women and men played a substantial role in preserving, elaborating, and passing on a venerable tradition of accommodating female spirituality within hierarchical structures. It is clear that the audience for these texts was never composed only of Syrian abbots, Roman matrons, Byzantine courtiers, and Frankish lords. Rather, they were aimed at disparate audiences of ordinary persons seeking guidance and consolation in an exceptionally tumultuous time. The vitae of holy women were an important vehicle for teaching moral lessons relevant to the needs and aspirations of common Christians in their homes, families, and marriages. In sustaining an ancient tradition of saintly biography, from the female ascetics of the eastern desert to the penitent queens of western courts, late antique and early medieval hagiographers responded to deep-seated spiritual anxieties and hopes. Their sacred fictions held out the promise of universal redemption. As Zosimas pleaded with Mary of Egypt when shame made her stop telling her story, "For God's sake, speak, Mother; go on and do not break the thread of your life-giving narrative."9

Notes

Abbreviations

AS	Acta Sanctorum. Bruxelles: Impression Anastaltique Culture
CC	et Civilisation, 1970. Corpus Christianorum. Series Latina. Turnholt: Brepolis Editores Parties.
CSEL	itores Pontificii, 1956. Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum. New York and
1542707	London: Johnson Reprint, 1963.
MANSI	Mansi, Joannes Dominicus, ed. Sacrorum Conciliorum Nova et
	Amplissima Collectio. 31 vols. Graz: Akademmische Druck—u. Verlagsanstalt, 1960.
MGH	Monumenta Germaniae Historica. Societas Aperiendis Fon-
	tibus Rerum Germanicarum.
EPP	Epistolae.
SCR	Scriptorum.
SRM	Scriptores Rerum Merovingicarum.
PG	J. P. Migne, ed. Patrologia Graeca. Paris, 1886.
PL	J. P. Migne, ed. Patrologia Latina. Paris, 1886.
SC	Sources Chrétiennes. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1943

Introduction

- I. "Mulier autem erat, quod videbatur, corpore nigerrimo, prae solis ardore denigrata, et capillos capitis habens ut lana albos, modicos et ipsos, non amplius quam usque ad cervicem descendentes": Vita S. Mariae Aegyptiacae, Meretricis, 7 (PL 73.677); translation from Benedicta Ward, Harlots of the Desert (Kalamazoo, Mich.: Cistercian Publications, 1987), 41.
- 2. The Vulgate reads: "caput autem eius, et capilli erant candidi tanquam lana alba, et tanquam nix." Biblical quotations, unless otherwise noted, are from the New Oxford Annotated Bible, Revised Standard Version.
- 3. Author's translation of Vulgate: "Nigra sum sed formosa . . . nolite me considerare quod fusca sim, quia decoloravit me sol."

154

- 4. "Late antiquity" includes both the chronological period of c. 300–800 CE and the geographic region of the Mediterranean and the Near East. The early Middle Ages (c. 500-1000) overlaps the period of late antiquity but comprises the geographic region of the barbarian kingdoms of northern Europe. For an overview of the era of late antiquity, see Averil Cameron, *The Mediterranean World in Late Antiquity*, AD 395–600 (London: Routledge, 1993).
- 5. The sections on the rhetorical uses of clothing are indebted to Marcia Colish's article, "Cosmetic Theology: The Transformation of a Stoic Theme," Assays 1 (1984): 3-14; and R. Howard Bloch, Medieval Misogyny and the Invention of Western Romantic Love (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991), 39-47.
- 6. The lives of both Mary and Pelagia appear in the compilation of later medieval saints' lives, Jacobus de Voragine, *The Golden Legend: Readings on the Saints*, ed. and trans. William Granger Ryan, 2 vols. (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1994), and have been translated into numerous languages, including Greek, Latin, Syriac, Arabic, Armenian, and various Slavic languages. See Pierre Petitmengin et al., eds., *Pélagie la pénitente: métamorphoses d'une légende*, 2 vols. (Paris: Études Augustiniennes, 1981, 1984); and Peter F. Dembowski, *La Vie de Sainte Marie l'Egyptienne* (Geneva: Librairie Droz, 1977).
- 7. See Kenneth Holum, Theodosian Empresses: Women and Imperial Dominion in Late Antiquity (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982), 25-26.
- 8. Ewa Kuryluk, Veronica and Her Cloth: History, Symbolism, and Structure of a "True" Image (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1991), 34.
- 9. Gallo-Roman and Frankish historians and hagiographers acknowledge the importance of the vitae of Helena, Melania the Elder, Melania the Younger, and Paula: Gregory of Tours, Decem libri historiarum, 1.40 (MGH SRM 1.1.27); Gregory of Tours, In Gloria Martyrum, 5 (MGH SRM 1.2.39-42); Baudonivia, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber II, 16 (MGH SRM 2.387-89); and the anonymous Vita Saldabergae abbatissae Laudunensis, 25 (MGH SRM 5.64).
- 10. Patrick Geary, "Saints, Scholars, and Society," chap. 1 in Living with the Dead in the Middle Ages (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1994), 11.
- II. Stephan Borgehammar, How the Holy Cross Was Found: From Event to Medieval Legend, Bibliotheca Theologiae Practicae Kyrkovetenskapliga studier 47 (Stockholm: Almquist and Wiksell International, 1991), details the textual tradition of the Helena legend.
- 12. Julia M. H. Smith, "The Problem of Female Sanctity in Carolingian Europe c. 780–920," *Past and Present* 146 (1995): 12.
- 13. For discussions of sinful women as salvific instruments, see Susan Harvey, "Women in Byzantine Hagiography: Reversing the Story," in *That Gentle Strength: Historical Perspectives on Women in Christianity*, ed. Lynda L. Coon, Katherine J. Haldane, and Elisabeth W. Sommer (Charlottesville: University Press of Virginia, 1990), 36–59; and Ward, *Harlots of the Desert*.
- 14. The twelfth-century mystic Hildegard of Bingen also viewed the Creator as a mother who gives birth to the "ministry of the Word." See Augustine Thompson, "Hildegard of Bingen on Gender and the Priesthood," *Church History* 63 (1994): 349–64.
 - 15. Caroline Walker Bynum, "The Female Body and Religious Practice in the

Later Middle Ages," in Fragmentation and Redemption: Essays on Gender and the Human Body in Medieval Religion (New York: Zone Books, 1992), 215.

- 16. For the asymmetrical pairings of masculine/feminine, see Bynum's essays in Fragmentation and Redemption, and her earlier work, Holy Feast and Holy Fast: The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1987), as well as, "... And His Humanity': Female Imagery in the Religious Writing of the Later Middle Ages," in Gender and Religion: On the Complexity of Symbols, ed. Caroline Walker Bynum, Stevan Harrell, and Paula Richman (Boston: Beacon Press, 1986), 257. Bynum cites the work of art historians on the Virgin Mary as symbolic altarpiece; see Barbara G. Lane, The Altar and the Altarpiece: Sacramental Themes in Early Netherlandish Painting (New York: Harper and Row, 1984), 71–72; and Carol J. Purtle, The Marian Paintings of Jan van Eyck (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1982), 13–15, 27–29.
- 17. Averil Cameron, "Virginity as Metaphor: Women and the Rhetoric of Early Christianity," in *History as Text: The Writing of Ancient History*, ed. Averil Cameron (London: Duckworth, 1988), 184-205.
- 18. Dyan Elliott, Spiritual Marriage: Sexual Abstinence in Medieval Wedlock (Princeton, N. J.: Princeton University Press, 1993), 265.
- 19. For a historiographical discussion of the radical feminist hermeneutics, see Elisabeth Schüssler-Fiorenza, "Toward a Feminist Critical Hermeneutics," chap. I in *In Memory of Her: A Feminist Theological Reconstruction of Christian Origins* (New York: Crossroad, 1983). Schüssler-Fiorenza here discusses the work of the "post-biblical" feminist, Mary Daly.
- 20. Janet Soskice ("Blood and Defilement," paper presented at the Society for the Study of Theology Conference, Oxford University, April 11–14, 1994) discusses how contemporary feminist theologians have highlighted Christ's "gender egalitarianism" and have ignored issues of ritual pollution and defilement.
- 21. For a discussion of feminist methodologies, see Schüssler-Fiorenza, "Toward a Feminist Critical Hermeneutics," and her Searching the Scriptures: A Feminist Introduction (New York: Crossroad, 1993).
- 22. Joyce Salisbury, in *Church Fathers and Independent Virgins* (London: Verso, 1991), examines the *vitae* of Constantia, Mary of Egypt, Helia, Egeria, Melania the Younger, Pelagia, and Castissima.
- 23. For a discussion of recent feminist theological critical methodologies, see Mary Ann Tolbert, "Social, Sociological, and Anthropological Methods," in Searching the Scriptures, ed. Schüssler-Fiorenza, 255-71, 258-59. Roberta Gilchrist provides an introduction to post-structuralism and medieval archaeology in chap. I of her Gender and Material Culture: The Archaeology of Female Monastic Houses (London: Routledge, 1994). See also Kate Cooper, The Virgin and the Bride: Idealized Womanhood in Late Antiquity (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1996); Gillian Cloke, This Female Man of God: Women and Spiritual Power in the Patristic Age, 350-450 (London: Routledge, 1995); Susanna Elm, Virgins of God: The Making of Asceticism in Late Antiquity (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1994); Gillian Clark, Women in Late Antiquity (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1993); Clarissa Atkinson, The Oldest Vocation: Christian Motherhood in the Middle Ages (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1991); Thomas Laqueur, Making Sex: Body and

Gender from the Greeks to Freud (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1990); Michel Feher, ed., Fragments for a History of the Human Body, 3 vols. (New York: Zone Books, 1989); Margaret Miles, Carnal Knowing: Female Nakedness and Religious Meaning in the Christian West (New York: Vintage, 1989); Peter Brown, The Body and Society: Men, Women, and Sexual Renunciation in Early Christianity (New York: Columbia University Press, 1988); Cameron, ed., History as Text, 184–205; and Aline Rousselle, Porneia: On Desire and the Body in Antiquity, trans. Felicia Pheasant (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1988). Several of these scholars cite Michel Foucault (The History of Sexuality, trans. Robert Hurley, 3 vols. [New York: Pantheon, 1978]) as a major influence.

- 24. Averil Cameron (Christianity and the Rhetoric of Empire: The Development of a Christian Discourse [Berkeley: University of California Press, 1991]) discusses the many "rhetorical strategies" found in sacred discourse.
- 25. Kate Cooper, "Insinuations of Womanly Influence: An Aspect of the Christianization of the Roman Aristocracy," *Journal of Roman Studies* 82 (1992): 151.
 - 26. Cooper, "Insinuations of Womanly Influence," 151.
- 27. Julia Smith ("The Problem of Female Sanctity," 20) discusses the depiction of Merovingian and Carolingian women saints "in terms of an essentially male notion of sanctity." See also Cloke, *This Female Man of God*, 13: "It is through these male commentators that we must look at women."
- 28. All four gospels contain the story of the anointing woman. There are, however, differences among the four accounts. In Matthew and Mark, the anointing occurs in the house of "Simon the leper." In Luke, the symbolic action takes place in the house of a Pharisee; and in John, it transpires in the dwelling of Mary and Martha of Bethany. In Luke and John, the woman wipes Jesus' feet with her hair.

Chapter 1

1. Cameron (Christianity and the Rhetoric of Empire, 5) defines discourse as "all the rhetorical strategies and manners of expression" contained within numinous Christian writings. The classic works on hagiography include Hippolyte Delehaye, The Legends of the Saints, trans. Donald Attwater (New York: Fordham University Press, 1962), and René Aigrain, L'Hagiographie: ses sources, ses méthodes, son histoire (Paris: Bloud et Gay, 1953). The secondary source work on hagiographical literature is extensive. The Bollandist successors to the early work of Delehaye include Baudouin de Gaiffier, Recueil d'hagiographie, Subsidia Hagiographica 61 (Bruxelles: Société des Bollandistes, 1977); Baudouin de Gaffier, Recherches d'hagiographie Latine, Subsidia Hagiographica 52 (Bruxelles: Société des Bollandistes, 1971); and Pierre Delehaye, Les Légendes hagiographiques (Bruxelles: Société des Bollandistes, 1955), among numerous others. More recent works include Thomas Heffernan, Sacred Biography: Saints and Their Biographers in the Middle Ages (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1988) and Peter Brown, Cult of the Saints: Its Rise and Function in Latin Christianity (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1981).

For the cross-cultural perspective, see Stephen Wilson, Saints and Their Cults: Studies in Religious Sociology, Folklore, and History (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983).

- 2. For example, Gregory of Tours describes how two blind men were healed during the public reading of a saint's vita during mass: "Factum est autem in die festivitatis suae, adstante populo, dum virtutes de vita illius legerentur, factus est super illos splendor corrusco similis, et confractis ligaturis, quae palpebras obseraverant, defluente ex oculis sanguine, late visu patente, cuncta cernere meruerunt." Gregory of Tours, De Virtutibus S. Martini, 2.29 (MGH SRM 1.2.170). E. Catherine Dunn (The Gallican Saint's Life and the Late Roman Dramatic Tradition [Washington, D.C.: Catholic University Press, 1989]) suggests that such public recitations were actually theatrical performances.
- 3. Confessors are those exemplary Christians who crucify their own flesh to imitate the passions of the martyrs and the death of Christ. Discussed by Raymond Van Dam, *Glory of the Confessors* (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 1988), 10–11.
- 4. "Alumnos cultoresque amicorum suorum protegere dignetur in saeculo": Gregory of Tours, *In Gloria Martyrum*, 106 (MGH SRM 1.2.111).
- 5. Peter Brown uses the phrase amici Dei ("friends of God") throughout Cult of the Saints.
- 6. Delehaye (*Legends of the Saints*, 230) states that the lives of the saints act out the "sublime ideal" of the gospels.
- 7. For the world-religions perspective, see Richard Kieckhefer and George D. Bond, eds., *Sainthood: Its Manifestations in World Religions* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988). This collection investigates notions of sanctity in Christianity, Judaism, Islam, Hinduism, Buddhism, and Confucianism.
- 8. For a discussion of classical hagiography, see Patricia Cox, *Biography in Late Antiquity: A Quest for the Holy Man* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1983); and Robert L. Cohn, "Sainthood on the Periphery: The Case of Judaism," in *Sainthood*, ed. Kieckhefer and Bond, 43–68.
- 9. William F. Arndt and F. Wilbur Gingrich, eds., A Greek-English Lexicon of the New Testament and Other Early Christian Literature (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1952), 9.
- 10. Edith Wyschogrod (Saints and Postmodernism: Revisioning Moral Philosophy [Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990], 13) argues that the life of Christ is an "unrealizable imperative" because its miraculous quality cannot be duplicated by mere mortals.
- II. Kieckhefer, "Imitators of Christ: Sainthood in the Christian Tradition," in Sainthood, ed. Kieckhefer and Bond, 12.
- 12. Brown, in *Cult of the Saints* (69-85), refers to the "very special dead" of God.
 - 13. Kieckhefer, "Imitators of Christ," 4.
- 14. For the process of canonization, see E. W. Kemp, Canonization and Authority in the Western Church (London: Oxford University Press, 1948); André Vauchez, La Sainteté en occident aux dernières siècles du Moyen Âge, d'après les procès de canonisation et les documents hagiographiques (Rome: École Française de Rome,

1981); Kenneth L. Woodward, Making Saints: How the Catholic Church Determines Who Becomes a Saint, Who Doesn't, and Why (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1990), 64–68; and Kieckhefer, "Imitators of Christ," 5–11.

- 15. Woodward (*Making Saints*, 15, 68) discusses both the papal procedures and the role of the *vox populi*. See also Kieckhefer, "Imitators of Christ," 6.
- 16. For an analysis of Hume, Gibbon, and hagiography, see Brown, *Cult of the Saints*, 13–22. See also Patrick Geary, "Saints, Scholars, and Society," in *Living with the Dead*, 9–10.
- 17. As early as the 1930s, Henri Pirenne's Mahomet et Charlemagne recognized the value of Merovingian hagiography as evidence for the continued existence of trade networks in northern Europe during the early Middle Ages. Pirenne's use of hagiographical texts is discussed in Richard Hodges and David Whitehouse, Mohammed, Charlemagne, and the Origins of Europe (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1983), 5–6. In the 1960s, Frantisek Graus (Volk, Herrscher und Heiliger im Reich der Merowinger: Studien zur Hagiographie der Merowingerzeit [Prague: Nakladatelství Ceskoslovenské akademie ved, 1965]) explored the social ramifications of hagiography as well as its propagandistic qualities. Patrick Geary ("Saints, Scholars, and Society," 12–13) discusses Graus's contribution to the field of hagiology. Other historians who have quarried vitae for glimpses of social and economic realities include Donald Weinstein and Rudolph M. Bell, (Saints and Society: The Two Worlds of Western Christendom, 1000–1700 [Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982]).
- 18. Peter Brown's Cult of the Saints (1981) explores the political, theological, and cultural uses of hagiographical narratives. Marc Van Uytfanghe ("Modèles bibliques dans l'hagiographie," in Le Moyen Âge et la Bible, ed. Pierre Riché and Guy Lobrichon [Paris: Éditions Beauchesne, 1984], 450) discusses saints' lives as "instruments d'évangélisation." Both Van Uytfanghe, "Modèles bibliques dans l'hagiographie," and Jean LeClercq, "L'Écriture sainte dans l'hagiographie monastique du Haut Moyen Âge," La Biblia nell'alto medioeve, settimane di studio del centro italiano di studi sull'alto medioeve (Spoleto: Presso la Sede del Centro, 1963), 103-28, examine the influence of the Bible on hagiographical literature. Caroline Walker Bynum has investigated the gendered implications of sacred biographies (Holy Feast and Holy Fast [1987] and Fragmentation and Redemption [1991]), and, more recently, Gillian Cloke (This Female Man of God) explores the social implications of late imperial women's hagiography. See also Susanna Elm, Virgins of God; Gillian Clark, Women in Late Antiquity; Aline Rouselle, Porneia; Peter Brown, Body and Society; Jo Ann McNamara, A New Song: Celibate Women in the First Three Christian Centuries (New York: Harrington Park Press, 1985); Franca Ela Consolino, "Modelli de sanctità femminile nelle piu antiche Passioni romane," Augustinianum 24 (1984): 83-113; and Averil Cameron and Kuhrt Cameron, eds., Images of Women in Late Antiquity (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1983).
 - 19. Cameron, Christianity and the Rhetoric of Empire, 202-3.
- 20. Marc Van Utyfanghe, "L'Hagiographie et son public à l'époque mérovingienne," *Studia Patristica* 16 (1985): 54–62.
 - 21. See Van Uytfanghe, "L'Hagiographie et son public," 55.
 - 22. Katrien Heene ("Audire, legere, vulgo: An Attempt to Define Public

Use and Comprehensibility of Carolingian Hagiography," in Latin and the Romance Languages in the Early Middle Ages, ed. Roger Wright [New York: Routledge, 1991], 146–63) uses the phrases "pastoral communication" and "pastoral objectives." She also discusses the vocabulary of Merovingian and Carolingian vitae. See also Heene's article, "Merovingian and Carolingian Hagiography: Continuity or Change in Public and Aims?" Analecta Bollandiana 107 (1989): 415–28. The work of Marc Van Uytfanghe: "Modèles bibliques dans l'hagiographie"; "L'Hagiographie et son public"; "Histoire du latin, protohistoire des langues romanes et histoire de la communication," Francia II (1984): 579–613, has done much to illuminate the issue of audience. Furthermore, consult Thomas J. Heffernan, Sacred Biography, 18–22; and Brian Stock, The Implications of Literacy: Written Language and Models of Interpretation in the Eleventh and Twelfth Centuries (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1983), chap. I. For audience response to the visual arts, see Michael Baxandall, Painting and Experience in Fifteenth-Century Italy (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1972).

