

A. Kiernan

FAMILIAR COMPOUND GHOST:
HOMER AND NAEVIUS IN THE AENEID'S FIRST SCENES

Terry McKiernan
Virgil Seminar
January 30, 1989

Virgil sometimes transferred whole passages from earlier writers, Macrobius tells us, and changed only a few words. Take, for example, the opening scene of the Aeneid -- the storm, the appeal by Venus, and Jupiter's important reply. This passage (locus totus) was lifted from Book 1 of Naevius' Bellum Poenicum! What are we to make of this claim, and how are we to balance it with Book 1's obvious affinities to Homer? In what sense can Virgil have 'transferred' passages from Naevius or from Homer, and what effect did the practice have on the poem that resulted?

"Naevius, as everybody knows, wrote funny plays, serious plays and -- late in life -- an epic poem in the Saturnian meter... The fragments of Naevius' Bellum Poenicum have been rewritten, rearranged and reinterpreted to the point of frustration."¹ For all the confusion, though, it does seem clear that the poet's celebration of the First Punic War included a tale of Aeneas' wanderings, and so combined treatment of past and present in good Hellenistic manner. Prophecy also seems to have played a part.² But what more can be said, particularly of the passage from Naevius that Macrobius thought had been transferred to the Aeneid?

The evidence, collected by Buechner and appended as Attachment 1 of this paper, is rather thin. Fragment 14, the analysis by Macrobius, says that in Book 1 of Naevius' poem Venus complains to Jupiter when the Trojans are troubled by a storm, and that Jupiter comforts her with hope of future events. Fragment 13 adds that after the tempest, Aeneas comforted his men as he does at A.1.198. Fragment 15, "she addresses her highest, best father," seems to be from the beginning of a speech like that of Venus; Fragment 16, "highest ruler of the gods, why do you hate the race," seems right, but exactly because the emendation "genus odisti" was suggested by Virgil. Without that last circular bit, we have no evidence for verbal imitation of

¹From Luck's entertaining article, pp. 267-8.

²See Wigodsky's discussion, p. 22.

Naevius in the first scenes of the Aeneid.³ What's more, the two statements that the passage in Naevius was transferred by Virgil may well derive from a single source, some list of Virgilian borrowings used both by Macrobius and by the author or redactor of Servius Auctus.⁴

We are left, then, with the simple statement that a transfer occurred. Because the Saturnian and the hexameter are entirely different meters, and because no Naevian verses at all similar to Virgil's survive, we must conclude that the transfer was of plot or event and not of language, and that it was limited to the few elements mentioned in Macrobius and Servius Auctus. We have the latter's assurance that Aeneas' speech at A.1.198 was transferred from Naevius, but we have ample evidence that Homer was a source as well.

When Odysseus and his ship escape from the Laestrygonians, their next landfall is Aiaia, the island of Circe. After a few day's rest, Odysseus climbs to a lookout and then hunts down a stag for his men. Just so, Aeneas and his ships take shelter in the Libyan harbor, he climbs to a vantage point, and then hunts. His words of encouragement when he returns with food answer those of Odysseus (passage 1 of Attachment 2), and the speeches, very different in tone, are related by their similar situations.

Aeneas' speech resembles more closely the one made by Odysseus⁵ in book 12 (passage 2) when his men are terrified by Scylla and stop rowing. Both men refer to the danger of the

³Wigodsky p.38.

⁴Jocelyn (1965) p. 143. In part I of the same article the author says that, though the text of Naevius was likely still extant, "the possibility that Macrobius or Servius or any scholar of this period drew to any considerable extent at first hand from early republican literature is a remote one." (Jocelyn, 1965, pp.282-3).

⁵See Macrobius 5.11.5-6.

Cyclops, now past.⁶ Aeneas also refers to Scylla as past, affording him a peculiar distance over the passage in the Odyssey. That distance is emphasized as well by narrative difference: the passages from the Odyssey have the rudeness of Greek first-person narration, while Virgil can relate the caring words that close Aeneas' little speech and set him off from his Greek model. Odysseus' speech to his men on the island of Helios (passage 3) begins as the others do, and food is again the subject; taken together, the three Homeric passages offer nervous parallels to Aeneas' speech, each one more uneasy than the one before. Two other parallels, though less clearly sources, are Odysseus' words to Eumaeus and Teucer's words to his men⁷ in Horace's Ode 1.7 (passages 4 and 5).

