
- 97 5, 6, 9. "[...] satyricae vero ornantur arboribus, speluncis, montibus reliquisque agrestibus rebus in topeodi speciem deformati." Here slightly revised translation from Loeb.
- 98 Pickard-Cambridge (1946), pp. 50 and 227.
- 99 See Beyen (1938), vol. 1, pp. 187-90.
- 100 Pickard-Cambridge (1946), pp. 68 and 122-23; on p. 54, however, he states, in a more simplified thesis, that the standard set comprised one with a palace, a second with a temple and: "A third set, with a cave in the centre of the background, whether by the sea or in a rustic setting, will have been available both for tragedy and for satyric drama, which frequently requires the cave."
- 101 *Ibid.*, p. 51.

Chapter 7 *Embryonic Modernity*

- 1 A sociologically searching study such as Schneider (1983) provides an important piece in the overall jigsaw; but, as far as I know, no one has of yet endeavoured to produce a macrohistorical model that could explain the empirical material in Webster (1938).
- 2 Nilsson (1920), pp. 354ff.
- 3 Toulmin and Goodfield (1965), pp. 56-60.
- 4 Of time in monastic life, see Le Goff (1977), pp. 67-78.
- 5 Hansen (2002), pp. 47-52.
- 6 Nilsson (1920), pp. 58-59, 278 and 70-77.
- 7 In the *Homeric Hymns to Demeter* 192 (8th century BC) Demeter is "bringer of resplendent gifts in season [*orephoros*]", and in the *Orphic Hymns* (29, 9 and 43, 7) Persephone is described as, respectively, playmate and companion for the Horae. See also Hanfmann (1951), p. 82.
- 8 *Iliad*, 5, 749f.
- 9 Parrish (1984), p. 30.
- 10 *On the Heavens*, 2, 3, 286a-b; *On Coming-To-Be and Passing-Away*, 2, 10, 336b. See also Hanfmann (1951), p. 93.
- 11 Serres (1989), pp. 235-36 and 326.

- 12 *Deipnosophists*, 5, 198a-b. See also Parrish (1984), pp. 11, 30 and 48.
- 13 Presumably after a Hellenistic original of c. 200 BC. See Onians (1979), p. 100.
- 14 Illustrated Greek monthly cycles certainly go back to c. 375 BC, as shown by an extant example on a fragmented Attic red-figure vase; see Parrish (1984), p. 41.
- 15 The relief is usually dated to the 2nd or 1st century BC, but seemingly without accurate validation. It is difficult to imagine a Hellenistic focus on work much earlier than the birth of Christ, and the relief could very well be from the 1st century AD, or even later. Levi (1941), p. 276, n. 59, does indeed cite a potential dating margin of 3rd century BC to 3rd century AD, albeit the author shares the conventional view.
- 16 Webster (1938), pp. 5-12. Webster thinks, on inexplicable grounds, that the month figures do not refer to work, but only to religion (p. 13).
- 17 This is also highlighted by Spaeth (1996), p. 147.
- 18 This reading, stemming from Le Bonniec, is expanded by Spaeth (1996), pp. 97-102.
- 19 Coin: Niggeler no. 1028, see Zanker (1988), p. 48; Spaeth (1996), p. 23. See also the Apollonian tripod base with a wheat garland crowned by a victory eagle, Paris, Musée du Louvre, inv. 358, reproduced in Zanker (1988), fig. 99.
- 20 See Spaeth's meticulous new reading, Spaeth (1996) pp. 125-51; also, Zanker (1988), pp. 173-77.
- 21 Two children are also seen clinging to the earth goddess Tellus on the statue of Augustus from Prima Porta, a marble copy of a bronze original made on the occasion of Augustus' victory over the Parths, 20 BC. Besides a cornucopia, this Tellus – as a symbol of her connection with Ceres – is adorned with a *corona spicea*. Tellus is seen in the lower section of Augustus' breastplate. See Zanker (1988), p. 188; reproduced in *ibid.*, fig. 137. Spaeth (1996), p. 129, emphasises the earth symbolism of the rock albeit, strangely, she overlooks the children's origins in a Tellus iconography.
- 22 These female figures were previously thought to be the breezes (*Auræ*) over the earth and sea respectively.
- 23 Vv. 29-32. See Zanker (1988), p. 176.
- 24 *Nero*, 31, 1-2.
- 25 Kojève (1980), pp. 24-25 and 53 (citation).
- 26 *Ibid.*, pp. 49-50 and 227-29.
- 27 *Ibid.*, pp. 53-56 (citation, p. 56) and 66.
- 28 Le Goff (1977), p. 114.
- 29 See also: 1 Corinthians 4: 12; 1 Thessalonians 2: 9; Ephesians 4: 28; and Applebaum (1992), p. 183.
- 30 The working clientele is also included in Christ's comfort: "Come to me, all who labor and are heavy laden, and I will give you rest." (Matthew 11: 28) At one point Christ even recommends replacing technical skill with spirit (Matthew 6: 25-34).
- 31 Applebaum (1992), p. 181. Noah was a farmer and the first to plant a vineyard (Genesis 9: 20). When the angel of the Lord appears before Gideon, the latter is "beating out wheat in the winepress" (Judges 6: 11). When Elijah goes to anoint Elisha, he finds him ploughing with twelve yoke of oxen (1 Kings 19: 19). Even King Saul "was coming from the field behind the oxen" (1 Samuel 11: 5).