- 23. Julia Smith ("Female Sanctity in Carolingian Europe," 13–14) notes that the *vita* of Radegund of Poitiers by Venantius Fortunatus circulated widely beyond Poitiers.
- 24. For the theory of oral composition, see the work of John Miles Foley: Immanent Art: From Structure to Meaning in Traditional Oral Epic (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1991); The Theory of Oral Composition: History and Methodology (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1988); and "Orality, Textuality, and Interpretation," in Vox intexta: Orality and Textuality in the Middle Ages, ed. A. N. Doane and Carol Braun Pasternack (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1991), 34-45.
 - 25. Heffernan, Sacred Biography, 22.
 - 26. Foley, Immanent Art, 7.
 - 27. Baxandall, Painting and Experience in Fifteenth-Century Italy, 45.
 - 28. Cameron, Christianity and the Rhetoric of Empire, 97.
- 29. Baudonivia, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber II, ed. Bruno Krusch, MGH SRM 2.377-95. In the prologue to the vita Baudonivia names herself: "Baudonivia humilis omnium." There are other female-authored saints's lives, including that of the Merovingian Queen Balthild composed by an anonymous nun at Chelles; see MGH SRM 2.482-508. For discussions of female-authored vitae, see Rosamond McKitterick, "Frauen und Schriftlichkeit im Frühmittelalter," in Weibliche Lebensgestaltung im Frühen Mittelalter, ed. H. W. Goetz (Cologue: Böhlau, 1991), 65-118; and Suzanne Fonay Wemple, Women in Frankish Society: Marriage and the Cloister, 500-900 (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1981), 181-88. For the female readership of medieval women's saints' lives, see Jocelyn Wogan-Browne, "Saints' Lives and the Female Reader," Forum for Modern Language Studies 27 (1991): 314-32.
- 30. Athanasius of Alexandria, Vita Antonii, PG 26.835-976. Athanasius wrote the vita shortly after the death of the holy Antony in 356. For a discussion of Athanasius's career and writings, see David Brakke, Athanasius and the Politics of Asceticism (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995).
 - 31. Most notably Jerome (c. 342-420), who wrote several biographies of

famous patrician women and men. For a discussion of the patristics and the discourse of virginity, see Bloch, *Medieval Misogyny*, chap. 4.

- 32. For a discussion of patristic uses of hagiographical discourse, see Cameron, *Christianity and the Rhetoric of Empire*, chap. 4; and Elm, *Virgins of God*, 39ff, 151ff.
- 33. See Jerome, Vita Pauli, PL 23.17–60; and Sulpicius Severus, Vita S. Martini, SC 133–35. Martin Heinzelmann ("Neue Aspekte der biographischen und hagiographischen Literatur in der lateinischen Welt [1.-6. Jahrhundert]," Francia I [1973], 27–44) discusses the relationship between early hagiography and pagan eulogy.
- 34. Hieronimus presbiter et post apostolum Paulum bonus doctor eclesiae refert": Gregory of Tours, *In Gloria Martyrum*, Prologue (MGH SRM 1.2.37).
 - 35. Cameron, Christianity and the Rhetoric of Empire, 141.
- 36. Robert A. Markus, *The End of Ancient Christianity* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990), 226.
 - 37. Cameron, Christianity and the Rhetoric of Empire, 209-10.
- 38. Discussed by Robin Lane Fox in "Literarcy and Power in Early Christianity," in *Literacy and Power in the Ancient World*, ed. Alan K. Bowman and Greg Woolf (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), 145–46. Baxandall, *Painting and Experience in Fifteenth-Century Italy*, examines nonverbal responses to the visual arts.
- 39. Rosamond McKitterick, *The Carolingians and the Written Word* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989), 241ff.
- 40. Gregory of Tours claims that his own mother cured a girl by tying a relic of a saint around her neck (*Gloria Confessorum*, 84).
- 41. Discussed by John M. McCulloh in "The Cult of Relics in the Letters and 'Dialogues' of Pope Gregory the Great: A Lexicographical Study," *Traditio* 32 (1976): 145–84.
- 42. For a discussion of the ability of religious images to evoke physical responses, see David Freedberg, *The Power of Images: Studies in the History and Theory of Representation* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1989), esp. 99–135.
- 43. Dunn, Gallican Saint's Life, 84-85, details the liturgical recitation of saints' lives in Gaul.
 - 44. Discussed by Cameron, Christianity and the Rhetoric of Empire, 57.
- 45. In his 1992 opera, *Mary of Egypt: An Icon in Music and Dance*, the contemporary British composer John Tavener describes the hagiographical life of the harlot-saint as a "moving icon" of the faith.
- 46. For an analysis of the eastern holy man as a "living icon," see Peter Brown, "Eastern and Western Christianity in Late Antiquity: A Parting of the Ways," in his Society and the Holy in Late Antiquity (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982), 166–95; and Markus, End of Ancient Christianity, 157–211.
- 47. Gregory of Tours, *Decem libri historiarum*, 8.15 (MGH SRM 1.1.380–383). Gregory frames his *Histories* in the motifs and metaphors of sacred discourse, and, therefore, it is a hagiographical history.
- 48. Simeon's life is in Theodoret of Cyrrhus, Historia Religiosa = Histoire des moines de Syrie, 26 (ed. P. Canivet and A. Leroy-Molinghem, SC 234, 257).

English translation in R. M. Price, A History of the Monks of Syria, Cistercian Studies Series 88 (Kalamazoo, Mich.: Cistercian Publications, 1985), 160–76.

- 49. Patrick Geary, Before France and Germany: The Creation and Transformation of the Merovingian World (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1988), 138.
- 50. One of the most influential eucharistic tales from the Middle Ages is the so-called Mass of Saint Gregory. For a discussion of the theological and political uses of the Mass of Saint Gregory, see Miri Rubin, Corpus Christi: The Eucharist in Late Medieval Culture (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991), 308–10, and Caroline Walker Bynum, The Resurrection of the Body in Western Christianity, 200–1336 (New York: Columbia University Press, 1995), 316.
- 51. In his Dialogorum libri IV (SC 251, 260, 265) Gregory the Great tells the story of a nun who became possessed after neglecting to bless her salad before she ate it, thereby missing the minute devil perched on the lettuce (Dialogorum libri IV, 1.7). Gregory also reinforces the importance of keeping the sabbath and holy days by relating the tale of a married woman who was possessed by a demon because she had sexual relations with her husband prior to the dedication of a church (Dialogorum libri IV, 1.10).
- 52. Gregory the Great's life of Saint Benedict includes an example of the saint's power to release souls from purgatory (*Dialogorum libri IV*, 2.23).
- 53. For a discussion of how saints' lives dictate proper reverence for the saints, see Brown, "Relics and Social Status in the Age of Gregory of Tours," in Society and the Holy, 222-50.
- 54. See Thomas Mathews, *The Clash of the Gods: A Reinterpretation of Early Christian Art* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1993), 43ff.
- 55. Brown, "The Holy Man in Late Antiquity," in Society and the Holy, 131-32.
- 56. See Tacitus, Annales 13.5; cited by Holum, Theodosian Empresses, 29–30; Holum also notes that Roman law prohibited women from wearing senatorial garb and insignia.
- 57. For a discussion of the evangelical image of Mary Magdalene, see Susan Haskins, "De Unica Magdalena," chap. 1 in *Mary Magdalene: Myth and Metaphor* (New York and London: HarperCollins, 1993).
- 58. William C. Young, "The Ka'ba, Gender, and the Rites of Pilgrimage," International Journal of Middle East Studies 25 (1993): 286, discusses how sacred texts and rituals establish a "hierarchy of piety" by overturning "social distinctions (between rich and poor and governors and governed)." See also Gillian Cloke, This Female Man of God, 57, on the motif of inversion in the lives of late imperial women saints.
- 59. See John Boswell, *Christianity, Social Tolerance, and Homosexuality* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1980), 156–58, for a discussion of the Christian reworking of classical gender expectations.
- 60. For an introduction to the textual tradition, see Graham Gould, "The Community and the Text," chap. 1 in *The Desert Fathers on Monastic Community* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993).
- 61. For example, the *Regula Sancti Benedictii*, 42 (Latin text with French translation by Adalbert de Vogüé, SC 182.584), required a public reading of the

Notes to Pages 20-24

desert vitae during meals: ". . . si tempus fuerit prandii, mox surrexerint a cena, sedeant omnes in unum et legat unus Collationes vel Vitas Patrum aut certe aliud quod aedificet audientes."

- 62. Jerome, Vitae Patrum, PL 23.17-60; Rufinus, Historia Monachorum in Aegypto, PL 21.387-462; Egeria, Itinera, CSEL 39; Cassian, Conlationes (Conferences), CSEL 13; Cassian, Institutiones Coenobiorum (Institutes), CSEL 17; and Palladius, Historia Lausiaca, ed. Cuthbert Butler, 2 vols. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1898 and 1904).
- 63. Theodoret of Cyrrhus, *Historia Religiosa*, 6.9; translation from Price, *History of the Monks of Syria*, 66.
 - 64. Athanasius, Vita Antonii, 8.
- 65. Rufinus (*Historia Monarchorum in Aegypto*, 5.6) asserts that there were 20,000 nuns living in Oxyrhynchus in the early fifth century. Theodoret of Cyrrhus (*Historia Religiosa*, 30.6) states that there are numerous ascetic "wrestling schools" sprinkled throughout Syria, Palestine, Cilicia, Mesopotamia, and Egypt.
- 66. Theodoret of Cyrrhus, *Historia Religiosa*, 29.4; translation from Price, *History of the Monks of Syria*, 184. See also Harvey, "Women in Byzantine Hagiography," in *That Gentle Strength*, ed. Coon, Haldane, and Sommer, 38.
- 67. For example, see the life of Eugenia (Vita S. Eugeniae, PL 73.602-24), who became the abbot of a male monastery. For discussions of the transvestite convention, see Caroline Bynum, Holy Feast and Holy Fast, 290-91; Evelyne Patlagean, "L'Histoire de la femme déguisée en moine et l'évolution de la sainteté féminine à Byzance," Studi Medievali 17 (1976): 597-623; John Anson, "The Female Transvestite in Early Monasticism: The Origin and Development of a Motif," Viator 5 (1974): 1-32; and Marjorie Garber, Vested Interests: Cross Dressing and Cultural Anxiety (New York: Routledge, 1992), 213-17.
- 68. Harvey ("Women in Byzantine Hagiography," 45) says that, "as women had been the source of sin through Eve, they could also be the source of salvation through Mary, the Second Eve. In hagiography, women become the weak made strong, the unworthy made worthy, the foolish made wise, the sensual made spiritual."
- 69. Theodoret of Cyrrhus, *Historia Religiosa*, 29.5. Theodoret himself claims to have "dug through" the door of the cell in order to visit the two women.
- 70. Theodoret of Cyrrhus, *Historia Religiosa*, 30.2; translation from Price, *History of the Monks of Syria*, 186-87.
 - 71. Theodoret of Cyrrhus, Historia Religiosa, 26.10.
 - 72. See Cameron, Christianity and the Rhetoric of Empire, 149.
- 73. Author's translation of Jerome, *Epistle*, 66.6, PL 22.642; "Quis enim hoc crederet, ut Consulum pronepos, et Furiani germinis decus, inter purpuras Senatorum, furva tunica pullatus incederet, et non erubesceret oculos sodalium, et deridentes se ipse derideret?"
- 74. Satius esse illum in infamia relinqui ac sordibus quam infirmo iudicio committi": Cicero, Epistula ad Atticum, I.16.2, in M. Tulii Ciceronis Epistulae, vol. 2.1, Episulae ad Atticum, ed. W. S. Watt, Scriptorum Classicorum Bibliotheca Oxoniensis Series (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1901), 23. Julia Heskel, "Cicero as Evidence for Attitudes to Dress in the Late Republic," in The World of Roman

Costume, ed. Judith Lynn Sebesta and Larissa Bonfante (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1994), 141–42, discusses Cicero's rhetorical uses of the pulla (which could have been black or grey), and the sordes, or a toga that had been smeared with ash or dirt. She claims that donning the sordes could also be interpreted as an act of political protest.

- 75. Shelley Stone, "The Toga: From National Costume to Ceremonial Costume," in *The World of Roman Costume*, ed. Sebesta and Bonfante, 15.
 - 76. Markus, End of Ancient Christianity, 165.
- 77. Scholars have provided a variety of explanations for the conversion of Roman women to a life of radical renunciation. For a summary of the historiographical traditions, see Bloch, *Medieval Misogyny*, 81ff.
- 78. Jerome, Epitaphium Sanctae Paulae, CSEL 55(2).306-51. Jerome wrote the life after Paula's death (404 CE) and dedicated the epitaphium to her daughter Eustochium.
- 79. Katharina M. Wilson and Elizabeth M. Makowski, Wykked Wyves and the Woes of Marriage: Misogamous Literature from Juvenal to Chaucer (Albany, N.Y.: SUNY Press, 1990), 27.
- 80. Cited by Mary R. Lefkowitz and Maureen B. Fant, Women's Life in Greece and Rome (London: Duckworth, 1982), 134.
- 81. For a discussion of Juvenal and the reversal of the Roman matron topos, see Wilson and Makowski, Wykked Wyres, 21-34.
- 82. Sulpicius Severus, Vita S. Martini, SC 133-35. For a detailed discussion of Sulpicius, see Clare Stancliffe, St. Martin and His Hagiographer: History and Miracle in Sulpicius Severus (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1983), 15ff.
- 83. Raymond Van Dam (Leadership and Community in Late Antique Gaul [Berkeley: University of California Press, 1985], 137) argues that Martin's life is transitional because later episcopal hagiographers modified Martin's image from that of "iconoclastic innovator and prophet" to that of miracle worker, monk, bishop, almsgiver, missionary, and healer.
- 84. Sulpicius Severus, *Dialogorum libri II*, SC 133-35. English translation by Bernard M. Peebles, *The Dialogues of Sulpicius Severus*, Fathers of the Church Series 7 (New York: Fathers of the Church, 1949), 161-251.
 - 85. Sulpicius Severus, Dialogorum libri II, 1.23.
- 86. Sulpicius Severus, Dialogorum libri II, 1.23; translation from Peebles, Dialogues of Sulpicius Severus, 193.
 - 87. Van Dam, Leadership and Community, 127ff.
- 88. Sulpicius Severus, Vita S. Martini, 9; translation from F. R. Hoare, "The Life of Saint Martin of Tours," in Soldiers of Christ: Saints and Saints' Lives from Late Antiquity and the Early Middle Ages, ed. Thomas F. X. Noble and Thomas Head (University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1995), 12.
 - 89. Sulpicius Severus, Dialogorum libri II, 1.24.
- 90. Constantius of Lyons, Vita Germani episcopi Autissiodorensis, MGH SRM 7.247-83. English translation by F. R. Hoare, "Life of Germanus of Auxerre," in Soldiers of Christ, ed. Noble and Head, 77-106.
- 91. Including those at Arles, Poitiers, Tours, Chelles, Nivelles, Faremoutiers, Maubeuge, Laon, Metz, Pavilly, and Marchiennes.

- 92. "Aliqua de sororibus vidit supra murum milia milium daemonum in specie caprarum adstare; ubi sancta dexteram beatam cum signo crucis elevavit, omnis illa multitudo daemonum fugata nusquam conparuit": Baudonivia, *De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber II*, 18 (MGH SRM 2.390); translation from Jo Ann McNamara and John E. Halborg, with E. Gordon Whatley, eds. and trans., *Sainted Women of the Dark Ages* (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 1992), 100.
- 93. Venantius Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 34 (MGH SRM 2.375). Translation from McNamara and Halborg, with Whatley, Sainted Women of the Dark Ages, 84.
- 94. "Et ostendit civitatem Dei altissimi et duodecim sedes apostolorum ex auro gemmisque rutilantes": Vita Saldaberga abbatissae Laudunensis, 26 (MGH SRM 5.65).
- 95. "Post nocturnas et matutinas vigilias una soror de locis monasterii cum se sopori dedisset, mysticam ostendit ei Deus visionem quasi sanctae memoriae B. Aldegunda adstetisset ante altare in loco Sacerdotis et oblationes Missales manibus in calicem fregisset": Vita Aldegundis, abbatissae Malbodiensis, 25, Acta Sanctorum Belgii selecta 4 (Bruxelles: Matthaei Lemaire, 1783–1794), 323. McNamara and Halborg, with Whatley (Sainted Women of the Dark Ages, 235) discuss this mystical event (251 n. 59).
- 96. Vita S. Burgundofarae, 19. The life is an extract from the seventh-century Vita S. Columbani abbatis discipulorumque eius, Liber II, by Jonas of Bobbio (MGH SRM 4.130-43). McNamara and Halborg, with Whatley, Sainted Women of the Dark Ages, 161, discuss this passage.
 - 97. Vita Genovefae, 6 (MGH SRM 3.217).
- 98. Jo Ann McNamara discusses early medieval women's charity and power in "The Need to Give: Suffering and Female Sanctity in the Middle Ages," in *Images of Sainthood in Medieval Europe*, ed. Renate Blumenfeld-Kosinski and Timea Szell (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1991), 199–204.
 - 99. Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 25.
- 100. See Magdalena Elizabeth Carrasco, "Spirituality in Context: The Romanesque Illustrated Life of St. Radegund of Poitiers," *Art Bulletin* 72 (1990): 414-35.

Chapter 2

- I. Beryl Smalley, *The Study of the Bible in the Middle Ages* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1952), xi. For a discussion of the transmission of biblical texts in the early medieval West, see Patrick McGurk, "The Oldest Latin Manuscripts of the Bible," in *The Early Medieval Bible*, ed. Richard Gameson (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), 1–23.
- 2. For the early Judaic and patristic interpretations and the impact of urbanization on Hebrew spirituality, see Carole Meyers, *Discovering Eve: Ancient Israelite Women in Context* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1988), chaps. 4 and 5; Brown, *Body and Society*, 94–96; Elaine Pagels, *Adam, Eve, and the Serpent* (New York: Random House, 1988); and Miles, *Carnal Knowing*, chap. 3.

- 3. Augustine, De civitate Dei (City of God), 14.17, CC 47.437. See Brown, Body and Society, 416.
- 4. Discussed by Wayne Meeks, *The First Urban Christians: The Social World of the Apostle Paul* (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1983), 88, 155. Meeks notes that the "garments of skins of the original couple" refer to their physical bodies in contrast to their garments of light or their "image of God" (155). See also Mary Douglas, *Purity and Danger* (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1966), 96.
- 5. For a discussion of the change from subsistence hill farming to metropolitan opulence, see Meyers, *Discovering Eve*, chaps. 3–8.
- 6. Mircea Eliade (*The Sacred and the Profane: The Nature of Religion*, trans. Willard R. Trask [New York: Harcourt Brace and Company, 1987], 135) argues "all ritual nudity implies an atemporal model, a paradisal image."
 - 7. Sulpicius Severus, Dialogorum libri II, 1.17.
- 8. Bloch, *Medieval Misogyny*, 41. Classical rhetoric similarly connects the opulence of women with urban decadence. The Roman historian Livy (*Ab Urbe Condita*, 34.1ff) used the *luxuria muliebris* as the antithesis of masculine Republicanism; see Alexander Hugh McDonald, ed., *Titi Livi ab Urbe Condita*, Scriptorum Classicorum Bibliotheca Oxoniensis 5 (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1965), 173ff.
- 9. "Jezebel" may be a Hebrew perversion of a Phoenician name which was connected with the worship of the fertility God, Ba'al. Like Jezebel, Solomon's "old wives" influence him to worship the cult of Ba'al's consort, Ashe'rah (I Kings II.4).
- 10. For example, in the fourth-century vita of Ambrose of Milan (Paulinus, Vita Sancti Ambrosii, 11ff, in M. S. Kaniecka, ed. and trans., Vita Sancti Ambrosii, Patristic Studies 16 [Washington D.C.: Catholic University Press, 1928]; English translation also available in F. R. Hoare, The Western Fathers [London: Sheed and Ward, 1954], 149–88) the empress Justina is Jezebel to Ambrose's Elijah.
- II. Hairstyles are associated in scripture with the following attributes: physical strength (Judges 16.19); spiritual vows (Numbers 6.5; Acts 18.18); depravity (I Peter 3.3; Revelation 9.8); sexual attractiveness (Song of Songs 4.1); contrition (Isaiah 3.24; Jeremiah 7.29; Micah 1.16); mourning (Luke 7.38; John II.2); ritual purity (Leviticus 10.6; Numbers 6.5; Ezekiel 44.20); impurity (Leviticus 13.3-4); and earthly hierarchies (I Corinthians II.6, 14-15; I Timothy 2.9; I Peter 3.3).
- 12. See Schüssler-Fiorenza, $In\ Memory\ of\ Her$, chap. 1, for a discussion of the historiography.
- 13. Because late antique and early medieval church writers attributed all of the Pauline epistles to the apostle himself, the contested authenticity of particular letters is not a crucial issue here. For discussions of the dating and authorship of the letters, see Meeks, First Urban Christians, 7–8; and Robin Lane Fox, The Unauthorized Version: Truth and Fiction in the Bible (New York: Knopf, 1992), 130–36.
- 14. Schüssler-Fiorenza discusses the various interpretations in chap. 6 of In Memory of Her. See also Meeks, First Urban Christians, 88-89, 155.
 - 15. Douglas, Purity and Danger, 55.
- 16. Most scholars agree that I-2 Timothy were not written by Paul, and that I-2 Peter were not written by the apostle Peter.
- 17. For a discussion of the archaeological evidence for Paul's descriptions of male and female hairstyles, see Cynthia L. Thompson, "Hairstyles, Head-coverings,

and St. Paul: Portraits from Roman Corinth," *Biblical Archaeologist* 51 (1988): 99–115. Thompson proposes that Paul refuses to allow men to cover their heads because this was the practice of contemporary Roman pagan cults. She also suggests that first-century Roman women could choose whether to veil or not, and that Paul is upholding the Judeo-Syrian custom of veiling, perhaps even while in the home. See also Mathews, *Clash of the Gods*, 126.