The parallels between Aeneas' speech and those of Odysseus connect the men's situations while differentiating their characters. Aeneas' speech also looks forward in the poem to the advice he gives his son (12.435-40),⁸ and that advice itself has parallels in the Odyssey and the Iliad (passages 6 and 7).

The richness of the parallels with Homer would suggest that Naevius' example, whatever it was, could not have been decisive; Virgil's linking of Aeneas' speech with another speech late in the poem puts this beyond any doubt. But the connections I've been describing have analogues for nearly every passage in the first 300 lines of the Aeneid. The network of allusion and self-reference outlined⁹ in Attachment 3 shows that Homer, and particularly the Odyssey, was a crucial source for the opening of

⁶See Hight's discussion, p. 195.

⁷It isn't clear whether Horace in C.1.7 imitates Virgil or vice versa, or whether both imitate another source (like Naevius, as Norden believed, or Pacuvius' Teucer, as Wigodsky suggests, p.38-9).

⁸Again, see Hight's discussion, p. 31.

⁹The works by Austin, Hight, and Williams cited in the bibliography have been useful here. I haven't consulted Knauer.

the Aeneid, and that Virgil used the resposion between Book 1 and Homer to shape later sections of his poem as well.

Aeneas' first two speeches are good examples of this. Their relation to the Homeric models is one of allusion and revision, and in the tension between these tendencies the character of Aeneas takes form. His character hardens in the course of the poem, and that shift can be appreciated by comparing Aeneas' first speech with his last (12.947ff); his words to Turnus have their own Homeric source -- in the Iliad now, rather than the Odyssey. This link across the length of the poem is signalled by the phrase "solvuntur frigore membra", which appears at 1.92, where Aeneas is first mentioned by name, and is used again at 12.956, applied now to Turnus at his death.¹⁰ Aeneas' second speech also has its counterpart, in his brief moment with his son¹¹ at A.12.435-440. This pair of paired speeches documents both the constancy of Aeneas' pietas and the hardening of his character.

While it is true that there can be no exact Homeric parallel to Jupiter's speech¹² at A.1.257-296, it is striking that one of the sources, Zeus' reply to Hera at Il.15.47-77, does talk in sonorous terms of his plan, and of the hero's fate. That Zeus' fate is within the poem, while Jupiter's is largely subsequent to the poem's action, is indeed an essential difference between Virgil's epic and those of Homer. There is also a reference forward to Jupiter's speech to Juno at A.12.829-42: these two prophetic speeches frame the poem. I suspect that another Homeric parallel, Il.5.426-30, where Zeus teases Aphrodite for intervening in the fight on Aeneas' behalf, is meant to work here by connection with A.1.94-101 -- where Aeneas

¹⁰See Austin's interesting note on the source of the phrase in Homer and Livius Andronicus.

¹¹Highet's discussion of Aeneas' speeches (pp. 29ff. and 187ff.) is helpful.

¹²As Williams p. 271 points out.

refers to the fight without actually naming his mother. That reference obliquely introduces her, preparing the way for her actual entrance at A.1.223.

Two elements in Virgil's treatment of the storm highlight an aspect of his relation with Homer that we need to bear in mind. The first simile in the poem, at A.1.148-156, imitates Il.2.144-152 but reverses the terms, so that nature is described by reference to politics. The inversion announces that Virgil's relationship to Homer is a creative one. It also establishes connections between nature and politics, and between the mythical and political planes, that will be central throughout the poem. Another sign of Virgil's independent treatment of Homer is Neptune's speech at A.1.132ff., which parallels Poseidon's at Od.5.286-90 but again inverts the situation. Poseidon enters and creates a storm, and knowingly acts against the decision of the gods. The contrast with Neptune calls attention to the theme of regulation that is so dominant in the Aeneid's first scenes.¹³ Both these instances show that Virgil's debt to Homer was a complicated and conscious one; although very little can be decided on the basis of the fragments that survive, his use of Naevius' old poem is likely to have been just as nuanced and subtle.