- 32 See Heitland (1921), pp. 207-12.
- 33 On North Africa as Rome's supplier of grain, see Parrish (1984), p. 37; Heitland (1921), p. 283; furthermore, Tacitus, *Histories*, 3, 8. A good introduction to Roman, North African agriculture and its feudal foundation is provided in Elers Koch (1985), pp. 18-23.
- 34 Ms Vat. lat. 3225, picture 48, reproduced as contour drawing in Stevenson (1983), p. 86. For other instances of night skies in the same manuscript, now with stars formed as dots surrounded by smaller dots, see *ibid.*, pictures 14 (p. 46) and 20 (p. 54).
- 35 Parrish (1984), pp. 45-47; Yacoub (1995), pp. 116-28.
- 36 In a fragmented triclinium floor in the palace of Theodoric (454-526), Ravenna, it is the mythical Greek hero Bellerophon who is shown in the centre of the four seasons; an inscription calls on the beholder to enjoy the universal benefits of these four seasons (see Parrish (1984), p. 13).
- 37 Schneider (1983) supplies a thorough analysis of this mosaic, pp. 68-84; see also Yacoub (1995), pp. 217-22.
- 38 From the literature of late antiquity it would seem that literary letters and produce of nature, particularly game, were often exchanged as gifts by villa owners; see Schneider (1983), pp. 70-72 and 107-08.
- 39 Parrish (1984), p. 56. The unchronological distribution of seasons is also found in a mosaic from Jebel Oust (Parrish (1984), cat. 48).
- 40 For the El Jem mosaic, see Yacoub (1995), pp. 122-26.
- 41 Parrish (1984), cat. 49.
- 42 See Magi (1972), pp. 23-35.
- 43 Webster (1938), p. 32. See also Hanfmann, vol. II, ills. 149-50 (Marcus and Marcellinus catacombs (c. 350)). In the catacomb of San Ponziano (reproduced in *ibid.* ill. 147) there are four season sections with full-grown figures who, respectively, harvest (roses, corn and olives) and carry out an unidentified activity with fire, a shield (?) and a spear: references to hunting or something religious?
- 44 The Vatican sarcophagus shows, to the right-hand side of a blessing Christ, men ploughing with the help of a mule and hoeing (in the soil?). The Benevento sarcophagus shows a man and ox ploughing, while two other men in front finish harvesting the corn and a third in the near background carries a basket with bread. Another sarcophagus in the Vatican Museum (31554 (Lat. 191A), from the Pretestato catacombs, c. 390-400)) shows scenes with the four seasons, putti harvesting corn (right side) and putti harvesting grapes (left side), and furthermore the Good Shepherd in a garland with grapes (front side). A third sarcophagus in the same museum (10536) shows the deceased standing and surrounded by: a peasant ploughing behind two oxen, a peasant hoeing the soil, two men grinding grain and baking, two men harvesting corn and two peasants driving home a load of hay in a cart. On one of the sarcophagi in the Musée du Louvre (Ma 3571) the front side shows a scene with Demeter entrusting the corn to Triptolemus, while the short sides show a ploughing scene plus Triptolemus carrying ears of corn. This sarcophagus has been dated to c. 160 AD but, in addition to the work iconography, this is rendered unlikely by the stocky figures, which would again indicate the 4th century.