- 18. For a discussion of this passage and its gender implications, see Bernadette Brooten, "Paul's Views on the Nature of Women and Female Homoeroticism," in *Immaculate and Powerful: The Female in Sacred Image and Social Reality*, ed. Clarissa Atkinson, Constance Buchanan, and Margaret Miles (Boston: Beacon Press, 1985), 75–78.
- 19. See Ben Witherington, *Women in the Earliest Churches* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), 90–104, 257 n. 76.
- 20. Brooten, "Paul's Views on the Nature of Women," 78. See also Gillian Cloke, *This Female Man of God*, 26–27.
 - 21. In Revelation 9.8, the plague-bearing locusts possess women's hair.
- 22. Although the rhetoric of I Timothy 3.2-4, 3.12 appears to be directed at pastoral men, I Timothy 3.12 and I Timothy 5.3ff contain possible references to pastoral women.
 - 23. From Colish, "Cosmetic Theology."
- 24. Tertullian, De habitu muliebri (Ch. I); De cultu feminarum (Ch. II), in CC 1.343-70. De virginibus velandis, in CC 2.1209-1226. English translation of De habitu muliebri and De cultu feminarum available by Edwin A. Quain, "The Apparel of Women," Rudolph Arbesmann, Emily Joseph Daly, and Edwin A. Quain, trans., in Disciplinary, Moral, and Ascetical Works, Fathers of the Church 40 (New York: Fathers of the Church, 1959), 117-49. English translation of De virginibus velandis available by S. Thelwall, "On the Veiling of Virgins," in The Ante-Nicaean Fathers: Translations of the Writings of the Fathers down to A.D. 325, 4, ed. Alexander Roberts and James Donaldson (Buffalo, N.Y.: Christian Literature Publishing Co., 1890), 27-37. Tertullian also wrote a treatise on the sacred vestments of the Hebrew high priest (de Aaron vestibus) which unfortunately has not survived.
- 25. Tertullian, *De habitu muliebri*, 1.2. Bloch in *Medieval Misogyny* (40) discusses this passage in terms of women's covetousness of fashion.
- 26. Tertullian, *De habitu muliebri*, 1.2; translation from Quain, "The Apparel of Women," 118.
 - 27. Tertullian, De habitu muliebri, 2.1.
- 28. The exact meaning of I Corinthians II.10 is unclear. Biblical exegetes have interpreted this passage to be indicative of the angelic order of the universe and that the veiling of women's heads supports the divine hierarchy.
 - 29. Tertullian, De habitu muliebri, 3.1.
 - 30. Tertullian, De cultu feminarum, 7.2; and De virginibus velandis, 7-8, 15.
- 31. Tertullian, De habitu muliebri, 1.3; translation from Quain, "The Apparel of Women." 118.
- 32. Cyprian, *De habitu virginum*, 5, PL 4.439–64. English translation by Angela Elizabeth Keenan, "The Dress of Virgins," in *Treatises*, ed. Roy J. Deferrari, Fathers of the Church 36 (New York: Fathers of the Church, 1958), 31–52.

- 33. Cyprian, De habitu virginum, 5; translation from Keenan, "The Dress of Virgins," 35.
 - 34. Cyprian, De habitu virginum, 5.
 - 35. Jerome, Epistle, 22.32.
- 36. "Solent quaedam, cum futuram virginem spoponderint, pulla tunica eam induere et furvo operire palliolo, auferre linteamina, nihil in collo, nihil in capite auri sinere re vera bono consilio": Jerome, *Epistle*, 128.2.
- 37. Although clearly, as Suzanne Wemple notes in *Women in Frankish Society* (142), the difference between episcopal legislation and actual practice could be quite extensive.
- 38. "Mulier, quamvis docta et sancta, viros in conventu docere non praesumat": Ancient Statutes of the Church (475), canon 37, CC 148.172; and "Sanctimonialis virgo, cum ad consecrationem sui episcopo offertur, in talibus vestibus applicetur qualibus semper usura est, professioni et sanctimoniae aptis": canon 99, CC 148.184. Also, "Viduitatis servandae professionem coram episcopo in secretario habitam imposita ab episcopo veste viduali indicandam": Council of Orange (441), canon 26, CC 148.85. Pope Gregory the Great ordered the wives of the major orders to wear dress that was symbolic of their commitment to God, *Registrum Epistularum*, 9.197, MGH EPP 2.185–86; cited by Wemple, *Women in Frankish Society*, 132.
- 39. "Sanctimoniales, quamlibet vita earum et mores probati sint, ante annum aetatis suae quadragesimum non velentur": Council of Agde (506), canon 19, CC 148.202. See also Council of Epaon in Burgundy (517), canon 38, CCL 148(A).34.
- 40. "Hic Bonifatius constituit ut nulla mulier aut monacha pallam sacratam contingere aut lavare aut incensum ponere in ecclesia nisi minister": L'Abbé L. Duschesne, ed., *Le Liber Pontificalis: Texte, introduction et commentaire* I (Paris: E. De Billard, 1955), 227; and "Hic constituit ut monacha non acciperit velaminis capitis benedictionem, nisi probata fuerit in virginitate LX annorum": *Liber Pontificalis*, 1.239.
- 41. "Non licet mulieri nudam manum eucharistiam accipere," and "Non licet, ut mulier manum suam ad pallam Dominicam mittat": Council of Auxerre (561–605), canon 36 and canon 37, CC 148(A).269. For Anglo-Saxon parallels, see the seventh-century Theodore's Penitential, 7.1, in John T. McNeill and Helena M. Gamer, eds., Medieval Handbooks of Penance: A Translation of the Principal Libri Poenitentiales and Selections from Related Documents (New York: Columbia University Press, 1938).
- 42. Council of Gangra, canons 13 and 17, in E. J. Percival, trans., *The Seven Ecumenical Councils*, Library of Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers 14 (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 1977), 93, 97, 99. Peter Brown (*Body and Society*, 288–99) discusses Gangra's condemnation of cross-dressing. See also Elm, *Virgins of God*, 108ff, for a discussion of the historical background of Gangra.
- 43. Theodosius, Theodosiani Libri XVI (Codex) cum constitutionibus Sirmondianis et leges novellae ad Theodosianum pertinentes, 16.27.I, ed. Theodor Mommsen and P. M. Meyer (Berlin: Apud Weidmannos, 1905). English translation by Clyde Pharr, The Theodosian Code and Novels and the Sirmondian Constitutions (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1969).
 - 44. Palladius, Historia Lausiaca, 32-33; English translation in The Lausiac

History of Palladius, trans. Robert T. Meyer, Ancient Christian Writers 34 (Westminster, Md.: Newman Press, 1965), 92–96.

- 45. Caesarius of Arles, *Regula Virginum*, SC 345. For a discussion of the women's community and the Rule by Caesarius, see William E. Klingshirn, *Caesarius of Arles: The Making of a Christian Community in Late Antique Gaul* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), 117–24. Klingshirn also discusses the foundation at Arles, 104–10.
- 46. Venantius Fortunatus referred to Caesarius's rule as sweet as a vestment of linen; see Dom Georges Marié, "Sainte Radegonde et le milieu monastique contemporain," in Études Mérovingiennes: Actes de Journée de Poitiers 1er-3 Mai, 1952 (Paris: Éditions A. et J. Picard, 1953), 224. Caesarius himself used the image of wool and linen to signify the flesh and the spirit ("Lana carnale aliquid significat, linum spiritale"); Caesarius of Arles, Sermones 139.2, CC 103.572.
- 47. For the text and detailed analysis of the rule, see Maria Caritas McCarthy, The Rule for Nuns of Caesarius of Arles (Washington, D.C.: Catholic University Press, 1960). McCarthy suggests that Caesarius probably used Augustine's rule and Cassian's Institutes as sources for his own rule (8). See also Adalbert de Vogüé, "La Règle de Césaire d'Arles pour les moines: un résumé de sa Règle pour les moniales," Révue d'Ascétique et de Mystique 47 (1971): 369-406.
- 48. Definition of *bombycine* in McCarthy, *Rule for Nuns*, 45. The ban on mixed yarns parallels Kosher restrictions on mixing fabrics.
- 49. Other early medieval women's rules contain similar stipulations. See the seventh-century rule of Donatus of Besançon, *Regula ad virgines*, PL 87.273–98; and the late sixth-century rule of Leander of Seville, *Regula ad virgines*, PL 72.873–94. For a translation of Donatus's *Regula*, see Jo Ann McNamara and John Halborg, "The Rule of Donatus of Besançon: A Working Translation," *Vox Benedictina* 2 (April/July 1985): 85–107; 181–203. In the East, Basil's rule emphasized women's involvement in textile production and a unique "female dress"; see Elm, *Virgins of God*, 72ff.
- 50. In the Vita Genovefae 6 (MGH SRM 3.217), the bishop Germanus of Auxerre gives the young Genovefa a copper coin inscribed with the cross to replace the customary opulent adornments of her sex, and another woman comes to Genovefa and asks the holy woman to "change her clothing." For a recent analysis of this text see Martin Heinzelmann and Joseph-Claude Poulin, Les Vies anciennes de sainte Geneviève de Paris: Etudes critiques, Bibliothèque de l'École des Hautes Études IVe Section Sciences Historiques et Philologiques 329 (Paris: Librairie Honoré Champion, 1986). See also the tenth-century life of Rictrude of Marchiennes (Vita S. Rictrudis, 15, AS, May 12.84) for a detailed sermon on the eschatological dress of women.
- 51. For example, Gregory of Tours (*Gloria Confessorum*, 16, MGH SRM 1.2.306-7) recounts the legend of the transvestite holy woman Papula.
- 52. Christ left his linen garments in the empty tomb to be discovered by the apostles, just as Elijah abandoned his hairy mantle before ascending into heaven.
- 53. Vita S. Austrebertae virginis (eighth century) 6, AS February, 10.417; and Vita S. Glodesindae (mid-ninth century) 10, AS July, 25.204. For datings of texts and textual history, see McNamara and Halborg, with Whatley, Sainted Women of the Dark Ages, 137, 304.
 - 54. The veiling of women has recently been interpreted to have many social,

economic, political, and theological meanings. See Leila Ahmed, Women and Gender in Islam: Historical Roots of a Modern Debate (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1992), 14–15; and Gerda Lerner, The Creation of Patriarchy (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1986), 10. Both Ahmud and Lerner note that ancient Mesopotamian veils indicated the sexual, social, and economic status, as well as the age, of the wearer.

- 55. Vita S. Glodesindae, 10, and Vita S. Austrubertae virginis, 12.
- 56. Vita S. Rusticulae (seventh century [?]) 19, MGH SRM 4.347. For a later woman saint who has a braided hair relic, see the twelfth-century vita and acta of Hildegard von Bingen, which claim that the saint's hair miraculously heals the sick and survives a church fire (Gottfried and Theodoric, Vita S. Hildegardis, 41, PL 119-20; Acta Inquisitionis de virtutibus et miraculis sanctae Hildegardis, 5, PL 197.136-35).
- 57. David Herlihy, Opera Muliebria: Women and Work in Medieval Europe (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1990), xiii.
- 58. Herlihy, *Opera Muliebria*, 13. Herlihy also discusses the classical metaphors (12ff).
 - 59. Tertullian, De cultu feminarum, 13.7.
- 60. "Deus mulieribus dedit texturae sapientiam": Ambrose, Exameron, 5.9.11; quoted in Herlihy, Opera Muliebria, 1. See also Jerome, Epistle, 128.1; and Sidonius Apollonaris, Ephithalamium, 15.126ff; cited by Herlihy, Opera Muliebria, 19–20.
- 61. Caesarius of Arles, *Sermones*, 139.6, CC 103.574-575. The sermon contains Caesarius's exegesis on Proverbs 31, the "good wife."
 - 62. Benedict of Nursia, Regula Sancti Benedictii, 55.
- 63. Vita S. Hesychii is part of the Passio S. Romani, in Hippolyte Delehaye, "S. Romain martyr de Antioch," Analecta Bollandiana 50 (1932): 269-70; cited by Herlihy, Opera Muliebria, 8. There are, however, examples of male saints who weave, particularly desert hermits who wove baskets, palm leaves, and even linen; according to Palladius (Historia Lausiaca, 41), the monks of Nitria wove linen. Weaving was, according to Herlihy (Opera Muliebria, 3, 7-8), an occupation for male slaves in Roman Egypt and the Mediterranean. The desert inversion of work roles reflects perhaps both an economic reality and the world upside down motif of the vita Christi.
- 64. For a discussion of the public humiliation of the two male saints, see John Boswell, *Same-Sex Unions in Premodern Europe* (New York: Villard Books, 1994), 148.
 - 65. Vita S. Mariae Aegyptiacae, Meretricis, 14.
- 66. Melania's vita is replete with examples of charitable deeds (Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, SC 90).
 - 67. Gregory of Tours, Gloria Confessorum, 104.
 - 68. Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 30.
- 69. Vita S. Chrothildis reginae francorum, 12 (MGH SRM 2.346-47). The text is a Carolingian redaction (late ninth or tenth century) of an earlier Merovingian legend.
- 70. Vita S. Eustadiolae viduae, 3, in the life of Saint Sulpicius of Bourges, AS June 8.131-33. The text is probably early eighth century (see McNamara et al., Sainted Women of the Dark Ages, 106).

171

- 71. Rufinus, Historiae Ecclesiasticae, I.7-8, PL 21.475-78. See also E.D. Hunt, Holy Land Pilgrimage in the Later Roman Empire AD 312-460 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1982), 44.
 - 72. For the karakallion as slave's hood, see Palladius, Historia Lausiaca, 46.3.
 - 73. Holum, Theodosian Empresses, 26.
 - 74. Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 17, 19.
 - 75. Sulpicius Severus, Dialogorum libri II, 2.6.
 - 76. Vita S. Austrebertae virginis, 10, AS February, 10.2.421.
- 77. For a discussion of the "housekeeping saint" topos, see Wemple, Women in Frankish Society, 171.
- 78. Discussed by Kuryluk, Veronica and Her Cloth, 18ff; and Mathews, Clash of the Gods, 61-63.
- 79. Craig S. Farmer, "Changing Images of the Samaritan Woman," Church History 65.3 (1996): 365-375, traces the exegetical tradition concerning the Samaritan woman, from patristic authors to Protestant commentators.
- 80. Boswell (Same-Sex Unions, 11) discusses John 4.4-30, and its use of the ambiguous Greek, aner/andros. See also Haskins, Mary Magdalene, 26-28; and Mathews, Clash of the Gods, 138.
 - 81. For a discussion of this passage, see Haskins, Mary Magdalene, 16-20.
- 82. Frederick Paxton, Christianizing Death: The Creation of a Ritual Process in Early Medieval Europe (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1990), 21.
 - 83. Discussed by Haskins, Mary Magdalene, 21-23.
- 84. Augustine, De civitate Dei, 1.13. Monastic rituals, liturgical performances, and even architectural structures symbolically represent the special relationship between faithful women and Christ's resurrection. Carolingian liturgical plays recreated the passion and resurrection, and monks assumed the role of the mourning Marys. The grave slabs of high medieval English nuns often contain images of the three Marys at Christ's tomb. Archaeologists have suggested that the double-story refectories of English nunneries may represent the "upper room" (Acts 1.13) where female disciples and male apostles stayed after Christ's death. And the sacred space of medieval monastic churches may have been gender-ordered, with the women's place located to the north as symbolic of the place where the Virgin stood at the cross. See Paxton, Christianizing Death, 64, and Gilchrist, Gender and Material Culture, 31, 166, 135ff, for the evidence of high medieval English nunneries.
- 85. Egeria, Itinera, 24.9-10. See also Gary Vikan, "Pilgrim in Magis' Clothing: The Impact of Mimesis on Early Byzantine Pilgrimage Art," in The Blessings of Pilgrimage, ed. Robert Ousterhout (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1990), 100.
 - 86. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 58.
- 87. Jerome, Epistle, 108.9. Later Frankish hagiographers emulate this motif. For example, nuns of the double monastery of Clion kiss every place where Martin had slept, stood, or sat and distribute the straw of his bedding (Sulpicius Severus, Dialogorum libri II, 2.7), and Monegund of Tours "prostrates herself on the ground as though humbly to lick the Lord's footprints" (see Gregory of Tours, Liber vitae patrum, 19.1, MGH SRM 1.2.287).
- 88. For Helena's procurement of the lignum crucis, see Ambrose, De obitu Theodosii oratio (395 CE), CSEL 73(7).371-401. Borgehammar (How the Holy Cross

Was Found) details the development of the Helena legend. Gregory of Tours also cites the legend, Decem libri historiarum, 1.34; In Gloria Martyrum, 5.

- 89. Baudonivia, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber II, 16. Baudonivia highlights Radegund's procurement of the lignum crucis both because of the Christological importance of the relic and because of its imperial associations. See Raymond Van Dam, Saints and Their Miracles in Late Antique Gaul (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1993), 30-41.
- 90. Paulinus of Nola, Epistle, 31.1, CSEL 29(1).268; and Gregory of Nyssa, Vita Sanctae Macrinae, 30, SC 178.240-42. See also Hunt, Holy Land Pilgrimage, 129, 134.
 - 91. Vita S. Rusticulae, 8, 12.
- 92. Holy women wash and dress the body of Lupicinus (Gregory of Tours, Liber vitae patrum, 13.3), and in the vita of Anstrude, the holy woman buries the dead (Vita Anstrudis abbatissae Laudunensis, 4, MGH SRM 6.68). In many saints' lives, women safeguard the relics of holy men. For example, Gregory of Tours recounts that a pious woman kept the sandals of the martyr Epipodius of Lyons (Gloria Confessorum, 63); the holy woman Meratina collects the turf at the tomb of bishop Gallus, puts it in her garden, and cures the sick with the tea she makes from it (Gregory of Tours, Liber vitae patrum, 6.7). See also Gregory of Tours, In Gloria Martyrum, 13, 30, 54, for Frankish women who collect the relics of male saints. For a detailed discussion of the early medieval rituals of burial, see Megan McLaughlin, Consorting with the Saints: Prayer for the Dead in Early Medieval France (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1994), chap. 1, "The Burial of the Dead."
 - 93. Gregory of Tours, Decem libri historiarum, 5.21.
- 94. See Patrick Geary, Phantoms of Remembrance: Memory and Oblivion at the End of the First Millennium (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1994), 51-73, for details of women's role in preserving familial memoria and mourning the dead.
- 95. Clearly, devotion to the dead body of Christ is not a uniquely female trait. Male saints similarly visit the biblical sites of the passion and crucifixion and nurture relics of the holy cross. When hagiographers choose to focus on women's role in the cult of the holy dead, their textual portraits evoke the pious care of Christ's body by the women at the tomb.

Chapter 3

A portion of this chapter was published in a different version in Sewanee Medieval Studies. I should like to thank Susan Ridyard, editor, for her permission to reprint it here.

1. Similarly, the fourth-century Emperor (and Pontifex Maximus) Julian ordered his Roman priests not to display their sacred dress in public. See Julian, Letter to a Priest, trans. W. C. Wright, in The Works of the Emperor Julian, 3 vols., Loeb Classical Library (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1913–1923), 1:332-35. Cited by Judith Lynn Sebesta and Larissa Bonfante, eds., World of Roman Costume, 4-5.