¹³See Poschl pp. 22-23 for a discussion of his theme and of the storm simile.

Bibliography

R.G. Austin. Aeneidos: Liber Primus. Oxford: Oxford University Press (1971).

Carolus Buechner. Fragmenta Poetarum Latinorum Epicorum et Lyricorum. Leipzig: Teubner (1982).

Gilbert Highet. The Speeches in Virgil's Aeneid. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press (1972).

H.D. Jocelyn. "Ancient Scholarship and Virgil's Use of Republican Latin Poetry. I." The Classical Quarterly 58 (New Series 14) (1964).

H.D. Jocelyn. "Ancient Scholarship and Virgil's Use of Republican Latin Poetry. II." The Classical Quarterly 59 (New Series 15) (1965).

Georg Luck. "Naeuius and Virgil." Illinois Classical Studies 8.2 (1983).

Macrobius. The Saturnalia. Translated by Percival Vaughan Davies. New York: Columbia University Press.

Viktor Poschl. The Art of Vergil: Image and Symbol in the Aeneid. Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press (1962).

Michael Wigodsky. Vergil and Early Latin Poetry. Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner (1972).

R.D. Williams. "Virgil and the Odyssey." Phoenix 17 (1963).

Antonie Wlosok. Die Gottin Venus in Vergils Aeneis. Heidelberg: Carl Winter, Universitätsverlag (1967).

A. B. B. B.

Attachment 1
RELEVANT FRAGMENTS OF NAEVIUS

13

SERV. DAN. ad Aen. 1, 198 (77 Th): O socii] . . . et totus hic locus de Naevio belli Punici libro translatus est.

Mar.¹ 46sq.; Wi. 23

Naeviano *Pauly*: Naevii *Thilo in app. crit.*: de Naevi I^o *Bachrens* post tempestatem Aeneas socios consolatur

14

MACROB. 6, 2, 30: sunt alii loci plurimorum versuum, quos Maro in opus suum cum paucorum immutatione verborum a veteribus transtulit . . . (31) in primo Aeneidos tempestas describitur et Venus apud Iovem queritur de periculis filii et Iuppiter eam de futurorum prosperitate solatur. hic locus totus sumptus a Naevio est ex primo libro belli Punici. illic enim aequae Venus Troianis tempestate laborantibus cum Iove queritur et sequuntur verba Iovis filiam consolantis spe futurorum.

Wi. 23

Macrobius testatur ordinem tempestatis, querellae Veneris, consolationis Iovis

15

VARRO ling. Lat. 7, 51: N(a)evius:

patrem suum supremum optimum appellat

supremum ab superrimo dictum.

Bar.¹ 332sqq.; Buech.¹ 332 n. 17; Hueb. 269; Mar.¹ 80; Wi. 23

adpellat *Warm.* | *fragmentum cum sequenti coniungendum esse iure censuit L. Muel-*
ler

16

FEST. 306 L (257 M): 'quianam' pro 'quare' et 'cur' positum est apud antiquos, ut Naevium in carmine Punici belli:

summe deum regnator, quianam genus odisti?

PAUL. 307 L (256 M): 'quianam' pro 'quare' et 'cur' ponitur.

Bar.¹ 332sqq.; Buech.¹ 26; Buech.² 17sq.; A. Garcia Calvo, *Crítica y anticrítica* IX-X, *Emerita* 21, 1953, 42; Hueb. 265sqq.; Leo¹ 47 n. 2; Wi. 23

genus isti *codd.*: genuisti *Scaliger, Merula, Lindsay*²: me genuisti *Havet, Warm.*: ursisti *Bothe*: genus sisti *Zander, corr. Leo*

Venus Iovem patrem alloquitur

Attachment 2
PARALLELS TO AENEID 1.198-207

① Od. 10.173 ff

“ὦ φίλοι, οὐ γάρ πω καταδυσόμεθ’ ἀχνύμενοί περ
εἰς Ἅϊδαο δόμους, πρὶν μόρσιμον ἡμᾶρ ἐπέλθῃ. 175
ἀλλ’ ἄγετ’, ὄφρ’ ἐν νηϊ θοῇ βρώσις τε πόσις τε,
μνησόμεθα βρώμης μηδὲ τρυχώμεθα λιμῶ.”