- 45 Of the latter motif, which would only seem to be in use for a single generation, see Guldan (1966), p. 22. As regards sarcophagi with Adam and Eve, sheep and sheaves of corn, a number of examples are found in the Vatican Museum (e.g. 31427 (Lat. 104) from San Paolo fuori le mura).
- 46 *In Vigilia paschae*, I, 4, in Migne, *Patrologia Latina*, 39, 2056: “[...] in Ecclesia cathecumeni sunt quasi herbae: cum credunt, velut in culmos se erigunt. Fideles quoque in spica maturi accrescunt; unde et sanctorum grana in horreis coelestibus reconduntur.”
- 47 Gauckler (1896), pp. 177-229; Yacoub (1995), pp. 200-03. See also the two-part mosaic in the Cherchel Museum (reproduced in Stevenson (1983), ill. 94), in which both registers show ploughing with oxen in front of olive trees; the lower register also shows sowing.
- 48 Yacoub (1995), pp. 209-15. Prêcheur-Canonge (1962), p. 42; Schneider (1983), pp. 19 and 117, emphasises the plants’ affiliation to the villa’s orchards and park.
- 49 On this mosaic, see Maguire (1987), p. 21.
- 50 *Iliad*, 18, 608.
- 51 See Torelli (1982), p. 119.
- 52 With reference to the following, see Winkelmann et al. (1958), pp. 51-56.
- 53 Reproduction of Bacher relief, *ibid.*, p. 68; reproduction of Linares fragment, *ibid.*, p. 47.
- 54 *Aeneid*, I, 428-29 and 437. This miniature has escaped Siegfried Lauffer’s attention in Winkelmann et al. (1958).
- 55 Webster (1938), p. 32.
- 56 See Åkerström-Hougen (1974), pp. 123-24. An early example of this development would seem to be represented by the so-called *Chronograph* of 354 AD, known from two 15th-16th-century copies (reproduced in Webster (1938), pl. III). Albeit there are still many – indeed, mostly – references to religious festivals, the months here comprise the standing figures which are not to be budged over the following centuries. Among the indirectly suggested labours of the months, we see, for example, a pile of birds for December and a goatskin-clad figure standing by a milk churn for March. Webster (1938, p. 16) acknowledges the fusion of month personification and accompanying illustration into a unifying figure attending to both functions, but he is also of the opinion that the earlier month illustrations – for example, Hagios Eleutherios – *only* referred to religion and not work; every time a later month personification lacks reference to work – for example, the 4th-century mosaic fragment of *June* in the State Hermitage Museum, St Petersburg (reproduced in *ibid.*, ill. 8) – Webster thus finds (p. 18) that it reflects an early tradition. On the other hand, he thinks (p. 95) that the *Chronograph* represents a new development – a linear development towards an increasing number of references to work, culminating in the Carolingian period. He does not, therefore, believe in a post-4th-century reaction against work, but sets up the generalised contrast that antiquity depicts work indirectly, while the Middle Ages depict it directly (p. 97). In my opinion, this thesis should rather be revised to a contrast between the completely work-free classical pictorial culture and the work-marked pictorial culture of late antiquity; at the same time, it has to be appreciated that the results of late antiquity were not followed up directly, but went through a reaction that lasted until the Carolingian period. Levi (1941), pp. 286-88, similarly

considers Webster's polarisation antiquity/Middle Ages too rigid, but, on the other hand, he himself ends up in an equally misleading levelling-out of differences, according to which genre characteristics were apparently present from earliest classical times.