172

- 2. For a detailed discussion of sanctified material culture in Hebrew sacred writings, see Rabbi Shalom Dov Steinberg, *The Mishkan and the Holy Garments*, trans. Rabbi Moshe Miller (Jerusalem: Toras Chaim Institute, 5752 [1992]). For the symbolic garments of ancient Hebrew priests, see Moshe Greenberg, *Lessons on Exodus* (New York: Melton Research Center Publications, 1974), 328-46.
 - 3. Jerome, Commentaria in Ezechielem prophetam, PL 25.427-44.
- 4. "Sancta sanctorum," from Council of Tours (567), canon 4, CC 148(A).178. There exist several editions of early church councils. For the entire corpus, see Joannes Dominicus Mansi, ed., Sacrorum Conciliorum Nova et Amplissima Collectio, 31 vols. (Graz: Akademische Druck—u. Verlagsanstalt, 1960), hereafter cited as Mansi; for the Gallic corpus, see Charles Munier, ed., Concilia Galliae, a. 314-a.506, CC 148, and Caroli De Clercq, ed., Concilia Galliae, a.511-a.695, CC 148(A). For a French translation of the church councils, see Karl Joseph von Hefele and Henri Leclercq, trans., Histoire des conciles d'après les documents originaux, 26 vols. (Paris: Letouzey et Ané, 1907-). For an English translation, see Karl Joseph von Hefele, Conciliengeschichte. English, 5 vols. (New York: AMS Press, 1972). For the papal decrees, see Duchesne, Liber Pontificalis. English translation by Raymond Davis, The Book of the Pontiffs, Translated Texts for Historians Latin Series, vol. 5 (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 1989).
- 5. See the General Council of Toledo (633), canon 41, and the fourth council at Braga (late seventh century), canon 6, Hefele and Leclercq, *Histoire des Conciles*, 3.623, 657.
- 6. Although the Hebrew Bible provided the foundation for later Christian conceptualizations of sacred vestments and objects, Christians did not attempt to emulate the intricate vestments of the Hebrew priests until the advent of the Ottonian and Capetian sacral monarchies. See Percy Schramm, *Kaiser*, *Könige und Päpste*, 2 vols. (Stuttgart: Anton Hiesemann, 1968), 1.75.
- 7. Wool causes the body to perspire, and therefore it is unclean: "They shall not gird themselves with anything that causes sweat" (Ezekiel 44.20).
- 8. For a discussion of artistic depictions Jesus' dress, see Mathews, Clash of the Gods, 28, 38, 101.
- 9. Also noted by Mathews, Clash of the Gods, 180. Mathews (123ff) discusses artistic representations of Christ's hair.
- 10. John R. Clarke, "The Warren Cup and the Contexts for Representations of Male-to-Male Lovemaking in Augustan and Early Julio-Claudian Art," Art Bulletin 75 (1992), 290. See also Sebesta and Bonfante, eds., World of Roman Costume, 7.
- II. On the toga, see Shelley Stone, "The Toga: From National to Ceremonial Costume," in World of Roman Costume, ed. Sebesta and Bonfante, 13-45; Janet Mayo, A History of Ecclesiastical Dress (New York: Holmes and Meier, 1984), 12-13; Jane Gardner, Women in Roman Law and Society (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1986), 129; and August Friedrich von Pauly and Georg Wissowa, eds., Paulys Real-Encyclopädie der classischen Altertumswissenschaft, 60 vols. (Stuttgart: J. B. Metzler, 1895–1953), Band VIA, s.v. "toga," 1651-60.
 - 12. Theodosius, Theodosiana Libri XVI, 14.10.1-4.
 - 13. Quintilian, Institutio Oratoria, 11.3.184, in M. Fabi Quintiliani Institu-

- tionis Oratoriae Libri Duodecim, ed. M. Winterbottom, Scriptorum Classicorum Bibliotheca Oxoniensis, vol. 2 (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1970), 690.
- 14. For Quintilian on rhetorical performance, see Fritz Graf, "The Gestures of Roman Actors and Orators," in A Cultural History of Gesture: From Antiquity to the Present Day, ed. Jan Bremmer and Herman Roodenburg (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1991), 36–58. See also Stone, "The Toga: From National to Ceremonial Costume," in World of Roman Costume, ed. Sebesta and Bonfante, 17.
 - 15. Quintilian, Institutio Oratoria, 11.3.131.
- 16. Serious men must allow the toga to fall to the middle of the shin: "Pars eius prior mediis cruribus optime terminatur." Insane men wrap the toga around their left hand or gird themselves with it. Effeminates throw the bottom of the garment over their right shoulders. Quintilian, *Institutio Oratoria*, 11.3.139ff.
- 17. Tertullian, De Pallio, CC 2.733-50. English translation by S. Thelwall available in Ante-Nicaean Fathers, 4.5-12. Quintilian, Institutio Oratoria, 11.3.131, 139ff. A sixth-century writer also deals with symbolic male garb; see Germanus of Paris, De Vestimentis, in Ordo Antiquus Gallicanus: Der gallikanische Messritus des 6. Jahrhunderts, ed. Klaus Gamber, Textus Patristici et Liturgici 3 (Regensburg: Verlag Friederick Pustet, 1965), 21-23.
- 18. Mayo, A History of Ecclesiastical Dress, 11-12. A number of scholars have noted that late antique ecclesiastical vestments derived from the tunics of Roman women and elderly men; see Marjorie Garber, Vested Interests, 212.
- 19. The Council of Gangra (340-345), canon 12, in *The Seven Ecumenical Councils*, trans. Percival, 97, castigates false ascetics who wear the *pallium*. Peter Brown discusses the social messages behind Gangra's decrees on spiritual dress and hairstyles; see *Body and Society*, 288.
 - 20. Tertullian, De Pallio, 5.
- 21. The following discussion is indebted to Marcia Colish's article on "Cosmetic Theology."
- 22. Colish, "Cosmetic Theology," 5. See also, Mathews, Clash of the Gods, 126, and Sebesta and Bonfante, eds., World of Roman Costume, 5-6.
- 23. Klingshirn (*Caesarius of Arles*, 97–104) details the circumstances surrounding the Gallic Council of Agde (506).
- 24. The Council of Paris (post 614), canon 2, CC 148(A).287, states that altars can be consecrated only in churches where there are relics of saints. The *ciborium* is a dome suspended above the altar and supported by columns, see *Liber Pontificalis*, 1.262, 312, 324, and 375.
- 25. "Altaria vero placuit non solum unctione chrismatis sed etiam sacerdotali benedictione sacrari": Council of Agde (506), canon 14, CC 148.200. Also, "Altaria nisi lapedea crismatis unctione non sacrentur": Council at Epaon (517), canon 26, CC 148(A).30; and "Ut altaria alibi consegrari non debeant nisi in his tantum ecclesiis, ubi corpora sepulta": Council of Paris (post 614), canon 2, CC 148(A).287.
- 26. "Basilicas hereticorum, quas tanta execrationem habemus exosas, ut pollutionem earum purgabilem non putemus, sanctis usibus adplicare dispicimus. Sane quas per violentiam nostris tulerant, possumus revocare": Council of Epaon (517), canon 33, CC 148(A).33.
 - 27. The Council of Laodicea (mid-fourth century), canon 19, PL 56.717,

states that only those who offer sacrifice are allowed to approach the altar; and the Council of Toledo (675), canon 13, Mansi 11.145–146, decrees that no possessed person may officiate at the altar.

- 28. Council of Lyons (567), canon 4, CC 148(A).202.
- 29. "Hic constituit ut sacrificium altaris non in siricum neque in pannum tinctum celebraretur, nisi tantum in lineum terrenum procreatum, sicut corpus domini nostri Iesu Christi in sindonem lineam mundam sepultus est: sic missas caelebrarentur": *Liber Pontificalis*, 1.171.
 - 30. Liber Pontificalis, 1.271, 276, 285, and 343.
- 31. "Observandum, ne pallis vel ministeriis divinis defunctorum corpuscula obvolvantur": Council of Clermont (535), canon 3, CC 148(A).106; and "Ne opertorio dominici corporis sacerdotes unquam corpus, dum ad tumulum evehetur, obtegatur et sacro velamine usibus suis reddeto, dum honorantur corpora, altaria polluantur": Council of Clermont, canon 7, CC 148(A).107; also, "Non licet mortuis nec eucharistia nec usculum tradi nec de vela vel pallas corpora eorum involvi": Council of Auxerre (561–565), canon 12, CC 148(A).267.
 - 32. Liber Pontificalis, 1.220, 230, and 232.
- 33. Council of Vaison (442), canon 3, CC 148.97; also, "Quoniam non oportet insacratos ministros licentiam habere in secretarium, quod Graeci diaconicon appellant, ingredi et contingere vasa dominica": Council of Agde (506), canon 66, CC 148.228.
- 34. "Ne ad nuptiarum ornatu ministeria divina praestentur et, dum inproborum tactu vel pompa saecularis luxuriae polluuntur, ad officia sacri mysterii videantur indigna": Council of Clermont (535), canon 8, CC 148(A).107.
- 35. See Robin Lane Fox in *Pagans and Christians* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1987), 504. For linen as the *signum* of Christ's burial, see the *Liber Pontificalis*, 1.171.
 - 36. Liber Pontificalis, 1.118.
- 37. "Hic ex praecepto beati Petri suscepit ecclesiae pontificatum gubernandi, sicut ei fuerat a domino Iesu Christo cathedra tradita vel commissa": *Liber Pontificalis*, 1.123.
- 38. The *Liber Pontificalis* (1.375 and 383) claims that certain popes gave the *ambo* to important churches. Mathews (*Clash of the Gods*, 113–14) discusses the relationship between the *cathedra* and episcopal power.
- 39. Klingshirn (*Caesarius of Arles*, 151-59), details the awesome nature of the sacred space of the basilica of St. Stephen in Arles. See also Mathews, *Clash of the Gods*, 94ff.
 - 40. Mayo, History of Ecclesiastical Dress, 20-21.
 - 41. Gregory of Tours, Liber vitae patrum, 8.5.
- 42. "Hic constituit sacerdotes et levitas ut vestes sacratas in usu cottidiano non uti, nisi in ecclesia": *Liber Pontificalis*, 1.154.
- 43. "Qui et constituit ut quicumque de fidelium martyrem sepeliret, sine dalmaticam aut colobium purpuratum nulla ratione sepeliret, quod tamen usque ad notitiam sibi devulgaretur": *Liber Pontificalis*, 1.159.
- 44. "Hic constituit ut diaconi dalmaticas in ecclesia uterentur et pallea linostima leva eorum tegerentur": *Liber Pontificalis*, 1.171.

- 45. See Klingshirn, Caesarius of Arles, 99-100.
- 46. "Hic constituit ut si quis desideraret in ecclesia militare aut proficere, ut esset lector annos XXX, exorcista dies XXX, acolitus annos V, subdiaconus annos V, custus martyrum annos X, diaconus annos VII, presbiter annos III, probatus ex omni parte, etiam et a foris qui sunt, testimonium habere bonum, unius uxoris virum, uxorem a sacerdote benedictam, et sic ad ordinem episcopatus accedere": Liber Pontificalis, 1.171–72. Later church councils, such as Braga (563), canon 20, underscored that laymen must rise through the orders until they reach the office of bishop (sacerdotium). The Council of Orléans (533), canon 16, CC 148(A).101, denies ordination to the uneducated (sine literis); and the Council of Orléans (538), canon 6, CC 148(A).116–117, dictates the appropriate ages for ordination. See also Klingshirn's discussion of the Council of Agde (506), Caesarius of Arles, 99–100.
- 47. The Council of Toledo (633), canon 28 (Hefele and LeClercq, eds., *Histoire des Conciles*, 3.623) assigns rank by dress and material objects. The bishop wears an *orarium*, ring, and staff; priests wear the *orarium* and *planeta*; deacons wear the *orarium* and alb; and subdeacons carry the paten and chalice. This same council (canon 39) emphasized that seating in the choir was by rank.
- 48. The Council of Agde (506), canon 20, CC 148.202, declared that all clerical dress must be under the supervision of superior officers of the church ("Clerici qui comam nutriunt, ab archidiacono, etiam si noluerint, inviti detundantur; vestimenta vel calceamenta etiam eis nisi quae religionem deceant, uti vel habere non liceat").
 - 49. The Council of Laodicaea, canon 22 and canon 23, PL 56.717.
 - 50. Liber Pontificalis, 1.177.
- 51. "Monacho uti orarium in monasterio vel cyanchas habere non liceat": Council of Arles (511), canon 20, CC148(A).10. The cyanchas were a kind of barbarian boot; see Mayo, History of Ecclesiastical Dress, 21.
- 52. The Council of Agde (506), canon 27, CC 148.205, decreed that bishops must approve all new convents and monasteries. The Council of Arles (511) contains several canons which place abbots and priests under the control of the episcopacy. For example, canon 22, CC 148(A).11, states that no monk may build a cell without the permission of either the bishop or abbot. Also, "Abbates pro humilitate religionis in episcoporum potestate consistant": Council of Arles (511), canon 19, CC 148(A).10.
 - 53. The Council of Mâcon (581), canon 5, CC 148(A).224.
- 54. For a discussion of the pallium, see Paulys Real-Encyclopädie, Band XVIII(3), s.v. "pallium," 249-254; and Mayo, History of Ecclesiastical Dress, 13, 19, and 161ff.
- 55. For a discussion of the *paenula*, see Norma Goldman, "Reconstructing Roman Clothing," in *World of Roman Costume*, ed. Sebesta and Bonfante, 229.
- 56. Hilary of Arles, Sermo de vita sancti Honorati, 35 (PL 50.1268-69), claims that threads from the saint's vestments performed miracles.
- 57. "Ut episcopus sine palleo missas dicere non praesumat": Council of Mâcon (585), canon 6, CC 148(A).224.
- 58. For an overview of the rhetorical uses of hairstyles, see Robert Bartlett, "Symbolic Meanings of Hair in the Middle Ages," *Transactions of the Royal His*-

Notes to Pages 64-65

torical Society 4 (1994): 43-60. See also Conrad Leyser, "Long-Haired Kings and Short-Haired Nuns," Medieval World 3/4 (1992): 37-42.

- 59. Gregory of Tours, *In Gloria Martyrum*, 27. See Fernand Cabrol and Henri Leclercq, eds., *Dictionnaire d'archéologie chrétienne et de liturgie* (Paris: Letouzey et Ané, 1903–1953), 2.2.2997. Both Hebrew and Roman cultures used shorn hair to symbolize humility. The ancient Hebrews shaved the head as a sign of repentance, and the Romans shaved the heads of manumitted slaves.
- 60. The Venerable Bede, *Historia ecclesiastica gentis Anglorum*, ed. Bertram Colgrave and R. A. B. Mynors, Oxford Medieval Texts Series 3 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1969), 25.
- 61. Stephanus, Vita Sancti Wilfrithi episcopi, 6, in The Life of Bishop Wilfrid by Eddius Stephanus, ed. and trans. Bertram Colgrave (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985), 14. The Latin reads, "formulam in modum coronae spineae caput Christi cingentis." Colgrave notes (12) that the vita of the Anglo-Saxon hermit, Cuthbert, contains the same passage. See also Bede, Historia ecclesiastica, 5.21.
- 62. There are several such combs extant. At the Victoria and Albert Museum in London, there are two liturgical combs, one from the Carolingian period and the other from the twelfth century. In the collected treasures of Durham Cathedral, Durham, England, there is an eighth-century Anglo-Saxon comb. The historians of material culture at the Victoria and Albert Museum suggest that the combs were used to symbolize the order of the divine universe.
- 63. Peter Lasko, "The Comb," in *The Relics of Saint Cuthbert*, ed. C. F. Battiscombe (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1956), 336-56.
- 64. Peter Brown, "The Rise and Function of the Holy Man in Late Antiquity," *Journal of Roman Studies* 61 (1971): 80-101.
- 65. Brown, "A Dark Age Crisis: Aspects of the Iconoclastic Controversy," in Society and the Holy, 300.
 - 66. Brown, "Dark Age Crisis," in Society and the Holy, 281.
- 67. "tulit pallium de collo eius et duxit in cubiculum; expolians eum induit eum vestem monachicam et abscondit eum": Liber Pontificalis, 1.293.
- 68. Similarly, the Carolingians emasculated the last Merovingian king by shaving his head and dressing him in a monastic habit; see Einhard, *Vita Caroli*, I, MGH SCR 2.443; "Gens Merovingorum, de qua Franci reges sibi creare soliti erant, usque in Hildericum regem, qui iussu Stephani, Romani pontificis, depositus ac detonsus, atque in monasterium trusus est, durasse putatur."
- 69. Thomas F. X. Noble details the secular responsibilities of the Bishop of Rome in *The Republic of Saint Peter: The Birth of the Papal State*, 680 –825 (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1984), 9–12.
 - 70. Megan McLaughlin, Consorting with Saints, 106.
- 71. "Non licet mulieri nudam manum eucharistiam accipere": Council of Auxerre (561–605), canon 36, CC 148(A).269. Klingshirn (*Caesarius of Arles*, 155) discusses Caesarius's sermons concerning the washing of the hands and the wrapping of women's hands in cloth.
- 72. For detailed discussions of sixth-century legislation, see Wemple, Women in Frankish Society, and Brian Brennan, "'Episcopae': Bishops' Wives Viewed in Sixth-Century Gaul," Church History 54 (1985): 311-23.

- 73. For example, Council of Clermont (535), canon 13, CC 148(A).108; Council of Tours (567), canon 13, CC 148(A).180–181; and Council of Mâcon (581–583), canon 3, CC 148(A).224.
- 74. "Germanitatis affectu": Council of Clermont (535), canon 13, CCL 148A.108. For a discussion of early medieval hagiographical representations of spiritual marriage, see Elliott, *Spiritual Marriage*, 68–73.
- 75. "In domum serpentem includere pro veste": Council of Tours (567), canon 10, CC 148(A).179.
- 76. "Illud quoque rectum nobis visum est disponere, ut, quae uxor subdiaconi vel exorcistae vel acoliti fuerat, mortuo illo secundo se non audeat sotiare matrimonio. Quod si feceret, separetur et in coenubiis puellarum Dei tradatur et ibi usque ad exitum vitae suae permaneat": Council of Mâcon (581), canon 16, CC 148(A).246.
- 77. Wemple (Women in Frankish Society, 136) also cites the eighth-century Bavarian Code (MGH Legum Sectio I.5.2.284–85) which accuses defiled women of causing plagues and famines, thus disrupting the divine order of the universe.
- 78. The Council of Laodicea (mid-fourth century), canon 11, PL 56.716, abolishes the female presbyters and elders. The Council of Nîmes (394), canon 2, CC 148.50, forbids women from ministering.
- 79. "Nihilominus impatienter audivimus tantum divinarum rerum subiisse despectum, ut feminae sacris altaribus ministrare ferantur; et cuncta quae non nisi virorum famulatui deputata sunt, sexum cui non competit exhibere": Pope Gelasius, *Epistolae et decreta*, 9.26, PL 59.55.
 - 80. Wemple, Women in Frankish Society, 140.
- 81. For the ordination of women deacons, see the Council of Nicaea (325), canon 19, Mansi 2.675–678. On the dismantling of the office, "Diaconae omnimodis non ordinandae: si quae iam sunt, benedictioni quae populo impenditur capita submittant": Council of Orange (441), canon 25, CC 148.84; "Foeminae, quae benedictionem diaconatus actenus contra interdicta canonum acceperunt, si ad coniugium probantur iterum devolutae, a communione pellantur. Quod si huismodi contubernium admonitae ab episcopo cognito errore dissolverint, in communionis gratia acta penitentia revertantur": Council of Orléans (533), canon 17, CC 148(A).101; and "Placuit etiam, ut nulli postmodum foeminae diaconalis benedictio pro conditionis huius fragilitate credatur": Council of Orléans (533), canon 18, CC 148(A).101. See also Wemple, Women in Frankish Society, 140.
- 82. Gilchrist (*Gender and Material Culture*, 20) notes, however, that nuns do appear in the historical record as sacristans.
 - 83. Council of Laodicea (mid-fourth century), canon 45, PL 56.719.
- 84. "Ut laici secus altare, quo sancta misteria celebrantur, inter clericos tam ad vigiliis quam ad missas stare penitus non praesumant, sed pars illa, quae a cancellis versus altare dividitur, choris tantum psallentium pateat clericorum. Ad orandum et communicandum laicis et foeminis, sicut mos est, pateant sancta sanctorum": Council of Tours (567), canon 4, CC 148(A).178. See also Robert A. Markus, "The Cult of Icons in Sixth-Century Gaul," *Journal of Theological Studies* 29 (1978): 155.
- 85. "Non licet mulieri nudam manum eucharistiam accipere": Council of Auxerre (578), canon 36, CC 148(A).269; and "Non licet, ut mulier manum suam

ad pallam Dominicam mittat": Council of Auxerre, canon 37, CC 148(A).269. Canon 42, CC 148(A).270, states that all women must bring a *dominicale* (a cloth with which to wrap the hands) to communion. Wemple (*Women in Frankish Society*, 142) cautions that this was not always carried out in the seventh century, particularly by nuns who made the linen *pallia* and often assisted at eucharist services.