“Dear friends, sorry as we are, we shall not yet go down into
the house of Hades. Not until our day is appointed.
Come then, while there is something to eat and drink by the fast ship,
let us think of our food and not be worn out with hunger.”

② Od. 12, 208 ff

“ὦ φίλοι, οὐ γάρ πώ τι κακῶν ἀδαήμενές εἰμεν·
οὐ μὲν δὴ τότε μείζον ἔπι κακὸν ἢ ὅτε Κύκλωψ
εἶλει ἐνὶ σπηϊ γλαφυρῶ κρατερῆφι βίηφιν· 210
ἀλλὰ καὶ ἔνθεν ἐμῆ ἀρετῆ βουλή τε νόω τε
ἐκφύγομεν, καὶ που τῶνδε μνήσεσθαι οἴω.
νῦν δ’ ἄγεθ’, ὡς ἂν ἐγὼ εἶπω, πειθώμεθα πάντες.
ὑμεῖς μὲν κώπησιν ἀλὸς ῥηγμῖνα βαθεῖαν

τύπτετε κληῖδεσσιν ἐφήμενοι, αἶ κέ ποθι Ζεὺς
δώῃ τόνδε γ’ ὄλεθρον ὑπεκφυγέειν καὶ ἀλύξαι·
σοὶ δέ, κυβερνήθ’, ὧδ’ ἐπιτέλλομαι—ἀλλ’ ἐνὶ θυμῶ
βάλλευ, ἐπεὶ νηὸς γλαφυρῆς οἰήϊα νωμᾶς—
τούτου μὲν καπνοῦ καὶ κύματος ἐκτὸς ἔεργε
νῆα, σὺ δὲ σκοπέλου ἐπιμαίεο, μὴ σε λάθῃσι 220
κεῖσ’ ἐξορμήσασα καὶ ἐς κακὸν ἄμμε βάλῃσθα.”

“Dear friends, surely we are not unlearned in evils.
This is no greater evil now than it was when the Cyclops
210 had us cooped in his hollow cave by force and violence,
but even there, by my courage and counsel and my intelligence,
we escaped away. I think that all this will be remembered
some day too. Then do as I say, let us all be won over.
Sit well, all of you, to your oarlocks, and dash your oars deep
215 into the breaking surf of the water, so in that way Zeus
might grant that we get clear of this danger and flee away from it.
For you, steersman, I have this order; so store it deeply
in your mind, as you control the steering oar of this hollow

ship; you must keep her clear from where the smoke and the breakers
are, and make hard for the sea rock lest, without your knowing,
she might drift that way, and you bring all of us into disaster.”

③ Od. 12. 320 ff

“ὦ φίλοι, ἐν γὰρ νηϊ θεῆ βρωσίς τε πόσις τε
ἔστιν, τῶν δὲ βοῶν ἀπεχώμεθα, μή τι πάθωμεν·
δεινοῦ γὰρ θεοῦ αἶδε βόες καὶ ἴφια μῆλα,
Ἥελίου, ὃς πάντ’ ἐφορᾷ καὶ πάντ’ ἐπακούει.”

“Friends, since there is food and drink stored in the fast ship,
let us then keep our hands off the cattle, for fear that something
may befall us. These are the cattle and fat sheep of a dreaded
god, Helios, who sees all things and listens to all things.”

④ Od. 15. 400 ff.

μετὰ γάρ τε καὶ ἄλγεσι τέρπεται ἀνὴρ,
ὅς τις δὴ μάλα πολλὰ πάθη καὶ πόλλ’ ἐπαληθῆ.