- 57 Applebaum (1992), p. 309.
- 58 Heitland (1921), p. 461.
- 59 With reference to this and the following section, see Le Goff (1977), pp. 115-34.
- 60 British Library, ms Cotton Jul. A. VI and Tib. B. V; see Webster (1938), pp. 53-55 and pls. XVII-XX. Meyer Shapiro, in his highly critical review of Webster's book in Schapiro (1941), however, only accepts a stylistic and not an iconographic derivation from the Rheims school.
- 61 See also Braunfels (1968), p. 171; Dufrenne (1978), pl. 22. For Byzantine images, especially miniatures, from the 11th to the 13th centuries, showing agricultural work, see Brubaker and Littlewood (1992), p. 218.
- 62 McCann (1978), pp. 25-29. The genre was already out of fashion by the mid-2nd century, see Kranz (1984), pp. 162-63.
- 63 Parrish (1984), cat. 49; see also *ibid.*, cat. 5 (*Winter* from Aumale, Algeria, c. 300). On a mosaic floor from the Quirinal Hill in Rome (2nd century AD; reproduced in Lehmann (1971), fig. 47) these seasonal sections are even 'autonomised': in the corners, around a Diana Ephesia as Pantocrator, there are isolated trees which, respectively, sprout, ripen, fade and wither away.
- 64 Maguire (1987), pp. 36-40.
- 65 Migne, *Patrologia Latina*, 59, 328D: "Sic cum desit hiems, nec torrida ferueat aestas,/ Fructibus autumnus, ver floribus occupat annum." See also Maguire (1987), p. 25.
- 66 *Logos*, 3, 2, in Migne, *Patrologia Graeca*, 30, 64B-C. See also Maguire (1987), p. 25.
- 67 *Hymns on Paradise*, 10 (citation: 10, 2-3).
- 68 Maguire (1987), p. 24.
- 69 *Ibid.*, p. 27. The last passage in *Hexaemeron*, 325-37, in Migne, *Patrologia Graeca*, 92, 1459-60.
- 70 Lehmann (1971), p. 244, similarly remarks on the way in which the seasons, with their relationship to "the world of experience", are eliminated from monumental Christian vaults and domes.
- 71 Maguire (1987), pp. 20-21; Lehmann (1971), p. 252.
- 72 Ms Vat. lat. 3867, f. 77, from *Aeneid*, 1.
- 73 More reproductions in Dufrenne (1978), pl. 4. See also the flood scene with a downpour of vertical blue-grey streaks in the *Vienna Genesis*, pict. 3 (6th century), reproduced in Weitzmann (1977) pl. 23. On the winds in medieval images, see Kirschbaum (1970-76), vol. IV, cols. 532-33.
- 74 Mayr-Harting (1991), vol. 2, p. 15.
- 75 See Meer (1978), p. 172.
- 76 Brubaker and Littlewood (1992), p. 226, colour reproduction, *ibid.*, Tf. 30.

Jacob Wamberg


Landscape as World Picture

Tracing Cultural Evolution in Images

VOLUME I

From the Palaeolithic Period to the Middle Ages

Translated by Gaye Kynoch

Aarhus University Press | 

Landscape as World Picture: Tracing Cultural Evolution in Images
Volume I: *From the Palaeolithic Period to the Middle Ages*

First published in Danish as *Landskabet som verdensbillede. Naturafbildning og kulturel evolution i Vesten fra hulemalerierne til den tidlige modernitet* by Passepartout, Aarhus, 2005

© Jacob Wamberg and Aarhus University Press 2009

Graphic design and cover: Jørgen Sparre

Cover illustration: Giovanni di Paolo, *Creation of the World and the Expulsion from Paradise* (c. 1445), tempera and gold on wood. New York, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, Robert Lehman Collection, 1975 (1975.1.31) Photograph © 1985 The Metropolitan Museum of Art.

Typesetting: Narayana Press

Type: Legacy Serif and Legacy Sans

Paper: Lessebo Design Smooth and Hello Silk

Printed by Narayana Press, Denmark

Printed in Denmark 2009

ISBN 978 87 7934 287 3

AARHUS UNIVERSITY PRESS

Langelandsgade 177

DK - 8200 Aarhus N

www.unipress.dk

Gazelle Book Services Ltd.

White Cross Mills

Hightown, Lancaster, LA1 4XS

United Kingdom

www.gaxellebookservices.co.uk

The David Brown Book Company

Box 511

Oakville, CT 06779

USA

www.oxbowbooks.com

Published with the financial support of
The Aarhus University Research Foundation
The Danish Research Council for the Humanities (FKK)
The New Carlsberg Foundation
The Novo Nordisk Foundation