86. "Hic Bonifatius constituit ut nulla mulier aut monacha pallam sacratam contingere aut lavare aut incensum ponere in ecclesia nisi minister": *Liber Pontificalis*, 1.227.

87. Gilchrist, Gender and Material Culture, 109.

88. Henry Ansgar Kelly, *The Devil at Baptism: Ritual, Theology, and Drama* (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1985), 207ff.

- 89. "Oracio super ancillas Dei quibus conversis vestmenta mutantur": in Gelasian Sacramentary, no. 792, in L. C. Mohlberg, L. Eizenhöfer, and P. Siffrin, eds., Liber Sacramentorum Romanae Aecclesiae ordinis anni circuli (Cod. Vat. Reg. Lat. 316/Paris Bibl. Nat. 7193, 41/56), Rerum Ecclesiasticarum Documenta, fontes, 4 (Rome: Herder, 1960). For exorcism, see Gelasian Sacramentary, nos. 293–97. Women are linked to the Body of the Church through God and Abraham, Isaac, and Israel; men are led through the Holy Spirit. See also Peter Cramer, Baptism and Change in the Early Middle Ages, c. 200-1150 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), 151.
- 90. Pope Symmachus constructed a matroneum at St. Paul's in Rome; see Liber Pontificalis, 1.262.
- 91. See Thomas Mathews, The Early Churches of Constantinople: Architecture and Liturgy (University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1971), 130-34.
- 92. Gregory of Tours, Gloria Confessorum, 26. The most distinguished desert fathers denied women access to the space around their cells, pillars, or caves. John of Lycopolis only blesses men through the window of his tiny cell. He speaks to women disciples in dreams (Rufinus, Historia Monachorum in Aegypto, 1.7).
 - 93. Sulpicius Severus, Dialogorum libri II, 2.12.
 - 94. Possidius, Vita Augustini, 26, PL 32.55.
- 95. Gregory of Tours, Decem libri historiarum, 2.1; 4.36; Gloria Confessorum, 31, 74, 75, 77.
 - 96. Sulpicius Severus, Vita S. Martini, 3.
- 97. For a discussion of the chlamys, see Mayo, History of Ecclesiastical Dress, 14, 20–21; Sabine MacCormack, Art and Ceremony in Late Antiquity (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1981), 180, 250–52; Ann M. Stout, "Jewelry as a Symbol of Status in the Roman Empire," in World of Roman Costume, ed. Sebesta and Bonfante, 83–84; and Mathews, Clash of the Gods, 101.
- 98. Vulgate reads "chlamydem coccineam circumdederunt ei." After the crucifixion, the Roman soldiers divided up Jesus' garments and cast lots for them (see Psalm 22.18: "They divide my clothing among themselves, and for my clothing they cast lots").
 - 99. Sulpicius Severus, Dialogorum libri II, 2.3.
 - 100. Sulpicius Severus, Vita S. Martini, 10.
 - 101. Sulpicius Severus, Dialogorum libri II, 1.23.

102. Van Dam, Saints and Their Miracles, 19.

103. See Goldman, "Reconstructing Roman Clothing," in World of Roman Costume, ed. Sebesta and Bonfante, 231-32.

104. Constantius, Vita Germani, 4.

105. Sulpicius Severus, Dialogorum libri II, 1.17.

106. Gregory the Great, Dialogorum libri IV, 2.1.

107. Vita S. Martini, 10; Vita Hilarii Arelatensis, 8.

108. "Is constitutus in ecclesia, tractante episcopo, vidit, ut ipse postmodum loquebatur, angelum ad aures episcopi tractantis loquentem ut verba angeli populo episcopus renuntiare videretur": Paulinus, Vita Sancti Ambrosii, 17 (Kaniecka, Vita Sancti Ambrosii, 56). The hagiographical physiognomy of holy men is as vague as that of Christ. Ambrose's hagiographer describes the bishop as the transfigured Christ whose face reveals the Holy Spirit. The vague descriptions of Christian saints invert the complex physiognomical treatments of classical emperors and public men.

109. Gregory of Tours, Liber vitae patrum, 12.3; and Gloria Confessorum, 20 and 38. See also Giselle de Nie, Views from a Many-Windowed Tower: Studies of Imagination in the Works of Gregory of Tours (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1987), chap. 3.

110. "Cappa autem huius indumenti ita dilatata erat atque consuta, ut solent in illis candidis fieri, quae per paschalia festa sacerdotum umeris inponuntur": Gregory of Tours, *Liber vitae patrum*, 8.5 (MGH SRM 1.2.246). Gregory describes this particular cape as the kind reserved for Easter celebrations because it was decorated with linen bands in memory of Christ's resurrection.

111. "palleolis vel reliqua ministerii ornamenta": Gregory of Tours, In Gloria Martyrum, 65 (MGH SRM 1.2.82).

112. Paraphrase of Georges Duby, William Marshal: The Flower of Chivalry, trans. Richard Howard (New York: Pantheon, 1985), 15. Duby uses the motif of changed dress to symbolize William Marshal's conversion to the ascetic life of a Templar.

113. Douglas, Purity and Danger, 10-11.

114. Geary, Before France and Germany, 134.

Chapter 4

- 1. See also Mark 1.12-13 and Luke 4.1-13.
- 2. Parallel texts in Mark 1.1-8; Luke 3.1-18; and John 1.6-8, 19-28.
- 3. The desert corpus exists in a variety of manuscript forms and languages, including Syriac, Coptic, Arabic, Ethiopic, Old Sogdiam, Armenian, Greek, and Latin, and its popularity in the West is attested by the number of extant copies housed in early medieval monastic scriptoria. E. A. Lowe, Codices Latini Antiquiores: A Paleographical Guide to Latin Manuscripts Prior to the Ninth Century (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1934), cites over twenty extant manuscripts and fragments of the desert corpus produced in monastic scriptoria in France, Italy, Rhaetia, Switzerland, Germany, and Spain. For the textual traditions of the desert corpus, see Gould, Desert Fathers on Monastic Community, 1–25; Rousselle, Porneia, 138–40; and Philip Rousseau, Ascetics and Authority in the Ages of Jerome and Cassian

(Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1978). For the translation of Rufinus, Historia Monachorum in Aegypto, see Norman Russell, trans., The Lives of the Desert Fathers, Cistercian Studies Series 34 (Kalamazoo, Mich.: Cistercian Publications, 1980); for Theodoret of Cyrrhus, Historia Religiosa = Histoire des moines de Syrie, see R. M. Price, trans., Theodoret of Cyrrhus: A History of the Monks of Syria, Cistercian Studies Series 88 (Kalamazoo, Mich.: Cistercian Publications, 1985); for the Apophthegmata Patrum, see Benedicta Ward, trans., The Sayings of the Desert Fathers, Cistercian Studies Series 59 (Kalamazoo, Mich.: Cistercian Publications, 1975); for Palladius, Historia Lausiaca, see Robert T. Meyer, trans., The Lausiac History of Palladius, Ancient Christian Writers Series 34 (Westminster, Md.: Newman Press, 1965); and, for Athanasius of Alexandria, Vita Antonii, see Robert C. Gregg, trans., The Life of Antony and the Letter to Marcellinus, Classics of Western Spirituality (New York: Paulist Press, 1980).

- 4. See Brown, Body and Society, chap. II.
- 5. Rufinus, Historia Monachorum, 7.2; translation from Russell, Lives of the Desert Fathers, 69.
 - 6. Theodoret of Cyrrhus, Historia Religiosa, 2.2.
 - 7. Palladius, Historia Lausiaca, 18.4.
- 8. Goubâ (pit); Theodoret of Cyrrhus, Historia Religiosa, 13.2; Price, Monks of Syria, 101.
 - 9. Theodoret of Cyrrhus, Historia Religiosa, 1.
- IO. In Theodoret of Cyrrhus's *Historia Religiosa* (6.10-11), a Syrian holy man tames wild lions and wild crows feed him.
- II. A. J. Festugière, *Les moines d'orient* 4(1) (Paris: Éditions du Cerf, 1964), 19, note to line 242, says that self-immurement in tombs (*necrotaphioi*) had already been part of a pre-Christian Egyptian religious practice.
- 12. Apophthegmata Patrum, Ammonas, 30; translation from Ward, Sayings of the Desert Fathers, 25.
 - 13. Apophthegmata Patrum, Antony, 27.
 - 14. Palladius, Historia Lausiaca, 48.3.
 - 15. Palladius, Historia Lausiaca, 43.1.
- 16. Palladius, Historia Lausiaca, 11.4, 18.4, 42; Rufinus, Historia Monachorum, 13.7.
 - 17. Apophthegmata Patrum, Arsenius, 42.
- 18. Russell (*Lives of the Desert Fathers*, 132 n. 1, under IX Amoun) notes that "large serpent" (*megalou drakontos*) was another way of saying the devil.
- 19. Rufinus, *Historia Monachorum*, 9.1; translation from Russell, *Lives of the Desert Fathers*, 80.
- 20. Theodoret of Cyrrhus, *Historia Religiosa*, 27.1; translation from Price, *Monks of Syria*, 177.
- 21. Theodoret of Cyrrhus, *Historia Religiosa*, Prologue, 9; translation from Price, *Monks of Syria*, 7.
- 22. For a discussion of women as salvific forces in human history, see Harvey, "Women in Byzantine Hagiography," 36–59. This article greatly influenced the following discussion.
- 23. Palladius, Historia Lausiaca, 5.1; translation from Meyer, Lausiac History, 36.

- 24. Palladius, *Historia Lausiaca*, 5.2; translation from Meyer, *Lausiac History*, 36-37.
 - 25. Athanasius, Vita Antonii, 10; translation from Gregg, Life of Antony, 39.
 - 26. Gregg discusses the aktina photos (saving light) in Life of Antony, 136 n. 24.
 - 27. For the entire episode, see Athanasius, Vita Antonii, 8-11.
 - 28. Theodoret of Cyrrhus, Historia Religiosa, 27.3.
 - 29. See Harvey, "Women in Byzantine Hagiography," 42.
 - 30. Palladius, Historia Lausiaca, 31, 60, and 67.
 - 31. Theodoret of Cyrrhus, Historia Religiosa, 29-30.
 - 32. The phrase "icon of repentance" is from Ward, Harlots of the Desert, 26.
- 33. For the textual tradition, see Sebastian P. Brock and Susan Ashbrook Harvey, eds., Holy Women of the Syrian Orient (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1987), 40–41, 186–87; and Pierre Petitmengin, Pélagie la Pénitente. Brock and Harvey (41–62) translate the Syriac version which is based on the Greek life; and Ward, Harlots of the Desert, 66–75, translates the Latin text. See Brock and Harvey, Holy Women of the Syrian Orient, 2–3, for a discussion of the historical value of the vita. Gillian Cloke, This Female Man of God, 193–94, discusses Pelagia's vita. Subsequent references are to the Latin Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, PL 73.663–72.
- 34. For example, an eighth- or ninth-century edition of the Latin vita found at Chartres fuses Pelagia's vita with the Life of Melania the Younger; see Elizabeth A. Clark, trans., The Life of Melania the Younger, Studies in Women and Religion 14 (New York: Edwin Mellen Press, 1984), 3, 178 n. 24.
 - 35. See Jacobus de Voragine, Golden Legend, 2.231.
- 36. In *Apophthegmata Patrum*, John the Dwarf, 16, an elderly hermit informs Abba John that, "you are like a courtesan who shows her beauty to increase the number of her lovers." See Ward, *Harlots of the Desert*, 60.
- 37. Brock and Harvey (*Holy Women of the Syrian Orient*, 40) note that some historians have mistakenly identified the legendary Nonnus as a fifth-century Bishop of Edessa.
 - 38. Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, 2.
- 39. "Ecce subito transiit per nos prima mimarum Antiochiae; ipsaque est prima choreutriarum pantomimarum, sedens super asellum; et processit cum summa phantasia, adornata ita, ut nihil videretur super ea nisi aurum et margaritae et lapides pretiosi; nuditas vero pedum eius ex auro et margaritis erat cooperta . . .": Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, 2, PL 73.664.
- 40. The Latin *Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis* (1) claims that the bishops hid their faces in their scapulas, or tabards worn over habits (see Mayo, *History of Ecclesiastical Dress*, 171). In the Syriac *vita* (6), the bishops merely avert their eyes.
 - 41. Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, 3.
- 42. Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, 3. In the Syriac vita (8), Nonnus beats his chest and soaks his hair shirt with tears.
- 43. Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, 3; translation from Ward, Harlots of the Desert, 68.
 - 44. Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, 4.
- 45. Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, 4; translation from Ward, Harlots of the Desert, 68.
 - 46. Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, 9. Christianity provided the avenue through

which actresses could legitimately abandon their profession. The Theodosian Code dictates that "actresses were not allowed to leave their profession unless they converted to Christianity." See *Theodosiani Libri XVI*, 15.7; cited by Clark, *Women in Late Antiquity*, 29–30. For a discussion of the female diaconate, see Cloke, *This Female Man of God*, 205–11.

- 47. Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, 11.
- 48. Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, 12. In the Syriac version (vita, 41), Nonnus gives Pelagia his chiton. In the gospel of John (19.23), Jesus wears a seamless shirt or chiton.
- 49. The hagiographer describes the shrine as "in modica cellula undique circumclusa, et parvam fenestellam habuerat in pariete"; *Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis*, 14, PL 73.670.
- 50. James claims that he could not have recognized the former prostitute: "Quomodo enim poteram cognoscere illam, quam antea videram inaestimabili pulchritudine, iam facie marcidam factam prae nimia abstinentia? Oculi vero eius sicut fossae videbantur": *Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis*, 14, PL 73.670.
 - 51. "Sanctum corpusculum": Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, 15, PL 73.670.
 - 52. Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, 15. Reference to Matthew 6.19-20.
- 53. Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, 15; translation from Ward, Harlots of the Desert, 74-75.
- 54. Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, 14; translation from Ward, Harlots of the Desert, 74.
- 55. See Clark, Women in Late Antiquity, 129; Bynum, Holy Feast and Holy Fast, 290–91; Salisbury, Church Fathers and Independent Virgins, 109–10; Ward, Harlots of the Desert, 63; Patlagean, "L'Histoire de la femme déguisée en moine," 597–623; Anson, "The Female Transvestite in Early Monasticism," 1–32; and Garber, Vested Interests, 213–17.
 - 56. Salisbury, Church Fathers and Independent Virgins, 110.
- 57. Acts of Paul and Thecla, 40, in New Testament Apocrypha 2, ed. E. Hennecke and W. Schneemelcher, trans. R. Mcl. Wilson (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1965). The Greco-Roman romantic topos is discussed by Clark, Women in Antiquity, 31.
- 58. For a detailed history of the Christian exegesis on the Song of Songs, see E. Ann Matter, *The Voice of My Beloved: The Song of Songs in Western Medieval Christianity* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1990).
 - 59. Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, 4.
 - 60. Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, 7.
- 61. Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, 7; translation from Ward, Harlots of the Desert, 70.
 - 62. Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, 8.
 - 63. Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, 14.
- 64. Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, 2; translation from Ward, Harlots of the Desert, 67.
- 65. Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, 8; translation from Ward, Harlots of the Desert, 71.
 - 66. Tertullian, De habitu muliebri, 1.2.

- 67. Vita S. Pelagiae, Meretricis, 11.
- 68. Discussed by Ward, Harlots of the Desert, 63.
- 69. Jerome, Vita Pauli, PL 23.17-60. For the textual traditions of the Life of Mary of Egypt, see Paul Harvey's forthcoming article, "Mary the Egyptian: Sources and Purpose," 25 mss pages (I should like to thank Professor Harvey for sharing his essay with me). Dembowski, La Vie de Sainte Marie l'Egyptienne, 21-22; and Salisbury, Church Fathers and Independent Virgins, 69. Albert Siegmund (Die Überlieferung der griechischen christlichen Literatur in der lateinischen Kirche bis zum zwölften Jahrhundert [Munich-Pasing: Filser-Verlag, 1949], 269) discusses the Latin translation from the Greek by Paulus Diaconus Neapolitanus, whose prologue to the vita is dated c. 876-877. In the prologue, Paulus states that he prepared a translation of Mary of Egypt's vita much earlier for Charles the Bald. Subsequent references are to Paulus Diaconus's Latin translation, Vita S. Mariae Aegyptiaciae, Meretricis, PL 73.671-90. Sophronius's text is in PG 87(3).3693-726.
- 70. For example, in Palladius, *Historia Lausiaca*, 34.6, an angel instructs Abba Piteroum to journey to the women's community at Tabennisi to witness the humility of a spiritual mother who resided there. At Tabennisi, Piteroum visits with each of the sisters, but finds no saint among them. Finally, he asks to see the mad woman of the community, who binds her head in rags, eats crumbs, and joyously performs the most vile tasks. When the female lunatic comes before him, the abba falls down at her feet exclaiming: "Bless me!" The nuns are shocked by the holy man's obsequious behavior, and they caution him not to embrace the insane woman. "You are the ones who are touched!" he replies "This woman is a spiritual mother"; translation from Meyer, *Lausiac History*, 98.
 - 71. Harvey, "Mary the Egyptian: Sources and Purpose," 6.
 - 72. Discussed in McKitterick, Carolingians and the Written Word, 241ff.
 - 73. Voragine, Golden Legend, 1,227-29.
- 74. Brown, Society and the Holy, 166-95; and Markus, End of Ancient Christianity, 157-211.
- 75. Vita S. Mariae Aegyptiacae, Meretricis, 22; translation from Ward, Harlots of the Desert, 53.
- 76. Vita S. Mariae Aegyptiacae, Meretricis, 19; translation from Ward, Harlots of the Desert, 50.
- 77. Vita S. Mariae Aegyptiacae, Meretricis, 7; translation from Ward, Harlots of the Desert, 41.
- 78. Vita S. Mariae Aegyptiacae, Meretricis, 4; translation from Ward, Harlots of the Desert, 39.
- 79. Vita S. Mariae Aegyptiacae, Meretricis, 10; translation from Ward, Harlots of the Desert, 42.
- 80. Theodoret of Cyrrhus (*Historia Religiosa*, 6.7–8) asserts that Abba Symeon the Elder had to convince two pilgrims that he was a man and not a demon.
- 81. Vita S. Mariae Aegyptiacae, Meretricis, 11; translation from Ward, Harlots of the Desert, 44.
 - 82. Vita S. Mariae Aegyptiacae, Meretricis, 12.
- 83. Vita S. Mariae Aegyptiacae, Meretricis, 15; translation from Ward, Harlots of the Desert, 46.