For afterwards a man who has suffered
much and wandered much has pleasure out of his sorrows.

⑤ H. C. 1.7

‘Quo nos cumque feret melior fortuna parente,
ibimus; o socii comitesque,
nil desperandum Teucro duce et auspice Teucro —
certus enim promisit Apollo

ambiguum tellure nova Salamina futuram;
o fortes peioraque passi
mecum saepe viri, nunc vino pellite curas:
cras ingens iterabimus aequor.’

⑥ Od. 24. 506 ff

“Τηλέμαχ’, ἦδη μὲν τόδε γ’ εἶσεαι αὐτὸς ἐπελθὼν,
ἀνδρῶν μαρναμένων ἵνα τε κρίνονται ἄριστοι,
μή τι καταισχύνειν πατέρων γένος, οἳ τὸ πάρος περ
ἀλκῆ τ’ ἠγνορέη τε κεκάσμεθα πᾶσαν ἐπ’ αἴαν.”

“Telemachos, now yourself being present, where men do battle,
and the bravest are singled out from the rest, you must be certain
not to shame the blood of your fathers, for we in time past
all across the world have surpassed in manhood and valor.’

⑦ Il. 6. 476 ff.

ὡς εἰπὼν οὐ παιδὸς ὄρεξατο φαίδιμος Ἕκτωρ·
ἄψ δ' ὁ πάϊς πρὸς κόλπον εὐζώνοιο τιθήνης
ἐκλίθη ἰάχων, πατρὸς φίλου ὄψιν ἀτυχθεῖς,
ταρβήσας χαλκὸν τε ἰδὲ λόφον ἵππιοχαίτην,
δεινὸν ἄπ' ἀκροτάτης κόρυθος νεύοντα νοήσας. 470
ἐκ δ' ἐγέλασσε πατὴρ τε φίλος καὶ πότνια μήτηρ.
αὐτίκ' ἀπὸ κρατὸς κόρυθ' εἴλετο φαίδιμος Ἕκτωρ,
καὶ τὴν μὲν κατέθηκεν ἐπὶ χθονὶ παμφαιώωσαν,
αὐτὰρ ὃ γ' ὄν φίλον υἷον ἐπεὶ κύσε πῆλὲ τε χερσίν,
εἶπε δ' ἐπευξάμενος Δίι τ' ἄλλοισίν τε θεοῖσιν. 475
"Ζεῦ ἄλλοι τε θεοί, δότε δὴ καὶ τόνδε γενέσθαι
παῖδ' ἐμόν, ὡς καὶ ἐγὼ περ, ἀριπρεπέα Τρώεσσιν,
ὣδε βίην τ' ἀγαθὸν καὶ Ἴλιον ἴφι ἀνάσσειν·
καί ποτέ τις εἴποι 'πατρός γ' ὅδε πολλὸν ἀμείνων'
ἐκ πολέμου ἀνιόντα· φέροι δ' ἔναρα βροτόεντα 480
κτείνας δῆμιον ἄνδρα, χαρεῖη δὲ φρένα μήτηρ."

So speaking glorious Hektor held out his arms to his baby,
who shrank back to his fair-girdled nurse's bosom
screaming, and frightened at the aspect of his own father,
terrified as he saw the bronze and the crest with its horse-hair,
nodding dreadfully, as he thought, from the peak of the helmet.
Then his beloved father laughed out, and his honoured mother,
and at once glorious Hektor lifted from his head the helmet
and laid it in all its shining upon the ground. Then taking
up his dear son he tossed him about in his arms, and kissed him,
and lifted his voice in prayer to Zeus and the other immortals:
'Zeus, and you other immortals, grant that this boy, who is my son,
may be as I am, pre-eminent among the Trojans,
great in strength, as am I, and rule strongly over Ilion;
and some day let them say of him: "He is better by far than his father",
480 as he comes in from the fighting; and let him kill his enemy
and bring home the blooded spoils, and delight the heart of his mother.'

Attachment 3
THE FIRST SCENES:
HOMERIC SOURCES AND RELATED PASSAGES LATER IN THE AENEID