- 84. Paul Havery ("Mary the Egyptian: Sources and Purposes, 6-7) discusses how iconophiles used Mary's conversion by an icon of the *Theotokos* during the iconoclastic controversy of the eighth century.
- 85. Vita S. Mariae Aegyptiacae, Meretricis, 16; translation from Ward, Harlots of the Desert, 47.
- 86. Vita S. Mariae Aegyptiacae, Meretricis, 19; translation from Ward, Harlots of the Desert, 50.
- 87. See also Exodus 15.24, where the unfaithful Israelites ask Moses, "What shall we drink?"
 - 88. Discussed by Cloke, This Female Man of God, 215-16.
- 89. Vita S. Mariae Aegyptiacae, Meretricis, 24-25; translation from Ward, Harlots of the Desert, 54.
 - 90. Vita S. Mariae Aegyptiacae, Meretricis, 20.
- 91. For the work of Francesco Traini, see Millard Meiss, "The Problem of Francesco Traini," *Art Bulletin* 15 (1933): 97–173. Later medieval depictions of Mary of Egypt show the holy woman with long hair. This may be due to the fact that Mary's *vita* had become closely associated with that of Mary Magdalene, who was portrayed with flowing tresses.
- 92. Miles (Carnal Knowing, 142-44) argues that the female nude was too erotic to illustrate spiritual strength but that the male nude personified commitment, extraordinary spiritual vitality, physical control, and order. Mary of Egypt's nudity (mentioned by Miles, 64) clearly depicts the female body as having obliterated sensuality. On Christian nudity, see also Brown, Body and Society, 313-17. Salisbury (Church Fathers and Independent Virgins, 70) argues that this ex-prostitute's rejection of the clothing of a harlot would have been scandalous in Roman society, which was governed by strict codes of dress according to occupation.
- 93. In the Sumerian *Epic of Gilgamesh*, the harlot figure represents urban civilization, while in the Pentateuch and books of the prophets harlots signify sinful Israel. For a discussion of the harlot-saint *topos*, see Ruth Mazo Karras, "Holy Harlots: Prostitute Saints in Medieval Legend," *Journal of the History of Sexuality* I (1990): 3-32.
- 94. Edith Wyschogrod (*Saints and Postmodernism*, 13) argues that the *imitatio Christi* is "an unrealizable imperative" because Christ's perfection cannot be duplicated by humans. Paul's *vita* operates similarly as an unrealizable imperative.
- 95. Vulgate reads "Nigra sum, sed formosa. . . . Nolite me considerare quod fusca sim, quia decoloravit me sol."
- 96. Vulgate reads "caput autem eius, et capilli erant candidi tanquam lana alba, et tanquam nix."
- 97. Origen (185–254 CE) in his exegesis on the Song of Songs, interprets the nigra sum sed formosa text as an allegory of the pristine church. See Origen, The Song of Songs, 2.1. English translation by R. P. Lawson, Origen: The Song of Songs Commentary and Homilies, Ancient Christian Writers Series 26 (Westminster, Md.: Newman Press, 1957), 91–92. Origen extols the beauty of the Bride of Christ, or the Church, who is "dark and beautiful, O Ye Daughters of Jerusalem." She is the mirror opposite of the indulgent daughters of earthly Jerusalem, who find her ugly and "despise and vilify her for her ignoble birth; for she is baseborn in their eyes."

Chapter 5

- I. Eusebius of Caesaria, Vita Constantini, 3.47, PG 20.II05-8. English translation by E. C. Richardson, "The Life of the Blessed Emperor Constantine," in Library of the Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers, second series, vol. I (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 1961), 481-559. An Italian translation is by Luigi Tartaglia, Eusebio di Cesarea Sulla Vita Di Costantino (Naples: M. D'Auria, 1984). Tartaglia (147 n. 110-11) discusses the title Augusta and the coins minted in her honor. Borgehammar (How the Holy Cross Was Found) details the development of the Helena legend. See also Holum, Theodosian Empresses, 32-33.
- 2. Brown (*Body and Society*, 146) notes the usurpation of clerical roles by ambitious women: "Some women, however, edged closer to the clergy: continence or widowhood set them free from the disqualifications associated with sexual activity."
- 3. See Salisbury, Church Fathers and Independent Virgins, 89–96; Elizabeth A. Clark, "Early Christian Women: Sources and Interpretations," in That Gentle Strength, ed. Coon et al., 29; Brown, Body and Society, 344–45; Rosemary Ruether, "Mothers of the Church: Ascetic Women in the Late Patristic Age," in Women of Spirit: Female Leadership in the Jewish and Christian Traditions, ed. Rosemary Ruether and Eleanor McLaughlin (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1979), 88–94; Jo Ann McNamara, "Muffled Voices: The Lives of Consecrated Women in the Fourth Century," in Distant Echoes: Medieval Religious Women, vol. 1, ed. John A. Nichols and Lillian Thomas Shank (Kalamazoo, Mich.: Cistercian Publications, 1984), 11–29; and Jill Harries, "Treasure in Heaven': Property and Inheritance Among Senators of Late Rome," in Marriage and Property, ed. Elizabeth M. Craik (St. Andrews: Aberdeen University Press, 1984), 54–70. See Cloke (This Female Man of God, chaps. 6–7) for the social implications of "Christian motherhood."
- 4. See Peter Brown, "Church and Leadership," in A History of Private Life: From Pagan Rome to Byzantium, ed. Paul Veyne, trans. Arthur Goldhammer (Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1987), 279.
- 5. Holum (*Theodosian Empresses*, 29-30) emphasizes that women could not hold office or be in the Senate nor could they wear the senatorial toga and emblems of office. See also Theodosius, *Theodosiana Libri XVI*, 6.4.17.
 - 6. See Holum, Theodosian Empresses, 24.
- 7. See Gardner, Women in Roman Law and Society, and Cloke, This Female Man of God, chap. 7.
- 8. Holum, *Theodosian Empresses*, 72. See also E. D. Hunt, "Hadrian and Helena," in *The Blessings of Pilgrimage*, ed. Robert Ousterhout (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1990), 67.
- 9. On the conversion of imperial ideology to Christian doctrine, see Holum, *Theodosian Empresses*, 24ff. He focuses on the transformation of the classical virtues of *eusebia*, *tapeinophrosyne*, *philanthropia*, and *philandria*. Elm (*Virgins of God*, 99ff) analyzes the eastern *vitae* of patrician women.
- 10. On Eusebius's comparison of Constantine and Helena to Christ and Mary, see P. W. L. Walker, *Holy City, Holy Places* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1990), 188.

- II. Eusebius, Vita Constantini, 1.28ff.
- 12. See Robert A. Markus, Saeculum: History and Society in the Theology of St. Augustine (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1970), 48-50. Markus notes that Eusebius "applies messianic categories to the rule of the Roman Emperors" and that Constantine's reign represented a "culmination of God's marvellous saving work" (49). See also Mathews, Clash of the Gods, 14ff, and Anthony Kemp (The Estrangement of the Past: A Study in the Origins of Modern Historical Consciousness [Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991], 17) for Constantine as a "divine deliverer."
 - 13. Eusebius, Vita Constantini, 3.10.
- 14. See Holum, *Theodosian Empresses*, 24; and Ernest Hello, *Physiognomies des Saints* (Paris: Librairie Académique Didier, 1900), 258.
- 15. See Robert L. Wilken, The Land Called Holy: Palestine in Christian Literature and Thought (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1992), 98. For a detailed discussion of the post-Eusebian legends of the inventio crucis, see Jan Willem Drijvers, Helena Augusta: The Mother of Constantine the Great and the Legend of Her Finding of the True Cross (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1992).
 - 16. Eusebius, Vita Constantini, 3.33.
- 17. See Hunt, "Hadrian and St. Helena," 67. See also Holum, *Theodosian Empresses*, 184-85, for the Empress Eudocia's pilgrimage to Palestine in 438 CE.
- 18. Borgehammar, How the Holy Cross Was Found, 1. The feast day for the inventio crucis is May 3rd.
 - 19. Eusebius, Vita Constantini, 3.42.
- 20. Cyril, Catecheses, PG 33.830; Ambrose, De obitu Theodosii oratio, 41-51, CSEL 73(7).393-398; Paulinus of Nola, Epistle, 31, CSEL 29(1).267ff; Socrates, Historia Ecclesiastica, PG 67.9-842; and Sozomen, Historia Ecclesiastica, PG 67.843-1630.
- 21. Eusebius, Vita Constantini, 3.41-47. See discussion by Wilken, Land Called Holy, 88ff.
- 22. See Walker (*Holy City, Holy Places*, 14ff) for a discussion of the impact of the conversion of Constantine on the physical landscape of Palestine. Walker maintains that by the mid-fourth century, the major named places of Christ's life had been identified and had become pilgrimage sites.
 - 23. Eusebius, Vita Constantini, 3.43.
 - 24. Eusebius, Vita Constantini, 3.44.
- 25. Eusebius, *Vita Constantini*, 3.44. Eusebius provides a long list of titles (*Vita*, 3.43, PG 20.1103): "Helena Augusta, religiosi imperatoris mater religiosissima, piae devotionis."
 - 26. Eusebius, Vita Constantini, 3.46-47.
- 27. Hunt, Holy Land Pilgrimage, 51; and Hunt, "Hadrian and St. Helena," 75ff. For a discussion of the political travels of the imperial family, see Helmut Halfmann, Itinera principum: Geschichte und Typologie der Kaiserreisen im Römischen Reich (Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1986).
 - 28. Hunt, "Hadrian and St. Helena," 76.
 - 29. Eusebius, Vita Constantini, 3.47.
- 30. Borgehammar (*How the Holy Cross Was Found*, chaps. 2-3) reconstructs the "Jerusalem tradition" surrounding the events connected with the Constanti-

nian refashioning of the Holy Land. Drijvers (*Helena Augusta*, 95ff) also discusses the earlier work of Gelasius of Jerusalem (*Church History* [c. 390]), which Drijvers argues is the oldest account of Helena's discovery of the true cross.

- 31. For a detailed discussion of Cyril's contribution to Holy Land pilgrimage, see Walker, *Holy City, Holy Places*; see also Wilken, *Land Called Holy*, 119-20.
 - 32. Cyril, Catecheses, 4.10, 10.19, 13.4.
- 33. Ambrose, *De obitu Theodosii oratio*, 41-51 (CSEL73[7].393-398). Borgehammar (*How the Holy Cross Was Found*, 60) gives the date of the public reading of the *oratio* as February 25, 395.
- 34. Borgehammar (*How the Holy Cross Was Found*, 60–66) details Ambrose's version of the legend. He notes that the Theodosian court treasured the image of Helena and that Theodosius's wife, Aelia Flaccilla, was the first empress after Helena to receive the title Augusta.
- 35. Author's translation of "Illa quasi sancta dominum gestavit, ego crucem eius investigabo. Illa generatum docuit, ego resuscitatum. Illa fecit, ut deus inter homines videretur, ego ad nostorum remedium peccatorum divinum de ruinis elevabo vexillum": Ambrose, *De obitu Theodosii oratio*, 44 (CSEL 72[7].394).
 - 36. Ambrose, De obitu Theodosii oratio, 46.
- 37. Author's translation of "Visitata est Maria, ut Evam liberaret: visitata est Helena, ut redimerentur imperatores": Ambrose, *De obitu Theodosii oratio*, 47 (CSEL 73[7].396).
 - 38. Ambrose, De obitu Theodosii oratio, 48.
- 39. Melania gave Paulinus a "partem particulae de ligno divinae crucis": Paulinus, *Epistle*, 31.1 (CSEL 29[1].268). English translation by P. G. Walsh, *The Letters of Paulinus of Nola*, Ancient Christian Writers 36 (Westminster, Md.: Newman Press, 1967), 2.125-33. Borgehammar (*How the Holy Cross Was Found*, 66-71) discusses Paulinus's *Epistle* 31, noting that Melania the Elder may have been the major source for his rendition of the legend.
- 40. Author's translation of "Qui princeps esse principibus Christianis non magis sua quam matris Helenae fide meruit": Paulinus, *Epistle*, 31.4 (CSEL 29[1].271).
 - 41. Paulinus, Epistle, 31.5.
- 42. Socrates, a Constantinopolitan lawyer, extended Eusebius's *Ecclesiastical History*, and Sozomen elaborated on the work of Socrates. The *vita* of Helena is in Socrates, *Historia Ecclesiastica*, 1.17, and Sozomen, *Historia Ecclesiastica*, 2.1–2. English translation of Socrates is by A. C. Zenos, Library of Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers 2.2.1–178; English translation of Sozomen is by C. D. Hartrauft, Library of Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers 2.2.179–427.
 - 43. Socrates, Historia Ecclesiastica, 1.17.
 - 44. Sozomen, Historia Ecclesiastica, 2.2.
 - 45. Holum, Theodosian Empresses, 25-26.
 - 46. See Hunt, Holy Land Pilgrimage, 172.
- 47. Jerome, Epistle, 108. Latin text in CSEL 55(2).306-51. English translation in Maenads, Martyrs, Matrons, Monastics: A Sourcebook on Women's Religions in the Greco-Roman World, ed. Ross S. Kraemer (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1988), 127-68.
 - 48. For a discussion of Jerome's epitaphium and his relationship with Paula,

- see J. N. D. Kelly, Jerome: His Life, Writings, and Controversies (London: Duckworth, 1975), 273-82; Martin Heinzelmann ("Neue Aspekte der biographischen und hagiographischen Literatur," 27-44) discusses the relationship between Christian hagiography and the classical laudatio funebris.
- 49. Author's translation of "Quis inopum moriens non illius vestibus obvolutus est": Jerome, Epistle, 108.5 (CSEL 55[2].310).
 - 50. Jerome, Epistle, 108.5.
 - 51. For example, Helena, Egeria, Melania the Elder, and Poememia.
- 52. Jerome, Epistle, 108.7. The Roman historian Dio Cassius (Histories 67.14) claims that Domitilla was banished to Pandateria after having been accused of atheism and Judaism. Leclercq (Dictionnaire d'archéologie chrétienne et de liturgie, vol. 4[2], 1401-04) notes that Domitilla was the granddaughter of the emperor Vespasian and that she had married Domitian's cousin, Titus Flavius Clemens.
 - 53. "Longum martyrium duxerat": Jerome, Epistle, 108.7 (CSEL 55[2].312).
 - 54. Jerome, Epistle, 108.7.
 - 55. "Asello sedens profecta est": Jerome, Epistle, 108.7 (CSEL 55[2].312).
 - 56. For Paula's tour of the Holy Land, see Jerome, Epistle, 108.9-13.
- 57. "prostataque ante crucem, quasi pendentem dominum cerneret, adorabat": Jerome, Epistle, 108.9 (CSEL 55[2].315).
- 58. "Ingressa sepulchrum resurrectionis osculabatur lapidem, quem ab ostio sepulchri amoverat angelus, et ipsum corporis locum, in quo dominus iacuerat, quasi sitiens desideratas aquas fide, ore lambebat": Jerome, Epistle, 108.9 (CSEL 55[2].315).
- 59. See Gary Vikan, "Pilgrims in Magis' Clothing" in Blessings of Pilgrimage, ed. Ousterhout, 97-107; and Markus, End of Ancient Christianity, 151.
- 60. Vikan ("Pilgrims in Magis' Clothing," 100) describes the Holy Sepulcher as a "living icon of the resurrection."
 - 61. Jerome, Epistle, 108.14.
 - 62. Jerome, Epistle, 108.28.
 - 63. Jerome, Epistle, 108.29.
- 64. Here Jerome echoes his earlier depiction of Flavia Domitilla's long martyrdom at Pontia: "mater tua longo martyrio coronata est" (Epistle, 108.31, CSEL 55[2].349).
 - 65. Jerome, Epistle, 108.33.
- 66. There has been a recent explosion of literature on Roman women. For detailed bibliographies, see Peter Garnsey and R. P. Saller, The Roman Empire: Economy, Society, and Culture (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1987), 126-47; Beryl Rawson, The Family in Ancient Rome: New Perspectives (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1986); Beryl Rawson, Marriage, Divorce, and Children in Ancient Rome (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1991); Veyne, ed., A History of Private Life; and Suzanne Dixon, The Roman Mother (London: Croom Helm, 1988). For Christian motherhood, see Cloke, This Female Man of God, chap. 7.
- 67. "Laudo nuptias, laudo coniugium, sed quia mihi virgines generant": Jerome, Epistle, 22.20 (CSEL 54.170).
- 68. Author's translation of "Romae praetulit Bethlem et auro tecta fulgentia informis luti vilitate mutavit": Jerome, Epistle, 108.1 (CSEL 55[2].306).

- 69. Jerome, Epistle, 108.28.
- 70. Jerome, Epistle, 108.9.
- 71. Jerome, Epistle, 108.4, 31.
- 72. Jerome, Epistle, 108.26.
- 73. Jerome, Epistle, 108.10.
- 74. Jerome, *Epistle*, 108.6.
- 75. According to Dixon (Roman Mother, 65-66), "convention insisted that the bond between mother and child was a fundamental one which had little to do with legal technicalities such as agnatic vs. cognate relationship. The dissolution of the marriage between parents did not exonerate mothers of the duty to provide for the children of that marriage from there own estates." See also her chap. 3, "The Maternal Relationship and Roman Law," 41-47. Dixon notes (42) that Roman women were under no legal obligation to leave their estates to their children.
 - 76. Jerome, Epistle, 108.5, 15, 30.
- 77. Jerome, Epistle, 108.16-17. Roman satirists ridiculed women who squandered familial wealth. See Veyne, ed., History of Private Life, 75.
 - 78. Jerome, Epistle, 108.15.
 - 79. Jerome, Epistle, 108.9.
- 80. "Omnis inopum multitudo matrem et nutricium se perdidisse clamabant": Jerome, Epistle, 108.29 (CSEL 55[2].348)
- 81. For other Roman women's funeral eulogies, see Lefkowitz and Fant, Women's Life in Greece and Rome.
- 82. Author's translation of "Cuncta largita est exheredans se in terra, ut hereditatem inveniret in caelo": Jerome, Epistle, 108.6 (CSEL 55[2].312).
 - 83. Jerome, Epistle, 108.20.
- 84 Author's translation of "Viduae et pauperes in exemplum Dorcadis vestes ab ea praebitas ostendebant": Jerome, Epistle, 108.29 (CSEL 55[2].348)
 - 85. Jerome, Epistle, 108.27.
 - 86. Jerome, Epistle, 108.23-26.
 - 87. Jerome, Epistle, 108.15.
 - 88. "Ossibus mortuorum": Jerome, Epistle, 108.17 (CSEL 55[2].328).
 - 89. Dixon, Roman Mother, 222.
- 90. Roman funerary inscriptions contain similar descriptions of the ideal matron. The funeral eulogy for the first-century BCE matron Murdia, for example, praises her modesty, propriety, chastity, obedience, woolworking, industry, and honor; see Lefkowitz and Fant, Women's Life in Greece and Rome, 139.
- 91. Livy, Ab Urbe Condita, 1.57-59, in Titi Livi ab Urbe Condita, ed. McDonald, 1.57-59. Augustine (De civitate Dei, 1.19) refutes Livy's presentation of Lucretia as the ideal matron because she committed suicide.
- 92. For the Greek text of the vita with a French translation (Denys Gorce, Vie de Sainte Mélanie), see SC 90. For both the Greek and Latin texts of the life and an Italian translation of the Greek vita, see Mariano del Tindaro Rampolla, ed. and trans., Vita Melaniae Junioris. Santa Melania giuniore, senatrice romana: documenti contemporanei e note (Rome: Tipografia Vaticana, 1905). For the English translation, see Clark, Life of Melania the Younger. Clark disagrees with Rampolla, who argues that the Greek text is the earlier of the two. Clark discusses the genre of

the vita (153–70) and provides an extensive discussion of the Greek and Latin texts and the manuscript traditions (1–24). There exists an eighth- or ninth-century manuscript of Melania's vita that intersperses the Roman matron's sacred biography with that of the harlot-saint, Pelagia (see Clark, 3, 178 n. 24). Subsequent citations, unless otherwise noted, are to Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, SC 90.

- 93. Palladius, Historia Lausiaca, 46, 54. Clark (Life of Melania the Younger, 83-92) provides a detailed examination of Melania's family: Melania the Elder was a member of the gens Antonia; Melania the Younger's mother, Albina, was of the Ceionii Rufii clan; and Melania's husband, Pinian, belonged to the Valerii. The elder Melania established two monasteries in Jerusalem between 378 and 380 (Clark, 116).
 - 94. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, Prologue.
 - 95. Clark, Life of Melania the Younger, 85.
 - 96. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 5.
- 97. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 6. Elliott (Spiritual Marriage, 55–56) discusses Melania and Pinian's sexual renunciation.
 - 98. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 8.
 - 99. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 9.
- 100. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 10. As Clark notes (Life of Melania the Younger, 100–101), Severus was probably within his legal right to attempt to control the couple's finances because they were both still minors.
- 101. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 11. Serena was the wife of Stilicho and mother-in-law of the Emperor Honorius; see Clark, Life of Melania the Younger, 101-2.
 - 102. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 12.
 - 103. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 15-17.
- 104. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 18. Clark (Life of Melania the Younger, 190 n. 24.) notes that the Latin life supplements this lavish description by claiming that the estate supported four hundred agricultural slaves. Clark also believes that this particular property could be the couple's Sicilian or Campanian estate (99).
 - 105. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 18.
 - 106. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 19.
 - 107. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 19.
- IO8. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 20. Augustine addresses several letters to Melania, Pinian, and Albina; see Epistles, 124, 125, and 126, CSEL 44(2/3).I-I8.
 - 109. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 21-22.
 - 110. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 22-24.
- III. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 32. The Syrian Father, Baradatus, similarly constructed a small wooden prayer chest; see Theodoret of Cyrrhus, Historia Religiosa, 27.2.
 - 112. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 29, 32.
 - 113. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 35.
- II4. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 35. Gorce (Vie de Sainte Mélanie, 194 n. 1) notes that all of the churches kept poor registries and categorized different levels of poverty.

- 115. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 37. Gorce (Vie de Sainte Mélanie, 197 n.4) says that the liquidation of Melania's property in Spain occurred after the Roman restoration of the province, c. 419.
 - 116. "Hos andra": Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 39, SC 90.198.
- 117. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 40. Melania's cousin was the daughter of Laeta who had married Toxotius, the son of Paula and Toxotius. Jerome wrote his Epistle 107 to Laeta on the subject of "little Paula's" Christian education. See Gorce, Vie de Sainte Mélanie, 204 n.1; and Clark, Life of Melania the Younger, 243 n. 72.
 - 118. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 40.
 - 119. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 41.
 - 120. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 41-47.
 - 121. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 48.
 - 122. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 49.
- 123. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 50-55. Clark (Life of Melania the Younger, 129) and Gorce (Vie de Sainte Mélanie, 224-25 n. 1) detail Volusian's biography. See also Cloke, This Female Man of God, 183.
- 124. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 52. Gorce (Vie de Sainte Mélanie, 227 n. 3) discusses this rather unusual "miracle" and cites the Theodosiana Libri XVI, 8.5.1.4, for the legal technicality involved.
 - 125. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 59-61.
- 126. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 54-57. See Cloke, This Female Man of God, 184.
 - 127. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 58.
 - 128. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 63.
- 129. For the date of Melania's death, see Clark, Life of Melania the Younger, 140.
- 130. "Andra prophetikon charisma": Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 34, SC 90.190.
- 131. Clark (Women in Late Antiquity, 115-16) discusses Melania's ascetic clothing.
- 132. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 69. See also Clark, Women in Late Antiquity, 116.
 - 133. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 11.
 - 134. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 31.
 - 135. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 62.
- 136. Hunt (Holy Land Pilgrimage, 138) states that the 120,000 solidi is the equivalent of approximately 1,700 pounds of gold. The Greek text of the life says that the 120,000 gold coins was Pinian's income, but the Latin text claims it belonged to Melania (see Clark, Life of Melania the Younger, 95). Clark (96) also points out that the wealthiest senators possessed incomes of approximately 4,000 pounds of gold. Hunt notes that Melania's liquidation of her estates in the West was "carried out in the 'teeth' of the Gothic raids" (139) with the calculated purpose of preventing them from falling into Alaric's hands. The correspondences between Augustine of Hippo and Melania, Pinian, and Albina suggest that the Roman saints chose to leave North Africa not on account of spiritual reasons but because of the threat of a Vandal incursion; see Augustine, Epistle, 126. Augustine suggests that it

was Pinian who worried about the Vandal menace, and that when Melania interjected that it was also the climate that made them want to abandon Thagaste, Pinian silenced her.

- 137. Brown (Cult of the Saints, 34-35) discusses the "privatization" of the holy in late antique North Africa. Cloke (This Female Man of God, 173) notes late Roman aristocratic women privately control the church in a manner reminiscient of the later medieval practice of Eigenkirchen, or lay dynastic control of church property.
- 138. Clark (*Life of Melania the Younger*, 189 n. 6) notes that the Latin version of the *vita* adds that Melania bribed her father's eunuchs not to report that she spent the entire night in prayer while she was pregnant.
 - 139. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 52.
- 140. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 17. Augustine (De sancta virginitate, 9, PL 40.400) warns wealthy women that riches do not guarantee salvation: "Quid enim si aliqua mulier dives multam pecuniam huic bono operi impendat, ut emat ex diversis gentibus servos quos faciat christianos; nonne uberius atque numerosius quam uteri quantalibet feracitate Christi membra gignenda curabit? Nec ideo tamen pecuniam suam comparare muneri sacrae virginitatis audebit." Peter Brown has argued that the male ecclesiastical hierarchy's reliance on the financial support of patrician women such as Melania was simultaneously imperative and embarrassing; see Brown, "Church and Leadership," in History of Private Life, ed. Veyne, 279.
- 141. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 38. Palladius's Historia Lausiaca (58.2) also contains an instance where Melania tries to give five hundred gold coins to the hermit Dorotheus.
- 142. Gerontius, Vita S. Melaniae Iunioris, 38, SC 90.198. Clark (Life of Melania the Younger, 53) translates this as a "spiritual ruse." Gorce (Vie de Sainte Mélanie, 199) translates the Greek as "un subterfuge tout spirituel." Cloke (This Female Man of God, 178) discusses this unusual passage.
- 143. Brown argues that women remained marginal figures within the eastern ascetic experience because "the life of the 'brides of Christ' always lay a little to the one side of the great myth of the desert that had given new meaning to male asceticism in Egypt and elsewhere" (Body and Society, 262).
- 144. For example, in Palladius's *Historia Lausiaca* (35.14–15), a wealthy woman, Poimenia, visited Abba John of Lycopolis. The great abba warned her not to travel to Alexandria, but she ignored his advice and continued on to the metropolis. When her entourage landed at Alexandria, they were attacked by thieves who "cut off the finger of a eunuch; another one they killed; not recognizing the saintly bishop Dionysius, they doused him in the river. After they had wounded all the other servants, they insulted and threatened Poimenia"; translation from Russell, *Lausiac History*, 103.

Chapter 6

I. See Proverbs 31.10-31; I Kings 17.8-13; 2 Kings 4.8-10; Mark 1.30-31; Matthew 8.14-15; Luke 4.38-39; Acts 9.36-41, 16.14-15.

- 2. Author's translation of "Languidis autem et caecis non cessabat ipsa cibos cum cocleare porrigere, hoc praesentibus duabus, sed se sola serviente, ut nova Martha satageret donec potulenti fratres laeti fierent conviviis": Fortunatus, *De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I*, 17 (MGH SRM 2.370).
- 3. For an overview of Merovingian hagiography, see Paul Fouracre, "Merovingian History and Merovingian Hagiography," Past and Present 127 (1990): 3–38. Fouracre asserts that the Merovingian period produced more saints' lives "than in any other comparable period in the post-Constantinian church" (9). See Graus, Volk, Herrscher und Heiliger im Reich der Merowinger; Jo Ann McNamara, "A Legacy of Miracles: Hagiography and Nunneries in Merovingian Gaul," in Women of the Medieval World, ed. Julius Kirshner and Suzanne F. Wemple (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1985), 36–52; Friedrich Prinz, Askese und Kultur: vor- und frühbenediktinisches Mönchtum an der Wiege Europas (Munich: C. H. Beck, 1980), 75–86; and Heinzelmann, "Neue Aspekte der biographischen und hagiographischen Literatur," 27–44.
- 4. Wemple (*Women in Frankish Society*, 28) argues that Frankish legal, narrative, and archaeological sources all point to the domestication of women's sanctity in the West.
- 5. See Paxton, Christianizing Death, 47. For monasticism in early Francia, see Friedrich Prinz, Frühes Mönchtum im Frankenreich (Munich: R. Oldenbourg, 1965), particularly 19–117; Eugen Ewig, Die Merowinger und das Frankenreich (Stuttgart: W. Kohlhammer, 1988); Eugen Ewig, Spätantikes und fränkisches Gallien, 2 vols. (Munich: Artemis Verlag, 1976–1979); Joachim Werner and Eugen Ewig, Von der Spätantike zum Frühen Mittelalter: Aktuelle Probleme in historischer und archäologischer Sicht (Sigmarigen: Jan Thorbecke, 1979); Ian Wood, The Merovingian Kingdoms, 450–751 (London: Longman, 1994), 181–202; and Van Dam, Leadership and Community in Late Antique Gaul.
- 6. See Fouracre, "Merovingian History and Merovingian Hagiography," 3-4, 9, 10; and Wood, *The Merovingian Kingdoms*, 1, for a discussion of the terms, "Merovingian," "Francia," and "Gaul." See also Prinz, *Frühes Mönchtum im Frankenreich*, 489-93.
- 7. Such Gallo-Roman aristocrats included Honoratus of Arles, John Cassian, and Victor of Marseilles; see Wood, *Merovingian Kingdoms*, 22ff.
- 8. Marmoutier is located approximately two miles from Tours. Martin lived in this "Gallic desert" with eighty disciples. Ligugé is approximately five miles from Poitiers. See Sulpicius Severus, Vita S. Martini, 7, 10. For a discussion of the geographic sites connected with the Life of Martin, see Sharon Farmer, Communities of Saint Martin: Legend and Ritual in Medieval Tours (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1991), chap. 1.
- 9. For the history of women's monasticism in France, see Penelope D. Johnson, *Equal in Monastic Profession: Religious Women in Medieval France* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991).
- 10. Geary (Before France and Germany, 43) cites the women associated with Caesarius's rule. For a detailed discussion of the rule, see Vogüé, "La Règle de Césaire d'Arles pour les moines," 369-406. For a discussion of the social and economic aspects of the regula, see Jo Ann McNamara, "A Legacy of Miracles," 40. For a general discussion of the women's rule, see Klingshirn, Caesarius of Arles, 117-

- 24; Wood, Merovingian Kingdoms, 182; Donald Hochstetler, "The Meaning of Monastic Cloister for Women According to Caesarius of Arles," in Religion, Culture, and Society in the Early Middle Ages, ed. Thomas F. X. Noble and John J. Contreni (Kalamazoo, Mich.: Medieval Institute Publications, 1987), 27-40; and Prinz, Frühes Mönchtum, 76-84.
- II. Wemple (Women in Frankish Society, 154ff) discusses the origins of women's monasticism in Gaul; McNamara ("A Legacy of Miracles," 36–52) examines the social world of the Merovingian convent, as does Jane T. Schulenberg, "Strict Active Enclosure and Its Effects on the Female Monastic Experience, 500-1000," in Distant Echoes, ed. Nichols and Shank, 1.51–86.
- 12. Janet Nelson, "Queens as Jezebels: The Careers of Brunhild and Balthild in Merovingian History," in *Medieval Women*, ed. Derek Baker (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1978), 31-78.
 - 13. McNamara, "A Legacy of Miracles," 40-41.
- 14. Gregory of Tours, *Decem libri historiarum*, 2.43, and *Gloria Confessorum*, 89. See the late ninth- or early tenth-century vita of the queen, Vita S. Chrothildis reginae francorum. The Carolingians present the queen as the Augusta of Gaul and the mother of the Frankish peoples. For Chlotild's patronage of the cult of Genovefa, see Van Dam, Saints and Their Miracles, 24.
- 15. For Chlotild, see Gregory of Tours, De virtutibus sancti Martini episcopi, 7; for Papula, see Gregory of Tours, Gloria Confessorum, 16; for Ingitrude, see Gregory of Tours, Decem libri historiarum, 5.21, 9.33, 10.12; and for Ultragotha, see Gregory of Tours, De virtutibus sancti Martini episcopi, 1.12. See also McNamara and Halborg, with Whatley, Sainted Women of the Dark Ages, 52-53.
- 16. Van Dam, Saints and Their Miracles, 30ff. See also McNamara, "A Legacy of Miracles," 39.
- 17. Gregory of Tours, Liber vitae patrum, ed. Bruno Krusch, MGH SRM 1.2.211-94. English translation by Edward James, Gregory of Tours, Lives of the Fathers, Translated Texts for Historians Latin Series I (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 1986). Krusch believed that Monegund's vita (Liber vitae patrum, 19) was composed prior to 587. Gregory of Tours also included an abbreviated version of Monegund's life in his Gloria Confessorum, 24.
- 18. Geary (Before France and Germany, 124) points out that thirteen out of eighteen bishops of Tours had come from Gregory's family. Prinz (Frühes Mönchtum, 37) discusses the cult of Monegund within the larger context of the spread of the veneration of Saint Martin.
 - 19. Gregory of Tours, Liber vitae patrum, 19.2.
- 20. McNamara and Halborg, with Whatley, Sainted Women of the Dark Ages, 51.
 - 21. Gregory of Tours, Liber vitae patrum, 19.1.
 - 22. Gregory of Tours, Liber vitae patrum, 19.1.
- 23. James (*Lives of the Fathers*, 120 n. 4) states that the basilica at Evena was built by Bishop Perpetuus of Tours (c. 460-490). Médard died c. 557/558.
 - 24. Gregory of Tours, Liber vitae patrum, 19.2.
- 25. "Quas vulgo mattas vocant": Gregory of Tours, *Liber vitae patrum*, 19.2 (MGH SRM 1.2.288). See also Benedict of Nursia, *Regula Sancti Benedictii*, 55.13;

James (*Lives of the Fathers*, 124 n. 9) says that a charter of 1031 records the existence of this small community. After that, all trace of Monegund's establishment disappears, but her relics were transferred to St.-Pierre-le-Puellier.

- 26. Sulpicius Severus describes the ex-soldier Martin's new spiritual weapons as healing with prayer and oil; see *Vita S. Martini*, 16.
- 27. Gregory of Tours, Liber vitae patrum, 19.1; and Constantius of Lyons, Vita Germani episcopi Autissiodorensis, 3.
- 28. Bynum discusses this traditional feminine imagery throughout Holy Feast and Holy Fast.
- 29. "Ad stabulum medicinae caelestis": Gregory of Tours, Liber vitae patrum, 19, Prologue (MGH SRM 1.2.286).
- 30. Author's translation of "hauriretque de fonte sacerdotali, quo possit aditum nemoris paradisiaci recludere": Gregory of Tours, *Liber vitae patrum*, 19, Prologue (MGH SRM 1.2.286).
 - 31. Gregory of Tours, Liber vitae patrum, 19.1.
- 32. Kelly (*Devil at Baptism*, III-I2) discusses the use of salt and oil in early baptism and exorcism.
 - 33. Gregory of Tours, Liber vitae patrum, 19.4.
 - 34. Kelly, Devil at Baptism, 116-17.
 - 35. See Van Dam, Saints and Their Miracles, 102.
- 36. Gregory of Tours, Liber vitae patrum, 19.3; translation from James, Lives of the Fathers, 123.
- 37. "Sanctum Martinum antestitem pastorem magnum": Gregory of Tours, Liber vitae patrum, 19.4 (MGH SRM 1.2.289).
- 38. Gregory of Tours, Liber vitae patrum, 19.4; translation from James, Lives of the Fathers, 124.
 - 39. Gregory of Tours, Liber vitae patrum, 19, Prologue.
 - 40. Gregory of Tours, Liber vitae patrum, 19.4.
 - 41. Gregory of Tours, Liber vitae patrum, 19.4.
- 42. McNamara ("A Legacy of Miracles," 41) discusses Monegund's spiritual transformation from independent ascetic to mother of a community at Tours.
- 43. For the textual and manuscript tradition, see Bruno Krusch's introduction to Fortunatus's and Baudonivia's vitae (MGH SRM 2.358-64). Krusch dates Baudonivia's text between 609 and 614. Gregory of Tours includes Radegund in his hagiographical accounts of Christian confessors in the Liber in Gloria Confessorum, 104. There exists an extensive secondary literature on the life and cult of Radegund of Poitiers. See Wood, The Merovingian Kingdoms, 136-39; Van Dam, Saints and Their Miracles, 30ff; Isabel Moreira, "Provisatrix optima: St. Radegund of Poitiers' relic petitions to the East," Journal of Medieval History 19 (1993): 285-305; Carrasco, "Spirituality in Context," 414-35; Cristina Papa, "Radegund e Bathilde: modele di santità regia feminile nel regno merovingia," Benedictina 36 (1989): 13-33; Sabine Gåbe, "Radegundis: sancta, regina, ancilla. Zum Heiligkeitsideal der Radegundisviten von Fortunat und Baudonivia," Francia 16 (1989): 1-30; Wemple, Women in Frankish Society, 181-85; Peter Dronke, Women Writers of the Middle Ages (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984), 27-28; Graus, Volk, Herrscher und Heiliger im Reich der Merowinger, 407-10; Louise Coudanne, "Baudonivie,

moniale de Sainte Croix et sa biographe de sainte Radegond," Études mérovingiennes: Actes des Journées de Poitiers (Paris: A. et J. Picard, 1953), 45-51; Étienne Delaruelle, "Sainte Radegonde de Poitiers, son type de sainteté et la chrétienté de son temps," Études mérovingiennes: Actes des Journées de Poitiers (Paris: A. et J. Picard, 1953), 64-74; D. Tardi, Fortunat: Étude sur un dernier représentant de la poésie latine dans la Gaule mérovingienne (Paris: Boivin et Cie, 1927); and René Aigrain, Sainte Radegonde vers 520-587 (Poitiers: Éditions des Cordeliers, 1917).

- 44. Smith, "Female Sanctity in Carolingian Europe," 13, notes that Fortunatus's vita was one of three that circulated widely in medieval Europe. Radegund's cultus also experienced a "renaissance" in the eleventh century, both in France and in England. For a discussion of the late eleventh-century Poitiers illustrated vitae of Radegund see Carrasco, "Spirituality in Context," and "Sanctity and Experience in Pictorial Hagiography: Two Illustrated Lives of Saints from Romanesque France," in Images of Sainthood in Medieval Europe, ed. Blumenfeld-Kosinski and Szell, 33–66; as well as Emile Ginot, "Le Manuscrit de sainte Radegonde de Poitiers et ses peintures du onzième siècle," Bulletin de la Société Française de Reproductions de Manuscrits à Peintures 4 (1914–1920): 9–80.
- 45. For the life of the Italian poet, see Brian Brennan, "The Career of Venantius Fortunatus," *Traditio* 41 (1985): 49–78. Brennan (78) states that Fortunatus had become bishop of Poitiers by 594. See also Judith W. George, *Venantius Fortunatus: A Poet in Merovingian Gaul* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1992). Prinz (*Frühes Mönchtum*, 485) asserts that Fortunatus's *Radegundisvita* established a new type of dynastic saint's life which fused nobility and holiness, and that this model would influence subsequent portrayals of medieval saints.
- 46. Prinz (*Frühes Mönchtum*, 157–58) discusses Radegund's contribution to Frankish monasticism.
- 47. Gregory of Tours, Decem libri historiarum, 3.4; Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 2.
- 48. McNamara and Halborg, with Whatley (Sainted Women of the Dark Ages, 71 n. 33) note that Athiès later became part of Radegund's Morgengabe.
 - 49. Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 2.
- 50. "Manu superposita, consecravit diaconam": Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 12 (MGH SRM 2.368).
- 51. Fortunatus neglects to discuss the foundation of the institution of Holy Cross. McNamara and Halborg, with Whatley (Sainted Women of the Dark Ages, 79 n. 66) believe that Fortunatus found the whole affair "too unfavorable to King Chlotar."
 - 52. Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 24.
- 53. See McNamara and Halborg, with Whatley, Sainted Women of the Dark Ages, 81 n. 71.
- 54. Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 2. Karen Jo Torjesen, ("Reconstruction of Women's Early Christian History," in Searching the Scriptures, ed. Schüssler-Fiorenza, 294) discusses architectural and artistic depictions of women ministering the eucharist at the table. See also Dorothy Irvin, "The Ministry of Women in the Early Church: The Archaeological Evidence," Duke Theological Review 2 (1980), 76-86.
 - 55. Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 5.

- 56. The text reads two sestaria. McNamara et al. (79 n. 67) say that one sestarius is approximately a pint.
 - 57. Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 25.
- 58. Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 22. Similarly, Germanus of Auxerre (Constantius, Vita Germani episcopi Autissiodorensis, 4) and Monegund (Gregory of Tours, Liber vitae patrum, 19.2) slept on ascetic bedding.
- 59. "Quia non essent persecutionis tempora, a se ut fieret martyra": Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 26 (MGH SRM 2.373).
 - 60. Radegund sites in England and Austria are often associated with baths.
- 61. Kelly (Devil at Baptism, 116–17) provides a theological interpretation of each of the rituals: the anointing of the ears means that holiness comes from the word of God; the anointing of the nostrils allows the catechumen to breathe in the Christian life; the anointing of the breast results in a "pure heart"; the naked body of the catechumen signifies the death of the flesh; the three immersions in water symbolize the trinity and the resurrection of Christ on the third day; and the reclothing of the Christian in white linen parallels the transfiguration of Christ.
- 62. Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 18. Carrasco ("Spirituality in Context," 424-25) discusses the liturgical images from the Romanesque illustrated life of Radegund.

63. For a discussion of the Germanic Raubehe, see Wemple, Women in Frankish Society, 12-14, 33-35.

- 64. "Tantum ne Christo vilesceret": Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 5 (MGH SRM 2.367). Elliott (Spiritual Marriage, 41, 66) discusses "the alleged incompatibility of prayer and normal conjugal relationships" as well as the hagiographical motif of married women who heroically attempt to preserve their yows of chastity.
- 65. See Wemple, Women in Frankish Society, 136-43; and McNamara et al., Sainted Women of the Dark Ages, 75 n. 53.
- 66. Elliott (*Spiritual Marriage*, 79 n. 108) observes that Médard may have hesitated to consecrate Radegund because repudiation of a spouse was "a male prerogative."
- 67. They may have also implied that the independent Radegund was a whore, though the Latin is a bit obscure concerning this point. "Ut praesumeret principi subducere reginam non publicanam, sed publicam": Fortunatus, *De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I*, 12 (MGH SRM 2.368).
- 68. "De qua regi dicebatur, habere se potius iugalem monacham quam reginam": Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 5 (MGH SRM 2.367).
- 69. "Hoc etiam praemeditans cum Samuele parvulo clerico gerebat": Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 2 (MGH SRM 2.365).
- 70. Domnolenus is referred to as a tribunus fisci: Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 38 (MGH SRM 2.376).
- 71. For the detailed accounts of her charitable donations, see Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 13, 14, 17. In fifth-century Ireland, the missionary Patrick returned the jewelry placed on his altar by zealous women in order to protect his reputation as a celibate holy man. "Virginibus Christi et mulieribus religiosis, quae mihi ultronea munuscula donabant et super altare iactabant ex ornamentis suis et iterum reddebam illis et adversus me scandalizabantur cur hoc

faciebam": Patrick, Confessio, 49, St. Patrick: His Writings and Muirchú's Life, ed. A. B. E. Hood (London: Phillimore, 1978), 32.

- 72. Fortunatus, *De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I*, 10–11. Radegund's prayer destroys the chains of the prisoners at Péronne in imitation of Acts (12.7), where an angel miraculously frees the Apostle Peter from prison.
- 73. "Mutata veste": Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 12 (MGH SRM 2.368).
- 74. "Conposito, sermone ut loquar barbaro, stapione, camisas, manicas, cofias, fibulas, cuncta auro, quaedam gemmis exornata per circulum, sibi profutura sancto tradit altario": Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 13 (MGH SRM 2.369). McNamara and Halborg, with Whatley (Sainted Women of the Dark Ages, 76 n. 55) discuss the rather puzzling word stapione and conclude that it may be slang for "dressed for stepping out." For a discussion of the queen's aristocratic dress, see Herlihy, Opera Muliebria, 39; Ewig, Die Merowinger und das Frankenreich, 79; Lina Eckenstein, Woman Under Monasticism: Chapters on Saint-Lore and Convent Life Between A.D. 500 and A.D. 1500 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1896), 54ff; on Merovingian dress in general, see Phyllis Tortora and Keith Eubank, A Survey of Historic Costume (New York: Fairchild Publications, 1989), 67ff; Edith Ennen, The Medieval Woman, trans. Edmund Jephcott (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1989), 50–51. See Wemple (Women in Frankish Society, 47) on the archaeological evidence for Merovingian women's aristocratic clothing and jewelry.
- 75. "Mox indumentum nobile, quo celeberrima die solebat, pompa comitante, regina procedere, exuta ponit in altare et blattis, gemmis, ornamentis mensam divinae gloriae tot donis onerat per honorem": Fortunatus, *De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I*, 13 (MGH SRM 2.369).
- 76. "Ergo casu dum glomus, quem sancta filaverat, perpenderet de camera, veniens sorix, ut tangeret, antequam filum incideret, mortuus in morsu pependit": Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 30 (MGH SRM 2.374). Meyer Shapiro ("'Muscipula Diaboli': The Symbolism of the Mérode Altarpiece," Art Bulletin 27 (1945): 182-87) points out that a mousetrap is symbolic of the crucifixion. According to Augustine (Sermon 263 in PL 38.1210), the cross is a mousetrap for the devil. Radegund therefore may be using her spindle symbolically to "catch the devil." For the spindle as symbolic of women's chastity, see Herlihy, Opera Muliebria, 1-12. The book of Leviticus (11.29), early medieval church legislation, and hagiographical texts all portrayed mice as unclean. For example, the holy woman Glodesind's body was defiled by a mouse; see the ninth-century Vita S. Glodesindae, 17.
 - 77. Sulpicius Severus, Vita S. Martini, 2.
- 78. Fortunatus, *De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I*, 19. Fortunatus uses the diminutive form for all the utensils—little knives, little drinking vessels, and little napkins.
 - 79. Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 8.
 - 80. Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 17.
- 81. The female hagiographer notes in her preface that she will focus on those events not covered in the *vita* by the Bishop Fortunatus. "Non ea quae vir apostolicus Fortunatus episcopus de beatae vita conposuit iteramus": Baudonivia, *De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber II*, Prologue (MGH SRM 2.378).

- 82. Brown (Society and the Holy, 222-50) details the western episcopacy's arbitration of saintly power through its control of relics and shrines. Baudonivia's Radegund fits Brown's model for a pastoral saint of early medieval Gaul. Eugen Ewig ("Die Merowinger und das Imperium," in Rheinisch-Westfälische Akademie der Wissenschaften [Düsseldorf: Westdeutscher Verlag, 1983], 28) discusses Radegund's relationship with the eastern empire vis-à-vis the procurement of the relic of the holy cross.
- 83. E. Gordon Whatley ("An Early Literary Quotation from the *Inventio S. Crucis*: A Note on Baudonivia's *Vita S. Radegundis* [BHL 7049]," *Analecta Bollandiana* III [1993]: 81–91) asserts that Baudonivia's *vita* includes the earliest reference to the *inventio* north of the Alps. He also argues (89) that Baudonivia eliminates the male roles from the original Helena legends and emphasizes the empresses's independent actions.
 - 84. Baudonivia, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber II, 1.
 - 85. Baudonivia, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber II, 7.
- 86. Baudonivia, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber II, 2. On Martin's destruction of a pagan shrine, see Sulpicius Severus, Vita S. Martini, 13.
- 87. Fortunatus writes several poems about Radegund and the wood of the cross. For a discussion of Radegund and Fortunatus's poetry, see George, *Venantius Fortunatus*, 161–78.
- 88. "Quod fecit illa in orientali patria, hoc fecit beata Radegundis in Gallia": Baudonivia, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber II, 16 (MGH SRM 2.388).
- 89. Baudonivia, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber II, 16, 23. For a discussion of the conflict between Radegund and Bishop Maroveus, see Van Dam, Saints and Their Miracles, 30-41; and Wood, Merovingian Kingdoms, 138-39.
 - 90. Baudonivia, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber II, 18.
 - 91. Baudonivia, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber II, 26, 28.
 - 92. Baudonivia, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber II, 8.
 - 93. Baudonivia, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber II, 10.
- 94. Vita S. Balthildis, 18, ed. Bruno Krusch, MGH SRM 2.482-508. For a textual commentary, see Paul Fouracre and Richard A. Gerberding, Late Merovingian France: History and Hagiography, 640-720 (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1996), 97-118. Fouracre and Gerberding believe that the Vita (A) was written c. 690.
- 95. Wood (*Merovingian Kingdoms*, 139) refers to Balthild as "the most influential queen of the seventh century." Fouracre and Gerberding (*Late Merovingian France*, 102) argue that Balthild was probably from a royal Anglo-Saxon background and not a lower-class one as her hagiographer maintains.
- 96. For discussions of her church reform, see Wood, Merovingian Kingdoms, 198–202; Eugen Ewig, "Das Privileg des Bischofs Berthefrid von Amiens für Corbie von 664 und die Klosterpolitik der Königin Balthild," Francia I (1973): 62–114, esp. 106–114, on Balthild's Klosterpolitik. See also Prinz, Frühes Mönchtum, 136–37, 274–75, 293, 520. Prinz believes that Balthild played a direct role in the development of Benedictine-Columbanan monasticism in Merovingian Gaul. Nelson ("Queens as Jezebels," 69) and Ewig (112) argue that Balthild may have been responsible for the acquisition of the famous Martin capella for the royal relic collection.
 - 97. Vita S. Balthildis, 5.

98. For the Hausherrschaft model, see Janet Nelson, "Queens as Jezebels," 52, 60, 74.

99. See, for example, Stephanus, Vita Sancti Wilfrithi episcopi, 6 (c. 710). See

also Wood, Merovingian Kingdoms, 139, 199.

- 100. Balthild's hagiographer suggests (Vita S. Balthildis, 10) that the nuns were not immediately convinced of the validity of Balthild's ascetic vocation. Nelson ("Queens as Jezebels," 51-52) believes that Balthild's forced exile at Chelles corresponded with her son Chlotar's "coming of age." She also argues that Balthild's retirement demonstrates the "precarious position of a queen-mother in seventh-century Francia" (52).
 - 101. Nelson, "Queens as Jezebels," 46.
- 102. Vita S. Balthildis, 1. For Erchinoald, see McNamara and Halborg, with Whatley, Sainted Women of the Dark Ages, 269 n. 24; and Horst von Ebling, Prosopographie der Amtsträger des Merowingerreiches von Chlotar III, 613, bis Karl Martell, 741, Beiheft der Francia 2 (Munich: Wilhelm Fink Verlag, 1974), 137-38.
 - 103. Vita S. Balthildis, 3. Nelson, "Queens as Jezebels," 47.
 - 104. Vita S. Balthildis, 4.
- 105. Vita S. Balthildis, 6-9. The cults included those of Saint Denis, Germanus, Médard, Peter, Anianus, and Martin. Nelson ("Queens as Jezebels," 69) points out that these were almost all of the major cultic sites of seventh-century Gaul.
- 106. Vita S. Balthildis, 10. Bertilla is a saint in her own right; see Vita Bertilae abbatissae Calensis, MGH SRM 4.534-46; and McNamara and Halborg, with Whatley, Sainted Women of the Dark Ages, 280-88. For the date of Balthild's holy retirement, see Nelson, "Queens as Jezebels," 51. According to Nelson (69) the abbess and nuns were originally from Jouarre.
 - 107. Vita S. Balthildis, 16.
- 108. Vita S. Balthildis, 3; translation from McNamara and Halborg, with Whatley, Sainted Women of the Dark Ages, 269.
 - 109. See Nelson, "Queens as Jezebels," 46.
 - 110. Vita S. Balthildis, 4.
- III. Vita S. Balthildis, 4. Ewig (Die Merowinger und das Frankenreich, 157) describes Genesius as a "grand aumônier." See also, Nelson, "Queens as Jezebels,"
- 112. Vita S. Balthildis, 8. For the parallel text in the life of Radegund, see Fortunatus, De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber I, 13.
- 113. Her sons are Chlotar III, Childeric, and Theuderic; see Vita S. Balthildis, 5. Nelson ("Queens as Jezebels," 50-51) discusses Balthild as a peacemaker.
- 114. Vita S. Balthildis, 7. See McNamara and Halborg, with Whatley, Sainted Women of the Dark Ages, 271 n. 34.
- 115. Vita S. Balthildis, 10. For Sigobrand, see McNamara and Halborg, with Whatley, Sainted Women of the Dark Ages, 273 n. 46; Nelson, "Queens as Jezebels," 70; and Ewig, Die Merowinger und das Frankenreich, 159.
 - 116. Nelson, "Queens as Jezebels," 61-63.
- 117. Vita S. Balthildis, 11; translation from McNamara and Halborg, with Whatley, Sainted Women of the Dark Ages, 274.
 - 118. Vita S. Balthildis, 13.

- 119. "Ut vera monacha": Vita S. Balthildis, 19 (MGH SRM 2.507).
- 120. Also discussed by Wemple, Women in Frankish Society, 67.
- 121. See Nelson, "Queens as Jezebels," 50-51.
- 122. Vita S. Chrothildis reginae francorum, 6; translation from McNamara and Halborg, with Whatley, 43. Gregory of Tours (Decem libri historiarum, 2.29) also emphasizes Chlotild's role in the conversion of the Franks. The image of Chlotild as the mediatrix gratiae for barbarian tribes is reproduced in other famous early medieval histories, including Bede's Historia ecclesiatica gentis Anglorum.

123. Stephanus, Vita Sancti Wilfrithi episcopi, 6; translation from Colgrave,

Life of Bishop Wilfrid, 15.

124. Colgrave (Life of Bishop Wilfrid, 154 note to Vita, 6) contends that Balthild may have been present at the execution and, because she was an Anglo-Saxon, she spared Wilfrid's life. See also Wood, Merovingian Kingdoms, 201; and Nelson, "Queens as Jezebels," 63-66. All three of these sources note that Stephanus confuses the figure of Dalfinus, who was the count of Lyons and brother of the archbishop Aunemundus. Colgrave (Life of Bishop Wilfrid, 154) points out that at least one ninth-century manuscript edition of the text names Brunhild (Brunechild) as the persecuting queen.

125. William Trent Foley (Images of Sanctity in Eddius Stephanus's Life of Bishop Wilfrid, an Early English Saint's Life [Lewiston, N.Y.: Edwin Mellen Press, 1992], 32-33) argues that Stephanus sets up Dalfinus and Wilfrid as father and son to parallel them with Abraham and Isaac. He further believes that Wilfrid's desire for martyrdom is a hagiographical recreation of Abraham's attempted sacrifice of Isaac, and that Wilfrid, like Isaac, is spared so that he can serve as the redeemer of Northumbria, just as Isaac, according to Christian exegesis, is the Hebrew redeemer of Israel. Foley also points out that Balthild's persecution of the holy Wilfrid foreshadows his later tribulations at the hands of the Northumbrians.

126. Similarly, Procopius of Caesaria's Anekdota vilifies the sixth-century Byzantine empress, Theodora. See Averil Cameron, Procopius and the Sixth Century (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1985), chap. 5, "Procopius and Theodora."

- 127. The eighth-century life of Balthild's abbess, Bertilla of Chelles (Vita Bertilae, abbatissae Calensis), similarly promotes the cloister and its monastic regula. McNamara ("A Legacy of Miracles," 36-52) discusses the financial realities of women's communities and the necessity of promoting the posthumous cults of sanctified nuns.
- 128. "Reliquid sanctum exemplum sequentibus humilitatis et patientiae, mansuetudinis et plenissime dilectionis studium immoque infinitae misericordiae astutaeque prudentiae vigilantiam et confessionem puritatis": Vitae S. Balthildis, 16 (MGH SRM 2.502-503); translation from McNamara and Halborg, with Whatley, Sainted Women of the Dark Ages, 276. The vita Genovefa (Vita S. Genovefae, 15) contains the stereotypical virtues of the female saint: faith, abstinence, patience, magnanimity, simplicity, innocence, concord, charity, discipline, chastity, truth, and prudence (see McNamara and Halborg, with Whatley, Sainted Women of the Dark Ages, 24-25 n. 26). The author of Genovefa's life claims that these precepts of feminine piety are from the Shepherd of Hermas, Book 3, Similtude, 9.15.
 - 129. Discussed by Carrasco, "Spirituality in Context," 414-35.

Conclusion

- 1. Vulgate reads "Itaque cum recubuisset ille supra pectus Iesu, dicit ei: Domine, quis est?" (John 13.25).
 - 2. Haskins, Mary Magdalene, 43.
- 3. David Anderson, translator, St. John of Damasus, On the Divine Images: Three Apologies Against Those Who Attack the Divine Images (Crestwood, N.Y.: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1980), 46, 105-6.
 - 4. See Elliott, Spiritual Marriage, 247.
- 5. Duane J. Osheim, "The Place of Women in the Late Medieval Italian Church," in *That Gentle Strength*, ed. Coon, Haldane, and Sommer, 83-84.
- 6. On separate spheres for women in the nineteenth century, see Carroll Smith-Rosenberg, "The Female World of Love and Ritual: Relations Between Women in Nineteenth-Century America," Signs I (1975): I-29.
- 7. On the role of women in voluntary reform organizations, see Anne Firor Scott, "On Seeing and Not Seeing: A Case of Historical Invisibility," Journal of American History 71 (1984): 7-21. For the religious context of nineteenth- and twentieth-century reform, see John M. Mecklin, The Passing of the Saint: A Study of a Cultural Type (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1941), and Elizabeth Anne Payne, Reform, Labor, and Feminism: Margaret Dreier Robins and the Women's Trade Union League (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1988), 180-84.
- 8. Louise Roberts, "Samson and Delilah Revisited: The Politics of Women's Fashions in 1920s France," *American Historical Review* 98 (1993): 657–84.
- 9. Vita S. Maria Aegyptiacae, Meretricis, 14; translation from Ward, Harlots of the Desert, 45.

Bibliography

PRIMARY SOURCES

Acta Inquisitionis de virtutibus et miraculis sanctae Hildegardis. PL 197.131–140. Ambrose. De obitu Theodosii oratio. CSEL 73(7).371–401.

Apophthegmata Patrum. PG 65.71-440. English translation by Benedicta Ward.

The Desert Christian: Sayings of the Desert Fathers, The Alphabetical Collection.

New York: Macmillan, 1975.

Athanasius of Alexandria. Vita Antonii. PG 26.835-976. English translation by Robert C. Gregg. The Life of Antony and the Letter to Marcellinus. Classics of Western Spirituality Series. New York: Paulist Press, 1980.

Augustine. De civitate Dei (City of God). CC 47-48.

— De sancta virginitate. PL 40.397-428.

_____. Epistolae. CSEL 34, 44, 57, 58, 88.

_____. Sermones. PL 38-39.

Baudonivia. De Vita Sanctae Radegundis Liber II. Edited by Bruno Krusch. MGH SRM 2.377-95.

Bede, The Venerable. *Historia ecclesiastica gentis Anglorum*. Edited by Bertram Colgrave and R. A. B. Mynors. Oxford Medieval Texts Series 3. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1969.

Benedict of Nursia. *Regula Sancti Benedictii*. Latin text with French translation by Adalbert de Vogüé. SC 181–86.

Caesarius of Arles. Regula Virginum. Latin text with French translation by Adalbert de Vogüé and Joel Courreau. SC 345. English translation available in Maria Caritas McCarthy. The Rule for Nuns of Caesarius of Arles. Washington, D.C.: Catholic University Press, 1960.

_____. Sermones. CC 103-104.

Cassian. Conlationes (Conferences). CSEL 13.

. Institutiones coenobiorum (Institutes). CSEL 17.

Cicero. M. Tulii Ciceronis Epistulae. 3 vols. Edited by W. S. Watt. Scriptorum Classicorum Bibliotheca Oxoniensis Series. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1901.

Codices Latini Antiquiores: A Paleographical Guide to Latin Manuscripts Prior to the Ninth Century. Compiled by E. A. Lowe. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1934.

Concilia Galliae, a.314-a.506. Edited by Charles Munier. CC 148.

Concilia Galliae, a 511-a.695. Edited by Caroli De Clercq. CC 148(A).

Constantius of Lyons. Vita Germani episcopi Autissiodorensis. MGH SRM 7.247–83. English translation by F. R. Hoare. In Soldiers of Christ: Saints and Saints' Lives from Late Antiquity and the Early Middle Ages. Edited by Thomas F. X.

THE MIDDLE AGES SERIES

Ruth Mazo Karras, General Editor Edward Peters, Founding Editor

A complete list of books in the series is available from the publisher.

Sacred Fictions

Holy Women and Hagiography in Late Antiquity

Lynda L. Coon

PENN

University of Pennsylvania Press Philadelphia